# UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DO RIO GRANDE DO SUL

# **MONICA STEFANI**

THE TRANSLATION OF PATRICK WHITE'S *THE SOLID*MANDALA INTO BRAZILIAN PORTUGUESE: AN ANALYSIS BASED
ON SOCIAL, HISTORICAL AND CULTURAL ASPECTS

## UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DO RIO GRANDE DO SUL INSTITUTO DE LETRAS

PROGRAMA DE PÓS-GRADUAÇÃO EM LETRAS ÁREA DE CONCENTRAÇÃO: ESTUDOS DE LITERATURA ESPECIALIDADE: LITERATURAS ESTRANGEIRAS MODERNAS LINHA DE PESQUISA: SOCIEDADE, (INTER)TEXTOS LITERÁRIOS E TRADUÇÃO NAS LITERATURAS ESTRANGEIRAS MODERNAS

# **MONICA STEFANI**

# THE TRANSLATION OF PATRICK WHITE'S *THE SOLID*MANDALA INTO BRAZILIAN PORTUGUESE: AN ANALYSIS BASED ON SOCIAL, HISTORICAL AND CULTURAL ASPECTS

Tese de doutorado em Literaturas Estrangeiras Modernas apresentada como requisito parcial para a obtenção do título de Doutora em Letras pelo Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras da Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul.

Orientadora: Prof.<sup>a</sup> Dr.<sup>a</sup> Rosalia A. N. Garcia

Porto Alegre 2016

## CIP - Catalogação na Publicação

```
Stefani, Monica
The Translation of Patrick White's The Solid
Mandala into Brazilian Portuguese: An Analysis Based
on Social, Historical and Cultural Aspects / Monica
Stefani. -- 2016.
312 f.

Orientadora: Rosalia Angelita Neumann Garcia.

Tese (Doutorado) -- Universidade Federal do Rio
Grande do Sul, Instituto de Letras, Programa de Pós-
Graduação em Letras, Porto Alegre, BR-RS, 2016.

1. Literatura Australiana. 2. Tradução. 3.
Competências. 4. Cultura. 5. Polissistemas. I.
Neumann Garcia, Rosalia Angelita, orient. II. Título.
```

Elaborada pelo Sistema de Geração Automática de Ficha Catalográfica da UFRGS com os dados fornecidos pelo(a) autor(a).

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First of all, thanks to my family, for supporting me throughout this enterprise. Thanks to my family in Sydney: Cathy Fazio, Amelia, Liana and Alyssa, and Tony, for welcoming me in your home and showing me how wonderful Australia is. Thanks for being part of my life.

I am deeply indebted to my advisor, professor Rosalia A. N. Garcia, for revising the manuscript and the translations. My most grateful thanks to professor Ian Alexander, for presenting Patrick White's world to me and encouraging this attempt to introduce White's world to Brazilians via translation. I am no less grateful to professor Déborah Scheidt, the pioneer in Patrick White studies in Brazil, for sharing her knowledge and materials with me, creating a virtual collaborative network on Australian Literature, and to professor Lawrence Flores Pereira, for the inspiration through his creative work in translation.

My most grateful thanks to UFRGS, and to my advisor in the scholarship provided by SEAD-UFRGS, professor Maria José Bocorny Finatto, for the invaluable help, and to my colleagues Aline Evers, Bianca F. Pasqualini and Fabiano B. Gonçalves. Thanks to professor Elizamari R. Becker, for the detailed and enlightening comments on my research, and to professors Patrícia R. Reuillard (for all the advice and support) and Cleci Bevilacqua. Thanks to professor and translator Chris Andrews, for his long-distance support and acceptance of my research proposal at the Writing and Society Research Centre at the University of Western Sydney (UWS), and to professor Anthony Uhlmann. Thanks to the UWS staff for continuously trying to make the sandwich scheme to research in Australia possible. Thanks to the Australian Department of Immigration and Border Protection (DIBP) for not making it possible. Thanks to professor Ivor Indyk and J. M. Coetzee, for reigniting my enthusiasm for this project after so many frustrations.

Thanks to the ones who helped me in our multimedia lab at UFRGS: Igor C. G. da Veiga, Karoline L. dos Santos, Leandro R. M. Rocha and specially Gabriel Lazzaron, for sharing with me your humor, outlook on life and experiences in your respective fields of study. You will always be in my heart.

Thanks to my students and now colleagues for making me see that what I was doing was not pointless: Amanda L. de Oliveira, Bruna T. dos Santos, Carolina S. Meyer, Carolina K. Facchin, Carolina M. de Macedo, Daniela R. Machado, Flávia P. S. Pires, Gabriel R. Borges, Isabel N. V. Ponte, Jacqueline M. S. Viana, Júlia S. Trindade, Kelvin P. Magagnin, Kenya S. Ortiz, Paulo G. Pilotti Duarte, Pedro H. M. Oliveira, Rachel T. Cardoso (*in memoriam*), Ricardo Sabadini, Thaís T. de Oliveira and Vitor Fernandes.

I must reacknowledge my debt to my best friends and colleagues, who comprise the Letradas group: Adriana Sühnel dos Santos (and family), Ana Paula Schizzi Paz (and family), Letícia Bauer (and family), Marivone C. Sirtoli, Eliane Lessa Caminha (and family), Luana Diehl Severo, Luciane Sarti and Fausto Silveira (and family) and especially Sue Anne Christello Coimbra (and family), for never letting me give up. Thanks to my friends and colleagues Larissa M. Brangel, Ana Flávia S. Oliveira, Pamela Osborn, Roberta Magano, Freya M. Conway, Marina G. Giongo (and family) and Luciane O. Müller, for the continuous support.

I owe a special debt of thanks to all the ones who replied to my emails and helped enrich this research by sharing their impressions on Patrick White's oeuvre: David Callahan, Georgina Loveridge, James Bennett, Jean Page, Maria Ammazzalorso, Maria Helena de Paiva Correia, María Socorro Suárez Lafuente, Mónica Herrero, Nataša Kampmark, Paulo Henriques Britto, Silvia Pupato and Susan Ballyn.

Without your help, almost every page of this dissertation would have less to offer.

"De aquí la enorme dificultad de la traducción: en ella se trata de decir en un idioma precisamente lo que este idioma tiende a silenciar. Pero, a la vez, se entrevé lo que traducir puede tener de magnífica empresa: la revelación de los secretos mutuos que pueblos y épocas se guardan recíprocamente y tanto contribuyen a su dispersión y hostilidad; en suma, una audaz integración de la Humanidad."

J. Ortega y Gasset, Miseria y Esplendor de la Traducción, *Obras Completas* 

"Ningún problema tan consustancial con las letras y con su modesto misterio como el que propone una traducción."

Jorge Luís Borges, Las Versiones Homéricas, *Discusión, Obras Completas I 1923-1949* 

"The purpose of a writer is to be read, and the criticism which would destroy the power of pleasing must be blown aside."

Samuel Johnson, Life of Pope

#### **ABSTRACT**

This dissertation presents and analyzes excerpts from my unpublished translation of Patrick White's *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese considering its socio-historical and cultural aspects at three levels of reading: as a translator, as a revisor/proofreader of the translation and as a literary critic. Itamar Even-Zohar's Polysystems Theory is adopted to justify the importance of (re)introducing Patrick White as a representative of Australian Literature into our Brazilian system via translation. Supporting the abilities necessary to perform the task, Amparo Hurtado Albir's model of competences is presented. In regards to cultural aspects, Javier Franco Aixelá's culture-specific items theory is used. The translations into French, German, Italian and Spanish are contrasted to mine, so as to identify inconsistencies and/or solutions and call attention to challenges which were not addressed. The version in Brazilian Portuguese is conveyed in this dissertation via selected excerpts, with the three levels being at work during the proofreading process of the translation. By attempting to make Patrick White's oeuvre be rediscovered not only in Brazil, but also in South America and in other Portuguese-speaking countries, through translation, this dissertation presents an innovative contribution to Translation Studies.

Keywords: Australian Literature. Culture. Competences. Polysystems. Reading. Translation.

#### **RESUMO**

Esta tese apresenta e analisa excertos da minha tradução não publicada de The Solid Mandala, de Patrick White, em português brasileiro, considerando seus aspectos sóciohistóricos e culturais em três níveis: como tradutor, como revisor da tradução e como crítico literário. A teoria dos polissistemas de Itamar Even-Zohar é adotada para justificar a importância de (re)introduzir Patrick White como representante da Literatura Australiana em nosso sistema literário brasileiro por meio da tradução. Como suporte às capacidades necessárias para realizar a tarefa, o modelo de competências de Amparo Hurtado Albir é apresentado. Quanto aos aspectos culturais, a teoria dos itens específico-culturais de Javier Franco Aixelá é empregada. As traduções publicadas em francês, italiano e espanhol são contrastadas com a minha a fim de identificar inconsistências e/ou soluções, bem como chamar a atenção para desafios que não foram contemplados. A versão em português brasileiro é proposta por meio de excertos selecionados, com os três níveis estando em funcionamento durante o processo de revisão da tradução. Ao buscar fazer a obra de Patrick White ser redescoberta não somente no Brasil, mas também na América Latina e em outros países de língua portuguesa, por meio da tradução, esta tese oferece uma contribuição inédita aos Estudos de Tradução.

Palavras-chave: Cultura. Competências. Leitura. Literatura australiana. Polissistemas. Tradução.

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

| 1 INTRODUCTION   | . 9     |
|--|---------|
| 1 INTRODUCTION   | . 28    |
| 1.2 THE ITALIAN TRANSLATION: MÀNDALA SOLIDO                |         |
| 1.3 THE FIRST SPANISH TRANSLATION: LAS ESFERAS DEL MANDALA | . 31    |
| 1.4 THE GERMAN TRANSLATION: DIE UNGLEICHEN BRÜDER          |         |
| 1.5 THE BRAND NEW SPANISH TRANSLATION: LAS ESFERAS         |         |
| DEL MANDALA  | . 35    |
|  |         |
| 2 PATRICK WHITE AND TRANSLATION: AN UNDENIABLE             |         |
| CONNECTION   |         |
| 2.1 PATRICK WHITE IN FRENCH (1951)                         |         |
| 2.2 PATRICK WHITE IN GERMAN (1957)                         |         |
| 2.3 PATRICK WHITE IN ITALIAN (1951)                        | . 49    |
| 2.4 PATRICK WHITE IN SPANISH OF SPAIN (1962)               | . 51    |
| 2.5 PATRICK WHITE IN SWEDISH (1964)                        |         |
| 2.6 PATRICK WHITE IN PORTUGUESE OF PORTUGAL (1973)         | . 58    |
| 2.7 PATRICK WHITE IN SERBO-CROATIAN (1974)                 | . 65    |
| 2.8 PATRICK WHITE IN GREECE (1980s)                        | . 67    |
| 2.9 PATRICK WHITE IN CHINA (1980)                          | . 70    |
| 2.10 PATRICK WHITE IN BRAZIL (1985)                        | . 71    |
| 2.11 PATRICK WHITE IN URUGUAY                              |         |
| 2.12 PATRICK WHITE IN ARGENTINA (2016)                     | . 79    |
| 3 READING AND TRANSLATION: PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS          | QQ      |
| 3.1 READING PATRICK WHITE IN AUSTRALIA                     |         |
| 3.2 READING PATRICK WHITE IN AUSTRALIA                     |         |
| 3.2.1 A árvore do homem                                    |         |
| 3.2.2 Voss   |         |
| 3.2.3 Patrick White's newest translation in Brazil         |         |
|  |         |
| <b>3.2.4 Patrick White and the Brazilian academy</b>       | .105    |
| POLYSYSTEMS THEORY   | 100     |
| POLISISIEMS THEORY   | .100    |
| 4 THE TRANSLATION OF THE SOLID MANDALA AND ITS CULTURAL    |         |
| AND SOCIO-HISTORICAL ASPECTS                               | .119    |
| 4.1 THE SOLID MANDALA: STRUCTURE                           |         |
| 4.2 METHODOLOGY OF THE TRANSLATION                         |         |
| 4.3 THE REVISION PROCESS                                   |         |
| 4.4 TARGET AUDIENCE  |         |
| 4.5 THE TITLE CHOSEN: A SÓLIDA MANDALA                     |         |
| 4.6 HISTORY AND MILITARY (COLONIAL, RELIGIOUS) TOUCHES     | . 12/   |
| IN THE SOLID MANDALA                                       | 121     |
| 4.7 THE SWEDISH TRANSLATOR'S DOUBTS: (HOW) WERE THEY       | . 131   |
| ADDRESSED?   | 162     |
| 4.8 LOCAL COLOUR AND ITS EFFECT IN TRANSLATION             | 179     |
| 4.9 LINGUISTIC DIFFERENCES AND NARRATIVE MARKS: THEIR      | . 1 / 0 |
| TO DITIOUS HE DIT LINERCES AND MAINTAINE MAINIS, HIEIN     |         |

| IMPORTANCE IN TRANSLATION  | 188 |
|--|-----|
| 4.10 INTERTEXTUALITY AND TRANSLATION IN THE SOLID MANDALA                    | 214 |
| 4.11 IMPORTANT SCENES IN THE SOLID MANDALA                                   | 220 |
| 5 CONCLUSION   | 278 |
| 6 REFERENCES   | 285 |
| ANNEX A – Contact with Editorial El Hilo de Ariadna, Buenos Aires, Argentina | 297 |
| ANNEX B – Contact with the translator Silvia Pupato                          | 301 |
| ANNEX C – Contact with Maria Ammazzalorso                                    | 302 |
| ANNEX D – Contact with Susan Ballyn (University of Barcelona)                | 303 |
| ANNEX E - Contact with Maria Helena de Paiva Correia                         | 304 |
| ANNEX F – Contact with Paulo Henriques Britto                                | 306 |
| ANNEX G – Contact with Nataša Kampmark                                       | 308 |
| ANNEX H - Contact with María Socorro Suárez Lafuente (University of Oviedo)  | 309 |
| ANNEX I – Contact with David Callahan (University of Aveiro)                 |     |
| ANNEX J- Contact with James Bennett  |     |

#### 1 INTRODUCTION

Theses whose subject matter is translation often start with statements about the importance of this rather tricky activity. To translate any text poses a challenge, but when in front of a literary piece, the usual challenges take a different dimension. In this work, Patrick White's *The Solid Mandala* has been chosen to be translated and commented. Published in 1966, the book, in addition to being considered by the author himself one of his best novels, features a different stage in his writing, evincing his maturity and literary genius. Also, this choice has to do with the ideas exposed by Alain de Bottom in his essay entitled *Can Tolstoi save your marriage?*: translation is part of humanities, and, as such, it should have the same function, that is to say, "to help us to live!". Culture should be looked at "as a storehouse of useful ideas about how to face our most pressing personal and professional issues. Novels and historical narratives can impart moral instruction and edification [...]<sup>2</sup>", helping "tease out the therapeutic and illuminative aspects of culture, so that we emerge from a period of study as slightly less disturbed, selfish and blinkered human beings<sup>3</sup>". This is one of the objectives of this dissertation: to ally the practice of translation to the presence of literature in one's life.

This work is part of a broader effort to make Australian literature recognized, or simply read, in Brazil, by providing a new Brazilian Portuguese translation of the Nobel Prize winner Patrick White (in addition to *Voss*, the only novel translated in Brazil and currently unavailable), as well as help recreate and "rediscover" – as the Australian literary critic Peter Craven puts it in his introduction to *Happy Valley* – him "as a fledging novelist, as fresh and wonderstruck and full of a desire to recreate the world as ever Australia was blessed with" (WHITE, 2012, p. XIII).

This dissertation does not dwell in the provinces of the post-colonial theories. It might get in contact with them (or it might even suggest points of contact for future research), but it does not represent, and is not part of, that whole set of ideas (including Cultural Studies).

Susan Bassnett divides Translation Studies into four general areas of interest, with two of them being product-oriented (i.e., focusing on the functional aspects of the translated text), and the other two being process-oriented (i.e., focusing on what happens during translation).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> BOTTOM, Alain de. Can Tolstoi save your marriage? Available at:

http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052748704828104576021713651690094. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Ibidem.

Essentially, this dissertation brings together both orientations, thus being classified in two of the categories exemplified by Bassnett: Category 1, "History of Translation", belonging to literary history, in which the scholar performs investigations concerning the many theories of translation over time,

the critical response to translations, practical processes of commissioning and publishing translations, the role and function of translations in a given period, the methodological development of translation and [...] analysis of the work of individual translators" (BASSNETT, 2002, p. 18),

and Category 4, "Translation and Poetics" (whose nomenclature is quite loose, according to her), which comprises the whole area of literary translation, in theory and practice, emphasizing

particular problems of translating poetry and [...] studies of the poetics of individual translators and comparisons between them, studies of the problems of formulating a poetics, and studies of the interrelationship between SL and TL texts and author-translator-reader (BASSNETT, 2002, p. 18).

As a result, the first part of this dissertation assumes translation as a process, whereas the final part assumes translation as a product.

When considering events that have helped spread Patrick White's oeuvre in the last few years as in a timeline, we would have the following sequence:

- In 2010, professor Ian Alexander and I presented the paper 'You are what you read': intertextual relations between Patrick White's *The Solid Mandala* and F. Dostoyevsky's *The Brothers Karamazov* at the Patrick White Conference: Modernist impact/Critical futures, King's College, London, which started paving the way to the celebrations of White's centenary, two years later.
- In 2011, the Master's thesis "You are what you read": intertextual relations in Patrick White's The Solid Mandala was presented at the Federal University of the State of Rio Grande do Sul, being the first research carried out on Patrick White at that institution, and now available worldwide through the Internet.
- In 2012, significant events took place, starting with the re-edition of *Happy Valley* (White's first novel, 1939) by Text Classics, a publishing house located in Melbourne, a good way to celebrate the author's centenary. In the same year, in Sydney (White's place), *The Hanging Garden* was unveiled and published, being transcribed from Patrick White's manuscript (which was found in a drawer), crowning the research performed by the scholars

Elizabeth Webby and Margareth Harris at Sydney University to spread White's literary reputation.

- In 2013, the whole year was devoted to the translation of the first version of *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese, with the final PhD research proposal presented to the panel at UFRGS.
- In 2014, there was the rereading and reassessment of the first version of the translation. Moreover, some good news reached us in Brazil: J.M. Coetzee's personal library was about to be published in Argentina, and, fortunately, *The Solid Mandala* was on the list.
- In 2015, the final paper started to be structured and composed, being evaluated in the qualification exam.
- In 2016, 50 years after its launch, the new Spanish translation *Las Esferas del Mandala* is published in Buenos Aires, and this dissertation is completed.

Cultural elements vary with historical periods, and in the case of the Brown family depicted in White's novel, the idea of movement (both historical and cultural) and progress seems to be highlighted in certain passages, but also ironized and criticized in others, depending on the tone of the narrative.

This dissertation is also an answer to John Beston's comment on *The Solid Mandala* in his most recent book on Patrick White's oeuvre:

If one tries to evaluate White's novels, one is struck by the fact that his best novels are those that are most poetically written: *The Aunt's Story, The Tree of Man, Voss, Riders in the Chariot, The Eye of the Storm,* and *A Fringe of Leaves.* And his weakest novels are the most prosaic: the first two apprentice novels, the two midcareer novels, *The Solid Mandala* and *The Vivisector,* finally his last two novels, *The Twyborn Affair* and *Memoirs of Many in One.* As one travels through the poetic landscape of White's work, one finds that the lush abundance of the major novels with their beautiful images, haunting rhythms, and memorable cryptic utterances alternates with the semi-desert terrain of the weaker works. The change in the stylistic landscape is especially noticeable in the two novels written in the 1960s, *The Solid Mandala* and *The Vivisector,* a long, fairly unproductive stretch for White: there is hardly a poetic sentence in either work (BESTON, 2010, p. 21).

After reading such a derogatory opinion about *The Solid Mandala*, there is definitely only one comment to be made: if John Beston, the author of such a comprehensive study on Patrick White, had attempted to sit down and translate any excerpt from *The Solid Mandala* into any language, he would certainly and quickly change his mind. Almost all references to that novel in his guide on White are not positive, which makes us think that Beston's aesthetical taste values only what was produced before (and including) *Voss*; thus, what came after it would not deserve attention, maybe because of a falsely induced judgement of lack of poetical

language (despite listing three post-*Voss* novels as among the best in the quotation). In my experience, however, the beginning of the Arthur chapter evinces poetry and demands a great deal of poetical effort from the translator:

In the beginning there was the sea of sleep of such blue in which they lay together with iced cakes and the fragments of glass nesting in each other's arms the furry waves of sleep nuzzling at them like animals. Dreaming and dozing (WHITE, 1966, p. 215).

Is not there any poetry in that? The poetical force of this text is undeniable to any reader, experienced or novice. Corroborating our idea, we have the following:

In *The Solid Mandala* he writes "Flurries of hydrangea-headed music provided a ceremony of white notes falling exactly into place". It becomes almost tangible, physical, when he describes what he likes, the "elect", in their daily tasks among familiar objects, surrounded by the Australian countryside. Here one meets White, the sensualist. The scourging satirist cannot compare with him when it is a question of vivid creation (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 120).

It is quite plausible to think that the references to the readings of the characters signal their position regarding translation. For instance, while mapping out Waldo's readings (STEFANI, 2011), the only works by foreign authors cited are Tacitus (a Latin classic) and Goethe (that Waldo claims to loathe). The other ones were all written in English. As for Arthur, he does not seem to care whether the books he was reading were translated or not, showing a rather eclectic taste, no matter the language or country of origin: *The Brothers Karamazov*, *The Bhagavad Gita*, *Upanishads*, Japanese Zen, and so on. Here the illusion of reading the translation as if it were the original is understated, alluding to Lawrence Venuti's concept of domestication.

Waldo, through this very British positioning in relation to translation, invariably helps to consolidate his view of "social isolation", i.e., what comes from overseas is not good, which was characteristic of the period when Britain, according to David Bellos, "seemed to wallow in 'splendid isolation' – *The Times* of October 22, 1957, famously ran the headline FOG IN CHANNEL, CONTINENT CUT OFF – but that was more pose than reality" (BELLOS, p. 9, 2011). Additionally, having the books does not necessarily mean that you actually read them. Arthur, on the other hand, is much more receptive to translations, so much so that the book which becomes his obsession is a translation: *The Brothers Karamazov*.

Selection is part of any research: from the choice of the theoretical scope to the number of excerpts to be presented, we are always making choices and possibly leaving

behind several topics which might be viewed by some scholars as crucial. Having this in mind, it should be noted, at this point, that this dissertation had to make an initial choice in terms of the kind of excerpts we would be presenting: prose or poetry? The book is all written in prose, but there are many beautiful poetical instances which will not be presented in this work. The translation of the poems of this novel (for example, to analyze Arthur's song and eventual production in opposition to Waldo's) would already deserve a separate academic work (either a thesis or a dissertation), certainly mentioning ways to approach those poetical instances considering the whole body of theory devoted to poetry translation and the creative work performed by the translator. This does not mean that they were not translated, though. Still in relation to the selection of the excerpts presented in this work, a brief note on their difficulty and/or complexity: the level of complexity/difficulty of a text varies according to the person reading/translating it. Therefore, perhaps sometimes an extract might be presented which is not complicated in one aspect to one scholar, but which represents a challenge in translation to others. In addition, many new options of translation might arise from the presentation of these excerpts not only in Brazilian Portuguese, but also in other languages. It should be stressed that these items made us interrupt our workflow, and were selected from so many others, which would not be enough to present in a sole dissertation.

To enrich this dissertation, the translations of *The Solid Mandala* into French, German, Italian and Spanish will be used (with the excerpts being placed in tables, together with our translation without a preliminary revision, as the revision process will be detailed in a specific chapter). This contrastive analysis is based on Walter Benjamin's argument that the translations are the "afterlives" (BENJAMIN, 2004, p. 77) of the original, that is, that the original gains in worth by being translated. Another theorist who champions this indirect translation reading and quality assessment is Javier Franco Aixelá, who considers it almost an "obligation because of the advantage that this means to the reader" (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 149, my translation<sup>4</sup>). He mentions that those who do not advocate for the reading of precedent translations, such as Pablo Mañé Garzón, translator of William Blake into Spanish, apologize for not having looked at previous versions of translations, in the intent of making their own works "spontaneous". The point here is clear: when looking at previous translations, the objective is to improve the quality of the new translation. Nida and other theorists recommend the practice, not only for the purposes of better quality, but also for researchers, who will

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> AIXELÁ, Javier Franco. **Condicionantes de traducción y su aplicación a los nombres propios (inglés – español**). Alicante: Universidade de Alicante, 1996. 779 f. Tese (Doutorado em Letras). Departamento de Filologia Inglesa, Universidade de Alicante, Alicante, 1996a. In the original: "[...] obligación por la ventaja que eso supone para el lector".

benefit from being able to observe the functional changes and procedures at play in different versions. Thus, it also becomes clear that the new translator had the opportunity of resorting to previous decisions, and, again according to Aixelá, "to rely on the help of previous translators is not equivalent at all to plagiarism, although there are cases in which this is produced" (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 150, my translation<sup>5</sup>). As will be presented in this dissertation, plagiarism is the last thing to be sought for when dealing with Patrick White's text being carefully and enthusiastically translated to a Brazilian audience. Here, some clarification is necessary as to strategies employed to possibly avoid plagiarism: my translation was ready and started to be proofread before I had access to the translations. In terms of possible limits to the amount and nature of ideas I might borrow from those other translations, the whole process is going to be described in this dissertation, with the suggestions brought up by the readings of the other translators being duly identified.

Three of the translations (French, Italian and Spanish) were published in the same year, 1973, and in the same month: November (while the German translation was launched in 1978). Patrick White had won the Nobel Prize of Literature in October, thus, we tend to believe that the idea of the publishing-houses was to have the book available for Christmas (at least that was verified in the Spanish context, according to what was exposed by Silvia Pupato, one of the translators of the novel into Spanish, in an interview via e-mail, available in the appendix). We perform a brief paratextual analysis of each translation later in this section. It should be stressed that we do not intend to focus only on the failures of these translations, since they are valuable efforts to promote Australian Literature in the literary systems of their respective countries. Working with translations is a good thing to distract us from the excessive focus on the original, which might eliminate or even prevent us from identifying rich possibilities of comparison among many and diverse literary works and their aspects of narrative construction. Moreover, Mads Rosendahl Thomsen claims that "world literature is a literature that gains in translation. This does not mean that the translation is better than the original, but that the whole corpus of originals and translations is of greater value than the original alone, both in terms of artistic value and cultural impact" (THOMSEN, 2008, p. 16), hence the idea of bringing those references to discussion. For the comparatist, translation proves that one nation reads the other, and that we can all learn from the other.

This dissertation is an exercise which allows the reader to observe how the readings of the translators work in the appreciation of White's text in these languages, contrasting those

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "[...] contar con la ayuda de traductores anteriores no equivale en absoluto al plagio, si bien existen casos en los que esto se produce".

versions with the original and then showing our attempt in Brazilian Portuguese, concomitantly contextualizing the choices made. Furthermore, it should be stressed that the translations described here did not condition my work, as my first draft was already finished by the time I had access to the translations. There might be some small traces of "contamination" in my proofreading, but given that some aspects were not adequately dealt with in the translations I had looked into, I feel more confortable in saying that I was not inclined to make the same mistakes (or even deletions) in my own work.

In connection to the exercise proposed here, we use the excerpt displaying Dulcie's multilingual letter (alluding to the myth of the Tower of Babel responsible for the creation of the many languages in our world) to illustrate White's position in recognizing and describing the diversity of languages forming Australia at that time (immigration flow). In the story, Dulcie goes to Europe to learn several languages. Like Arthur, she is receptive to the new, and that, among other things, explains their close friendship. The letter she wrote to him is proof of that Tower of Babel (the disposition of the languages in the exhibit follows the alphabetical order of the languages involved, and this will be the pattern in all exhibits from now on in this work):

Exhibit 1 -Dulcie's letter

| French                         | German                        | Italian                    | Spanish 1                  | Spanish 2             |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|
| Le 14 avril 1914.              | 14. April 1914                | 14 aprile 1914             | 14 de abril de             | 14 de abril de 1914   |
| Es ist hier sehr nett          | Es ist hier sehr net <b>t</b> | Es ist hier sehr nett      | 1914.                      | Es ist hier sehr nett |
| u. freundlich bei              | u. freundlich bei             | u. freundlich bei          | Es ist hier sehr nett      | u. freundlich bei     |
| unserer kleinen                | unserer kleinen               | unserer kleinen            | u. freundlich bei          | unserer kleinen       |
| Pension où nous                | Pension wo wir                | Pension dove noi           | unserer kleinen            | Pension en la cual    |
| sommes descendues              | beide jetzt ein paar          | due abitiamo dopo          | Pension donde              | estamos parando       |
| toutes deux après              | Tage verbringen               | essere stati               | estamos las dos            | las dos después de    |
| avoir manqué être              | nachdem uns die               | amabilmente                | después de que             | que los parientes     |
| étouffées par                  | lieben Verwandten             | soffocati dai parenti.     | nuestros familiares        | nos asfixiaran com    |
| l'amabilité de notre           | vor Liebe fast                | È così bello               | nos sofocaron com          | su amabilidad. Es     |
| famille. C'est si              | erdrückt haben. Es            | mangiare trote sulle       | su amistad. Es             | tan lindo comer       |
| agreeable de manger            | ist wunderhübsch,             | rive del lago. Je ne       | lindíssimo comer           | truchas junto al río. |
| de la truite au bord           | direct am Wasser zu           | peux croire qu'il y        | truchas junto al           | Je ne peux croire     |
| de l'eau. Je ne peux           | sitzen und Forellen           | aura guerre – come         | lago. Je ne peux           | qu'il y'aura guerre   |
| croire qu'il y aura            | zu essen. Je ne peux          | giurano tutti i            | croire qu'il y'aura        | – como vaticinan      |
| guerre <sup>1</sup> , comme le | croire qu'il y'aura           | sapientoni – il y a        | guerre – como              | los sabelotodos – il  |
| prédissent ceux qui            | guerre – wie das die          | trop de soleil. Mio        | prometen los               | y a trop de soleil.   |
| savent toujours tout,          | Besserwisser                  | caro Arturo <sup>1</sup> , | sabelotodo – <i>il y a</i> | Mio caro Arturo,      |

il y a trop de soleil¹.

Mio caro Arturo,
nous avons visite
une villa ou un petit
château au milieu du
lac, les murs étaient
constellés de
morceaux de cristal
de roche! J'ai pensé
à Arthur, e tutte
nostre cosi chiare
conversazionni.
Affeti! D.

1. En français dans

1. En français dans le texte. (*N. d. T.*) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 281)

ständig behaupten il y a trop de soleil. Mio caro Arturo, wir haben eine Villa besichtigt, oder eigentlich ein kleines Schoß, draußen auf dem See, und in einem der Zimmer war die ganze Wand von Bergkristallen bedeckt! Da habe ich an einen gewissen Arthur gedacht – e tutte nostre cosi chiare conversazioni.

Affetti!- D.

303)

14th April 1914

(WHITE, 1978, p.

abbiamo visitato una villa, o un piccolo castello, in mezzo al lago, e le pareti di una delle stanze erano tempestate di cristallo di rocca! Ho pensato a te, Arthur... e tutte nostre cosi chiare conversazionni. Affetti! $^2$  – D. <sup>1</sup> In italiano nel testo (N. d. T.) <sup>2</sup> Così nel testo (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 277)

trop de soleil. Mio caro Arturo,
visitamos una villa,
o pequeño castillo,
junto al lago; ¡y las
paredes de uno de
los cuartos estaban
revestidas en cristal
de roca! Pienso em
ti – e tutte nostre
cosi chiare
conversazioni.
¡Affetti! – D.
(WHITE, 1973a,
p.288-289).

visitamos una villa, que es un pequeno castillo, ubicada sobre el Igo, y en la paredes de una habitación ¡había incrustaciones de cristal de roca!

Pensé en Arthur... e tutte nostre così chiare conversazioni. ¡Affetti! D. (WHITE, 2016, p. 385).

#### English

## First Attempt

# 14 de abril de 1914

## Brazilian Portuguese - Revised

14 de abril de 1914

Es ist hier sehr nett u. freundlich bei unserer kleinen Pension where we are staying the two of us after being suffocated amiably by relatives. It is so beautiful eating trout beside the water. Je ne peux croire qu'il y'aura guerre - as the know-alls promise  $-il \ v \ a$ trop de soleil. Mio caro Arturo, we visited a villa, or small castle, out on the lake, and the walls of one of the rooms were studded with rock-crystal! I thought of Arthur - e tutte nostre cosi chiare

Affetti!

D.

conversazioni.

Es ist hier sehr nett u. freundlich bei unserer kleinen Pension onde estamos nós duas depois de sermos amavelmente sufocadas por parentes. É tão bonito comer truta junto à água. Je ne peux croire qu'il y'aura guerre - como os sabe-tudo prometem - il y a trop de soleil. Mio caro Arturo, visitamos uma vila, ou um pequeno castelo, no lago, e as paredes de um dos quartos estavam cravejadas de cristais! Pensei em Arthur - e nostre cosi chiare conversazioni. Affetti! D.

Es ist hier sehr nett u. freundlich bei unserer kleinen Pension onde nós duas estamos depois de sermos amavelmente sufocadas por parentes. É tão bonito comer truta junto à água. Je ne peux croire qu'il y'aura guerre — como os sabe-tudo prometem — il y a trop de soleil. Mio caro Arturo, visitamos uma vila, ou um pequeno castelo, junto ao lago, e as paredes de um dos quartos estavam cravejadas de cristais! Pensei em Arthur — e tutte nostre così chiare conversazioni. Affetti! D.

(WHITE, 1969, p. 247)

Evidently, the narrow scope of languages Dulcie mentions (and later Arthur asks her about the possibility of learning Russian, as well) is symptomatic of the languages which were dominant in the past for being vehicles of artistic expression and scientific breakthroughs, according to David Bellos:

[...] Italian and French in the European Renaissance and early modern period. [...] English and French continued to be used for numerous disciplines, but German burst onto the scene in the nineteenth century with the new chemistry invented by Liebig and others [...] (BELLOS, 2011, p. 8),

and before the First World War (the reason Arthur asks about Russian): at the eastern edge, Turkey and Russia (Orthodox/Muslim); in the most visited region, Britain, France, Germany, the Austro-Hungarian Empire and Italy (Catholic and Prostestant). This multilingual letter is one more compelling reason why *The Solid Mandala* (*A mandala sólida*) deserves to have its translation into Brazilian Portuguese published in the near future. It might also be said that, in addition to discussing the pertinence of Literature in one's lives, consciously or not, Patrick White antecendently unveils and deals with issues pertaining to translation. In fact, it is quite interesting to verify that the fragment gained a footnote in two translations, the French and the Italian, to signal to the reader that the letter was presented in such an awkward way on purpose in the original text, therefore, not beingthe translator's invention. As seen by the footnotes, this preoccupation is well signalled. Let us call attention to the form "Affeti" (without the double "t") in the closing of the letter translated into French (it might have been really a typo). About the rest, we see that both translators felt the necessity to explain to the reader that it was not their mistake or responsibility.

Another passage from *The Solid Mandala* which more emphatically evinces its metatraductory character than in any of Patrick White's other novels is this:

But neither Waldo nor Mother had ears for it. They were too busy translating their own thoughts. Waldo used to say Dad was teaching himself Norwegian to translate his thoughts into a language which could not be read (WHITE, 1974, p. 270).

In reality, George Brown had a book, *How to Teach Yourself Norwegian*, with passages demanding footnotes even in the original, as shown next. Hence, the evidence that translation is as much a part of our lives as literature:

Exhibit 2 – Excerpts with footnotes

| French                             | German                    | Italian                        | Spanish 1                   | Spanish 2                         |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Lorsqu'il eut                      | Nachdem George Brown      | Dopo aver buttato              | Cuando pudo                 | Una vez que hubo                  |
| accouché de son                    | dies mühsam               | fuori quello che               | terminar de decirlo         | vomitado lo que                   |
| discours à la sueur                | hervorgebracht hatte,     | aveva da dire                  | George Brown                | tenía que decir,                  |
| de son front,                      | wandte er sich wieder der | George Brown                   | volvió al <i>Enséñese</i>   | George Brown se                   |
| George Brown se                    | Selbstlehrmethode für     | tornò al suo                   | noruego usted               | enfrascó de nuevo                 |
| replongea dans Le                  | Norwegisch zu. Waldo      | Impara da solo il              | mismo. Por ese              | en <i>Aprenda</i>                 |
| norvégien par                      | konnte inzwischen an      | norvegese. Ormai               | entonces Waldo              | noruego por su                    |
| vous-même.                         | den Mundbewegungen        | Waldo era in                   | podía reconocer la          | cuenta. Por esse                  |
| Waldo savait                       | erkennen, welche Sätze    | grado di                       | forma de las frases         | entonces, Waldo                   |
| maintenant                         | er wiederholte: Hun       | riconoscere la                 | más repetidas: Hun          | ya podía                          |
| reconnaître la                     | hoppet i sjøen: SIE       | struttura delle                | hoppet i sjøen <sup>2</sup> | reconocer la                      |
| forme des phrases:                 | SPRANG IN DAS             | frasi ripetute: Hun            | Han merket det hog          | forma de las                      |
| Hun hoppet I                       | MEER Han merket det       | hoppet i siøen <sup>1</sup>    | reddet henne³ Jeg           | frases que se                     |
| sjøen¹. Han                        | og reddet henne: ER       | Han merket det og              | har spart penger for        | repetían: Hun                     |
| merket det og                      | MERKTE ES UND             | reddet henne <sup>2</sup>      | °a kjøpe en gave til        | hoppet i sjøen <sup>3</sup>       |
| reddet henne <sup>2</sup> .        | RETTETE SIE Jeg           | Jeg har spart                  | min søster <sup>4</sup>     | Han merket det                    |
| Jeg har spart                      | har spart penger for a    | penger for °a                  | Porque el padre le          | hog reddet                        |
| penger for a kjøpe                 | kjøpe en gave til min     | kjøpe en gave til              | había asustado y            | henne <sup>4</sup> Jeg har        |
| en gave til min                    | søster: ICH HABE          | min søster <sup>3</sup>        | luego le había              | spart penger for a                |
| <i>søster</i> <sup>3</sup> . Comme | GELD GESPART, UN          | Waldo s'irritò                 | avergonzado, lo             | kjøpe en gave til                 |
| Papa l'avait                       | MEINER SCHWESTER          | perché Papà                    | cual era peor,              | <i>min søster</i> <sup>5</sup> Se |
| effaryé, puis                      | EIN GESCHENK ZU           | l'aveva spavenato,             | Waldo quedó                 | sentía irritado                   |
| embarrassé, il                     | MACHEN Vater hatte        | e poi – peggio                 | enfadado. Empezó a          | porque el papá lo                 |
| devint fureieux, ce                | ihn erst erschreckt und   | ancora – messo in              | relacionar la               | había asustado y                  |
| qui était pire.                    | dann verlegen gemacht –   | imbarazzo.                     | solemne idiotez de          | luego lo había                    |
| 1. Il sauta dans le                | was viel schlimmer war –  | <sup>1</sup> Essa si è tuffata | las palavras                | hecho passar                      |
| mer.                               | und deshalb wurde         | in mare. ( <i>N. d. T.</i> )   | recitadas con el            | vergüenza, lo que                 |
| 2. Il le remarqua et               | Waldo jetzt wütend        | <sup>2</sup> Egli la vide e la | inexorable                  | era peor. Empezó                  |
| la sauva.                          | (WHITE, 1978, p. 93).     | salvo. ( <i>N. d. T.</i> )     | movimiento del              | a establecer un                   |
| 3. J'ai mis de                     |                           | <sup>3</sup> Io ho risparmiato | tren.                       | vínculo entre la                  |
| l'argent e côté                    |                           | dei soldi per                  | 2. Ella saltó al mar.       | solemne idiotez                   |
| pour acheter um                    |                           | comperare un                   | 3. El lo advirtió y la      | de esas palavras                  |
| cadeau à ma soeur.                 |                           | regalo per mia                 | salvo.                      | recitadas y la                    |
| (WHITE, 1973b,                     |                           | sorella. (N. d. T.)            | 4. He ahorrado              | implacable                        |
| p. 90).                            |                           | (WHITE, 1973c,                 | dinero para comprar         | marcha del tren.                  |
|                                    |                           | p. 85).                        | un regalo a mi              | 3. Ella se                        |
|                                    |                           |                                | hermana. (WHITE,            | zambulló en el                    |
|                                    |                           |                                | 1973a, p. 90-91).           | mar. [N. de la T.]                |

|  |   | 4. El se dio cuenta y la salvó. [N. de la T.] 5. Ahorré dinero para comprarle un regalo a mi |  |
|--|---|--|--|
|  |   | hermana. [N. de la T.] (WHITE,   |  |
|  |   | 2016, p. 137).   |  |
| English                                  | First Attempt   | Brazilian Portuguese – Revised   |  |
| When he had sweated it out               | Quando ele havia suado isso   | Quando ele penara o bastante George  |  |
| George Brown turned again to             | para fora George Brown se   | Brown se voltou novamente para o   |  |
| Teach Yourself Norwegian.                | voltou novamente para o Teach   | Aprenda norueguês sozinho. Waldo   |  |
| Waldo could recognize by then            | Yourself Norwegian. Waldo   | agora já conseguia reconhecer as formas  |  |
| the shapes of the repeated               | conseguia reconhecer por então  | das frases repetidas: Hun hoppet i   |  |
| phrases: Hun hoppet i sjøen <sup>1</sup> | as formas das frases repetidas: sjøen¹ Han merket det d                           |  |  |
| Han merket det og reddet                 | Hun hoppet i sjoen <sup>1</sup> Han   | henne <sup>2</sup> Jeg har spart penger for a kjøp   |  |
| henne <sup>2</sup> Jeg har spart penger  | merket det og reddet henne <sup>2</sup> en gave til min søster <sup>3</sup> Porqu |  |  |
| for a kjøpe en gave til min              | Jeg har spart penger for a kjope havia assustado, e depois enver                  |  |  |
| søster <sup>3</sup> Because Dad had      | em gave til min soster o que era pior, ele ficou irritad                          |  |  |
| frightened, then embarrassed             | Porque Papai o havia assustado,   | começou a relacionar a solene idiotice   |  |
| him, which was worse, he grew            | então o envergonhado, o que era   | das palavras recitadas com o moviment  |  |
| angry. He began to relate the            | pior, ele ficou irritado. Ele   | implacável do trem.  |  |
| solemn idiocy of the recited             | começou a relacionar a solene   |  |  |
| words to the unrelenting motion          | idiotice das palavras recitadas   | 1. Ela pulou no mar  |  |
| of the train.                            | com o movimento descontínuo   | 2. Ele o percebeu e a salvou.  |  |
|  | do trem.  | 3. Eu poupei dinheiro para comprar um  |  |
| 1. She jumped into the sea.              |   | presente para minha irmã.  |  |
| 2. He noticed it and saver her.          | <sup>1</sup> Ela pulou no mar.  |  |  |
| 3. I have saved money to buy a           | <sup>2</sup> Ele a notou e a salvou.  |  |  |
| present for my sister. (WHITE,           | <sup>3</sup> Economizei dinheiro para   |  |  |
| 1974, p. 78).                            | comprar um presente para minha  |  |  |
|  | irmã.   |  |  |

Evidently, most translations kept the notes (including the Brazilian version), as well as the sentences in the original (albeit the typo found in the Italian edition in the reproduction of the Norwegian text – "siøen" instead of "sjøen"). The German version is the only one which, according to its editorial policy, decided to embed the translations of the Norwegian into the main text, thus eliminating any footnotes. The new Spanish translation transformed the

English translations of the Norwegian sentences into separate footnotes, even indicating that they come from the translator (using "N. de la T.").

In Brazilian Portuguese, several changes can be seen from the first to the final translation: the expresion "sweat it out" works quite well in English, but in Brazilian Portuguese we need to find words to give the idea of someone sweating due to fever, of suffering. Initially, we used the literal translation with the verb "suar". However, in addition to changing the verb, we had to think about the aspect, thus, instead of using past perfect, we decided to choose the Brazilian Portuguese pluperfect form "penara". This is one of the difficulties in translating: many times the verb form coincides with the original in English, but when we reread the translated fragment, we feel, as native speakers of Brazilian Portuguese, that the aspect does not work so well in the sentence as in the original, or that the change in Brazilian Portuguese might add to the aesthetical style of the text. For the adjective "unrelenting", instead of "descontínuo", we changed to "implacável", which is also found in the new Spanish translation. Another change is seen in the second sentence in the footnotes: instead of attributing to the pronoun "it" the reference to "his sister", we decided to use "o" meaning "isso", i.e., the act of his sister jumping into the sea. In the third sentence, we had to perform some changes, because the verbs "economizar" and "poupar" have different levels of informality. For a book presenting simple sentences to learners of a second language, it might sound more natural to read "poupei" rather than "economizei". We decided to keep the order of the apposition, because it does create a tension in the scene. Were we to change that order, the effect would have been lost (as is the case when reading the new Spanish version, when Waldo is first irritated and then explains why).

Déborah Scheidt, the Brazilian pioneer in the studies of Patrick White, makes a good summary of the abilities and sensation we feel after reading his oeuvre, which would apply to any person reading for entertainment or for translation:

Through his fiction, White gives compelling artistic expression to his own conflicts, shows an honesty that is taken to its last consequences and helps blur the usual distinctions between the fictional and the biographical (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 52), and this applies to *The Solid Mandala*.

When the name Patrick White is mentioned to any person who has only heard of him, but never read his novels (particularly in Australia), the immediate impression is that he is an elitist. That would be a much too a hasty conclusion because, despite his family background was marked by a privileged financial condition, the descriptions of his life at Dogwoods, for

example, were not really marked by wealth. Perhaps the common story surrounding his life is that he was able to pursue his literary career without relying exclusively on his work as a writer to pay his bills and make ends meet. However, perhaps the sole purpose of this dissertation (and the reason which prompted me to translate the novel) is to make people read him. *The Solid Mandala* was chosen precisely because in it White unveils inner conflicts; different ways of life, ordinary events taking on different and rather significant proportions (Arthur getting in contact with *The Brothers Karamazov* at the Mitchell Library and finding out the meaning of the mandala). Patrick White's oeuvre is there to help rescue this aspect of, say, magic and fascination, sadly banalized by postmodern times, by making people stop and learn how to grasp delicate and subtle meanings.

In this dissertation, the reflection of many theorists and professionals who deal with Australian Literature will appear to substantiate and contrast our arguments. The Spanish scholar Amparo Hurtado Albir will be the reference in terms of the abilities required by a translator when s/he is in front of any given piece of text. Even though her academic work at Universidad Autònoma de Barcelona focuses on the technical branch of the field of translation, the topics described in her model of competences do apply to professionals in the literary field as well.

Another name from Spain is Javier Franco Aixelá (from the University of Alicante) and his culture-specific items. His thorough PhD dissertation on the translation of proper nouns over time, encompassing many textual genres, is also a valuable contribution to our study. Accurately, his theoretical summary sheds light on some branches of Translation Studies, mainly related to the Polysystems Theory (headed by Itamar Even-Zohar and Gideon Toury in Israel, and Theo Hermanns and other theoreticians in Europe and across the world). Moreover, Mona Baker's work will be described here, on the importance of coherence in translation (borrowing the concept from Textual Linguistics).

Issues about intertextuality, again drawing on the considerations about the topic made by Basil Hatim and Ian Mason, will reappear, this time connected to the challenges of translation in *The Solid Mandala*. For example, we will examine how Alfred Tennyson's poem *Fatima* (two stanzas appear in the novel) is dealt with by the translators: was it translated freely? Was it copied from an already known and consolidated translation into their respective languages? What should we do in Brazilian Portuguese, given that Tennyson is a famous name in English Literature, but with translations available only in Portuguese of Portugal (and which do not include the poem *Fatima*)? As already mentioned, Patrick White enjoys playing with literature, subtly placing it in the lives of the characters and then giving it

such an importance, as if it were a magnificent tool that could change their lives, that the translator needs to make decisions about what is going to be translated or not. Many titles appear in the novel (some fictional, others real), and this is evidence of the high attention required in our reading (and in our sources during the research as well).

Umberto Eco claims that translation theory has to rely on a kind of "active or passive experience of translation" (ECO, 2001, p. 5), i.e., to translate texts or to see our texts being translated by someone else. Some argue that theory is quite dispensable in translation, championing the argument that practice leads to perfection without any theoretical support. Notwithstanding, theories do exist in translation, if not to improve, at least to explain and systemize ideas and procedures. Regarding the importance of translation theory, the translator Emma Wagner questioned the theorist Andrew Chesterman, in the book *Can Theory Help Translators?*, about the ways in which the reflection about translation could be useful to make us better translators while generating a feeling of professional self-esteem. Chesterman takes the opportunity to answer not only the question posed, but also some suppositions brought by it, such as: "would that same question be asked about other sorts of theory?":

Should musicology help composers to become better musicians or composers? Should literary theory help writers and poets to write better? Should sociology help the people and groups it studies to become better members of society? Should the theories of mechanics and cybernetics help engineers and computer scientists to produce better robots? I guess your answers to these questions will not be identical: I myself would be more inclined to answer yes to the last one than to the others. To the sociology one, I might answer that it should at least help people like politicians to make better decisions. But the ones on musicology and literary theory seem a bit different; such theories seem more to help other people understand these art forms, rather than the artists themselves. In particular, such theories might help academics (theorists) to understand something better, and hence, in some abstract way, add to the sum total of cultural knowledge (CHESTERMAN; WAGNER, 2002, p. 1-2).

Massimiliano Morini, in his book *The Pragmatic Translator*, claims that the various sciences present in Chesterman's reply can be viewed as "mirror-images of different aspects of Translation Studies" (MORINI, 2013, p. 10). For example, Descriptive Translation Studies offer the description provided by musicology and literary theory; linguistic theory helps us study the "cybernetics" of translation, the terminology to organize our understanding about the subject, as well as the mechanisms of language which allow us to perform this activity. Descriptive Translation Studies question the exclusivity of the linguistic field to account, on its own behalf, for all the intricacies of translation (mainly via the concepts of fidelity and equivalence), without considering the other items at stake. However, albeit the questioning of

such validity, Descriptive Translation Studies have yet failed to bring up a necessary substitute for those concepts. The theorist Kirsten Malmkjaer admits that the notion of equivalence is not so easily given up in Translation Studies, since there is a relationship between target text and source text if we are to consider that the former is going to be a translation of the latter: "the notion is essential if we are to make sense of certain types of translation and mistranslation and, even, arguably, of difference and non-translation" (MALMKJAER, 1999, p. 263). Hence, this dissertation will work with the notions of equivalence, by contrasting the translations and the original (there is a strong relation between the original and the translation). The translator may often be compared to a musician, following what the Argentinian translator Marcelo Cohen writes: "The translator, as the writer, thinks that neither music is free from the tension of the meaning, nor literature is overwhelmed by signification" (COHEN, 2014, p. 12, my translation). Thus, we are always looking for sounds and melodies to translate (compose) songs which will be read by the reader, while being interpreted by the characters in the novels we, as translators, read and translate, or, when not translating, read and inevitably stop to think of how we would translate them.

Therefore, after this brief outline of the topics to be delevoped in this work (or exercise in translation), the innovativeness of the theme of this dissertation lays and is described in the following items:

- 1) The author chosen to be translated (Patrick White, although already translated into Brazilian Portuguese, lacks academic works on his oeuvre, be it in the original or translation).
- 2) The translation of Australian Literature overseas, in addition to being a very rich field of study that is not so easily recognizable by Australians themselves, makes this work pertinent to enrich not only our Brazilian system, but also the Australian, providing a historical, social and cultural account of the translations available. Robert Dixon explains that "Australian writers and Australian literature have never been confined to the boundaries of the nation" (2007, p. 21): indeed, besides Patrick White, Christina Stead and Henry Handel Richardson, who were cosmopolitan and spoke several languages (although sharing an Anglo-Australian background), there are many Australian writers who live (or lived) in Australia and write in another language Lily Brett (German), Janette Turner Hospital (French) –, Catherine Rey who writes in French –, John Hughes writing in English, German and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> In the original: "El traductor, como el escritor, piensa que ni la música está libre de la tensión del sentido, ni la literatura apabullada por la significación. [...] Y la literatura anhela incurablemente una fragilidad semejante como un resguardo de futuro, de indeterminación, de encantamento, y de constancia de que cualquier sonido atñe al cuerpo (COHEN, 2014, p. 12).

French. In summary: the reputation of authors such as David Malouf, Peter Carey (with academic works on his oeuvre in Brazil in recent years), Les A. Murray, Robert Dessaix, J. M. Coetzee, among others, abroad, "where they are often read very differently to the way they are read here [in Australia]" (DIXON, 2007, p. 20), might be, among other factors, thanks to translation.

- 3) The analysis shifts from the aspects of the novel to the challenges involved in its translation, to prompt new readers of Portuguese to discover White's writing and start debating his contribution in the introduction of a new continent in worldwide literature.
- 4) It is the first formal (although summarized) account of the work performed by other translators in Portuguese, in its varieties of Portugal and Brazil.
- 5) One more work trying to call attention to the importance of the Polysystem Theory, which finds application and usefulness now and in the future. It has its flaws (which theory is exempt from flaws?), but it was chosen because it represents a necessary change in the field of Translation Studies, bringing the focus to the translated text.
- 6) Following Lawrence Venuti's convincing argument about the translator's invisibility, this work is a complementary attempt to spread his idea: "to make the translator more visible so as to resist and change the conditions under which translation is theorized and practiced today [...]" (VENUTI, 2004, p. 17). Translators are not invisible, and their work needs to be valued and debated, and this dissertation intends to set the stage for such debate.
- 7) This work deals with the importance of the types of reading in effect during a translation, mainly in the proofreading process, when the translator is detached from the original text and starts working solely with the accuracy and impressions s/he wants to include in the translated text (thus becoming a revisor and, eventually, a critic of her/his own work).
- 8) It is the first academic attempt to discuss the translated novels of Patrick White in Latin languages, such as French, Italian, Spanish and Portuguese (varieties of Portugal and Brazil), and also the German translation.

The Blind Men and the Elephant<sup>7</sup> is a pertinent fable when referring to the choice of the theoretical apparatus to support our analysis. When they heard there was an elephant in the village, six blind men, although without any idea of what an elephant looked like, decided to go and at least feel it. All of them touched the animal and exposed their impressions: the first one touched the leg and thought the elephant was a pillar; the second one touched its tail

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Available at: http://www.jainworld.com/education/stories25.asp. Accessed on: 29 Jul. 2015.

and thought it was like a rope; the third one touched the trunk and thought the elephant was like a thick branch of a tree; the fourth touched the ear and thought it was like a big hand fan; the fifth touched the belly and thought it was like a huge wall; the last one touched the tusk of the elephant and thought it was like a solid pipe. Their disparate views generated a heated argument because each one of them insisted they were right about their impressions on what the elephant looked like. A wise man seeing the event, stopped and asked what was going on. They replied that they could not reach an agreement on what the elephant looked like. The wise man explained that all of them were right and the reason why they had such disparate views about the same thing was that each one of them had touched a different part of the elephant. Thus, the elephant has all of the characteristics that they had felt. The blind men stopped arguing and felt happy because, in a way, they were all right. Hence, in the case of Translation Studies, we may all be touching a different part of the subject, and we may all have quite disparate views about it, but we cannot say that one theory is more right than the other; they, in fact, are used according to different purposes, and, for that reason, should be approximated, to give us a useful picture. In this work, we present our view of translation, and hope that other academics bring their views on the translation of *The Solid Mandala* as well.

In Chapter 2, Patrick White's situation (reception) in translation in many countries is outlined. To perform this description, we had to look for the titles of the translations, since this information is not systematically and didactically organised. The only exception was Germany, which had a volume published with all the references of Australian Literature translated into German, thus becoming a rich source of material for any researcher. AustLit, the main corpus of reference, has some failures (for instance, names of translators and years of publication were missing) which then prompted us to visit the National Libraries websites to confirm and/or look for that information. For example, the title *Los vivos y los muertos* appears with an unknown translator on AustLit. However, that datum is available at the website of the National Library of Spain. The translation of *Voss* into Brazilian Portuguese, for instance, did not appear on AustLit until recently. The problem with the famous and easily accessible Wikis is that in most of the entries the titles of the translations do not match the real translations, i.e., they feature many free translations, which end up complicating the researcher's activity.

Chapter 3 talks about the context for reading Patrick White both in his home country, Australia, and in the country which receives the translation (target country), Brazil. In the description of the Australian scenario, the crisis in the field of humanities is evoked, with emphasis on the particular situation of Australian Literature, which might explain Patrick

White's current neglect in his own country. In the Brazilian scenario, the two translations into Portuguese (both Portuguese and Brazilian varieties) are briefly analysed, signaling how White's oeuvre has been promoted so far to our reading audience. There is a brief item describing how Patrick White has been treated in the academy in Brazil. Furthemore, in this chapter, we introduce Itamar Even-Zohar's Polysystems Theory, analyzing its fundamental ideas and relating them to the Australian and Brazilian literary systems and what kind of reaction the new Spanish translation (and the Brazilian one, when published) might provoke in the literary systems involved.

Chapter 4 lays out the selected excerpts from the translation of *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese (and in French, German, Italian and the two versions in Spanish), featuring its socio-historical and cultural aspects which need to be duly dealt with by any translator. Amparo Hurtado Albir's model of competences is presented, and some excerpts from the novel appear to illustrate the strategies adopted by the translators when dealing with "history-specific items" (to evoke Javier Franco Aixelá's culture-specific items); starts the discussion about the importance of the cultural elements in the novel, and how they are responsible for the visibility of the translator. After Javier Franco Aixelá's theory is illustrated, there is a description of how the revision took place, with a reading more focused on the translated text, aiming at making it more adequate in terms of verbal tenses (which seemed one of the most difficult challenges in our workflow) and also of vocabulary and style. In this part, we observe how the translator, acting as three different entities (translator, proofreader and literary critic), works with the text and impose her/his accompanying readings. Finally, the conclusions drawn from this reflection are presented, together with the references used to substantiate this dissertation.

The objectives of this work, in addition to allying the practice of translation to the presence of literature in one's life and to making people in Brazil read Patrick White, are:

- 1) To make one more work by Patrick White available to the Brazilian audience, soon after the celebration of his centenary, which took place in 2012 and was marked by several events in Australia, considering that, among its many functions, translation revitalizes original works, as made evident by numerous examples. The novel chosen is *The Solid Mandala*, since its theme is not as tied to the eminently colonialist/geographic and historical aspects that are present in his only two novels translated into Portuguese from Portugal and Brazilian Portuguese so far: *The Tree of Man* and *Voss*.
- 2) To further the analysis of the Master's dissertation entitled 'You are what you read': intertextual relations in Patrick White's The Solid Mandala (STEFANI, 2011),

presented in March 2011, seeing how the intertextual references might influence (or not) the translation process. Concomitantly, the idea is to boost studies not only on Patrick White, but also on Australian Literature as a whole at UFRGS.

- 3) To continue the outstanding development of research on Translation Studies (Literary Translation) at UFRGS, inspired by recent works which ally both literature and translation, such as Larissa Rohde's "An annotated Translation of Narayan's Novel *The Guide*" (2011), in which the Indian author Narayan is introduced to our Brazilian literary system via translation; Guilherme Braga's Master's thesis entitled "O escaravelho de Poe e a teoria do escopo: Uma abordagem comunicativa para a tradução do criptograma em The Gold-Bug" (2012) about a new translation of the cryptogram found in Egdar Allan Poe's short story "The Gold-Bug" using Skopos Theory as the theoretical support, and his doctoral dissertation, entitled "Arthur Machen e O grande deus Pã: uma proposta funcionalista de tradução retrospectiva" (2016) and so many other academic works which have translation as their main topic of discussion.
- 4) To allow more readers/writers to discover and become interested in Patrick White's oeuvre assuming that translation enriches the target language (due to the work performed by the "artist of the words"), the translation of Patrick White is a way to enrich our Brazilian literary system. Thus, the theory envisaged by Itamar Even-Zohar will be beneficial in this part. It is important to mention that Brazilian [Portuguese] is one of the most spoken languages in the world, and this inevitably makes the task even more important, augmenting the translator's responsibility.
- 5) To address issues related to how the opposition between Britishness versus Australianness appears (and represents a challenge) in the story and how to emphasize this opposition in the translation.
- 6) To propose a way to maintain the creative work performed by Patrick White in the composition of the geographical names/references present in the story (for example, Barranugli, Sarsaparilla and Terminus Road). We believe some creative work must be carried out by the translator as well, so the options we came up with should render an interesting discussion in this work.
- 7) To follow what Andre Lefevere exposes in his paper *Mother Courage's Cucumbers: Text, System and Refraction in a Theory of Literature*, namely, to make literary texts accessible to the reader using a systems approach to literary studies, which does so by describing, analyzing, translating, doing historiography, and searching "to know the ways in which literature offers its knowledge, which is so important that it should be shared to the

greatest possible extent" (LEFEVERE, 2004, p. 254), therefore, being the *raison d'être* of this research.

#### 1.1 THE FRENCH TRANSLATION: LES MYSTÉRIEUX MANDALA

Before advancing towards the portrayal of Patrick White's situation in translation around the world, Gerard Genette's concept of "paratext" needs to be recalled: "the paratext is what enables a text to become a book and to be offered as such to its readers and, more generally, to the public" (GENETTE, 1997, p. 1). In effect, according to his view:

a literary work consists, entirely or essentially, of a text, defined (very minimally) as a more or less long sequence of verbal statements that are more or less endowed with significance. But this text is rarely presented in an unardoned state, reinforced and unaccompanied by a certain number of verbal or other productions, such as an author's name, a title, a preface, illustrations. And although we do not always know whether these productions are to be regarded as belonging to the text, in any case they surround it and extend it, precisely in order to *present* it, in the usual sense of this verb but also in the strongest sense: to *make present*, to ensure the text's presence in the world, its "reception" and consumption in the form (nowadays, at least) of a book. These accompanying productions, which vary in extent and appearance, constitute what I have called elsewhere the work's paratext [...] (GENETTE, 1997, p. 1).

Thus, the paratextual exercise performed with the translations of *The Solid Mandala* cited in this work is a valid exercise to receive and comprehend those translations more fully, while perceiving each publisher's editorial policy.

The French translation, by Andrée Picard, is a brand new edition (although it was published in 1973) and already signals in its red cover band surrounding the book that Patrick White is the 1973 Nobel Prize winner. On the cover there is, first, the title of the collection by Gallimard in capital letters (DU MONDE ENTIER), followed by the author's name. Below, in large red capital letters, the title and, below that, the information about the translator ("Novel translated from the English by Andrée Picard8"), together with an image of a black lined sphere. On the left flap, there is a picture of Patrick White and a brief text, summarizing his life and career, calling attention to four of his novels: *Happy Valley*, *The Living and the Dead*, *Voss* and *Riders in the Chariot* (*Le Char des Élus*, in French). On the other flap, the remaining titles of the collection, including authors such as Mario Vargas Llosa, John Updike and Yukio Mishima. On the back cover, there is a very good summary of the story, describing to the reader the opposition represented by the twin brothers:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> In the original: "Roman traduit de l'anglais par Andrée Picard".

Deux frères jumeaux unis par des liens qui semblent se situer au-delà de l'amour et de la haine: Waldo, hautain, dominateur, qui voudrait devenir écrivain, mais dont l'extrême lucidité et le manque de sensibilité limitent la vision de l'univers; Arthur, simple d'esprit, dote d'un grand pouvoir d'affection, et qui grâce à son étrange don de perception saisit les experiences humaines dans leur totalité<sup>9</sup>. Il triomphe là où son frère échoue, même dans l'amour de Dulcie Feinstein (WHITE, 1973b, back cover).

The epigraph at the beginning of the novel, comprised of four sentences, was entirely translated. As for footnotes, some of them accounted for the intricacies of the original which cannot be fully translated into French (for example, the pun with the surname Brown), although other occurrences, when not ignored, were not really connected to the challenging elements to be sorted out in the translation (irrefutably, many things that stood out during the translation activity in Brazilian Portuguese were not considered by the French work). As Patrick White usually inserts many words in French in his text, the Fracophone reader is often reminded via footnotes that the expression is already there in that language (as evinced in the letter excerpt presented earlier). In addition, some titles of books appear with the authorship indicated in footnotes, (and the pertinence of such an action might be questioned: does the reader really need to know the author of titles mentioned throughout the story?):

Exhibit 3 – French Translation Footnote Example

| English   | French   |
|---|--|
| If no comment was made by Dad, the reader in the        | Si Papa ne fit aucun commentaire, Papa, le grand lecteur                       |
| family, who sat there in painful attitudes, pushing his | de la famille, assis parmi eux dans une posture pénible,                       |
| bad leg in yet some other direction, re-reading         | changeant sans cesse de place sa jambe malade, relisant                        |
| Religion Medici, Sesame and Lilies, and then Essays     | Religio Medici <sup>1</sup> , Sésame et Lis <sup>2</sup> , puis les Essais sur |
| in the Study of Folk-Songs by the Countess              | l'étude des chansons populaires de la comtesse                                 |
| Martinengo-Cesaresco, which the other day he had        | Martinengo-Cesaresco, qu'il venait de dénicher                                 |
| picked up cheap [] (WHITE, 1973, p. 82)                 | quelques jours auparavant à bon compte []                                      |
|   |  |
|   | 1. De Sir Thomas Browne. ( <i>N.d.T.</i> )                                     |
|   | 2. De John Ruskin. ( <i>N.d.T.</i> ) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 95)                     |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> My translation: Waldo, haughty, dominant, who wants to become a writer, but whose extreme lucidity and lack of sensitivity limit his vision of the universe; Arthur, simple-minded, gifted with a great power of affection, and who, thanks to his unusual gift of perception, grasps human experiences in their totality (WHITE, 1973b, back cover).

Basically, this seems more like an edition for study, and not for mere entertainment. Futhermore, it is possible to say that this is a domesticating translation, as we can see in the following:

Exhibit 4 - Woolworths

| English                                      | French  |
|--|---|
| [] Take Woolworths. Though Arthur            | [] Prenez les magasins à prix uniques, par example.         |
| Brown loved Woolworths.                      | Cependant Arthur Brown adorait les Prisunic.                |
| "Can't we go into Woolies, Waldo?"           | "Ne pourrions-nous pas aller aux Prisunic, Waldo?           |
| "It isn't open yet."                         | – Ce n'est pas encore ouvert."                              |
| Arthur liked to spend mornings in Woolworths | Artrhur aimait passer ses matinées aux Prisunic en évaluant |
| costing the goods (WHITE, 1974, p. 55).      | le prix réel des merchandise (WHITE, 1973b, p. 64).         |

This is the only translation of those analyzed in which the supermarket name Woolworths, which is characteristic of Australia, was domesticated to Prisunic, which was a retail chain in France until 1931, thus erasing an element of local colour. Surely, this tendency to domesticate foreign elements of the text will be illustrated in other cases later in this dissertation.

As is customary in any translation, food and other elements of local colour deserved footnotes, but during the comparisons of our choices it will be possible to identify them and describe their usefulness (or not) to the Francophone reader, while observing the function of the strategies adopted by the translator.

## 1.2 THE ITALIAN TRANSLATION: MÀNDALA SOLIDO

Also published in 1973, this translation, authored by Andrea D'Anna, is not as informative as the French, judging from its scarce initial elements: we find only the name of the author and the title of the novel, no summaries, no images, no information about the author, no external references. Was that because of the fact that Patrick White was already a famous name in Italy to dismiss such content?

As for the footnotes and strategies used, apparently foreign words deserved some explanation, as seen in the German word present in the title of the last chapter:

Exhibit 5– Italian Translation Footnote Example

| English   | Italian  |
|---|--|
| 4 Mrs Poulter and the Zeitgeist (WHITE, 1974, p. 295) | 4. LA SIGNORA POULTER E LO ZEITGEIST <sup>1</sup>      |
|   | <sup>1</sup> Spirito del tempo. (WHITE, 1973c, p. 331) |

As for the epigraph at the beginning, all the sentences were translated into Italian. Throughout this dissertation, some neglected challenges in that version will be unveiled.

#### 1.3 THE FIRST SPANISH TRANSLATION: LAS ESFERAS DEL MANDALA

Also published in 1973, the Spanish translation was done by Silvia Pupato and Román García-Azcárate. Perhaps this is the most informative edition of the three. On the cover, there is the name of the author and the title in large capital letters. Below that, there is the indication of the publisher and an illustration featuring twins facing each other and about to embrace. Surrounding the illustration, the real images of glass marbles (6 in total: one is in the upper-left corner, 4 are around the twin's illustration, and the last one is close to the information which serves as a subtitle for the illustration: "1973 Nobel Prize of Literature"). On the back cover, eight glass marbles reappear, together with a repetition of the twin's illustration in a smaller scale (indicating, on the right, Julio Vivas as the author of the cover), and the summary of the story. Below that, there is the indication of the series to which the book belongs: Breve Biblioteca de Literaturas. In effect, the quality of the summary resembles the French:

Las esferas del mandala es la historia de dos mellizos, Arthur y Waldo Brown, y del oscuro pasado de la familia de que proceden y del mundo de frustración en que han transcurrido sus vidas. El pensamiento de Waldo y la narración de Arthur van repitiendo y perfilando los hechos de esas vidas contadas desde una ancianidad angustiosa y resentida. Waldo es un escritor frustrado, Arthur, un personaje en equilibrio entre la sana vulgaridad y la subnormalidad que juega a jalonar sus descubrimientos del mundo con la posesión de simbólicos mandalas, canicas, en realidad. El contraste continuo entre la visión del mundo de los dos mellizos y el conflicto elemental y terrible entre sus gemelares existencias está dado en un crescendo narrativo que va exigiendo progressivamente la participación del lector<sup>10</sup> que acabará siendo sin darse cuenta juez de los pleitos tan infinitamente pequeños como universales de la convivencia humana que el monólogo de los mellizos simboliza (WHITE, 1973a, back cover).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> My translation: The continuous contrast between the twins' worldview and the elementary and terrible conflict between their twin existences is shown in a narrative crescendo which progressively demands the reader's participation.

It is interesting to notice the emphasis on the participation of the reader to better understand all the conflicts described in the narrative, inviting the potential reader to take part in the story, to put herself/himself in the twin's shoes and unconsciously become the judge of their actions.

On the left flap there is a picture of Patrick White followed by biographical and bibliographical information (the translated titles already appear in their Spanish version, with the remaining ones which had not been translated in their original). On the other flap, the other titles of this and other collections, but in the same category as *Las Esferas del Mandala* there are Yukio Mishima, Elio Vittorini, Witold Gombrowicz, Alexandr Solzhenitsin, and others.

The epigraph of this edition was completely translated. As for footnotes, the edition follows what the others did: puns and foreign words deserved explanations. Let us see an example:

Exhibit 6 – Footnote (Christian Science)

| English   | Spanish 1   |
|---|---|
| But it was Mr Allwright who died,' Arthur           | - Pero fue Mr. Allwright el que se murió -                  |
| continued. 'Lacing up his boots. Mrs Allwright      | continuó Arthur –. Atándose las botas. Mrs.                 |
| took up Christian Science. She'd do anything not    | Allwright se convirtió a la Ciencia Cristiana. <sup>6</sup> |
| to wake up and find she was dead.'                  | Daría cualquier cosa por no despertarse y ver que           |
| 'You don't wake up,' Waldo reminded.                | está muerta.  |
| He wouldn't listen. Only it was not possible not to | <ul> <li>No se despiertan – objetó Waldo.</li> </ul>        |
| listen.   | Si fuera por él no prestaría atención. Pero era             |
| 'Eh?' asked Arthur.                                 | imposible no prestar atención.                              |
| Though of course he had heard. Arthur always did    | –¿Eh? – preguntó Arthur.                                    |
| hear, even with traffic whizzing or lurching along  | Aunque por supuesto había oído. Arthur siempre              |
| the Barranugli Road.                                | oía, incluso cuando el tráfico pasaba zumbando o            |
| 'Wonder if Mrs Allwright died. That's the worst of  | dando bandazos por Barranugli Road.                         |
| it when people leave the district. Sometimes their  | – ¿Habrá muerto Mrs. Allwright? Eso es lo malo              |
| relatives forget, or don't know how to put the      | de que la gente se vaya de aquí. A veces sus                |
| notice in the column. Or perhaps Mrs Allwright      | parientes olvidan, o no saben cómo poner el aviso           |
| didn't die. By rights, by logic – wouldn't you say? | en el periódico. O tal vez Mrs. Allwright no haya           |
| – Christian Scientists don't.'                      | muerto efectivamente. Por derecho, por lógica -             |
| 'Death, thank God' - Waldo caught himself,          | ¿no dirías tú eso? -, los científicos cristianos no         |
| 'comes to everyone.'                                | mueren.   |
| Or almost everyone (WHITE, 1974, p. 114-115).       | – La muerte, gracias a Dios – dijo Waldo,                   |
|   | conteniéndose –, le llega a todo el mundo.                  |
|   |   |

| 6. Christian Science: Credo de una secta moderna  |
|---|
| que combina la práctica de la religión con un     |
| procedimento mental para la curación de todas las |
| enfermedades. (N. del T.) (WHITE, 1973, p. 133-   |
| 134).   |
|   |

In this case, the footnote reflects the times in which the translation was being done: Franco's dictatorship in Spain upheld Catholicism as the rule, i.e., the only acceptable religious doctrine. Therefore, anything different from that, with the exception of the other traditional forms of religion (such as the Church of England – which did not receive any footnote in the translation) would have to be explained. The other translations did not have any footnote for Christian Science, thus, this already indicates a different reading (of course, in a different context). This strategy (and readings) will be fully detailed in this dissertation in the comparison of the translations (from now on, this version is going to be named "Spanish 1" in all exhibits).

## 1.4 THE GERMAN TRANSLATION: DIE UNGLEICHEN BRÜDER

Translated by Matthias Büttner (whose name appears on the title page) and published by Claassen in 1978 (today, the publishing house is part of Ullstein Verlag), its freely translated title would mean "the different brothers". Surprisingly, the German edition features one thing which calls the attention of any translator perusing its pages: it does not contain any footnotes (as exemplified earlier with the excerpt which had a footnote already in the original and which was not kept in the translation).

In a brief paratextual analysis of the edition, again the Nobel Prize is the eye-catching element. On the cover, the first element is the name Patrick White in large letters, followed by the title, entirely capitalized, with the expression that it was a novel published by Claassen, and then the famous sentence taken from the Swedish Academy's explanation for the prize: "Patrick White erhält den Nobelpreis für eine epische und psychologische Erzählkunst, durch die der Literature in neuer Erdteil zugeführt worden ist<sup>11</sup>" ("Patrick White has received the Nobel Prize for an epic and psychological narrative art which has introduced a new continent into literature"). On the back cover, there is a review from *The Spectator* (which is probably a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Containing the information: Aus der Begrünung zur Verleihung des Nobelpreises für Literatur 1973.

translation from the review written originally in English, back in the 1960s, when the book was released), but there are no dates or references to prove such information.

The left flap contains two paragraphs summarizing the story, stressing the character of "world literature", as in the following:

Waldo and Arthur Brown are unseparable. As old men, they sup, hand in hand, the end of the trajectory. Waldo is the intellectual of them, but his literary ambition is atrophied in the Public Library, his disillusion becomes in hatred of the world – and of his brother. Arthur, supposedly imbecile, contradicts Waldo's cold rectitude with the fool's disobedient ardour. He, who, to Waldo, comes up as a load and hassle for a successful life, is, in reality, the one who is able to live and protects his brother. While the world freezes under Waldo's outlook, it becomes vivid under Arthur's kind view. He is the one who can give love and, because of that, also receives love.

The touching description of the fate of this different brother is, at the same time, however, a study of the context of his life, of Suburbia, the modern suburb, whose dwellers share Waldo's coldness and complexity and in which the saint and foolish Arthur seems to be the only exception. Patrick White's novel about the complex and conflicting relationship between Waldo and Arthur is, because of its poetry and psychological profundity, an essential contribution to world's literature (WHITE, 1978, left flap)<sup>12</sup>.

Surely, the summary is quite precise and features what the reader is really going to find: a psychological, actionless novel, but with two opposite world views which take place in a modern suburb in a different (and new, in this context) country: Australia. In truth, there is no reference to White's specific surroundings in the text of the cover, which is a pity, as they might guide the perception of the relationship of the twin brothers. The other flap contains the repetition of the excerpt from the Nobel Prize speech on the cover, followed by a black and white picture of Patrick White. After that, some biographical information (when and where he was born), together with the indication that two other titles, published earlier (1972 and 1974, respectively), were available from Claassen: *Der Mahler (The Vivisector)*, and *Im Auge des Sturms (The Eye of the Storm)*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> In the original, in German: Waldo und Arthur Brown sind unzertrennlich. Als alte Männer schlurfen sie Hand in Hand die Terminus Road hinunter. Waldo ist der intellektuelle von beiden, aber sein literarischer Ehrgeiz verkümmert in der Leihbücherei, seine Enttäuschung verwandelt sich in Haß auf die Welt – und auf seinen Bruder. Arthur, angeblich schwachsinnig, setzt Waldos kalter Korrektheit die hartnäckige Wärme des Einfältigen entgegen. Er, der Waldo als Bürde und Hindernis zu einem erfolgreichen Leben erscheint, ist in Wirklichkeit der lebensfähige, der seinen Bruder beschützt. In gleichem Maße, wie unter Waldos kalten Blick die Welt erstarrt, wird sie in Arthurs liebevoller Sicht lebendig. Er ist es, der Liebe geben kann, und daher auch Liebe empfängt. Der bewegende Bericht vom Schicksal dieser ungleichen Brüder ist zugleich aber auch eine Studie ihres Lebenshintergrundes, der Suburbia, der modernen Vorstadt, deren Bewohner Waldos Kälte und Verklemmung teilen und in der her heilige Narr Arthur als die einzige Ausnahme zu sein scheint. Patrick Whites Roman über die kompliziert-widersprüchliche Beziehung szwichen Waldo und Arthur ist aufgrund seiner Poetik und psychologischen Tiefe ein wesentligher Beitrag zur Weltliteratur (WHITE, 1978, left flap). Many thanks go to my big friend and colleague, the Brazilian translator Adriana A. Sühnel dos Santos, who has helped in the translation of these sentences into Brazilian Portuguese and then into English.

Inside the entire flap, there is a list of titles, with the following subdivisions: Literarische Kostbarkeiten (which would mean "literary treasures"), Große Biographien ("important people's biographies"), Zeitgenössische Literatur ("contemporary literature) – and on this section Iris Murdoch's *The Flight of the Enchanter (Uhrwerk der Liebe*) is included –, and Moderne Weltliteratur (modern world literature), which is the section featuring Patrick White's titles, along with the Peruvian Mario Vargas Llosa, and the Chileans Jose Donoso and Pablo Neruda, among others. Accompanying the titles, there is a brief summary, or a review by important newspapers, such as *Die Zeit, Frankfurter Neue Presse*, *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung* (FAZ), *Passauer Neue Presse*, *Rheinische Post* and *Rhein-Zeitung*. The four sentences which comprise the epigraph of the book were all translated.

#### 1.5 THE BRAND NEW SPANISH TRANSLATION: LAS ESFERAS DEL MANDALA

Part of J.M. Coetzee's Biblioteca Personal published by El Hilo de Ariadna, the book was launched in April 2016, and was on sale in bookshops and at Fería del Libro de Buenos Aires (from 21 April to 02 May 2016, taking the opportunity that Coetzee was in the city for his Chair at the University of San Martín). No ceremonies were organized to mark such a specific occasion, perhaps because Coetzee was promoting the first volume of his book of essays, entitled *Las Manos De Los Maestros I*, also by El Hilo de Ariadna (there is already a version of that book in Spanish of Spain, but, according to Coetzee, these are independent translations, and, therefore, two publishers are responsible for the task: El Hilo de Ariadna in Argentina and Mondadori in Spain<sup>13</sup>).

In a brief paratextual analysis of the brand new edition of *Las Esferas del Mandala*, the first thing which impresses the reader is the quality of the material used to build the book: hardcover, with the font in a quite readable size printed on a good quality paper, which could prompt us to say that it is an edition for collectors. The cover features an 1875 painting by Frederic Edwin Church entitled *Autumn*. The backcover highligths the fact that White is a Nobel Prize winner and cites one paragraph of the Swedish Academy justification for his 1973 Nobel nomination. After that, there is a paragraph extracted from the introductory note by J. M. Coetzee, saying, among other things, that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> For more information, see the complete interview by Coetzee to Perfil during his stay in Buenos Aires on: TORIZ, Rafael. Un escritor secular de la mano de los maestros. **Perfil**, Buenos Aires, 17 Apr. 2016. Available at:http://www.perfil.com/cultura/un-escritor-secular-de-la-mano-de-los-maestros-0416-0059.phtml. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

Patrick White was a critic of Australian society and, for sure, satirized many of its aspects, particularly its hostility to intellectual life... A large part of his oeuvre, including *The Solid Mandala*, is about making the shadows on and inside Australia visible. Read that way, as a corrective of the Australian joy, *The Solid Mandala* is, undoubtedly, a very dark novel...<sup>14</sup>" (WHITE, 2016, backcover, my translation).

The first pages of the Argentinian edition feature a whole-page picture of Patrick White (on the left page) and his summarized biography on the opposite page. The same happens with Coetzee: a whole-page picture of him followed by his summarized biography on the opposite page. After that, the introductory note we will propose for an eventual Brazilian edition of *The Solid Mandala* is present in this one: composed of 14 pages and translated by Cristina Piña, it explains not only Coetzee's choice, but also the importance of Patrick White as a writer, contextualizing the novel and its author. However, all titles by White were freely translated in the text, which repeats the procedure adopted by the previous Spanish edition and the Brazilian translation of *Voss*, which in fact might mislead the reader when looking for information about actual translated titles of Patrick White.

Importantly, this is the only edition in which we find the name of a proofreader (in this case, Mónica Herrero, responsible for the "corrección", i.e., the final reading of the book). The translator gains a voice, soon after the introductory text, with a note by Elena Marengo explaining her guiding rules:

This translation was done from the edition of The Viking Press (New York, 1966). I have tried to resist the temptation of clarifying the cryptic prose of Patrick White. The criterium which guided me was not to "naturalize" the translation to Spanish to accept its reading. Except in the few cases in which my version went beyond the limits of the intelligible, I have wanted to respect rigorously the style of the author: his particular paragraph division, the almost absolute predominance of parataxis, his peculiar punctuation, lexical artefacts. Above all, I have tried to keep the constant ellipses without bridging their gaps (WHITE, 2016, p. 31, my translation)<sup>15</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> In the original, in Spanish: "Patrick White era crítico de la sociedad Australiana y, por cierto, satirizada muchos aspectos de ella, en particular su hostilidad a la vida intelectual... Gran parte de su obra, incluída *Las Esferas del Mandala*, se ocupa de hacer visibles las sombras que hay sobre y dentro de Australia. Leído de este modo, como un correctivo de la alegría australiana, *Las esferas del mandala* es, sin duda, un libro muy oscuro..." (WHITE, 2016, backcover).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> In the original, in Spanish: "Esta traducción se realizó a partir de la edición de The Viking Press (Nueva York, 1966). He tratado de resistir la tentación de clarificar la críptica prosa de Patrick White. El criterio que me guio fue no "naturalizar" la traducción al castellano para aceitar su lectura. Salvo en los contados casos en que mi versión transponía el límite de lo inteligible, he procurado respetar rigorosamente el estilo del autor: su particular división en párrafos, el predominio casi absoluto de la parataxis, la peculiar puntuación, los artefactos léxicos. Sobre todo, he tratado de mantener las constantes elipsis sin tender un puente sobre ellas. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 31).

It is a big evolution to see the translator's voice explaining her choices. In a way, this might account for the fact that this is the only edition in which the four sentences of the epigraph remained in English, that is, the ellipsis of those four sentences in English would remain.

This new edition has 27 footnotes, and most of them explain the source of the many intertextual references which appear in the novel. For example:

Exhibit 7- Footnote Example (Argentinian Edition)

| English   | Spanish 2   |
|---|---|
| "Oh," she said, "I like to read. I've just finished | - ¡Oh! - dijo ella Me gusta leer. Acabo de                      |
| The Mill on the Floss."                             | terminar El molino sobre el Floss <sup>10</sup> .               |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 93).                               |   |
|   | <sup>10</sup> The Mill on the Floss, de George Eliot. [N. de la |
|   | T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 160).                                      |

Another aspect of the footnotes is that the translator uses it as a space to talk to the reader, explaining, for instance, that she did not work alone: in truth, J. M. Coetzee helped her in the role of a technical revisor, as in the following:

Exhibit 8 - Footnote with Coetzee's help

| English   | Spanish 2   |
|---|---|
| Mrs Feinstein, who had behaved so piano since her | Mrs. Feinstein, que había mantenido un tono <i>piano</i>  |
| welcome, with hands in the sleeves of a coat she  | desde que los recibió, com las manos metidas en           |
| was wearing although it wasn't cold, began to     | las mangas de un saco que llevaba puesto aunque           |
| shriek with laughter.                             | no hacía frío, comenzó a reírse histéricamente.           |
| "I am the bottom of the bottom,"                  | Ahora soy el Fondo de los fondos, cantaba Arthur.         |
| Arthur sang,                                      | Pero no pensaré   |
| "But shall not dwell                              | en esa hondura.   |
| On which well.                                    | Podría ver mi rostro                                      |
| Might see my face                                 | ¡en el traseeero! <sup>15</sup>                           |
| At the bott-urrhm!"                               |   |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 134).                            | <sup>15</sup> Juegos de palabras. Arthur representa uno o |
|   | varios personajes y dice "I am the bottom of the          |
|   | bottom" [soy el fondo del fondo], pero la palabra         |
|   | bottom también significa "trasero". Por otra parte,       |
|   | en una escena del Sueño de una noche de verano,           |
|   | de Shakespeare, el tejedor Bottom también                 |
|   | representa a vários personajes y los espectadores         |
|   | tienen que adivinhar quién es cada uno de ellos.          |

| Debo a J. M. Coetzee haberme señalado esta        |
|---|
| última asociación. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. |
| 220).   |

In our translation, this reference to Shakespeare in this specific part had not been recognized, as our immediate concern was in terms of how to maintain the rhymes and rhythm of Arthur's song, rather than searching (and then accounting) for this intertextual reference to the reader. Again, this all depends on the reader profile indicated by a publisher, or the one we have in mind, while working with a translation. This makes us recall what the Brazilian scholar Solange Mittmann claims about the "virtual reader<sup>16</sup>":

When the reader reads the text, s/he finds there a virtual reader, imagined by the author, and can identify more or less with the position of such virtual reader. As a result, her/his reading will be closer or farther from the reader envisioned by the author<sup>17</sup> (MITTMANN, 2003, p. 95, my translation).

Thus, the reader of the translation "will not be carrying out a decoding, or a rescue of a message put there by the author through the translator's words, but will also be producing meanings<sup>18</sup>" (Ibidem, p. 57, my translation). In this case, two readings are at play (the translator's – which, like ours, had not identified the reference – and Coetzee's), and many more will appear to pinpoint additional references and/or even to oppose this one. All this discussion took place in a special territory: the translator's footnote.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Concept developed by the Brazilan scholar Eni Orlandi in *Discurso e Leitura* (Campinas: Unicamp, 1993, p. 9): "a reader which is constituted in the very act of writing", which can be viewed either as an "accomplice" or an "opponent".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> In the original, in Brazilian Portuguese: "[...] não estará efetuando uma decodificação, ou um regsate de uma mensagem ali posta pelo autor com as palavras do tradutor, mas estará também produzindo sentidos (MITTMANN, 2003, p. 57).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> In the original, in Brazilian Portuguese: "[...] quando o leitor lê o texto, ele encontra ali um leitor virtual, imaginado pelo autor, e pode identificar-se mais ou menos com a posição desse leitor virtual. Como resultado, sua leitura será mais ou menos aproximada da leitura prevista pelo autor (MITTMANN, 2003, p. 95).

#### 2 PATRICK WHITE AND TRANSLATION: AN UNDENIABLE CONNECTION

The invisible hand of the cultural marketplace will always ensure that literary value will be perpetuated equitably across language barriers (ALLEN, 2000, p. 82).

We start this chapter by introducing the concept of "reception", which is what we are going to outline in the following lines connected to Patrick White's oeuvre. Hans Robert Jauß and Wolfgang Iser are the main names immediately associated with Reception Theory, which has, as its fundamental idea, the virtually tautological fact that any work of art is the object of some kind of reception. Jauß revolutionized literary studies by adopting the reader's perspective, i.e., it is the reader who is responsible for guaranteeing the historicity of a literary work (which, by its turn, is always being updated), as well as the continuity of the literary process. Jauß also introduced the idea of "horizons of expectation" (Erwartungshorizont): a shared set of assumptions and criteria used by generations of readers to judge literary texts in any given period. Because times, meanings and values change, the horizons of expectation of each generation will change as well, since "a literary work is not an object which stands by itself and which offers the same face to each reader in each period. It is not a monument which reveals its timeless essence in a monologue" (JAUB, 1970, p. 5). The concept of "aesthetic distance" devised by Jauß measures literary value in terms of the degree to which a work deviates from the horizon of expectaction of its first readers: the greater the aesthetic distance, the higher the literary value. To illustrate this, following what Regina Zilbermann posits in her paper Recepção e Leitura no Horizonte da Literatura<sup>19</sup> (Reception and Reading in the Horizon of Literature), it is possible to think of the interval often necessary for a work of art to be fully accepted by readers in a given society, i.e., an interval between, on the one hand, what writers were doing and their contemporaries were thinking, and, on the other, their own oeuvre. An emancipatory work depicts reality as it is known by its readers, with its values and prejudices, so that readers can realize that it should not be like that:

The experience of reading can liberate one from adaptations, prejudices, and predicaments of a lived praxis in that it compels one to a new perception of things. The horizon of expectations of historical lived praxis in that it not only preserves actual experiences, but also anticipates unrealized possibility, broadens the limited

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> ZILBERMAN, Regina. Recepção e leitura no horizonte da literatura. In: *Alea: Estudos Neolations* [online]. Jan./Jun.2008, vol.10, n.1, pp.85-97. Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S1517-106X2008000100006. Accessed on: 20 May 2016.

space of social behavior for new desires, claims, and goals, and thereby opens paths of future experience (JAUß, 1982, p. 41).

Therefore, Patrick White's oeuvre has challenged (and certainly will go on challenging) the horizon of expectations of many readers not only in Australia, but all over the world. Following what our colleague, the Brazilian translator Fabiano B. Gonçalves mentions in his work, given only a small share of the population is proficient enough in any foreign language to read a literary work in the original, translation "usually" (GONÇALVES, 2006, p. 82) becomes the only way by which people can become familiar with foreign literary works. Thus, the importance attached to the translation process connected to reception.

White was born in London in 1912, and returned to Australia with his parents when he was 6 months old. His education was predominantly English: when he was 12 yeals old, he was sent to a boarding school in England. After completing his studies (and then a 17-year-old youth who detested himself), he returned to Australia, where he would work as a jackeroo<sup>20</sup>, which would not prevent him from practicing his passion in his spare time: writing. His parents thought he might start a diplomatic career, thus, Australia would not be good enough to provide him with the necessary education. Therefore, he was sent again to England, this time to study at the University of Cambridge. At this moment, we can see that White's decision to study German instead of History might signal a certain foreignness which, in turn, might indicate his potential interest or connection with the theme of translation. After finishing his academic studies, he was determined to become a writer and decided to reside in London. After spending several years of his life in the city, his heart longed for the landscape he admired (and described) in his novels: "Sydney is what I have in my blood" (MARR, 1995, p. 423), and then returned, where he passed away in September 1990.

The publishing house Vintage in Australia qualifies White using the following terms, accentuating his talent as a writer:

The great poet of Australian landscape, he has turned its vast empty spaces into great mythic landscapes of the soul. His position as man of letters was controversial, provoked by his acerbic, unpredictable public statements and his belief that it is eccentric individuals who offer the only hope of salvation. Technically brilliant, he is one modern novelist to whom the oft-abused epithet 'visionary' can safely be applied (WHITE, 2008, p. 1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> According to the definition provided by the Australian Dictonary Macquarie, jackaroo is "a young man working on a sheep or cattle station, to gain practical experience in the skills needed to become an owner, overseer, manager, etc." Available at: https://www.macquairedictionary.com.au/resources/help/29/. Accessed on: 30 Jul. 2016.

Thus, in this work we first present an overview of Patrick White's connection to translation, starting with the languages he took up at an academic level, moving on to other languages and/or countries (it should be highlighted here that sometimes it it easier to think in terms of countries, and not in terms of language, thus explaining the title of the sub-items), then following a chronological perspective. Hence, the order is: French (1951) and German (1957) – because of his proficiency –, Italian (1951, perhaps the language into which the greatest number of his novels have been translated), Spanish of Spain (1962 – indeed, the translations into that language were commissioned and launched first there and later reached other Spanish-speaking countries), Swedish (1964), Portuguese of Portugal (1973), Serbo-Croatian (1974 – an interesting project is underway involving the translation of Australian Literature), Greek (1980s – because of the importance of Greece to his partner, Manoly Lascaris – although his birthplace is actually Egypt), and Mandarin (and how White's oeuvre reached the most populous country in the world). To conclude the first part, we depict the reality of Patrick White in translation in Brazil (proposing a discussion about why his work is not more discussed and read nowadays) and in Uruguay and Argentina.

The Solid Mandala was translated into other languages, in addition to the ones chosen to be discussed in this dissertation<sup>21</sup>:

| Translation (Year) | Translation (Title)    | Translator(s)     | Language  |
|--------------------|------------------------|-------------------|-----------|
| 1968               | Wezel, przelozyla      | Maria Skibniewska | Polish    |
| 1970               | Den uknuselige mandala | Aksel Bull Nja    | Norwegian |
| 1974               | Bila vrajita           | Anda Teodorescu   | Romanian  |
| 1987               | Gulat há-mandalah      | G. Aryokh         | Hebrew    |

Exhibit 9 – Translations of *The Solid Mandala* 

The utmost objective is to add A sólida mandala to this list as soon as possible.

#### 2.1 PATRICK WHITE IN FRENCH (1951)

Talking about Patrick White and his connection with translation encourages us to think of how impressive it is for translation researchers to immerse themselves in first translating, and then studying, the whole process to gain insights not only about one's own practice, but also

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA – SEARCH FOR THE SOLID MANDALA. Available at: http://catalogue.nla.gov.au/Search/Home?lookfor[]=the+solid+mandala&combinator[]=and&type[]=all&bool[]= AND&lookfor[]=&combinator[]=or&type[]=all&bool[]=AND&lookfor[]=&combinator[]=or&type[]=all&limit[]=&thelanguage=&lower=YYYY&upper=YYYY&submit=Find. Accessed on: 30 Apr. 2015.

about interpretive issues that inevitably come up concerning White's oeuvre. Initially, he was inclined to study History at university, but he finally made up his mind for the study of two languages: French and German. In relations to the former, a little of his early experience with the language is told in his autobiography *Flaws in the Glass*:

Before leaving Cheltenham I enjoyed a brief flirtation with France and the French language when I was boarded with a family at Dieppe during the summer holidays. [...] In addition to this I started reading *Madame Bovary* while stretched out on an uncharitable *plage*. My inadequate French and the pebbles under my vertebrae made it torture. [...] It was all very stimulating and at the same time frustrating, not to be able to unlock a language with so many treasures behind its bars (WHITE, 1983, p. 36-37).

The context of the quotation is the year 1929, when Patrick White was spending some time in Dieppe, to learn French. For a 17-year old boy having fun and discovering the pleasures of life, this insight in relation to his own appreciation of foreign literature was positive, and appears later in his admiration and concern for the work of translators dealing with his own oeuvre (perhaps something that might never have crossed his mind at the time he was striving to read *Madame Bovary* in the original). This proves Patrick White's recognition of how special (and rather difficult) it is to start studying foreign languages (and in turn their literatures), and translating them too. This background is seen in his oeuvre and is a necessary aspect of our work as translators, so we can better appreciate the text and consequently render a final translation which seeks to keep the same tones and nuances presented in the original. Awareness of Patrick White's initial translating background already signals that we are far from wasting our time when doing a thorough research on the translation into Brazilian Portuguese of one more novel: *The Solid Mandala*:

Dealing with translators was always a happy chore, for White wondered darkly what 'dreadful mistakes' were being made when translators did not bother to ask him questions. His precise, patient explanations are little manuals of Australian life and language (MARR, 1995, p. 518).

These facts, albeit mundane to many, provide the translator who chooses to deal with his novels – considered difficult even for readers whose native language is English – with enthusiasm to go on thinking and writing about the translation process and pursuing the completion of this rather daunting task, even when things do not seem to go very smoothly along the way.

There is a compelling reason to justify the title of this chapter. Patrick White made the decision to stop writing around 1949, when he felt that what he was composing did not attract

people, adding to his disillusion with the reception of his art (most precisely, *The Aunt's Story*) in his own country (deserving "four bleak paragraphs in the bottom corner of the *Sydney Morning Herald*'s literary page<sup>22</sup>") which, in his view, was populated with "philistines", i.e., the form he used to address the ones who dictated what was to be read/acclaimed or not in Australia (STEFANI, 2011, p. 39). In his correspondence with his publisher in the United States, Ben Huebsch, he said he was aware that *Happy Valley* and *The Aunt's Story* were going to be published in French (although the information he had was not very detailed). Meanwhile, he was anxious to get information on the English edition of *The Aunt's Story*. The news was not very good, however, as the reviews in London were "respectful but for the most part unenthusiastic<sup>23</sup>". Precisely, using David Marr's words once again, this whole set of rejections left a "deep fissure of bitterness that ran to the core of his character<sup>24</sup>." Notwithstanding, the power and influence of translation in his career was strong enough to make him change his mind and thus needs to be emphasized:

Most of the time White was depressed by the suspicion that no one could be interested in what he was writing. But after six months he confessed to Peggy Garland: 'I am lifted up at times to considerable heights, and that may be a sign. If it is another failure, I suppose the writing alone will have done something to one.' Encouragement came, once again, from Paris. Gallimard sent him an early copy of *Eden-ville*, the first of his works to be translated, and he thought it 'very well done'. An Italian translation was due to arrive at Dogwoods at any moment though he worried how it had turned out, for the publishers, Bompiani, had 'rushed it out without a single query on the part of the translator'. Marie Viton was by this time at work on *The Aunt's Story* and as White struggled with *The Tree of Man* it was reassuring and stimulating to have her letters pestering him with questions about the text of his favourite novel, the neglected child to whom he then felt so close (MARR, 1995, p. 286).

The point to be praised here is the fact that the enthusiasm shown by the French translator, Marie Viton, Madame d'Estournelles, somehow saved Patrick White's self-esteem and confidence in his own potential. In White's case, having heard vaguely that the novels were going to be published in French was not enough: he needed to receive the letters (the empirical evidence) from the translator asking him questions and showing a genuine interest in his novels to re-ignite that flow of writing which was to last until his death, in 1990. In addition, the translator's enthusiasm was so paramount that Gallimard bought the rights to all of White's novels then published (namely, *Happy Valley, The Living and the Dead* and *The Aunt's Story*). Again, from David Marr's account:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> MARR, David. **Patrick White: a Life.** Sydney: Vintage, 1995. p. 258.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ibidem.

Viton wrote 'long, interrogatory and autobiographical letters' and was inclined to sulk if White did not dash off immediate replies. [...] She was also battling tuberculosis that soon killed her. Viton's letters to White began in the winter of 1949 when he felt 'there was not much point in my continuing to write. Nobody read what I had to say. I was also up to my ears in the place at Castle Hill. However, d'Estournelles continued to pester me by correspondence.' He later claimed it was her efforts as much as anything else that decided him to embark on a novel (MARR, 1995, p. 274).

The final result was that *Éden-Ville* (the title chosen in French for *Happy Valley*) was finally published in 1951. Marie Viton died in 1954 in a sanatorium, and her work with *The Aunt's Story* was never to appear.

In 2014, the most recent document published about Patrick White, the unfinished novel *The Hanging Garden* (which represented a huge effort in terms of archive and decodification of White's handwriting), deserved attention and, of course, a translation was launched by Gallimard (*Le jardin suspendu*, translated by Françoise Pertat). In a recent survey on Amazon.fr (which is perhaps the biggest source of books online), we observe that many titles received new editions (*Éden-Ville* is one of them, whose publication date is 2014; *The Solid Mandala* is not in that category yet). The following table shows some of the books available in French<sup>25</sup> (keeping the year of the original and of the translation, so it is possible to calculate how long it took for the translation to appear to the general audience).

Exhibit 10 – French Translations

| Translation<br>(Year) | Translation (Title)      | Translator(s)        | Original<br>(Year) | Original<br>(Title)      |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|
| 1951; 2014            | Eden-ville               | Marie Viton          | 1939               | Happy Valley             |
| 1990                  | Des morts et des vivants | Jean Lambert         | 1941               | The Living and the Dead  |
| 1967                  | Voss                     | Jean Lambert         | 1957               | Voss                     |
| 1965                  | Le char des élus         | Suzanne<br>Nétillard | 1961               | Riders in the<br>Chariot |
| 1969                  | Les échaudés             | Collective           | 1964               | The Burnt<br>Ones        |
| 1970                  | Les mystérieux mandala   | Andrée R.<br>Picard  | 1966               | The Solid<br>Mandala     |
| 1979                  | Le vivisecteur           | Georges<br>Magnane   | 1970               | The Vivisector           |
| 1978                  | L'oeil du cyclone        | Suzanne              | 1973               | The Eye of the           |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> It has been done a compilation of data coming from Wikipédia in French (http://fr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White) and Amazon.fr (https://www.amazon.fr). Accessed on: 12 Feb. 2014.

|            |                          | Nétillard    |      | Storm        |
|------------|--------------------------|--------------|------|--------------|
| 1981, 2013 | Une ceinture de feuilles | Jean Lambert | 1976 | A Fringe of  |
|            |                          |              |      | Leaves       |
| 1983       | Les incarnations d'Eddie | Jean Lambert | 1979 | The Twyborn  |
|            | Twyborn                  |              |      | Affair       |
| 1985       | Défauts dans le miroir:  | Eola Tranec  | 1981 | Flaws in the |
|            | Un autoportrait          |              |      | Glass        |
| 1988       | Mémoirs éclatés d'Alex   | Jean Lambert | 1986 | Memoirs of   |
|            | Xenophon Demirjian Gray  |              |      | Many in One  |
| 1994       | Histoires peu ordinaires | Jacqueline   | 1987 | Three Uneasy |
|            |                          | Délia        |      | Pieces       |
| 2015       | Le jardin suspend        | Françoise    | 2012 | The Hanging  |
|            |                          | Pertat       |      | Garden       |

# 2.2 PATRICK WHITE IN GERMAN (1957)

Patrick White's concern with the task of his translators has already been mentioned, with the focus on one of the languages he dominated and read/understood with ease, French. Now, we shall move on to his impressions on the German translations of his novels. We can anticipate that his relationship with the German translators was quite different from the one he had with Marie Viton, and perhaps this reflects his residual scorn for the big names of German literature (he constantly complained about Goethe<sup>26</sup> and other German authors – even in *The Solid Mandala* there are excerpts as evidence of that) and again his recognition of the idiosyncrasies of the language.

Patrick White did not have German as a priority. Once again, according to his autobiography *Flaws in the Glass*:

Germany came later. I only decided for the German language the day I arrived at my Cambridge college. I had passed the entrance exam on History, then felt as the time approached I could not face writing yet another History essay and condemnation of my fanciful style. I was confident I could rustle up enough French for the tripos. But German? From my smattering of rudimentary school German I had to advance to honours standards (WHITE, 1983, p. 38).

After that, his experience in Germany helped him dive into German Literature, because, among other reasons, "I had to catch up on a language which, until I visited the country, I could never take seriously: comic, hedgehog words constantly colliding, syntactical structures to get lost in" (WHITE, 1983, p. 39). According to his words, he became aware of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> [...]"and in spite of my lack of sympathy with Weimar's two great poets, one a manufactory of German platitudes, the other a genius who founders in his hypocrisy and pretensions as a human being. For me Tolstoy is the only literary genius who survives his own hypocrisy. Not Goethe" (WHITE, 1983, p. 40).

the political events taking place in Germany at the time only when his "nose was rubbed in it" (WHITE, 1983, p. 39).

Using David Marr's words, Patrick White was not satisfied, for example, with the title chosen in German for *The Tree of Man*: *Zur Ruhe kam der Baum des Menschen nie* (the tree of man never came to rest). Essentially, there is a kind of confession in the biography, because the translator was the famous German novelist Heinrich Böll:

Though White read and spoke German with ease, his literary German was not up to the task of answering Böll's queries, so he turned to Ile Krieger for help. Part, at least, of the translation arrived at Dogwoods in midwinter, but White suspected it came too late for his corrections to be incorporated. He found a number of mistakes, such as "Goldgräbber" for 'digger', i.e. soldier. Böll's letters struck him as arrogant (MARR, 1995, p. 323).

It would not come as a surprise if Patrick White actually raged at his translator publicly, by declaring that he was "an insufferable kind of German. I think he is really trying to work it so that his translation will appear without my having looked at it" (MARR, 1995, p. 324). As can be inferred from White's precise impression, the translated material was eventually published without his seeing it. According to Ile Krieger, despite occasional problems<sup>27</sup> related to "Australian details, it seemed to be excellent<sup>28</sup>". In a letter to his publisher in the United States, Patrick White exuded his rage again: "I shall always remember him as an intolerable person and arrogant German, and if K. & W. [Kiepenheuer & Witsch] want to do *Voss*, they will have to find another translator<sup>29</sup>".

Critiques and rancour aside, in terms of literary record, a fantastic initiative in Translation Studies must be presented in a dissertation analysing Patrick White in translation: taken up by two professors in Germany – the Australian expatriate Russell West-Pavlov<sup>30</sup> and the German Jens Elze-Vollard, both working at the Free University of Berlin – the project entitled Translation History as a Provocation for Literary Studies has resulted in the *Australian Literature in German Translation: A Catalogue of Titles, Translators and, Trends* – 1789-2010<sup>31</sup>, the compilation of the first complete catalogue of German translation of Australian Literature which, according to them, has "the potential to revolutionize literary

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Actually, the word that appears is "mistakes". Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> He was born in Melbourne, and decided to do his doctorates at Lille and Cambridge, and post-doctorate in Cologne.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Available at: http://www.geisteswissenschaften.fu-berlin.de/we06/forschung/forschungsprojekte/2010-03-10\_Translation\_catalogue.pdf

studies by levering the study of literary history out of its customary national framework<sup>32</sup>". A welcoming surprise, it intends "to rectify the astounding lack of information about the translation of Australian Literature in Europe<sup>33</sup>", thus assuming

a new transnational paradigm of Australian literary space so as to comprehensively map patterns and trends in the translation of Australian Literature [...] to provide a, in the long run, a knowledge base upon which authors, translators, literary agents, publishers and cultural institutions can draw in order to participate in the pan-European project of translating Australian Literature in better informed and more coherently oriented ways<sup>34</sup>.

After this summary, and as part of the description of the data gathered, the professors make some considerations about Patrick White, the focus of this dissertation:

High-brow authors are led, hardly surprisingly, by the 1973 and 2003 Nobel Prize winners Patrick White and J. M. Coetzee. [...] Coetzee tops the list with 38 translations, followed by Patrick White with 35 translations. Interestingly, White's popularity in Germany did not simply come with the Nobel, as he was already substantially translated (7 translations) from the 1950s onwards (among others by another future Nobel laureate, Heinrich Böll)<sup>35</sup>.

This might explain the importance of such studies for translators, helping evince the reception of an author in a specific time. Moreover, these studies help see how the re-editions of many works attest the permanence of certain authors in the preference of a given audience (in this case, the German readers):

The more persistent classics of the popular variety (Morris West, McCullogh) join the middle- and high-brow authors like Patrick White, Coetzee, Tim Winton, Thomas Keneally to constitute the more resilient branch of Australian literature translated into German. Texts from this branch remain reprinted and reedited long after their original publications – if sometimes sporadically (as is the case with Patrick White). Most of the less successful popular texts remain confined to one or two printings and then vanish into what a projected *long durée* analysis of translation of Australian Literature into German<sup>36</sup>.

From this information, we see in the catalogue that the last translation of Patrick White was *The Tree of Man*, published in 1998. Some of Patrick White novels published in German

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Ibidem.

according to the catalogue are shown in the following table (only the years of the first and of the most recent translations – in the case of re-editions – are presented)<sup>37</sup>.

Exhibit 11 – German Translations

| Translation | Translation (Title)       | Translator(s)    | Original | Original      |
|-------------|---------------------------|------------------|----------|---------------|
| (Year)      | i i                       | . ,              | (Year)   | (Title)       |
| 1957, 1998  | Zur Ruhe kam der Baum des | Annemarie and    | 1955     | The Tree of   |
|             | Menschen nie              | Heinrich Böll    |          | Man           |
| 1958        | Voss                      | John Stickforth  | 1957     | Voss          |
| 1969        | Die im feurigen Wagen     | Curt and Maria   | 1961     | Riders in the |
|             |                           | Prerauer         |          | Chariot       |
| 1992        | Die Verbrannten           | Reinhard Kaiser  | 1964     | The Burnt     |
|             |                           |                  |          | Ones          |
| 1978        | Die ungleichen Brüder     | Matthias Büttner | 1966     | The Solid     |
|             |                           |                  |          | Mandala       |
| 1972        | Der Maler                 | Wilhelm Borgers  | 1970     | The           |
|             |                           | and Erwin Bootz  |          | Vivisector    |
| 1974        | Im Auge des Sturms        | Erika Gebühr and | 1973     | The Eye of    |
|             |                           | Ulrich K.        |          | the Storm     |
|             |                           | Dreikandt        |          |               |
| 1982        | Der Lendenschurz          | Kurt Heinrich    | 1976     | A Fringe of   |
|             |                           | Hansen           |          | Leaves        |
| 1986        | Die Twyborn-Affäre        | Kurt Heinrich    | 1980     | The           |
|             |                           | Hansen           |          | Twyborn       |
|             |                           |                  |          | Affair        |
| 1994        | Risse im Spiegel: Ein     | Reinhard Kaiser  | 1981     | Flaws in the  |
|             | Selbstportrat             |                  |          | Glass         |
| 1988        | Dolly Formosa und die     | Frank Heibert    | 1986     | Memoirs of    |
|             | Auserwählten. Die         |                  |          | Many in One   |
|             | Memoiren der Alex         |                  |          |               |
|             | Xenophon Demirjian Gray   |                  |          |               |

Now, we shall move to another European country, which seems surprisingly quite interested in Patrick White's oeuvre: Italy. We can grasp that by observing the many translations of his novels into that language and the literary scholars from that country who attend conferences to discuss his oeuvre.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Available at: http://www.geisteswissenschaften.fu-berlin.de/we06/forschung/forschungsprojekte/2010-03-10\_Translation\_catalogue.pdf. Accessed on 15 Jan. 2014.

## 2.3 PATRICK WHITE IN ITALIAN (1951)

Although there is nothing specific connecting Patrick White and Italian language, the number of his works translated in that country is quite impressive. Australia had a very strong immigration flow from Italy in the post-war years (1946-1970s), and perhaps the idea to translate Australian novels for those whose first language is Italian would represent a way for them to get to know the new country and its cultural and historical specificities. In a paper published in 2011, Denise Formica, a scholar at Monash University, in Melbourne, writes about the importance of the archive of Australian texts in Italy and makes a huge complaint about the fact that Patrick White's oeuvre has not been entirely translated into Italian. If we compare the Italian situation to ours in Brazil, we detect that the former should be happy with the provision of many more titles and possibilities to their readers than we have, considered in a broader Lusophone context. For instance, according to Formica's words:

Although popular narratives continued to dominate translated Australian titles in the decade 1976-1985, three of Patrick White's titles – *The Solid Mandala* (1966), *The Eye of the Storm* (1973), and *Riders in the Chariot* (1961) – were all translated during this time (FORMICA, 2011, p. 4).

Comparing to our reality, in the same period, only *Voss* was translated into Portuguese. One more datum from Formica's paper must be noted: "While a number of Patrick White's works were translated for the Italian market during the last half of the twentieth century, *The Tree of Man* (1956) was a noteworthy exception" (FORMICA, 2011, p. 7). However, she later explains the situation:

The Tree of Man, The Vivisector and Flaws in the Glass are notable among those titles missing. Although difficult to confirm, it seems likely that the symbolic capital attached to the Nobel Award did not convert to financial capital in the market for the Italian publishers of White and thus no further translations of his titles were commissioned after the mid-seventies (FORMICA, 2011, p. 8).

The Italian reality sheds some light on the reason for this work to appear in Brazil now, in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. One of the findings presented by Formica in her paper concerns the translation of Christina Stead in Italy in the 1980s, which stemmed from the interest in her oeuvre, nurtured at the academic level. Basically, according to Lawrence Venuti, the effectiveness of the academy as an agent for translation is quite significant in establishing the nature of the scope of texts to be translated due to its institutional authority in the target language. Thus, in addition to the agency of a translator (as seen in the case of Patrick White in France –

recalling the "will to translate<sup>38</sup>", about which Esther Allen writes very well) and the award of international prizes, the academy plays a significant role in spreading the archive of a country. Australia has had many initiatives involving translation, for example, the project *Creative Nation: Commonwealth Cultural Policy*, which attempts to promote Australia as a reference for good translations and publishing in the field.

Besides taking Australian writing to the major international fairs in Bologna, London and Frankfurt, this body [Marketing Strategies Division of the Australia Council] also organises the very successful Visiting International Publishers (VIP) program. In order to promote rights sales of Australian titles into overseas markets and to strengthen links between Australian and overseas publishing houses and literary agencies, the VIP program invites overseas publishers to Australian literary festivals in Adelaide and Sydney. Since its beginning, the VIP program has hosted 128 publishing representatives from Europe, the UK, USA, Canada, China, Japan, Korea, Israel, Brazil and India, with more than 300 Australian titles sold into overseas markets through the program. In both these government initiatives to promote Australian writing internationally the emphasis falls on attracting overseas publishers and lends further support to the power that international publishers exercise in the selection of titles for translation – and hence in the shaping of the Australian archive abroad (FORMICA, 2011, p. 10).

Sadly, there is very little support for translating *into* English in Australia. From this information, an endeavour related to Patrick White in Brazil would not sound strange, and should have the support of organizations from both countries. It is noteworthy to mention the effect of the translations in the Italian context, with repercussions arising in translation theory as well.

Research into the intercultural movement of texts indicates that the selection of a title for translation will sometimes be a reflection of its innovative nature, its capability to offer another culture a model to invigorate their national literary repertoire, as for example in the case of the adoption of Latin American 'magical realism' into English. On other occasions, a selection will reflect the symbolic capital of a particular author or a specific literary tradition and the commercial interests of publishers acting to implement their cultural and/or commercial corporate strategies. Perhaps more significantly, the selection process reflects the complexity of the relationship between translated literature as cultural artifact and commodity, of the interconnectedness between text and market. Patrick White's Voss, Tim Winton's Dirt Music, Murray Bail's Eucalyptus and Sally Morgan's My Place can all be seen as cultural products that are fulfilling Italian cultural expectations of what an Australian text should be like but they are also deliberate choices made by publishers on the basis of commercial criteria (FORMICA, 2011, p. 11).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> In: ALLEN, Esther; BERNOFSKY, Susan. **In Translation: Translators on Their Work and What It Means**. New York: Columbia University Press, 2013.

Based on this argument, there is a similarity between Italy and Brazil in relation to the choice and publication of Patrick White in both countries. Some of his novels published in Italian translation<sup>39</sup> are:

Exhibit 12 – Italian Translations

| Translation (Year) | Translation<br>(Title)    | Translator(s)  | Original<br>(Year) | Original<br>(Title)       |
|--------------------|---------------------------|--|--------------------|---------------------------|
| 1951               | Mai un passo<br>amico     | Emma Cremonese   | 1948               | The Aunt's<br>Story       |
| 1965               | L'esploratore             | Piero Jahier   | 1957               | Voss                      |
| 1976               | I passeggeri del<br>carro | Camillo Pennati  | 1961               | Riders in the<br>Chariot  |
| 1973               | Màndala solido            | Andrea D'Anna  | 1966               | The Solid<br>Mandala      |
| 1974, 2011         | L'occhio<br>dell'uragano  | Paola Botalla Nordio,<br>Loredana Da Schio and<br>Rodolfo Delmonte | 1973               | The Eye of<br>the Storm   |
| 2008               | La mano di una<br>donna   | Simone Garzella  | 1974               | The<br>Cockatoos          |
| 2014               | Ter storie<br>insolite    | Giovanni Soldini   | 1987               | Three<br>Uneasy<br>Pieces |
| 2014               | Il giardino<br>sospeso    | Mario Fortunato  | 2012               | The Hanging<br>Garden     |

## 2.4 PATRICK WHITE IN SPANISH OF SPAIN (1962)

To talk about Patrick White in Spanish is quite difficult because we need to take into account a wide range of countries in three continents: Europe, North America and South America. In this work, we start with the predominance of publications coming from Spain. After that, we shall describe the reception of White in translation in two countries geographically close to my locus of enunciation, i.e., Porto Alegre: Uruguay and Argentina, highlighting the reception of Patrick White in translation in these places via the views of important

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> ITALIAN TRANSLATIONS OF PATRICK WHITE. Wikipédia. Available at: https://it.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White. Accessed on: 10 Jan. 2014. It should be noted that there is a huge difficulty in finding the translations available in Italian. Some titles appear with a free translation, thus, this demands a great deal of research to make sure that the free translation (usually written in parentheses) matches the title actually published. The same thing happens in Portuguese, French and Spanish. To have the free translation in parentheses does not mean that the book was really translated, and this is misleading to researchers. The sites of the National Libraries, which should provide this information, sometimes do not have data available even on the translators (only the dates of publication).

intellectuals and calling attention to a significant event: a new Patrick White translation in Argentina. Let us start with Spain.

A historical surprise has been found out during the research in the .es domain: the digitalized news item from *El País* reporting Patrick White's death on 1 October 1990. This is proof that White deserved a news item informing, in addition to his death, a little bit of his contribution as an autor of worldwide literature to readers in Spain (the social function of obituaries as registers of historical knowledge). Let us pay attention to the phrases used to qualify him:

White was considered the most influential among a group of novelists who appeared in Australia in the 1950s. His works stood out at the beginning for their insistence on Australian themes, but the treatment he gave to his texts surpassed nationalistic limitations. His more known novels are *The Eye of the Storm* and *The Tree of Man*<sup>40</sup>.

The "1950s" is mentioned probably because the best known novels by White were published in that decade (*The Tree of Man* and *Voss*, respectively), although they chose to include *The Eye of the Storm* in the note instead of *Voss*. All of these titles, however, were available in Spanish translations at the time, i.e., in the 1990s.

The data available in Biblioteca Nacional de España<sup>41</sup> corroborate Patrick White's strong translation tradition in the Spanish of Spain: the first translation of *Voss* was done in 1962 by Rafael Nadal Guasp, receiving the title *Tierra Ignota*<sup>42</sup>. The other titles translated are shown next.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> EL ESCRITOR australiano Patrick White, premio Nobel de Literatura en 1973, muere a los 78 años. El País, Madrid, 1 Oct. 1990. Available at: http://elpais.com/diario/1990/10/01/cultura/654735606\_850215.html. Acessed on: 12 May 2015. In the original: White estuvo considerado como el más influyente de un grupo de novelistas que surgió en Australia en la década de los años cincuenta. Sus obras se distinguieron en principio por su insistencia en temas australianos, pero el tratamiento que dio a sus textos sobrepasaba las limitaciones nacionalistas. Sus novelas más conocidas son El foco de la tempestad y El árbol del hombre.
<sup>41</sup> BIBLIOTECA NACIONAL DE ESPAÑA. Available at:

http://catalogo.bne.es/uhtbin/cgisirsi/5Sz34hdp8m/BNMADRID/40700093/123. Accessed on: 16 Apr. 2015. This was a quite reliable reference, helping in terms of locating the names of the translators and the titles. It remains the only source to find the proper names, as on the Spanish wiki on Patrick White, almost all titles appear with free translations (for example, *Happy Valley* has not been translated, but the information presented in paratheses – *El valle feliz* – on the website invariably misleads the researcher). Some of the titles have wikis, but they refer to the titles exclusively in English, not to translations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Reprinted and published in Cordoba, Spain, in 2008, by Icaro Editorial, according to data from Biblioteca Nacional de España.

Exhibit 13 – Spanish translations

| Translation | Translation     | Translator(s)           | Original | Original (Title) |
|-------------|-----------------|-------------------------|----------|------------------|
| (Year)      | (Title)         |                         | (Year)   |                  |
| 1974        | Los vivos y los | Idalia Cordero          | 1941     | The Living and   |
|             | muertos         |                         |          | the Dead         |
| 1974        | El peso de las  | María del Carmen        | 1948     | The Aunt's       |
|             | sombras         | Azpiazu                 |          | Story            |
| 1976; 1979  | El árbol del    | Alvaro Castillo         | 1955     | The Tree of Man  |
|             | hombre          |                         |          |                  |
| 1962;2008   | Tierra Ignota   | Rafael Nadal Guasp      | 1957     | Voss             |
| 1966; 1983  | El carro de los | Carlos Puerto           | 1961     | Riders in the    |
|             | elegidos        |                         |          | Chariot          |
| 1975        | Los calcinados  | Domingo Manfredi Cano   | 1964     | The Burnt Ones   |
| 1973; 1975  | Las esferas del | Silvia Pupato and Román | 1966     | The Solid        |
|             | mandala         | García-Azcárate         |          | Mandala          |
| 1974        | El foco de la   | Manuel Bartolomé López  | 1973     | The Eye of the   |
|             | tempestade      |                         |          | Storm            |
| 1976; 1979  | Las cacatúas    | Alvaro Castillo         | 1974     | The Cockatoos    |

Thus, the argument that there are no Patrick White novels translated into Spanish cannot be accepted as an excuse for his neglect. Furthermore, this list prompted a research with scholars in Spain about Patrick White's status: 1) How is Patrick White seen in Spain nowadays? 2) What could be said of Patrick White's reception in Spanish-language countries? 3) Would more translations of Patrick White be required/commissioned in the future? 4) Was translation a factor in his (either good or poor) reception in Spain? 5) Patrick White's centenary was celebrated in 2012. Did any kind of event take place in Spain to mark the occasion? The scholars interviewed for this dissertation work in the academy, and their selection was carefully made: after all, they needed a solid knowledge in the broad area labeled Australian Literature (almost an umbrella term, including cinema and other forms of artistic expression connected to Australia).

The first scholar contacted was professor María Socorro Suárez Lafuente, from the University of Oviedo, who, although admitting her contribution would not be very rich, gave her valuable testimony:

I do love White as a novelist and, occasionally, I teach some of his short works - I particularly like "The night the prowler". [...] However he is not a widely read author. Australia is a far off culture for Spain and Australian authors are rarely read here - one exception might have been Peter Carey's *Oscar and Lucinda*, thanks to the film, but even so... And, I'm sorry to tell you, White's centenary passed

unnoticed, with just a short reminder in some of the Literary Supplements in the newspapers<sup>43</sup>.

Professor Lafuente corroborates our impression: the books are available, but his geographically distant origin seems to explain his neglect. Notwithstanding, this should not be an excuse for keeping Patrick White away from the syllabuses at universities which still offer Australian Literature as a topic of study. The positive side is that like the translators who admire Patrick White and do what they can to keep his novels around and available in translations, professor Lafuente also uses her personal appreciation by working with his short stories with her students, which apparently is the way to guarantee that one more Nobel Prize winner does not end up covered in dust at the libraries all over the world. One more reference comes from professor Susan Ballyn, Director of the Australian Centre at the University of Barcelona:

There is very little general knowledge in the public arena about him but he is often taught on courses dealing with Australian literature or culture. I can only answer regarding Spain and his reception is strictly within the academic domain. They should be [commissioned] but whether that will happen I do not know and given the present crisis I would think that preference would be given to other authors<sup>44</sup>.

When asked about the quality of translations being (or not) a factor in Patrick White's reception in Spain, she is quite categorical: "No".

Given this work focuses on *The Solid Mandala*, a word from one of the translators of the novel, the Argentinian Silva Pupato, helps elucidate the conditions of production of the text in 1973. When asked about the conditions she and her colleague, Róman, had to face while translating the novel, she says that "the translation had to be done very quickly because the publisher wanted to have the book in the stores by Christmas. And it was<sup>46</sup>" (indeed, the date of the publication is December 1973). The translators were living in Barcelona at the time, and were already working for the publisher (and had just finished one book), thus, there was not any special nomination for the task. According to Pupato, Román was responsible for the proofreading of the novel, and it was published "as handed in<sup>47</sup>". A very important

<sup>47</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> LAFUENTE, María. **Patrick White in Spain (Australian literary studies in translation)** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 19 Jul. 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> BALLYN, Susan. **Patrick White in Spain** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 15 Jul. 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Ibidem, see attachments (all the e-mails are available).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> PUPATO, Silvia. **The translation of The Solid Mandala into Spanish** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 17 Jul. 2014.

question to our purpose in this dissertation had to be asked: What kind of research have you both conducted while translating *The Solid Mandala*? The Internet was not available at the time, so what kind of sources did you look up? The reply was: "There was nothing to research with. Vocabulary was common usage. Not even Aussie words. And there were dictionaries. Internet may ease things but it is not a dictionary<sup>48</sup>". When questioned about previous contact with Patrick White's oeuvre, she said:

That Patrick White was nominated to a Nobel prize was a real surprise, for he was practically unknown outside Australia. *Mandala* sold very well and the publisher gave us *The Tree of Man* to translate. [...] One thing: before translating I read the book. I believe it is essential to find how characters develop throughout the plot. It helps a lot to know them beforehand. I remember there was one thing though: "in the *mean*time", if I'm not mistaken. I thought a lot about how to solve this, but I cannot remember which was the result.<sup>49</sup>

Another question concerned the importance or necessity of visiting Australia to perform the translation, and her reply was as follows:

I visited Australia 20 years later -approx.-. I don't think it would have been helpful to visit Australia before translating. Characters were not local, vocabulary was not local, grammar was not local. The book was universal as a whole<sup>50</sup>.

By all means, her opinion shall be respected. However, the purpose of this dissertation is to prove the contrary: *The Solid Mandala* may be universal in its theme of human conflicts and relations, but its specificity lies in the regionalisms and Australian elements, which represent huge challenges not only to readers in other English-speaking countries, but specially to translators. The characters were born in England and raised in Australia, hence, we need to admit that their concerns are not quite the same as they would have been in other places of the world, such as Buenos Aires or Beijing.

Given the book was translated during Francisco Franco's dictatorship (encompassing the period 1939-1975) many readers would be inclined to believe that there must have been some influence on the cultural production in Spain (and we may well extend that influence to other Spanish-speaking countries, which relied on Spain to have access to such production), therefore, the question concerning the religious theme of *The Solid Mandala* seemed reasonable (and related to swear words and any other relevant aspects as well). One of the characteristics of the Francoist regime, along with its authoritarianism and nationalism, was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Ibidem.

its strong reliance on Catholicism to guarantee and strengthen the leader's popularity. Silvia Pupato's comments shed light on the subject:

No influence at all. Franco's dictatorship lasted 40 years and by 1973 was almost at its end. By that time people were not executed nor imprisoned nor interned in concentration camps because they supported "anti-Spain" ideas, and censorship was really lax.

It's my personal view. You have to consider that in Argentina people were living in conditions quite similar to those of the first years of the Franco dictatorship, and we felt quite safe and at ease in Spain, in spite of Franco<sup>51</sup>.

This is a crucial account which needs to be credited, yet it will not prevent many readers from still perceiving an influence of the regime in the materiality of the text. This is why the topic of translation and reading is so fascinating: different people, with their different backgrounds and perspectives, will read the text and translate it in many enriching, valid and debatable ways over the years.

#### 2.5 PATRICK WHITE IN SWEDISH (1964)

Sweden deserves special attention in this work because the Nobel Prize Academy is located there (even though the editions translated into Swedish to the general audience did not really contribute to his nomination, given the members of the Academy read in English). The information provided in this part comes from the time of White's nomination during the 1960s, through Ingmar Björkstén's reliable work, *Patrick White: a general introduction*. It is important to perceive White's reality in translation at that time:

In Sweden Patrick White was first introduced in 1964, when Torsten Blomkvist translated his sixth novel, *Riders in the Chariot*. The sales figures were hardly encouraging: 1,900 copies sold of an edition of 3,000. In the pocket edition of 1970, with its printing of 8,000 copies, 1,200 of these had been sold two and a half years later. In 1969 Ingergärd Martinell's translation of White's seventh novel, *The Solid Mandala*, appeared. Of the printing of 2,500 copies, 600 were sold. In 1970 Magnus K;son Lindberg's translation of *The Tree of Man* was published in an edition of 2,500, of which 2,000 have found purchasers to date. Lindberg's translation of White's 1970 novel, *The Vivisector*, was ready in 1971 (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 14).

The phrase "was ready in 1971" is symptomatic: the publishers decided to wait two more years, probably foreseeing White's Nobel award and considering the benefits generated by this fact. The title chosen for the book was *Målaren* ("The Painter"), and in terms of sales,

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Ibidem.

5,000 out of 7,000 copies comprising that edition had been purchased by 1975. It is quite crucial to underline that, because of the Nobel Prize, a pocket edition of *The Tree of Man* was launched, with impressive sales figures: 15,000 of its 16,000 copies were sold. And perhaps because of this success, one more title was commissioned to be translated: Lindberg accepted the challenge of working with *The Eye of the Storm*, which was published in January 1976 with the title *Stormens oga*. Later, this novel was to appear in the form of a movie, directed by Fred Schepisi and which is broadcast on the channel HBO quite often in Brazil.

Concerning the Nobel Prize, we should recall that, according to David Marr's biography, some of the members of the Nobel Committee of the Academy had already considered White for the prize in 1969, when some of the members had had access to *The Solid Mandala* in the Swedish translation, hence signaling the importance of translation in divulging White's talent and oeuvre in the country:

[...] the eighteen members of the Academy appear to have had advance copies of the translation in the summer of 1969, when they considered Patrick White for the first time. Only a few of the academicians tackled him in English; others read *Voss* and *The Tree of Man* in German (MARR, 1995, p. 532).

The novels translated into Swedish that we managed to find are in the Exhibit<sup>52</sup> displayed below:

Exhibit 14 – Swedish translations

| Translation (Year) | Translation (Title)       | Translator(s)            | Original<br>(Year) | Original<br>(Title)      |
|--------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|
| 1991               | Tant Theodora             | Ingegärd<br>Martinell    | 1948               | The Aunt's<br>Story      |
| 1970               | Livets träd               | Magnus K:son<br>Lindberg | 1955               | The Tree of<br>Man       |
| 1983               | Voss                      | Ingegärd<br>Martinell    | 1957               | Voss                     |
| 1964               | De fyra utkorade          | Torsten<br>Blomkvist     | 1961               | Riders in the<br>Chariot |
| 1969               | Den oförstörbara mandalan | Ingegärd<br>Martinell    | 1966               | The Solid<br>Mandala     |
| 1973               | Målaren                   | Magnus K:son<br>Lindberg | 1970               | The<br>Vivisector        |
| 1975               | Stormens öga              | Magnus K:son             | 1973               | The Eye of the           |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Available at: http://sv.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White. Accessed on: 20 Feb. 2014. It should be noted that this Swedish wiki on Patrick White was a reliable source in terms of translations, thus showing the organisation and preoccupation of the Swedish in disclosing the right information to researchers (e.g., it was the only wiki including the names of the translators close to all the titles translated, saving the researcher's time in looking for each name either on the Swedish or the Australian National Library website).

|      |                          | Lindberg   |      | Storm        |
|------|--------------------------|------------|------|--------------|
| 1979 | En frans av löv          | Roland     | 1976 | A Fringe of  |
|      |                          | Adlerberth |      | Leaves       |
| 1981 | Fallet Twyborn           | Ingegärd   | 1979 | The Twyborn  |
|      |                          | Martinell  |      | Affair       |
| 1984 | Skavanker i spegeln: ett | Ingegärd   | 1981 | Flaws in the |
|      | självporträtt            | Martinell  |      | Glass        |
| 1989 | Det kluvna minnet: Alex  | Ingegärd   | 1986 | Memoirs of   |
|      | Xenophon Demirjian Grays | Martinell  |      | Many in One  |
|      | memoarer                 |            |      |              |

## 2.6 PATRICK WHITE IN PORTUGUESE OF PORTUGAL (1973)

Considering the date of the first publication of the translation, *The Tree of Man* was translated into European Portuguese in 1973, year of the Nobel Prize award, by Cardigos dos Reis. This is the edition found in Brazil (with some adaptions to our variety of Portuguese, as seen later in this work, and distributed via the now extinct publishing-house Círculo do Livro, which ended its operations in 2008) and in other Portuguese-speaking countries.

Nonetheless, the enthusiasm about Patrick White and Australian Literature was apparently short-lived. In our research online, few works about Patrick White's oeuvre and its reception in Portugal could be retrieved (and the places to perform this search were appropriate). For instance, the CECBase – Bibliografia Comparatista em Portugal –, of the Centre for Comparative Studies (Centro de Estudos Comparatistas) at the University of Lisbon, states its mission as follows:

> [...] there were no systematically organised and treated elements which could provide a rigorous overview about the history and the framing of Comparative Literature in Portugal, its temporal, quantitative and qualitative demarcation, as well as specific areas of comparative interest in our country or the dimensions and the expression they had. [...] to allow not only a correct historical view of the dimension of this field of study among us but also to make available the bibliographical elements indispensable to any investigation in the area<sup>53</sup>[my translation].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> In the original: "[...] não existiam elementos sistematicamente organizados e tratados que pudessem fornecer um panorama rigoroso sobre a história e o enquadramento da Literatura Comparada em Portugal, a sua balizagem temporal, quantitativa e qualitativa, bem como as específicas áreas de interesse comparatista no nosso país ou as dimensões e a expressão que tiveram. [...] por forma não só a permitir uma correcta visão histórica da dimensão deste campo de estudos entre nós mas ainda a fazer com que passassem a estar disponíveis os elementos bibliográficos indispensáveis a qualquer investigação na área". Available at: http://cecbase.comparatistas.edu.pt/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=1&Itemid=2. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

The data compilation started in 2000 and, up to now, it offers 8625 entries. The results retrieved for Patrick White come from the same person (Maria Helena Ribeiro de Paiva Correia Gomes de Valléra), and were done in 1969 and 1973, respectively. The first item is "Patrick White e a tradição australiana", O regresso à Abissínia ou uma interpretação do romance de Patrick White<sup>54</sup> ["Patrick White and the Australian tradition", Return to Abyssinia or an interpretation of Patrick White's novel (a thesis), and the second item is a paper entitled "Considerações a propósito de *The Aunt's Story* de Patrick White" (Considerations on Patrick White's The Aunt's Story] published in the journal Revista da Faculdade de Letras -Universidade de Lisboa<sup>55</sup>. From this sample, the scholar had as object of study the works in the original in English (The Aunt's Story was not translated into Portuguese, yet, and A árvore do homem was already available in Portuguese). A broader research has been carried out, but no significant results were retrieved (neither at PORBASE - Base Nacional de Dados Bibliográficos - from Biblioteca Nacional de Portugal, nor at Depósito de Dissertações e Teses Digitais – Digital Repository of Theses and Dissertations, which is part of the Division of the National Bibliographical Agency and Acquisitions – Divisão da Agência Bibliográfica Nacional e Aquisições).

We had the opportunity of contacting the now retired professor Maria Helena de Paiva Correia via the Australian scholar Jean Page<sup>56</sup>. Given professor Maria Helena was the only representative name in Portugal to have studied and written about Patrick White's oeuvre, this is truly a very interesting account to enrich this dissertation. At the beginning of her message, she admits that all she knows "about the reception of Patrick White in Portugal, university teaching, student interest, translation" [...] is "not much<sup>57</sup>". In terms of teaching of Patrick White at the academy, she said:

As a matter of fact, I never taught Patrick White either to undergraduates or to graduate students. Australian Literature was not taught in those days. Later on, I tried to introduce it at Faculdade de Letras, at least by means of CEAUL G4. Please ask Prof. Teresa Casal. I think there is no one teaching Australian Literature<sup>58</sup>.

<sup>58</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Available at: http://cecbase.comparatistas.edu.pt/index.php?option=com\_cecbase&task=lista&id=2581. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Available at: http://cecbase.comparatistas.edu.pt/index.php?option=com\_cecbase&task=lista&id=1856. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> A special thanks to Jean Page, who kindly forwarded my message to professor Maria Helena in order to get this important feedback on the reception of Patrick White in Portugal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> CORREIA, Maria Helena Paiva. **Patrick White in Portugal** [personal message]. Message received by *jean.page@mac.com*, on 24 May 2015.

CEAUL stands for Centre for Anglophone Studies at the University of Lisbon (Centro de Estudos Anglísticos da Universidade de Lisboa). In effect, when looking for the name of Professor Teresa Casal on the centre's website, we see that her main interests lie in the studies of English Literature in general. When searching on the website using the word "australiana", four results were retrieved, presenting events recently organized at the university. The first refers to a seminar on Aboriginal Australian Literature: "The trickster: satirizing whiteness in the fiction of Australian Indigenous writer Marie Munkara<sup>59</sup>", ministered by professor Anne Brewster (from University of New South Wales, who was a visiting professor at the University of Copenhagen, which has a nucleus of Australian Literature). The second event was also under her responsibility, entitled: "The Indigenous Protest Poetry of Romaine Moreton<sup>60</sup>". The third event was an arts exhibition called Vida sob os nossos pés (Life under our feet), as part of the international colloquium Life Down Under – Australian Literature and Culture, which was open from 14 to 25 February 2011. The fourth event on the list of results is precisely the colloquium Life Down Under – Australian Literature and Culture<sup>61</sup>, which was held on 14 and 15 February 2011. Looking at the programme of the event available online, we see a sad reality: Patrick White's name was not there. Among the authors chosen to be discussed at the event, which had the presence of the then Australian Ambassador to Portugal Patrick Lawless (who is now the Australian Ambassador to Brazil), were Steven Carroll, Ern Malley, James McAuley, Sarah Day, Emma Jones (most of the names contemporary, except for James McAuley and Ern Malley: the hoax poet invented by McAuley and Harold Stewart), and many works on Australian Literature focusing on its Aboriginal and Asian branches and on post-colonialist studies. If the objective of the colloquium, as its title in Portuguese stressed, was to talk about Australian Literature today, then it would be relatively easy to understand the absence of Patrick White's name from the programme, although James McAuley is there. However, the statement of the goal of the event is a little misleading:

[...] to allow the academy and the general audience to have direct contact with Australian literature and culture. In this sense, this first colloquium dedicated to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/seminario-sobre-literatura-aborigene-australiana-the-brokering-of-decolonising-cosmopolitanism-the-case-of-kim-scotts-that-deadman-dance.html. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/palestra-sobre-literatura-aborigene-australiana-the-indigenous-protest-poetry-of-romaine-moreton.html. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> In Portuguese, the title was *Vida sob os nossos pés - Literatura e Cultura Australianas Hoje*. Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/coloquio-internacional-sobre-a-australia.html and http://australiainlisbon.blogspot.com/ and http://www.ulices.org/images/site/pdfs/prog-Australia.pdf. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

Australia proposes to present and discuss a wide range of areas and themes directly related to the arts, humanities and social sciences of that country of the Southern hemisphere, so as to frame it and interpret it, thus contributing to the much necessary development of its studies and knowledge in Portugal<sup>62</sup>.

The only work talking about Australian Studies in Europe and Portugal was presented by a Dannish scholar, Lars Jensen (from Roskilde University, Denmark). The "wide range of areas" concentrated on post-colonialism, and translation was not a topic, meaning that if you wanted to get to know Australian culture and literature, the first thing you needed was to be proficient in English (in fact, there is the presupposition that none of the novels are translated). This idea apparently signals the negative connotations ignited (therefore, the status of the activity) when we refer to "translation" at the academy. Asked about the attendance and reception of such an impressive event, professor Callahan is quite emphatic:

The Australian studies conference in Lisbon attracted very limited interest among students and staff. It was noticeable that the powerful members of staff in the English department did not attend, and did not show any interest in the significant Australian writer Robert Dessaix who was at the conference (and who has had something translated into Portuguese, although I don't remember what at the moment), not to mention the younger writers.

Recently the same research group had another conference on Home in Postcolonial Literature, and there were several papers on Australian issues. Once again, the conference was poorly attended. People are just not interested in anything much outside the Anglo-American axis.<sup>63</sup>

This is what we notice when looking at the background of the professors who currently teach at the University of Lisbon, as many of them went to England or the United States to further studies on language and/or literature. The problem is that there seems to be a perpetuation of interest in the Northern poles of literary studies, in a way hindering any attempts of introducing, not necessarily new, but not commonly dealt with/read, Australian literary artifacts.

Professor Maria Helena goes on describing her experience with Patrick White:

As a young student, I had to write a thesis to complete my undergraduation (Germanic Philology – English / German, 5 years + thesis). I wrote a thesis on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> In the original: "[...] tem por objetivo levar a academia e o público em geral ao contacto directo com a literatura e cultura australianas. Nesse sentido, este primeiro colóquio dedicado à Austrália propõe-se apresentar e discutir um amplo leque de áreas e temas directamente relacionados com as artes, humanidades e ciências sociais daquele país do hemisfério sul, de modo a enquadrá-lo e interpretá-lo, assim contribuindo para um muito necessário desenvolvimento do seu estudo e conhecimento em Portugal". Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/coloquio-internacional-sobre-a-australia.html. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> CALLAHAN, David. **Patrick White (Brazilian PhD student)** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 27 May 2015.

Patrick White [...]. I sent this work to Patrick White who kindly had provided me with some bibliography (see attachments, please). He wrote back quite angry because he couldn't conceive [sic] the idea of my writing the thesis in a language he couldn't read. I had to write it in Portuguese. [sic] Then, it was compulsory<sup>64</sup>.

It is a good mental exercise to visualize Patrick White's reaction when receiving a work about his own production in English written in a language he could not read, but the positive aspect is that it became one more reference in Portuguese, adding to the translation of *A árvore do homem*, published some years before. She concludes with the following comment:

I am almost sure that in other "good" Portuguese Universities there is nothing at all about Patrick White (Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Universidade de Coimbra, Universidade do Porto, Universidade do Minho). Besides, if there were, Prof. David Callahan would know, I dare say<sup>65</sup>.

Given this alarming scarcity of academic works on Patrick White (and on Australian Literature, as this term was used as well in the research performed), information from people who currently teach this subject in the country might be useful to explain this evident neglect. David Callahan, Associate Professor at the Department of Languages and Cultures at the University of Aveiro, is our reliable source and has a realistic (albeit sad) overview of the situation:

Well, that sounds interesting indeed. Unfortunately, there is almost no interest in Australian studies in Portugal. When I held a big Australian studies conference here 10 years ago, nobody came from Portugal apart from a PhD student of mine and an English friend at the University of Aveiro. And we had important writers, an important artist, and an important documentary filmmaker, as well as many important Australian scholars. Last year they had a small Australian studies conference in Lisbon but it was noticeable that the staff were not interested and did not attend, apart from the couple of staff who were organising it in the effort to look more international<sup>66</sup>.

In reality, the conference referred to in the passage was held from 23 to 27 September 2003, and was held by the European Association for Studies on Australia (EASA) – (VII Biennial Conference). Looking at the programme, many famous names in the field ring a bell, such as Luisa Pércopo from Italy, Susan Ballyn and Dolores Herrero from Spain, Lars Jensen from Denmark, Jaroslav Kusnir from Slovakia, and Brigitta Olubas, Elizabeth McMahon, Bill

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>65</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> CALLAHAN, David. **Patrick White translation in Brazil** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 3 Apr. 2003.

Ashcroft and Jean Page from Australia, attracting "about 120 speakers<sup>67</sup>". The organizer of the event goes on:

However, apart from Jean Page (who at that time was working at the Embassy) nobody came from the rest of Portugal. And at the time I was the Secretary of the Associação Portuguesa de Estudos Anglo-Americanos (the name says it all) so I had included information about the conference and the call for papers in the Association's newsletters, so they can't say it hadn't been publicised<sup>68</sup>.

From this and the many events held since 2003 in Portugal, a clear trend or interest in Australian Literature focusing on post-colonialism themes tends to come up, mainly regarding the Aborigines and the Asians. Thus, this would apparently be a reason to justify why Patrick White is an absent name: he is still considered an elitist in his own country. Professor Callahan, when asked about this noticeable impression, said:

Indigenous issues are central to most European countries' interest in Australia, if they have any. I don't think there is any interest in Australia in Portugal to speak of, whether Indigenous issues, canonical literature, recent literature, whatever.

Complementing this view, when the subject of this dissertation was mentioned, professor Callahan's impression remained categorical:

This is to say that your project would have difficulty being achieved here, even though Patrick White is a great writer. My next article to appear begins by talking about *The Aunt's Story*, although I am no expert on Patrick White. It's interesting that you've chosen *The Solid Mandala*. I'm a great fan of *Riders in the Chariot*, followed by *The Tree of Man* I guess. I have never taught White though. I've always gone for more contemporary material, and also shorter books. Even at Master's level I need to cover all of English literature outside the UK and the US, so there's only space for one Australian book at a time<sup>69</sup>.

From the impressions gathered so far about Portugal, we feel that "translation" is an underrated topic, after all, the University of Lisbon has a course of translation (even promoting events about the subject to discuss its pertinence). It would be a fantastic suggestion to try to couple the subjects, i.e., to have Australian literature and culture being viewed and dealt with in translation. However, it seems that the idea is to talk about Australian Literature only "in the original".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> CALLAHAN, David. **Patrick White (Brazilian PhD student)** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 27 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Ibidem.

In terms of translations, it would be acceptable to think that, because of the current economic crisis, nothing about Patrick White (or any of the contemporary authors previously cited) would be commissioned. In the sub-item about Spain, professor Susan Ballyn signals the recent economic downturn affecting the Iberian countries, as well as Italy and Greece, as a reason why new translations are not being commissioned. However, *The Hanging Garden*, the newest title by Patrick White posthumously published, deserved translations in both Italy and France, so, that argument would lose its validity. David Callahan mentions the topic translation in his 1991 paper, entitled "The image of Australia in Portugal since the Revolution: From Timor to Television<sup>70</sup>", which focuses on Australian television programmes being broadcast in the country at the time. One point in the paper calls our attention:

With respect to Australian writing, this is very badly served, and not because they don't translate much literature in Portugal. They do. As I was wandering through the Lisbon Book Fair this year, listening to Kylie Minogue (whom my students thought was American) over the loud-speakers, I could see translations of the latest books by Ian McEwan, Dennis Potter, Margaret Atwood, Chinua Achebe, V.S. Naipaul, Bret Easton Ellis, Anita Brookner, Raymond Carver, J.L. Carr, Bruce Chatwin, etc. However, only one Patrick White novel has been translated – The Tree of Man. The only other 'serious' book to be translated is Oscar and Lucinda, which appeared in August 1990 and the response to which it is too soon to judge. Significantly these two choices have been patently mediated by European institutions of literary power which are perceived as authoritative in Portugal. When the English edition of Oscar and Lucinda was briefly reviewed in a literary magazine it appeared in a piece called 'English Books'. Among best-sellers, again mediated by foreign institutions of literary power, this time in the USA, there are translations of Colleen McCullough and Morris West, for example. West in not mentioned as an Australian on the covers of his books, while with Colleen McCullough it is her status as a best-seller writer which subsumes her Australianness. In Portugal, the strange undeveloped nature of the reading public means, incidentally, that best-sellers are not the best-sellers. Indeed, as foreign television is subtitled in Portugal, nor can Australian programmes mean much to the approximately 18 per cent of the population who is illiterate (CALLAHAN, 1991, p. 17).

We need to keep in mind that this was the impression in the 1990s. As the author mentions, the paper

[...] makes comments which were true in 1990 when I wrote it but which are not at all true now. Australian television is now absent on Portuguese channels, and in any event the advent of cable television and then the internet has changed consumption in this area enormously<sup>71</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> CALLAHAN, David. "The Image of Australia in Portugal since the Revolution: From Timor to Television." **Australian Studies**, London, n. 5, p. 8-18, Apr. 1991.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> CALLAHAN, David. **Patrick White** (**Brazilian PhD student**). Personal message. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 27 May 2015.

Coming back to our present time, we can say that Portugal remains with one of the lowest literacy rates in Europe, and that, in terms of translations, the activity goes on, as "there have, however, been a number of translations of Australian novels, much more than used to be the case. Even a couple of Australian poets (John Mateer, Kit Kelen)<sup>72</sup>". As a matter of fact, while this dissertation was being concluded, some marvellous news reached us in Brazil: a brand new translation of *Voss* (done by João Reis) was launched in October 2016 in Lisbon by the new publishing house E-primatur, which was born through social media and focusses on publishing classics and other alternative titles. We do hope that this positive event, which really cheers up any Portuguese-speaking Australian literature student, helps spread White's literary talent and, of course, change the devastating scenario previously depicted.

#### 2.7 PATRICK WHITE IN SERBO-CROATIAN (1974)

It is salutary to introduce in this work the breath of life received in recent years not only by Patrick White's oeuvre, but also by Australian Literature as a whole, in other countries, such as Serbia. With its political disturbances, Serbia might not be an option in a work dedicated to the discussion of the translation of an Australian writer. However, an enthralling project developed by the University of Novi Sad proposed the translation of Australian literature in that country, and deserves mentioning here.

The endeavour, proposed by the Serbian professor Nataša Kampmark, PhD, suffered a little at the beginning, and all because of funding. A publisher in Serbia became enthusiastic about the idea of translating Australian literature after reading an issue of a literary magazine devoted to the Australian short story, which was then edited by professor Kampmark. There was an interest in working on an anthology, provided that professor Kampmark be committed to getting the funding. Thus, according to her words: "It is not lack of interest which prevents publishers from publishing translated works of Australian writers but it is the funding, especially at these times of economic crisis<sup>73</sup>". Like Italy, the funding was eventually granted by the Australian Council for the Arts which enabled the continuity of the project in Serbia.

Looking back, Patrick White is an obvious name on the list of Australian authors already translated into Serbian. According to information provided by professor Kampmark, the following novels were translated into Serbian (Serbo-Croatian until 1991):

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> KAMPMARK, Nataša. **Questions on translation!** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 28 Feb. 2014.

| Translation (Year) | Translation<br>(Title) | Translator(s)                       | Original<br>(Year) | Original<br>(Title) |
|--------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| 1979               | Prica Teodore          | Snezana Stojanovic and              | 1948               | The Aunt's          |
| 1974               | Gudman<br>Voss         | Zlatica Putincanin Josip Kataliniac | 1955               | Story<br>Voss       |
| 1974               | Oko oluje              | Ljiljana Filipović                  | 1933               | The Eye of the      |
| 17,7               | one only               | Zjiljana i mpovie                   | 1775               | Storm               |
| 1977               | Noc lupeza             | Marija Herman-Sekulic               | 1974               | The Night the       |
|                    |                        |                                     |                    | Prowler             |
| 1984               | Twybornova             | Ines Zupanov                        | 1979               | The Twyborn         |
|                    | Stvar                  |                                     |                    | Affair              |

Exhibit 15 – Serbio-Croatian Translations

From the dates, we infer that the Nobel Prize might have had an influence on the initiative. Although we see many titles translated, a question arises: what is the quality/condition of these translations? Are they readable to a Serbian? Were they conceived with care and responsibility? In a paper discussing the 1979 translation of *The Aunt's Story*, professor Kampmark claims the following:

[...] Unfortunately, this is not the only instance of White's original metaphors and unusual similes being lost or distorted in translation. White's imagination working at this level would compare an uneventful day to a flat pastry board (21), but sometimes his creative inventiveness becomes challenging for the Serbian reader owing solely to mistranslation. So, the Serbian reader is, on one occasion, expected to imagine a man with a clockwise smile (osmeh u smeru kazaljki na satu, 39). The original text, however, describes a peddler whose smile is not a result of a genuine feeling but rather an impersonal and mechanical gesture expressing the expected kindness to his prospective customers: "He uncovered his brown teeth in a clockwork smile" (21) (KAMPMARK, 2013, p. 162).

Kampmark goes on and cites many instances in which the translator's misreading and lack of care confuse the Serbian reader or make her/him question some of the choices, thus compromising the text in the target language. These inaccuracies mentioned by professor Kampmark allude to André Lefevere's concept of "refractions", i.e. "the adaptation of a work of literature to a different audience, with the intention of influencing the way in which that audience reads the work" (LEFEVERE, 2004, p. 241) which perpetuate a literary system.

She ends the paper with a warning:

The Nobel Prize for literature, which was awarded to Patrick White in 1973, recognized him as one of the most excellent authors in what is called world literature. "What is most excellent, is most inimitable," claims Sir John Denham, who consequently views translation as an act of injury, adding that "if even the worst Authors are yet made worse by their Translators, how impossible is it not to

do great injury to the best?" (Denham 122). The translators of Patrick White's *The Aunt's Story*, as the analysis has shown, did great injury to the original text (KAMPMARK, 2013, p. 165).

Perhaps this inaccuracy in the Serbian translations of an important Australian literary representative can be seen as one more reason to justify the idea of a project involving new translations of other authors, improving the supply of translations. Of course, an argument against this critique might be that the translation was done in the 1970s and that time changes, as well as our reading. However, it should be noted that the idea of the project to occasionally retranslate some of these novels is part of the craft of translation, which evinces the historical and social transformations of languages.

Although the most recent title is from 1984, other short stories by Patrick White appeared later in literary magazines. This is quite impressive, in comparison to what we have seen in other countries, and in a way helps explain professor Kampmark's opinion that there is not a great interest in the translation of Patrick White in Serbia nowadays - the question was asked because *The Solid Mandala* is not on the list presented earlier. The result of the project was that, from the translation of Patrick White, other names started to call the attention of students (who were the initial target of the project), and then of the publishing houses in the country, which then decided to market the novels to a broader audience.

At the conference DisLocated Readings: Translation and Transnationalism, held at Monash University, in Melbourne, in 2013, some figures of the project were presented, showing the evolution of the acceptance of Australian Literature in Serbia. This has represented a new encouragement for our activity in Brazil: would it be possible to see the same results and movement in our country from the translation and thus increased adoption and introduction of Australian novels and authors in the syllabuses at the universities? This cannot be accurately foreseen, but with the quite recent interest in the study of Southern Literature, a similar initiative might yield positive results in Brazil.

## 2.8 PATRICK WHITE IN GREECE (1980s)

Greece to Patrick White represented not only a landscape to be depicted, but also a place where the family members of his partner, Manoly Lascaris, spent most of their lives (although he was actually born in Cairo, Egypt). Vrasidas Karalis, former professor at the University of Sydney, has conceded an interview to *The Australian* about, among other things, his experience with the translation of Patrick White into Greek and the promotion of his new

book, *Recollections of Mr Manoly Lascaris*, published in 2008, which has represented a major research work in White studies. In that volume, Karalis unveils, through his conversations with him in Greek, the mental side of Mr Lascaris which had remained unknown, or disguised (in fact, in the public imagination, that small man had always been viewed as "the butler").

Another story of passion (as seems to be the case in the examples shown so far) characterizes Vrasidas Karalis's undertaking. Having arrived in Australia from Greece in 1990, his devotion to Patrick White's novels ignited when he found all White's books in their US editions left in a bookshop in The Netherlands. Karalis was translating *Voss* (eventually published in 1995) and this task compelled him to ring the doorbell at 20 Martin Road, Centennial Park, seeking information (memories of the author) from his fellow countryman that might help him. What he found, to his surprise, was that Mr Lascaris, at the time aged 81, was a quite solitary man, in need of friends, and who was trying to cope with such a loss in his life. When someone appeared to talk to him in Greek, that enlivened him:

Our relationship was purely intellectual. I was going to his place and he was starting all these incredible monologues about Plato, about Aristotle, about my proletarian upbringing. He was so tempestuous. You couldn't stop him. And he spoke always in Greek. He said once, 'It's so good speaking in Greek. Doesn't it give you a hard on?' I said, 'No, Mr Lascaris. I'm trying to improve my English. Greek does not give me a hard on<sup>74</sup>.'

Karalis stated that the references to classical authors, such as Sappho, Aristotle, Plato, and many poets, and even Goethe (with Mr Lascaris quoting them from the original), with analyses and ideas about history, writing and art, all sounded like "medieval Byzantine hymns<sup>75</sup>" to him. Thus, this raises the inevitable thought: were the conversations between Mr. White and Mr. Lascaris like that? Karalis's reply is discerning:

No. But I think they must have had some very interesting discussions about characters and settings, and references as well. Don't forget, Patrick used to give him the manuscript of each novel for his comments before submitting it to the publisher. I think Mr Lascaris believed his input was critical to the finalization of the text. In Voss, the explorer is in the middle of the desert when he has a vision of Hagia Sophia. "Whenever you see these Byzantine references, it's because of Manoly"<sup>76</sup>.

<sup>76</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> HOPE, Deborah. The Face: Vrasidas Karalis. **The Australian**, Sydney, 10 May 2008. Available at: http://www.theaustralian.com.au/arts/books/the-face-vrasidas-karalis/story-e6frg8nf-

<sup>1111116261600.</sup> Accessed on: 10 Jan. 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Ibidem.

This linguistic input helped Karalis in his translation. For example, it is understandable that the puns created by Mr Lascaris were profound and worth taking notes about because it was something natural to him, enabling him to play with the registers, and showing "richer emotional nuances and grades of meaning<sup>77</sup>": "His puns in Greek were amazing. When he said something like, 'Australia is a country designed by Chekhov', I would say, 'Let me write it down'. It was so interesting<sup>78</sup>".

Karalis summarizes quite well his endeavour: "He was a living monument. The book, it's a tribute to him; I wanted to save him from oblivion<sup>79</sup>". In reality, the book was launched in 2008, but seven years earlier, in 2001, he had translated *The Vivisector* too. In the paper presented at the Patrick White Conference, held in London in 2010, Karalis claims that translating White represents

an extremely daunting task. Not simply because the translator has to deal with his irregular and somehow anomalous language; essentially this could only be the pretext for further critical engagement with the work itself<sup>80</sup>.

By acting both as a memorialist and a translator, Karalis has been making a trustworthy contribution to White studies all around the world.

Some of the titles available in Greek are displayed in the following exhibit. In this part, special thanks to Maria Ammazzalorso, Greek Archives Project Supervisor at La Trobe University (in Melbourne), who kindly provided this information via email, and her colleagues Eva Fisch and Leonidas Veikos, who helped find the information. Without their help, these data could not have been displayed in this dissertation:

Exhibit 16 – Greek Translations

| Translation (Year) | Translation (Title)       | Translator(s)   | Original<br>(Year) | Original<br>(Title) |
|--------------------|---------------------------|---|--------------------|---------------------|
| 1988               | Η ιστορία της θείας       | Serapheim Velentzas<br>(Σεραφείμ Βελέντζας)   | 1948               | The Aunt's Story    |
| 1976               | Το δέντρο του<br>ανθρώπου | <ul><li>K. Galanopoulou (K. Γαλανοπούλου) and</li><li>Vangelis Katsanis</li><li>(Βαγγέλης Κατσάνης)</li></ul> | 1955               | The Tree of<br>Man  |
| 1990; 1995         | Βος: σπουδή στην          | Vrasidas Karalis (Βρασίδας  | 1957               | Voss                |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Ibidem.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> PATRICK WHITE CONFERENCE: MODERNIST IMPACT/CRITICAL FUTURES, 2010, London. **Translating Patrick White's Novel** *Voss*. London: University of London, 2010.

|      | περιπέτεια και τον | Καραλής)              |      |              |
|------|--------------------|-----------------------|------|--------------|
|      | έρωτα              |                       |      |              |
| 1999 | Η υπόθεση          | Serapheim Velentzas   | 1980 | The          |
|      | Τουάιμπορν         | (Σεραφείμ Βελέντζας)  |      | Twyborn      |
|      |                    |                       |      | Affair       |
| 2008 | Ψεγάδια στον       | Giannis Vasilakakos   | 1981 | Flaws in the |
|      | καθρέφτη: Μια      | (Γιάννης Βασιλακάκος) |      | Glass        |
|      | αυτοπροσωπογραφία  |                       |      |              |

## 2.9 PATRICK WHITE IN CHINA (1980)

In China, likewise proving the power of the translator in promoting literature, the dedication of a man was responsible for introducing Patrick White's work in the country. A report published in *The Australian* on 13 February 2010 narrates the story of Li Yao, who in 2008 received the Australia-China Council (ACC) Award at the Australian Embassy in Beijing for his "outstanding contribution to Australia's bilateral relations with China<sup>81</sup>". His work conditions were quite difficult, mainly during the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976), when he had to disguise his three beloved books, namely Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice*, Lewis Carroll's *Alice in Wonderland* and Peter Abrahams's *The Path of Thunder*, with red covers to make them look like Mao Zedong's Little Red Book. According to Yao: "I had to keep reading English otherwise I would forget it<sup>82</sup>".

If we complain about the situation of translators in Brazil, in China there is a similar picture: according to the information from the news item, in 2007 the Australia Council reduced the amount paid to \$4,000 (for a work which usually needs about a year to be completed), whereas in 2000 that value was \$6,000 (\$2,000 for the copyright fee, \$2,000 for the translation fee and \$2,000 for the print fee). As a matter of fact, Li Yao claims to be the only professional translator of Australian literature in China and, perhaps because of that, often has to finance his own work. Given the increasingly strong economic and cultural exchanges between China and Australia, with many Chinese heading for Australia, Li states "that Australian literature is a great source for Chinese to better understand the country and its people<sup>83</sup>". Thus, the importance of the undertaking.

<sup>81</sup> JUN, Liu. How Li was found in translation. **China Daily**, Beijing, 18 Nov. 2008. Available at: http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/cndy/2008-11/18/content 7213587.htm. Accessed on: 13 Jan. 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> SAINSBURY, Michael. Found in Translation. **The Australian**, Sydney. 13 Feb. 2010. Available at: http://www.theaustralian.com.au/opinion/columnists/found-in-translation/story-e6frg78o-1225828280475. Accessed on: 13 Jan. 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> JUN, Liu. How Li was found in translation. **China Daily**, Beijing, 18 Nov. 2008. Available at: http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/cndy/2008-11/18/content\_7213587.htm. Accessed on: 13 Jan. 2014.

Li Yao's words concerning the task of translating Patrick White's *The Tree of Man* into Chinese deserve to be reproduced here: "The book with some 50,000 words was like a giant mountain for a beginner like me. White's elegant style and insightful thoughts were thrilling to my soul. From then on, I dedicated myself to the translation of Australian literature<sup>84</sup>".

Perhaps the most exciting moment for Li Yao happened in 1988, when he had the opportunity to meet Patrick White in Australia. White on the occasion gave Yao his autobiography Flaws in the Glass (later translated) with the following inscription: "For my brave translator Li Yao: May he and his readers be rewarded, Patrick White, Sydney, 1988<sup>85</sup>." White also commented: "True literature should belong to mankind as it has no boundary of country or nation<sup>86</sup>". Nowadays, Li Yao goes on translating Australian literature, and was planning to publish children's books at the time of the report. However, Yao's great complaint was in relation to the weakness of Australian cultural programmes in China in comparison to the strong incentives received by other institutions, such as Alliance Française, Instituto Cervantes and Goethe Institut.

# 2.10 PATRICK WHITE IN BRAZIL (1985)

To buy a new translation of a novel by Patrick White in Brazil today is impossible: Voss and The Tree of Man (or A árvore do homem) are available only on virtual second-hand bookstores.

We might feel inclined to believe that when there is the nomination of a writer for a Nobel Prize, as already described in the section about Patrick White in Sweden, the rush to carry out translations is quite common. However, this phenomenon curiously did not take place in Brazil. According to David Marr's words, in connection with the author under study, at the time of his Nobel Prize nomination:

> Translation sales were swift. There is a rule of thumb in publishing that a Nobel creates such an appetite for translations that they alone can yield as much cash as the prize. White was already published in French, German, Swedish, Italian, Dutch, Polish, Norwegian, Portuguese, Romanian, Czech and Hungarian. Old translations were hurried back into the shops, and publishing houses which had only ever translated one or two of his titles now set out to fill the gaps. Greece joined the

85 SAINSBURY, Michael. Found in Translation. The Australian, Sydney. 13 Feb. 2010. Available at: http://www.theaustralian.com.au/opinion/columnists/found-in-translation/story-e6frg78o-1225828280475. Accessed on: 13 Jan. 2014.

86 Ibidem.

list for the first time, buying the novels but not yet his superb Greek short stories. Pirate editions appeared in the East. He reported 'Mysterious going-ons in Russia'. Shortly after the prize, O'Hea told White's New York agent that translation sales were 'very impressive... something over £50,000 – of which of course Patrick gets half' (MARR, 1995, p. 538).

It calls our attention that Portuguese is mentioned in the quotation, though, in reality, it refers to Portuguese from Portugal, since the only novel translated into Portuguese was *A árvore do homem* (1956), and the publishing-house which bought the copyrights is from Lisbon (also, the translator is from there, Cardigos dos Reis), as seen in the item about Patrick White in Portugal. White won the prize in 1973, and another publication in a Portuguese-speaking country would appear 12 years later, in 1985, with *Voss* (this time, a Brazilian Portuguese translation). The information provided by a bibliographical analysis found on the National Library of Australia's website has just been updated<sup>87</sup>, now indicating that the copyrights of the translation of *Voss* into Brazilian Portuguese belong to Nova Fronteira.

There was an unusual stream of events which deserves some research and provides us with a justification for this dissertation. As already mentioned, the milestone took place in 1973, and what happened in Brazil? In a news item published in *Veja* magazine, we have the following:

His [White's] victory provoked a shock which was already antipodeanly felt in his native England and in his adoptive Australia. In London, bookmakers, betting on the French André Malraux as the one who would get the US\$ 52,000, found out that the Nobel in Literature is still the same, digging up talents who are out of the contest<sup>88</sup>.

According to the journalist Leo Gilson Ribeiro, we are faced with an "unburied talent", and his premonition in 1973 perhaps shows the reality of literary translation in Brazil, mainly after the announcement of an unexpected name:

Once again Europe bowed down to a continent. After the United States (Ernest Hemingway), Latin America (the Guatemalan Miguel Ángel Asturias) and Asia (the Japanese Yasunari Kawabata), and before an Old World where the contestants for the Nobel Prize in Literature seem scarce, the Swedish Academia discovered Australia. Under the shock of surprise, Brazilian editors will race to find out if Patrick White, 61, the winner, is not the name of a promontory near Sydney. And they will demand that starving and heroic translators pass, into a hasty

<sup>87</sup> In our last research, carried out on their database in January 2014, that information was missing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> RIBEIRO, Leo Gilson. Patrick White, escritor australiano ganhador do Prêmio Nobel de Literatura em 1973.
Veja, São Paulo, 24 oct. 1973. In the original: "Sua vitória provocou um abalo que já se fez sentir antipodamente na sua Inglaterra natal e na sua Austrália de adoção. Em Londres, os book-makers que apostavam no francês André Malraux como vencedor dos 52 000 dólares do prêmio, constataram que o Nobel de Literatura continua o mesmo, desenterrando talentos absolutamente fora de páreo".

Portuguese, a sometimes hermetically regional vocabulary ("grey dunny", for example, means "outhouse" or "yard toilet", "the little house" as it is called in the Brazilian countryside)<sup>89</sup>.

In the referred news item, three titles were mentioned: *Voss, The Burnt Ones* and *The Solid Mandala*. Concerning the latter, we have the following:

He's not an "engagé", however. It's not a political structure that he condemns, but the very human condition which he illuminates and deplores, invoking symbols from Hinduism when he wants to show a possible exit: the mystical interpretation of *The Solid Mandala* with its marginalized hermaphrodites, and its loneliness described as a challenge comparable to doing a jigsaw whose original image has been lost <sup>90</sup>.

Thirty-eight years later (and 26 after the translation of *Voss*), it seems that the interest in that talent has vanished, at least in the Portuguese language (in Brazil). It is quite surprising that *The Solid Mandala* was mentioned in this news item, which might have motivated its reading (or even its translation at that time), though nothing came out of it.

Thus, we find that the Nobel Prize was the main reason to translate *Voss* in Brazil, but what happened over this long period? Certainly, a failure, for the 12-year delay to publish *Voss* needs an explanation. If *The Solid Mandala* was translated right at the beginning of the 1970s in Europe, why was there such a delay in the only translation of Patrick White we have here, namely, *Voss* (published in 1985)?

The Brazilian scholar Déborah Scheidt, in her final paper for her Master's Degree at the Federal University of the State of Paraná, made the following comment in the introduction of her work, entitled "All the Difference in the World": Aspects of Alterity in Three Novels by Patrick White (presented in 1997):

One of the reasons that might be contributing to this lack of recognition with the wider public in Brazil is that, as far as I know, only three of White novels have been translated and published here up to now (*Voss, The Tree of Man*, and *The* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Mais uma vez a Europa se curvou diante de um continente. Depois dos Estados Unidos (Ernest Hemingway), da América Latina (o guatemalteco Miguel Ángel Asturias) e da Ásia (o japonês Yasunari Kawabata), e diante de um Velho Mundo onde parecem escassear os pretendentes ao Prêmio Nobel de Literatura, a Academia Sueca descobriu a Austrália. Sob o choque da surpresa, os editores brasileiros correrão para saber se Patrick White, 61 anos, o vencedor, não é o nome de um promontório perto de Sydney. E encarregarão tradutores famintos e heróicos de passar, para um português apressado, um vocabulário às vezes hermeticamente regional ("grey dunny", por exemplo, quer dizer "privada no quintal", a "casinha" do interior brasileiro)".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Ele não é um "engagé", porém. Não é uma estrutura política que ele condena. Mas a própria condição humana que ilumina e deplora, apelando para simbolismos do hinduísmo quando quer mostrar uma possível saída: a interpretação mística de *The Solid Mandala* com seus marginalizados hermafroditas, e sua solidão descrita como um desafio comparável ao de se montar um quebra-cabeças cuja imagem original se perdeu".

*Aunt's Story*). In addition to that poor representation, they are no longer commercially available<sup>91</sup>.

Voss and The Tree of Man were translated, but the third reference to The Aunt's Story has proved impossible to find so far. We have checked innumerable websites and references seeking for the title translated into Portuguese (either European or Brazilian or in any other variant), but nothing has been found. A possible reason for this mistake might be the text introduced in the few editions of the Brazilian translations, which put a free translation of the title in parenthesis – for example, The Aunt's Story (A história da tia) –, thus misleading the reader (the same procedure often appears on Wikipédia, so our level of distrust when researching translated titles needs to be constantly high).

The renowned translator Paulo Henriques Britto undertook the task of translating *Voss* into Portuguese, and so far, his work has not been debated and/or rejected. In truth, the book has been out of print, and the only possibility of acquisition is via the Internet (second-hand bookstores). In a brief analysis of that translation<sup>92</sup>, we have found several inconsistencies, such as the translation of the word 'country' in reference to Australia (at the time, it was not a country, but the colony of New South Wales). From those instances in the translation, the whole meaning of the story is affected, thus rendering a distorted historical narrative. In the case of *The Solid Mandala*, even though its setting is the urban environment of Sydney, historical aspects need to be duly handled too.

A brief interview with the translator helped clarify some issues. For instance, according to Paulo Henriques Britto, *Voss* was his first literary translation:

I was in my twenties and had read a lot since my tender years, but had very little experience of translation *tout court*, zero knowledge about Australia and Australian Literature. It was a tremendous challenge<sup>93</sup>.

Basically, according to his words, the text was translated in the 1970s (1977 or 1978, at most), and it took around 15 years to be launched. So, the work was done, but in this case the delay

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> SCHEIDT, Déborah. "All the difference in the world": Aspects of Alterity in Three Novels by Patrick White. Curitiba: UFPR, 1997. 150 f. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras) – Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras. Curitiba, UFPR, 1997.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> This issue was analysed in more detail in ALEXANDER, Ian; STEFANI, Monica. Your Country is of Great Subtlety: Aspects of the Brazilian Translation of Patrick White's Voss. Ilha do Desterro A Journal of English Language, Literatures in English and Cultural Studies, Florianópolis, v. 69, n. 2, p. 107-116, Jun. 2016. Available at: https://periodicos.ufsc.br/index.php/desterro/article/view/2175-8026.2016v69n2p107.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> BRITTO, Paulo Henriques. **Perguntas (tradução de Patrick White)** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@msn.com*, on 28 Feb. 2014. In the original: "*Voss* foi minha primeira tradução literária. Eu tinha vinte e poucos anos, lia muito desde a mais tenra infância, mas tinha muito pouca experiência de tradução *tout court*, zero conhecimentos a respeito de Austrália e literatura australiana. Foi um tremendo desafio".

was the responsibility of the publishing house. When asked about the workflow and his participation in the decision-making process, professor Paulo is quite straightforward: "At that time, we handed the book to the publishing house and it did whatever it wanted with our translation. There was no contact with the proofreader, nor the editor. The book got published only many years later<sup>94</sup>".

One element which stands out in the cases described so far in this dissertation is the translator's passion – therefore, knowledge, contact, experience – about the author being translated. When asked about his previous knowledge and reading of Patrick White and the choice of his name to translate such a novel, professor Paulo again makes a remarkable comment:

I had never read anything by him. They gave me the book because I was willing to start translating, to earn more money; I went to Nova Fronteira, presented my poor CV - I had translated 1 or 2 books, none of them literary – and they gave me  $Voss^{95}$ .

Thus, this is again one more argument that puts the blame on the publishing house: was *Voss* really a left over on their list of publications? Or were they testing with a privileged challenge one of our renowned translators, who at that time was starting his career? There is a paramount element in all undertakings analyzed so far: passion. If you do not love the author you are translating, chances are that your work is not going to be as good as it might be. In relation to this, in his essay *Writer's Writer and Writer's Writer's Writer*, Julien Barnes claims that the first known translation of *Madame Bovary* into English was done by Juliet Herbert, governess to Flaubert's niece and later his lover<sup>96</sup>. It is said that she taught Flaubert English, but it is not certain whether he actually learnt the language or not. As proof, Flaubert's library contained titles by "Le Grand William", so, perhaps Flaubert at least attempted to read Shakespeare in the original. When Herbert's translation was ready, Flaubert wrote, in a letter to the Parisian publisher Michel Lévy, that it was "a masterpiece". According to Barnes, it is a sad fact that the manuscripts proving these events were lost. This brief description helps to corroborate that the will to translate coupled with passion results in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Na época a gente entregava o livro à editora e ela fazia o que bem entendia com a nossa tradução. Nenhum contato com revisor nem preparador. O livro só foi publicado muitos anos depois".
<sup>95</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Nunca tinha lido nada dele. Me deram o livro porque eu estava querendo começar a traduzir, para ganhar mais dinheiro; fui à Nova Fronteira, apresentei meu parco CV – havia traduzido um ou dois livros, nenhum deles de literatura – e me deram *Voss*".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup>BARNES, Julian. Writer's Writer and Writer's Writer. **London Review of Books**, London, v. 32, n. 22, p. 7-11, Nov. 2010. Available at: http://www.lrb.co.uk/v32/n22/julian-barnes/writers-writer-and-writers-writers-writer. Accessed on: 25 May 2016.

careful works of translation. More than funding, the translators' passion for their craft is what moves this activity. And arguably this is what had moved Patrick White in his career as well: he might have stopped writing and taken up painting, for instance. However, a French translator's passion for his novels represented a turning point, which deserves to be echoed.

After the presentation of these references, one thing is clear: the translator, in addition to contributing to the literary system of his/her own language by inserting a new novel and making it available to people, in a way ends up acting as a memorialist, in the sense that s/he starts a deep research into the life of the author which sometimes takes him/her to unintended places, unveiling otherwise complex and obscure concepts. Notwithstanding, in our particular case, a mental drawback needs to be addressed, and which might explain why Patrick White has not deserved a place in Brazil (and this is not related to translation):

If your son says that he intends to learn English in Australia, doubt it. Real English is learnt in England or in the United States. Stays in Australia yield, at the most, a certain fluency in Australian – that language with a peculiar pronunciation which, in British ears, causes a damage comparable to the impact of a demented boomerang<sup>97</sup>.

Perhaps these words shallowly justify why most Brazilians lack the interest to study the literatures of the South. The enterprise taken up by Universidad San Martín in Argentina, supported by a Nobel Prize winner and other higher education institutions from Australia and South Africa, is a worthy endeavour, and this dissertation certainly is part of that positive turnaround, precisely to try to undermine and eventually change this poor and prejudiced view which, sadly, still seems to predominate at the academy as well as with the broader audience in Brazil. This preconceived idea is the starting point for the next chapter of this dissertation: reading Patrick White in Australia and then in Brazil, discussing the challenges imposed in both countries in terms of translation and literary studies.

#### 2.11 PATRICK WHITE IN URUGUAY

To all appearances, Uruguay would not deserve to be included as a sub-item in this dissertation, as the references to Patrick White were quite scarce. Just knowing that most titles

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> JUNQUEIRA, Eduardo. Farra com sotaque. **Veja**, São Paulo, n. 48, 27 Nov. 1996. p. 98. In the original: "Se o seu filho disser que pretende aprender inglês na Austrália, desconfie. Inglês de verdade aprende-se na Inglaterra, ou nos Estados Unidos. Temporadas na Austrália rendem, no máximo, certa fluência em australiano – aquela língua de pronúncia peculiar que causa em ouvidos britânicos estrago comparável ao impacto de um bumerangue desatinado".

are available in Spanish and that they are sold on the Internet in the uy. domain (Mercado Libre, for instance) should suffice. However, a relevant finding was an impressive article written by the Argentinian-Canadian intellectual Alberto Manguel, published in the main Uruguayan newspaper, El País, on 17 July 2012 (two months after Patrick White's centenary), entitled *Quién controla el mundo* (Who controls the world, in our translation). He describes his experience of reading Patrick White while working at a bookstore in Buenos Aires when he was 16 years old (1964): a boy full of dreams and collecting material to start his career in letters. He explains that his introduction to Patrick White's oeuvre was made through the owner of the bookstore, who said the following about *The Tree of Man*, the book he was attempting to read in the original at the time: "This will not teach you how to write, but it might teach you how to read<sup>98</sup>". In the article, Manguel goes on describing his reactions to the text he was experiencing (in English):

Here there were neither the defined statements of my heroes nor the stuffing and the slag which my parents seemed to admire. They were doing something to the English language which made me alien, a twisting and turn of the sounds and meaning which made the familiar unknown, and the unknown terribly real. I got used to the explicit, a certain cleanness of prose which clarified what was dark and told me a direct story, as strange as it was. In the prose of this Australian there were no obvious statements, or anything which seemed obvious, perhaps because, like the ruffian Ray Parker: "explanations don't explain". Patrick White certainly didn't do that<sup>99</sup>.

Thus, what Manguel says about his experience with the language of Patrick White not only in *The Tree of Man*, but in all of his novels (in this case specifying the context of *The Solid Mandala*) can be applied to the activity performed by the translator, who needs to think about such changes in the sonority and meaning to convey them (whenever possible) in the translated text. Manguel gives one breath of life to the anxious translator, though: "I think it takes time and concentrated patience to fully enjoy Patrick White's mastery, and even then White's books are never read without effort<sup>100</sup>". And he completes:

<sup>98</sup> MANGUEL, Alberto. Quién controla el mundo. El País, Montevideo, 27 Jul. 2012. Cultural. Available at: http://historico.elpais.com.uy/suplemento/cultural/quien-controla-el-mundo/cultural\_653517\_120727.html. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2014. In the original: "Éste no te enseñará a escribir, pero podría enseñarte a leer".
99 Ibidem. In the original: Aquí no había ni las declaraciones definidas de mis héroes ni el relleno y la escoria que mis padres parecían admirar. Le estaban haciendo algo al idioma inglés que me lo hacía alienígeno, un retorcimiento y giro de los sonidos y el significado que volvían lo familiar desconocido, y lo desconocido terriblemente real. Me había acostumbrado a lo explícito, una cierta limpieza de la prosa que aclaraba lo que era oscuro y me contaba una historia directa, por extraña que fuera. En la prosa de este australiano no había declaraciones obvias, o nada que pareciera obvio, tal vez porque, como dice el bandolero Ray Parker: "las explicaciones no explican". Patrick White por cierto no lo hacía".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Creo que lleva tiempo y paciencia concentrada disfrutar plenamente de la maestría de Patrick White, e incluso entonces los libros de White nunca se leen sin esfuerzo".

As I soon saw, the owner of the bookstore was right: Patrick White showed himself among the few writers who taught me how to read. Since *The Tree of Man* I graduated to *Voss*, and later to *The Vivisector* and *The Eye of the Storm*. I read *The Aunt's Story* at the end, fortunately, because even more than the previous ones, that novel demands, I think, a certain experience of life and books – what Henry Miller (in the epigraph of the second part of the novel) calls "the great fragmentation of maturity<sup>101</sup>".

Manguel corroborates the idea we have about Patrick White: his novels teach how to read, and therefore, how to translate. Two years after the publication of the article in El País, the Nobel Prize winner John Maxwell Coetzee decided to include Montevideo in his itinerary to present his lecture "The idea of a library<sup>102</sup>", focusing on the role of libraries in their domestic aspects and the concept of publishing a personal collection<sup>103</sup>. As part of the invitation to the lecture, he presented the edition of the newspaper La Diaria of 30 April 2014 with an exclusive essay, talking specifically about *The Solid Mandala*, but also calling attention to the influence of Patrick White to the Uruguayan reader:

Surely, Patrick White goes on being, in almost all senses, the greatest writer that Australia has produced. All of his novels, from *The Aunt's Story* onwards, are works fully attained, without any weak link in the chain. To him, *The Aunt's Story*, *The Solid Mandala* (1966) and *The Twyborn Affair* (1979) were the best. *Voss* was not on his list, perhaps because he was sick of being identified as "Patrick White, author of *Voss*<sup>104</sup>".

And later in the article, he summarises the importance of *The Solid Mandala*:

At one level, *The Solid Mandala* is a perfectly realistic story about the private life of two brothers with a very different psychological structure, sons of British immigrants who never integrate themselves into Australia. Patrick White was a critic of Australian society and certainly satirized many of its aspects, particularly its hostility to intellectual life. He had a sharp eye on the significant details and a sharp ear to speaking; he had read Charles Dickens and knew how to use that author's technique to create comic characters from small gestures and verbal tics. *The Solid Mandala* can be read as a minute report of the destiny of a certain kind of middle

<sup>101</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Como pronto averigüé, la dueña de la librería tenía razón: Patrick White se contó entre los pocos escritores que me enseñaron a leer. Desde El árbol del hombre me gradué a Tierra ignota, y más tarde a El vivisector y El foco de la tormenta. Leí La historia de mi tía al final, por suerte, porque aún más que los anteriores, aquella novela temprana exige, creo, una cierta experiencia de la vida y los libros -lo que Henry Miller (en el epígrafe a la segunda parte de la novela) llama "la gran fragmentación de la madurez".

102 Ibidem. In the original, "La idea de una biblioteca".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> The lecture was delivered on 5 May 2014 at Solis Theatre, in Montevideo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> COETZEE, J. M. Patrick White: *Las esferas del mandala*. Un ensayo inédito del premio Nobel J. M. Coetzee. **La Diaria**, Montevideo, 30 Apr. 2014. My translation. In the original: "Sin embargo, Patrick White sigue siendo, en casi todos los sentidos, el mayor escritor que produjo Australia. Todas sus novelas, desde La historia de la tía en adelante, son obras plenamente logradas, sin ningún eslabón débil en la cadena. Para él, La historia de la tía, Las esferas del mandala (1966) y El caso Twyborne (1979) eran los mejores. Tierra ignota no figuraba en su lista, tal vez porque estaba harto de que lo identificaran como "Patrick White, autor de Tierra ignota".

class family in a social surrounding in constant evolution in the  $20^{th}$  century Australia [my translation]<sup>105</sup>.

The words used by both Manguel and Coetzee to introduce Patrick White and *The Solid Mandala* to Uruguayan readers are adequate, but the big question remains: how will the public actually react? Now, we do look forward to seeing the new translation of *The Solid Mandala*, thus reigniting possibilities of study (and reflection) about the reception of Patrick White in the country. The summary provided by Coetzee sounds appropriate, and raises one topic which needs to be elaborated in the analysis of the translation in this dissertation: in addition to cultural and historical aspects, society needs to be taken into account to explain certain choices (as well as the "shadows on and inside Australia", as mentioned in the except) and their implications in the translated text to a general Brazilian audience.

## 2.12 PATRICK WHITE IN ARGENTINA (2016)

Alberto Manguel's testimony about his experience with Patrick White in the 1960s conveyed in the Uruguayan media was relevant to start the discussion about the reception of the Australian author in South America. However, an excerpt in that same text describing an experiment he devised to detect how Patrick White's style would be received in Buenos Aires by fellow writers and intellectuals is worth mentioning:

I tested with one or two pages with various of the writers who I knew in Buenos Aires, with uneven results. Adolfo Bioy Casares thought White was brilliant and bought all of his books; Borges didn't like him, perhaps because White's imaginative language was rather too close to Borges's himself in his first youth, when Góngora was one of his idols. Other Argentinian writers read and enjoyed White and, in the late 1960s, the prestigious Editorial Centre of Latin America, under the direction of Boris Spivacow, had planned to published many of his novels in its collection of universal classics before it was closed by the military junta. W.H. Auden once wrote that a poet's hope was "to be, like the cheese from some valley, local, but valued in other parts". In Argentina, Patrick White was valued for sure [my translation] 106.

<sup>105</sup> Ibidem. My translation. In the original: "En un nivel, *Las esferas del mandala* es una historia perfectamente realista sobre la vida íntima de dos hermanos de estructura psicológica muy diferente, hijos de inmigrantes británicos que nunca se integran en Australia. Patrick White era crítico de la sociedad australiana y por cierto satirizaba muchos aspectos de ella, en particular su hostilidad a la vida intelectual. Tenía una mirada aguda para los detalles significativos y un oído agudo para el habla; había leído a Charles Dickens y sabía cómo usar la técnica de este autor para crear personajes cómicos a partir de pequeños gestos y tics verbales. *Las esferas del mandala* puede leerse como un minucioso relato del destino de un cierto tipo de familia de clase media, en el entorno social en constante evolución de la Australia del siglo XX".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> MANGUEL, Alberto. Quién controla el mundo. El País, Montevideo, 27 Jul. 2012. Cultural. Available at: http://historico.elpais.com.uy/suplemento/cultural/quien-controla-el-mundo/cultural\_653517\_120727.html. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2014.

This dissertation gains importance not only because of the recent translations of *The* Hanging Garden in Italy and France, but also due to the remarkable events held on Australian Literature studies in general, and the book, in particular, in South America: the publication of a new translation into Spanish of Las esferas del mandala in Buenos Aires, done by Elena Marengo (by Editorial El Hilo de Ariadna), potentially reaching a broader audience, encompassing other Spanish-speaking countries. The disclosure of the Nobel Prize winner J.M. Coetzee's personal library includes 11 more titles, which will have an introductory text created by him specially for the collection, providing the reader with an overview of the book and its author, so that s/he might read it as if it were really recommended by a friend. The prefaces (ending with Coetzee's signature, thus stressing this personal characteristic of the collection) were translated by Cristina Piña, and are marked by Coetzee's elegant and effective language in outlining what would be difficult to be detected in a first reading, thus exuding his admiration for the chosen novels<sup>107</sup>: The Scarlet Letter (La letra escarlata, by Nathaniel Hawthorne, in an updated Spanish translation by José Donoso and Pilar Serrano); The marquise of O and Michael Kohlhaas (La Marquesa de O y Michael Kohlhaas, by Heinrich von Kleist, translated by Ariel Magnus; Three Women and Union (Tres mujeres y Uniones, by Robert Musil, translated by Mariana Dimópulos) and Madame Bovary (by Gustave Flaubert, translated by Graciela Isnardi) are already available. The other titles are Watt (by Samuel Beckett); The Assistant (El ayudante, by Robert Walser); Roxana, by Daniel Defoe; The Good Soldier (El buen soldado, by Ford Madox Ford); Short Stories (Relatos, by Franz Kafka); The Death of Ivan Ilyich, Master and Man and Hadji Murat (La muerte de Ivan *Ilich, Amo y criado y Hadji Murat*, by Tolstoi) and an anthology of poetry.

Basically, Coetzee follows Jorge Luis Borges's tradition of keeping a personal library and having the generous, intellectual and edifying spirit of sharing it with the public (Borges started the introduction of his personal library for the publishing-house Hyspamérica between 1985 and 1986, the year of his death, using as a criterion solely his own literary taste, and not

In the original: "Probé con una página o dos con varios de los escritores que conocía en Buenos Aires, con resultados desparejos. Adolfo Bioy Casares pensó que White era brillante y compró todos sus libros; a Borges no le gustaba, tal vez porque el lenguaje imaginista de White estaba demasiado cerca al del propio Borges en su primera juventud, cuando Góngora era uno de sus ídolos. Otros escritores argentinos leyeron y disfrutaron a White, y, a fines de los años sesenta, el prestigioso Centro Editor de América Latina, bajo la dirección de Boris Spivacow, había planeado publicar varias de sus novelas en su colección de clásicos universales antes de que fuera cerrado por la junta militar. W. H. Auden escribió una vez que la esperanza de un poeta era "ser, como el

queso de algún valle, local, pero valorado en otras partes". En Argentina, Patrick White era valorado sin duda". <sup>107</sup> If J. M. Coetzee is responsible for an introductory note for each title in the collection, in Brazil the very same

thing would be required: a brief note to appropriately contextualize the novel.

any academic canon or norm). In an interview conducted by the translator and writer Anna Kazumi Stahl, when asked about whether there was any connection among the novels he chose to compose his library (politics and literature, or fiction as a place to develop ethics), Coetzee says:

The books which mean more to me as a writer are those which broaden my horizon, which show me what is possible to achieve in fiction. Therefore, the patent thematic content of the books (what Madame Bovary exposes about the position of married women in provincial France in the mid 19<sup>th</sup> century, for example, or what Michael Kohlhaas says about the tensions between the mercantile class and the landowning class at the beginning of the Modern era in Germany) means less to me than what Flaubert can teach us about keeping emotional distance regarding the heroine about which one writes, or what Kleist can teach us about the fast narrative [my translation]<sup>108</sup>".

Thus, perhaps the most important question about the whole project was asked: what did he expect to achieve with his personal library? Would it have any significant effect on the readers? His answer is clarifying:

They are great books in themselves. Some will result more familiar to some readers; others will be less. But each one of them is able to transform the inner world of those who read them, as great texts often do<sup>109</sup>.

As already mentioned, translation is the main issue (both Stahl and Coetzee are translators), and Anna-Kazumi Stahl could not leave the question behind. She asked him about his opinion on the experience of reading in translation, and his reply is another breath of life to translators:

To read in translation will always be a second-hand experience, mainly when the original has been elaborated with extreme care. But to read a great literary work in translation will always be better than not reading it<sup>110</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> STAHL, Anna Kazumi. J. M. Coetzee: los libros preferidos de un gran autor. **La Nación**, Buenos Aires, 22 Nov. 2013. Available at: http://www.lanacion.com.ar/1640348-j-m-coetzee-los-libros-preferidos-de-un-gran-autor. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2014. In the original: "Los libros que significan más para mí como escritor son aquellos que expanden mi horizonte, que me muestran lo que es posible lograr en la ficción. Por ende, el contenido temático patente de los libros (lo que Madame Bovary expone acerca de la posición de las mujeres casadas en la Francia provinciana a mediados del siglo XIX, por ejemplo, o lo que Michael Kohlhaas dice acerca de las tensiones entre la clase mercantil y la clase terrateniente a principios de la época moderna en Alemania) significa menos para mí que lo que Flaubert nos puede enseñar acerca de mantener distancia emocional con respecto a la heroína sobre la cual uno escribe, o lo que Kleist nos puede enseñar acerca de la narración veloz."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Son grandes libros en sí mismos. Algunos resultarán más familiares para los lectores, otros menos. Pero cada uno de ellos es capaz de transformar el mundo interior del que los lee, como con frecuencia hacen los grandes textos".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Leer en traducción será siempre una experiencia de segunda mano, sobre todo cuando el original ha sido elaborado con sumo cuidado. Pero leer una gran obra literaria en traducción siempre va a ser mejor que no leerla".

After Coetzee's words, our contact with people in El Hilo de Ariadna needs to be addressed, since they are the ones who can help describe the path *The Solid Mandala* went through from its commission and acquisition of copyrights to its publication and disposition on the shelf of a bookstore. Monica Herrero is the editor-in-chief responsible for contracting the rights of the author of the original works and of the translations for J.M. Coetzee's personal collection, also performing the activities of translation and revision of each title published. The books have been published since 2013, with 4 books published per year. She summarises the objective, as well as the guidelines for the translators, of the collection in an interview conducted via e-mail:

The idea has been to offer these works to the reader in an attractive way, with few notes; it's not about annotated academic editions but editions for the full enjoyment of reading and destined to any reader interested in widening her/his universe of readings or in seeing why a Nobel Prize winner liked or chose these works [my translation]<sup>111</sup>.

The first question we asked was about the procedures for the acquisition of the copyrights of the Spanish translation (the information available was that they belonged to Barral Editores, from Barcelona). Her reply is transcribed here:

Seix Barral no longer had those copyrights. The contract had expired. We did a search for the copyrights of the author and we managed to contact the literary agent who represents the copyrights of the author. We made a proposal and signed an acquisition contract of the copyrights for the translation into Spanish [my translation]<sup>112</sup>.

At the time of the interview, there was no official information about the possible translator(s) chosen to deal with *The Solid Mandala*. The only known names connected to the project were José Danoso, Pilar Serrano and Cristina Piña, so it was natural that we asked whether they would also be involved in translating Patrick White into Spanish. Monica Herrero provided us with the answer: "The translator of this novel is Elena Marengo, who had the assistance of John M. Coetzee himself to clarify some doubts mainly about Australia and dialectal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> HERRERO, Mónica. **Contacto el hilo de Ariadna** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 4 Sept. 2014. In the original: "La idea ha sido ofrecer al lector estas obras de una forma atractiva, con pocas notas, no se trata de ediciones académicas anotadas sino de ediciones para el pleno disfrute de la lectura y destinadas a cualquier lector interesado en ampliar su universo de lecturas o tratar de ver por qué a un Premio Nobel estas obras le gustaron o las eligió".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Seix Barral ya no tenía esos derechos. Había vencido el contrato. Hicimos una búsqueda de los derechos de autor y conseguimos contactar a la agente literaria que representa a los herederos del autor. Le hicimos una propuesta y firmamos un contrato de adquisición de derechos de traducción al español".

questions on the local English<sup>113</sup>". Considering that the initial idea was that there would be three people entitled to perform the translation, we asked about the division of work, i.e., how the novels had been distributed? Her reply about the editorial workflow needs mentioning:

In the collection Biblioteca Personal John M. Coetzee we have been concerned with offering new translations of the works of already existing translations done by professionals of uncontroversial prestige in the editorial domain in the Spanish language. Such is the case of José Donoso and Pilar Serrano, who had already translated *La letra escarlata* by Nathaniel Hawthorne and who licensed the copyrights for the translation. Another analogous case is that of the Mexican professor Sergio Pitol with the translation of *El buen soldado* by Ford Madox Ford, which is going to be published next year in this collection [my translation]<sup>114</sup>.

Considering that the novel already had a translation available, done in 1973, it seemed appropriate to ask whether they had the idea of trying to use the material published back in the 1970s in Spain, or if the editors simply decided to translate it again entirely, taking into account that translations need to be revised periodically. Herrero's reply is interesting:

Exactly, with the case of *The Solid Mandala*, the existing translation is very good. Azcárate did it, although for moments it is a little outdated. Nevertheless, we would have liked to obtain it and work with the translator. Unfortunately, this was not possible and, due to a matter of time, we decided to seek a translator of our full confidence who faced the task [my translation]<sup>115</sup>.

The interview was conducted in 2014, so we asked about a possible date for the book's release. To our surprise, the answer was: "Yes, the translation is ready. I'm finishing revising it and the editorial plan is to launch it this year, until the year's end" Another contact was made in November 2014:

The book will be out either at the end of this year or at the beginning of the next. In general, at the Book Fair of Buenos Aires we make the presentations. However, we have not planned it yet, so I do not have a date. But when I do, I will

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "La traductora de esta novela es Elena Marengo, quien contó con la asistencia del propio John M. Coetzee para aclarar algunas dudas sobre todo respecto de Australia y de cuestiones dialectales del inglés del lugar".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "En la colección Biblioteca Personal John M. Coetzee hemos tratado de ofrecer nuevas traducciones de las obras o traducciones ya existentes hechas por profesionales de indiscutido prestigio en el medio editorial de la lengua española. Tal es el caso de José Donoso y Pilar Serrano, quienes ya habían traducido *La letra escarlata* de Nathaniel Hawthorne y nos licenciaron los derechos de traducción. Otro caso análogo es el del maestro mexicano Sergio Pitol con la traducción de *El buen soldado* de Ford Madoxx Ford, que saldrá el año que viene dentro de esta colección".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Justamente, con el caso de *The Solid Mandala*, la traducción existente es muy buena, la hizo Azcárate, aunque por momentos está un poco antigua. No obstante, nos hubiera gustado conseguirla y trabajar con el traductor. Lamentablemente, no fue posible y, por cuestiones de tiempo, decidimos buscar una traductora de nuestra entera confianza que encarara el trabajo."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Sí, la traducción está lista. La estoy terminando de revisar y el plan editorial es que salga este año, hacia final de año".

let you know in time. We have already finished the editing process and we are waiting for the design department to send us the galleys<sup>117</sup>.

The most recent contact with the editor-in-chief provided a very pertinent explanation for the release of the book:

It has just gone into print and will be distributed by the first days of April. I will let you know when they tell me, but I think John M. Coetzee will arrive on the first days of April (before the Fair) and there we will have the opportunity to make the presentation of this title of his Personal Library<sup>118</sup>.

The Brazilian translator – whose recent published works include the translations of *Dracula* (2014) and *Contos da Cantuária* (*The Cantebury Tales*), both by the publishing house Companhia das Letras –, José Francisco Botelho needs to be quoted here, as

the new translation of an important classic at first sight immediately signals the conjunction of two forces: the always renewable character of the original work and the vigour of the literature which again receives it<sup>119</sup>.

Precisely, John M. Coetzee arrived in Argentina on the first days of April, and the reason for his visit is closely related to the many remarkable cultural festivities which took place during the Fería Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires (International Book Fair of Buenos Aires): the inauguration of the eponymous Chair at Universidad San Martín (UNSAM), whose main purpose is to make us "[...] start seeing the South through Southern eyes<sup>120</sup>"; the chair "Literatures of the South" (Literaturas del Sur") aims at being a space for reflection and interchange regarding Africa, Australia and Latin America. This idea came from UNSAM and was enthusiastically accepted by Coetzee.

<sup>117</sup> HERRERO, Mónica. **Lanzamiento** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 3 Nov. 2014. In the original: "El libro saldrá o a fines de este año a principios del que viene. Por lo general, en la feria del Libro de Buenos Aires hacemos las presentaciones. Todavía no lo tenemos planeado así que no tengo fecha, pero en cuanto la tenga, aviso con tempo. Ya terminamos el proceso de edición, estamos esperando que el departamento de diseño nos mande las galeras".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> HERRERO, Mónica. **Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 4 Mar. 2015. In the original: "Acaba de entrar en imprenta y estará distribuido para los primeros días de abril. Te cuento en cuanto me digan, pero creo que John M. Coetzee viene los primeros días de abril (antes de la Feria) y allí aprovecharemos para hacer la presentación de este título de su Biblitoeca Personal".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> BOTELHO, José Francisco. O 'Hamlet' de Lawrence Pereira. **Correio do Povo**, Porto Alegre, 28 nov. 2015. Caderno de Sábado. In the original: "A nova tradução de um grande clássico sinaliza, logo à primeira vista, a conjunção de duas forças: o cárater sempre renovável da obra original e o vigor da literatura que torna a recebêla"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> NOTICIAS UNSAM. Arrancó la cátedra Coetzee en el Campus: "Comencemos a ver el Sur a través de ojos sureños". Available at: http://noticias.unsam.edu.ar/2015/04/08/arranco-la-catedra-coetzee-en-el-campus-comencemos-a-ver-el-sur-a-traves-de-ojos-surenos/. Accessed on: 5 May 2015. In the original: "Comencemos a ver el Sur a través de ojos sureños".

The seminar "Literatures of the South" belongs to the Centre of Latin American Studies of the School of Humanities at UNSAM. The 32-hour workload is divided into 17 hours face-to-face and 15 dedicated to reading. The UNSAM provost Carlos Ruta, the academic coordinator of the Chair, Anna Kasumi-Stahl, and Coetzee spent their summer working to be able to start the classes in April 2015. The syllabus includes 6 sessions (The Poetry of the South; Indigenous Literature; Home, Anxiety and Displacement; Asian Australia; Regions, Spaces and Creatures; and Imaginary Lives). In analyzing the bibliography of each session, we find Patrick White in two sessions: The Poetry of the South with the discussion of Chapter 16 of *The Literature of Australia* (talking about *Voss*), and in Regions, Spaces and Creatures with the short story *Down at the Dump*. The syllabus again reinforces the mission of the course: "The students will be invited to think about the convergences and divergences between the writing in Australia and the writing in Argentina<sup>121</sup>".

According to Carlos Ruta, "Literature has to help place us into contact with other worlds no matter how far or unknown they are 122". The challenge of these classes is summarised by Coetzee:

One of the things that I hope to achieve in this course is to acknowledge the literature of the South about the South, a literature which ignores the look from the North and sees the South as a home and not as a place that one visits for a short time. I hope we can start seeing it through austral eyes, instead of seeing it through northern eyes, as the Other North<sup>123</sup>.

It is admirable that the provost of UNSAM became interested and accepted the challenge of supporting this sort of activity, which complements the Global South Programme (Programa Sur Global), which fosters experiences in many fields of study "to bring worlds together<sup>124</sup>". Ruta believes that literature should be a central part of those experiences of

<sup>121</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Se invitará a los estudiantes a reflexionar sobre las convergencias y divergencias entre la escritura en Australia y la escritura en Argentina".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> POLACK, María Elena. Coetzee, un premio Nobel suelto en Buenos Aires. **La Nación**, Buenos Aires. 8 Apr. 2015. Available at: http://www.lanacion.com.ar/1782522-coetzee-un-premio-nobel-suelto-en-buenos-aires. Accessed on: 12 Aug. 2015. In the original: "La literatura tiene que ayudar a ponernos en contacto con otros mundos por lejanos o desconocidos que sean".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Una de las cosas que espero que logremos en este curso es dar reconocimiento a la literatura del Sur sobre el Sur, una literatura que ignora la mirada del Norte y ve al Sur como un hogar y no como un lugar que uno visita por un breve tiempo. Espero que podamos comenzar a verlo a través de ojos australes, en vez de verlo a través de ojos norteños, como el Otro Norte".

<sup>124</sup> In the original: "Este es un gran desafío para nuestra universidad. Este proyecto busca hacer una experiencia para acercar mundos. Estamos convencidos de que necesitamos conocer experiencias hermanas de países del sur; estamos tratando de hacerlo en diversas disciplinas a través del Programa Sur Global. Creemos que es central poner en el núcleo de esta experiencia de diálogo a la literatura como una de las mejores formas para poner en contacto estas experiencias". NOTICIAS UNSAM. Arrancó la cátedra Coetzee en el Campus: "Comencemos a

dialogue and contact. Differently from the experience of lack of interest reported by professor David Callahan in Portugal, we need to highlight the opposite effect in Argentina: there were no seats left in the Teatro Tornavía for the students. Some of them had to remain standing or sit on the floor for more than two hours, but once one considers the rewarding – albeit uncomfortable – opportunity of seeing a Nobel Prize winner in person and delivering a lecture, almost everything is endured.

J. M. Coetzee's explanation about the division of South-North is paramount to start understanding the objective of this intellectual enterprise in Argentina. To him, there are two conceptions fighting between themselves in connection to the South: the dominant one, championing globalization and political economy, places the South as "a territory of oppression and exploitation, in opposition to the North, the territory of global capital". Following this idea, Africa and Latin America are part of the South, together with most of Asia (excluding Japan). Australia, on the other hand, totally placed to the South of the Equator, belongs to the North, along with the United States, the North of Rio Grande and most of Europe. Therefore, there is not any geographical basis in this division, only relations of economic power. The other paradigm devised by Coetzee is mythical: Africa was the first place of this mythical South, with its people, animals and natural wealth 125.

As part of the efforts established still in 2013, Coetzee returned to Argentina in 2015 and 2016 not only to launch his book, but also to continue the new trend which, like the ashes of Southern volcanos, hopefully will reach Brazil, as well: the study of the literatures of the Southern Hemisphere, considering not only Australia, but also South Africa and Latin America, juxtaposing those reading experiences. The University of San Martín, in Buenos Aires, has accepted this challenge, in an intellectual partnership with the Writing and Society Research Centre in the University of Western Sydney. This dissertation intends to explain in

\_\_

ver el Sur a través de ojos sureños". Available at: http://noticias.unsam.edu.ar/2015/04/08/arranco-la-catedracoetzee-en-el-campus-comencemos-a-ver-el-sur-a-traves-de-ojos-surenos/. Accessed on: 5 May 2015. 125 In the original: "Existen, me parece a mí, dos concepciones que compiten entre sí en relación al Sur. La dominante proviene de la economía política contemporánea y su discurso de globalización. Esta concepción posiciona al Sur, el territorio de la opresión y la explotación, en contra del Norte, el territorio del capital global. En este paradigma, África y América Latina pertenecen al Sur, junto con la mayor parte de Asia (sin incluir a Japón). Ahora bien, Australia, el séptimo continente, acostado totalmente al sur del Ecuador, pertenece al Norte, junto con Estados Unidos, el norte de Río Grande y la mayor parte de Europa. En otras palabras, esta es una división Norte-Sur que le presta poca atención a la geografía. Está mucho más interesada en las relaciones de poder y específicamente en las relaciones de poder económico" [...] "La otra concepción del Sur es la que llamo mítica. África fue el primer lugar de este Sur mítico, un continente de gente salvaje, animales bizarros y una enorme riqueza sin explotar. Luego, después de 1492, América se convirtió en el Sur de Europa. Finalmente, a fines del siglo XVIII, navegantes europeos descubrieron Australia. Pero incluso antes de eso, los sabios ya habían especulado que debía existir un continente en los mares del sur para equilibrar las masas de tierra del norte". NOTICIAS UNSAM. Arrancó la cátedra Coetzee en el Campus: "Comencemos a ver el Sur a través de ojos sureños". Available at: http://noticias.unsam.edu.ar/2015/04/08/arranco-la-catedra-coetzee-en-el-campuscomencemos-a-ver-el-sur-a-traves-de-ojos-surenos/. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

detail how the initiative has been carried out. The Australian professor and writer Gail Jones, in an interview to La Nación, expressed her curiosity "to find out whether the writers of the South share certain formal and thematic preoccupations and why to write in the periphery seems, at this moment, more vigorous than in the old imperial metropolis [...]<sup>126</sup>". The Australian professor and writer Nicholas Jose, Gail Jones's colleague at the University of Western Sydney, stated that the chair "it's not so much about looking at the South, but from the South, looking at all the parts of the South, looking at the East and West. It's a position from and not to. It's a poetic idea associated to open spaces 127". Surely, questions will begin to be answered and made "in the exchanges between professors and students of literature, and between the writers of Argentina, Australia and South Africa, during the visits to Buenos Aires<sup>128</sup>".

<sup>126</sup> POLACK, María Elena. Coetzee, un premio Nobel suelto en Buenos Aires. La Nación, Buenos Aires, 8 Apr. 2015. In the original: "Tengo curiosidad por descubrir si los escritores del Sur comparten ciertas preocupaciones formales y temáticas y por qué escribir en la periferia parece, en este momento, más vigoroso que en las antiguas metrópolis imperiales. [...]"Tengo la esperanza de un nuevo modelo de la solidaridad imaginativa- a surgir entre los escritores del Sur. Compartimos historias del colonialismo, la migración y los disturbios internos de diversos tipos".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "No es tanto mirar al Sur, sino desde el Sur, mirar todas las partes del Sur, mirar al Este y al Oeste. Es una posición desde y no hacia. Es una idea poética asociada a espacios abiertos".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Ibidem. In the original: "Es una pregunta que vamos a empezar a responder en los intercambios entre profesores y estudiantes de literatura, y entre los escritores de la Argentina y de Australia y Sudáfrica, durante las visitas a Buenos Aires".

### 3 READING AND TRANSLATION: PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS

It is possible to say that to read is to translate. When we read a novel, we end up translating in one way or another its images, connotations and so many other consciously or unconsciously relevant aspects in one's mind, triggering feelings, past events, changes in outlook, and so on. In a dissertation about translation, the concept of reading, intrinsically so complex and at the same time fascinating in its attempts of definition (what is it to read?), has theoretical implications. In this chapter, we will focus on the activity of reading Patrick White nowadays in his homeland, Australia, and in my homeland, Brazil, trying to outline the effects the reading done in these two places might generate when translating one of his books into Brazilian Portuguese, with some parts of the translation process happening in Australia.

The claim made by many theorists (in the fields of Philosophy, Psychology, etc.) that reading literature (for example, reading Dostoyevsky) does not make us better people in both social and moral terms due to a lack of strong evidence to support this idea has been defied recently by studies carried out in Canada by professors Raymond Mar (York University) and Keith Oatley (University of Toronto), who came to the conclusion that individuals who read fiction tend to be better able to understand other people, empathize with them and view the world from their perspective. Moreover, the importance of believing in literature (and keep on translating it) is vital nowadays in order to teach the younger generation how to become "deep readers" who enter a state which psychologist Victor Nell compares to a "hypnotic trance<sup>129</sup>", in which readers manage to establish an intimate relationship with the author through a fast decoding of words while keeping an unhurried progress on the page. According to the literary critic Frank Kermode, this type of reading is called "spiritual", in opposition to "carnal reading", which is the kind currently practiced by young people, characterized by pragmatism and instrumentalism, and which "are much the same. Spiritual readings are all different" (KERMODE, 1979, p. 9).

This work is the result of my spiritual reading of *The Solid Mandala*, which has been done throughout the last 7 years of contact with Patrick White's oeuvre. If we have not given up so far, it was because we uphold this idea of providing the Brazilian reader, if not with an entire translation, at least with some comments about it at academic level. Furthermore, we call attention to the kind of reader we need to be, which, according to Vladimir Nabokov, is what we have always been: a rereader, because "[...] curiously enough, one cannot *read* a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> PAUL, Annie M. Reading Literature Makes Us Smarter and Nicer. **Time Magazine**, New York City, 3 June 2013. Available at: http://ideas.time.com/2013/06/03/why-we-should-read-literature/. Accessed on: 5 May 2016.

book: one can only reread it. A good reader, a major reader, an active and creative reader is a rereader 130". In effect, in this work, which lasted 4 years, we performed the task of rereading *The Solid Mandala* many times and for many purposes: to understand the story, to find pleasure in its plot, to learn new cultural elements, to translate the new knowledge to a Brazilian reader. Yet, we hope for many rereadings of the novel, either in the original in English, or in the many translations described in this work.

## 3.1 READING PATRICK WHITE IN AUSTRALIA

It is necessary to start with a true, although apparently rather brutal, summary about Patrick White's status in his homeland, written (and purposely chosen for this dissertation) in the review of *The Hanging Garden*, by John Sutherland in *The New York Times*:

The most cross-grained of writers, Patrick White went out of his way to mention, in acknowledging his 1973 Nobel Prize in Literature, that a newspaper had labeled him "Australia's most unreadable novelist." He wore the insult with pride. It did not mean he wasn't Australia's greatest novelist — which he knew he was. But White was never loved by his countrymen, who found his outspoken views of them and their homeland unpalatable. Australia, White said, proved you could recycle excrement. It's hard to forgive a remark like that. More so as White used a blunter term than "excrement" <sup>131</sup>.

The Brazilian scholar Déborah Scheidt starts the second chapter of her Master's thesis with a question asked by her Australian friend: "Are you sure you want to do a thesis on Patrick White – a crotchety old man – but a wonderful writer?" (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 38). Surely, he still holds that image of an old and grumpy person, who avoided smiling in pictures because he did not feel very comfortable about his dentures. White's quite uncivilized reactions when accosted by journalists and reporters, his frequent declines to lecture and speak in public, and his strong remarks about Australian society comprise this sort of myth which becomes a barrier to explain why he should be read again nowadays. However, Alan Lawson tried to demystify this by saying that Patrick White's work has received more "sustained and informed and consistent attention in Australia that anywhere else<sup>132</sup>". He is quite right, but we cannot deny that Patrick White still holds a quite negative status in his homeland. Thus, it is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> NABOKOV, Vladimir. Lectures on Literature. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1980. p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> SUTHERLAND, John. Trouble Down Under: 'The Hanging Garden,' by Patrick White. **The New York Times**, New York, 24 May 2013. Sunday Book Review. Available at:

http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/26/books/review/the-hanging-garden-by-patrick-white.html?\_r=1. Accessed on: 24 May 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> LAWSON, Alan (ed.). **Patrick White: Selected Writings**. St. Lucia, Qld.: University of Queensland Press, 1994, p. xii.

not so difficult to imagine the huge challenge the translation into Brazilian Portuguese of one of his titles represents, let alone the reception of such translation.

Reading is an activity which today often appears to be forgotten by the young (and by adults, as well), given the many other distractions available provided by the Internet and many other devices. In "Elogio de la lectura" ("Praise of Reading" in a free translation), Alberto Manguel says that "reading is one of the happiest, most generous and most effective ways of being conscious<sup>133</sup>", thus, we hope to raise consciousness in this endeavour involving *A sólida mandala* in Brazilian Portuguese.

Since this dissertation is about the translation of *The Solid Mandala*, a search was performed on the AustLit database to see whether the book appears in syllabi across the country. La Trobe University (located in Melbourne) had the book listed on two subjects: Contemporary Approaches to Fiction<sup>134</sup> (first semester of 2015) and Contemporary Approaches to Literature<sup>135</sup> (first semester of 2014). The University of Sydney had the book listed for the subject Revolutionary Writing? 1960s & beyond in the first semester of 2015<sup>136</sup> and in the first semester of 2011<sup>137</sup>, and for Australian Literature 1960-1988 in the second semester of 2009<sup>138</sup>. Therefore, *The Solid Mandala* happily has a place in contemporary syllabi, although in few universities and subjects. Comparatively, White's main novels tend to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> MANGUEL, Alberto. Elogio de la lectura. **El País**, Madrid. 22 Apr. 2006. In the original: [...] "Quienes tenemos la fortuna de ser lectores sabemos que es así, puesto que la lectura es una de las formas más alegres, más generosas, más eficaces de ser conscientes." Available at:

http://elpais.com/diario/2006/04/22/babelia/1145662750\_850215.html. Accessed on: 10 Mar. 2015.

The other books on the list were: *Carpentaria*, by Alexis Wright *Othello* and *Twelfth Night*, by William Shakespeare, *The Road*, by Cormac McCarthy, *Paradise Lost*, by John Milton, *March*, by Geraldine Brooks, *The Long Song*, by Andrea Levy, *Loaded*, by Christos Tsiolkas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> The objective of the subject was to make students "read a body of work that traverses five centuries of literature in English, from Shakespeare to the present, and across three or more continents. The distinct approach taken in this subject brings together the close study of individual texts on one hand, and considerations of very contemporary debates, concepts and theoretical approaches on the other. It revisits the traditions that have shaped literary studies, looking at the ways literary texts arise from, depart from and return to orthodoxy; it studies different genres across time and place; it looks at 'time' and 'place' themselves; it looks at contestations over artistic "centres" and "margins", and the effects on these of theories and politics of decolonization, sexuality and gender.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> The other books enlisted were: *Monkey Grip*, by Helen Garner, *Tirra Lirra by the River*, by Jessica Anderson, *The Watch Tower*, by Elizabeth Harrower, *Wild Cat Falling*, by Colin Johnson.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> The 1960s were a time of international cultural and social upheaval. A new range of cultural influences, drugs, pop art, sexual, women's and gay liberation, and the predominantly American counter-culture, influenced a new generation of Australian writers. Bush realism gave way to previously censored subject material - sex, drugs, anti-Vietnam War sentiment - and innovative forms of writing. This unit of study investigates these issues through the works of some of the key writers of this period.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> This unit of study aims to introduce some of the key writers of this period. It will also encourage students to develop reading skills appropriate to different genres and to acquire an awareness of issues, movements and critical debates that have been central to the development of recent Australian literature.

appear more. For example, looking for *Voss*, we find 27 occurrences<sup>139</sup>. For *The Aunt's Story*, we see 24 occurrences.

The lack of some of White's novels was already a problem in 2011, when *The Solid Mandala* was not available in new editions in Australia (the problem persisted in 2013, as that specific title was not on the shelves). However, other titles by Patrick White deserved new editions with interesting introductory notes, such as *Happy Valley*, published by Vintage in 2012 (as part of the celebrations of Patrick White's centenary).

Nevertheless, it is quite difficult to find many positive reactions, or mind-blowing comments, about Patrick White nowadays. What has happened? Why is it that the following depiction of White's reception no longer applies?

Letters from unknown readers gave him the most straightforward pleasure, and he could boast unselfconsciously of them arriving in great bundle at Dogwoods. *The Tree of Man* was a book which seemed to change many lives. White wrote to Huebsch, 'I am having wonderful reactions here and there round the world. People are stealing copies.' Later he was delighted to hear *The Tree of Man* was 'popular with truck drivers'. When Australia seemed unbearable and he was tempted to find somewhere more congenial to live, White found a reason for staying in the letters from 'unknown Australians for whom my writing seems to have opened a window'. In a world White saw split into armed camps, these men and women were his foot soldiers (MARR, 1995, p. 306).

There would be five possible reasons to explain why this situation does not happen nowadays. First: Patrick White's modernism might no longer fit in a post-modern world. So how does one explain that William Faulkner, James Joyce and Virginia Woolf remain in the spotlight, given they were all part of the same group of writers who believed that there was a distinction between literary art and popular texts, describing in their writings that the old certainties supported by religion and politics were in conflict with the experiences and feelings of the modern era. Second: Patrick White is far too pessimistic about life. Yes, he might be considered pessimistic, but he shows reality without any kind of mask (see Waldo's part of *The Solid Mandala*, for instance), shocking the reader into a sort of acknowledgment, one that might not be viewed as a positive trait in his art. However, how can we explain the American playwright Eugene O'Neill's appeal? People do not look for a little cheering-up when reading his plays, yet he is viewed as a great artist. Third: Patrick White's homosexuality is a problem. We rarely look for the author's sexual option when enjoying literature, thus, this would not really be an issue to account for White's neglect. Fourth: Patrick White was Australian, so his peripheral origin would prevent the world from reading

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> As for the research carried out on 19 June 2015.

him more. This argument might be the only plausible one, as there is a sort of domination in the publishing media. One might think: why should an American or English reader look for the literature produced by a country famous for kangaroos, koalas, wildlife, beautiful beaches and an accent which is mimicked in comedy films? Fifth: that the characters devised and penned by White do not live, i. e., that they do not convince the reader to be on their side throughout the plot, although supported by elaborate linguistic finery would be a quite simplistic argument. Voss and Laura Trevelyan are icons to the ones familiar with White's universe, and the substance used to create them came from real events. In the case of *The Solid Mandala*, three of the novel's characters find their substance in real people (although it might be argued that they do not "live" as literary characters): Waldo would be White at his "coldest and worst" (WHITE, 1983, p. 146-147); Arthur in his cousin Philip Garland; and Mrs Poulter, in his actual neighbor Mrs H., at Castle Hill.

Just to depict how literature has been treated in Australia, an experiment was carried out (possibly by the journalist Jennifer Sexton) in 2006<sup>140</sup> (the article describing it was published in The Australian). Using the name Wraith Picket (some would even suggest the alternative Keith Crapwit), Chapter 3 from The Eye of the Storm was sent to 12 publishers and agents in the country. Obviously that the names of the characters were changed, including the title: The Eye of the Cyclone. Two of those who received the material had not replied after three months. The remaining rejected the text, with the highest compliment being "clever". Some of those who received the material even suggested that Mr Picket should look for a book by the English literary critic David Lodge on how to write fiction (probably the title was The Art of Fiction). Others, such as Pan Macmillan, recommended that he join writers' workshops. Mark Latham's agent, Mary Cunnane, said the author should read Penguin Book's The Art of Writing. A form rejection letter was sent by Text Publishing, which at the time was so very proud of publishing Australian Literature. Harper Collins, according to the journalist, simply disregarded the material. Some might question the choice of what was sent; however, five years after the experiment, in 2011, The Eye of the Storm would become the first novel by White adapted into a film (screenplay by Judy Morris and directed by Fred Schepisi). According to Kerryn Goldsworthy, writing for the Australian political website *Crikey*, three facts stood out in the whole process:

<sup>140</sup> SEXTON, Jennifer. White Rejections Speak Volumes on Cultural Arbiters. **The Australian**, Sydney, 17 Jul. 2006.

a) the bad faith of the entrapment, the smugness of its aftermath and the shabby [...] reactionary agenda behind the exercise; b) the failure of the agents and publishers' readers who rejected the chapter to recognize either the actual novel or, at the very least, White's unique, highly spottable style, and the incontrovertible evidence it provides that people getting jobs in Australian publishing houses have clearly not seen fit to make it their business to read a little Australian writing, or (c) the unambiguously, unashamedly and exclusively commercial agenda behind some of the rejections<sup>141</sup>.

This lack of knowledge coming from those responsible for selecting what is going to be published or not might be connected to the crisis in Australian arts in general.

The Brazilian scholar Déborah Scheidt, writing in 1997, already suggested that Patrick White, more specifically, had an aura of controversy surrounding his work, and that two opposing views needed consideration. The first one, championed by Alan Lawson, is more positive, and has as its main argument the 1973 Nobel award:

White's texts have for some time occupied a position of canonical authority at the centre of the field of Australian literary culture. In that sense, he is modern(ist) Australian literature's equivalent of Henry Lawson. In an important sense he cannot be displaced, just as Henry Lawson has not been displaced from *his* keystone position in the widely-familiar, earlier, populist, masculinist edifice of Australian literature. The example of Henry Lawson's posthumous reception has taught us (like recent arguments over Shakespeare's canonicity) that too much value has already been added to the figure of Lawson (or Shakespeare or White) for him to be displaceable. What does happen is that Lawson (or Shakespeare) becomes a sign of cultural value which is filled from time to time with different content; and this too will happen to the figure of White. Figures of this magnitude are not demolished or forgotten, but they do become sites of struggle which are fought over precisely because they are positions (possessions, signs, icons) of cultural value and power (LAWSON, 1994, p. viii-ix).

The second one, championed by Simon During, is that, in the future (which is our present), White's oeuvre will be destined to oblivion. His frequent classification as a post-colonial writer derives, according to During, from White's success in promoting himself by offering the type of literature that Australia was looking for while the country was getting over the populist myth to establish its own identity. During prophesies that White will not significantly influence or have any connotation in Australian Literature, remaining a name often cited in literary history, but not actually read.

It is with this background of crisis that we read Patrick White in Australia. The lack of interest in his reading is a result of a broader disinterest in literature and arts as a whole, which might be part of a culture that prefers to praise athletes and other important figures, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> GOLDSWORTHY, Kerryn. Shock: Australian publishers reject Patrick White novel. **Crikey**, Melbourne, 17 Jul. 2006. Available at: http://www.crikey.com.au/2006/07/17/shock-australian-publishers-reject-patrick-white-novel/?wpmp\_switcher=mobile#2006/07/17-1138-9739. Accessed on: 18 Jun. 2015.

not writers/intellectuals. To fight such disinterest, governmental intervention is often necessary (such as the initiatives to grant funds to boost translations of Australian novels abroad). However, the negative points have not diminished our enthusiasm and determination in the task of translating *The Solid Mandala* in Brazil, because, as the Australian scholar Georgina Loveridge says, we need to "continue the conversations about White's fiction [...] that span the social, political and metaphysical, the national and international, the personal and universal<sup>142</sup>". Together with the efforts already in action in Australia, with this dissertation featuring the translation process of one more novel by Patrick White, we intend to use translation as a means to promote Australian Literature overseas and, why not, in the country as well.

#### 3.2 READING PATRICK WHITE IN BRAZIL

All reading is translation, and every translator is, at first, a reader, as Xavier Franco Aixelá points out:

From a strictly chronological viewpoint, the translator is also a reader, before being a (re)writer. At this point of linguistics and semiotics, it seems quite illusory to expect that a text (or since we mention it, any utterance) can have a single meaning equal to the emitter and to any receiver, mainly if we take into account, among other factors, the evident disparity of each individual's idiolect and the polyssemic and connotative potential accompanying any semantically charged component of a natural language <sup>143</sup> (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 48, my translation).

To complement Aixelá's statement, it is pertinent to consider Ian Alexander's view which will guide the reading for the translation of *The Solid Mandala*, whose results will be readily discussed in this work:

When we teach literature, we present a view of the world, when we tell the story of our literature, we present a view about our place in the world. What will we teach to our children about their literature? About their place in the world? What we need is not the formalist reading of the New Criticism, which impoverishes the texts by taking them away from their context, nor the national reading of the

<sup>142</sup> LOVERIDGE, Georgina. Review: Remembering Patrick White: Contemporary Critical Essays. Eds. Elizabeth McMahon and Brigitta Olubas. In: **JASAL**, n. 10. Available online at: http://www.nla.gov.au/openpublish/index.php/jasal/article/view/1781/2226. Accessed on: 21 Jun. 2015. 143 In the original: "Desde un ponto de vista estrictamente cronológico, el traductor es también, antes que (re)escritor, un lector. A estas alturas de la lingüística y de la semiótica, parece bastante ilusorio pretender que un texto (o ya que estamos, cualquier enunciado) pueda tener un significado único e igual para el emisor y para cualquier receptor, sobre todo si tenemos en cuenta, entre otros factores, la evidente disparidad del idioleto de cada individuo y el potencial polisémico y conotativo que acompaña a cualquier componente semánticamente cargado de una lengua natural (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 48).

Romanticism, which impoverishes literature by presupposing that its only context is the nation. We do not need a reading which overestimates "the margin", as if it were intrinsically more ethical or more enlightening to be born and think far from the big centres, nor a reading abstractedly distant, as if the western tradition had exactly the same outlines in all places (ALEXANDER, 2006, p. 14-15, my translation)<sup>144</sup>.

Thus, what does it mean to read (and translate) Patrick White in Brazil? What about translating literature from that point in the world? Certainly, the reading, predominantly done in Brazil, will exude in the choices made in the translation, as they will evince the many elements involved when coping with specific aspects of the text created by Patrick White between two places: Sydney and Porto Alegre.

As already explained in the previous chapter, it is not a smooth task to read Patrick White in Brazil in Portuguese, given the translations are not easily available. Specifically, in order to translate *The Solid Mandala*, it was paramount to get to know the novels by Patrick White translated and published in Brazil. Therefore, for the purposes of this dissertation, we will consider the materiality of what is available so as to produce a better outcome for the Brazilian reader when s/he eventually takes in her/his hand (or online) the text of *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese.

Paratextual elements, following Gérard Genette's theory, condition one's reading, creating the horizon of expectation. Hence, we proceed to a brief paratextual analysis of the two novels published in Brazilian Portuguese. If we are readers in Brazil eager to savour White's writing, there is nothing more appropriate than to look at the information provided by the elements on the front and back flaps of the books. As a researcher, this is paramount to depict a more realistic picture of what the Brazilian reader has at her/his disposal up to now about Patrick White in translation.

### 3.2.1 A árvore do homem

Starting with *A árvore do homem*, two editions are under analysis: one is the Portuguese translation published in 1973 by Publicações Dom Quixote and the other is the Brazilian edition published in 1980 by the now extinct Círculo do Livro. This publishing-house had a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> In the original: "Quando ensinamos a literatura, apresentamos uma visão do mundo, quando contamos a história da nossa literatura, apresentamos uma visão sobre o nosso lugar no mundo. O que vamos ensinar para os nossos filhos sobre a sua literatura? Sobre o seu lugar no mundo? O que precisamos não é a leitura formalista da Nova Crítica, que empobrece os textos ao tirá-los do seu contexto, nem a leitura nacionalista do romantismo, que empobrece a literatura ao pressupor que o seu único contexto seja a nação. Não precisamos de uma leitura que sobrevalorize "a margem", como se fosse intrinsecamente mais ético ou mais esclarecedor nascer e pensar longe dos grandes centros, nem de uma leitura abstratamente distanciada, como se a tradição ocidental tivesse exatamente os mesmos contornos em todos os lugares" (ALEXANDER, 2006, p. 14-15).

praiseworthy trajectory in its mission to spread the access of translated books in Brazil, to some extent following what the famous Brazilian writer Monteiro Lobato had always thought: "A nation is made by men and books<sup>145</sup>" (KOSHIYAMA, 1982, p. 99). According to his point of view, Brazil needed more literature from other places other than France, the dominant country in Brazilian intellectual circles at the time, so he helped initiate the importation of works composed in English. Lobato is a notable name in the movement which highlights the "spiritual enrichment" (LOBATO, 1964, p. 125-130) provided by translations, and was always calling attention to the lack of good translations from other languages, including authors such as Homer, Sophocles, Herodotus, Plutarch, Aeschylus, Shakespeare, Goethe, Schiller, Molière, Rabelais and Ibsen, in Brazil. In his view, "The Brazilian reader needs light, air and new horizons, wide-open windows in her/his dark prison" (MILTON, 2003, p. 213-214).

Were he alive today, at least regarding translations of Australian novels, he would be appalled: Patrick White in a Brazilian Portuguese translation reached our public only 12 years after his Nobel Prize award. Would Patrick White have shaken the minds of people had he been translated earlier in Brazil? Would White have introduced Australia in the Brazilian reader's mind?

On the cover of the Portuguese edition (composed in three colours: dark green, pale green and black), the first information (from the upper left corner downwards, which is the more frequent direction of reading) is the identification of the book as belonging to the collection Prémio Nobel (thus inferring that the book in question has been written by a Nobel-Prize winner). The drawing that follows resembles a very big and hairy gum tree, with the name of the author appearing in big letters and, immediately under it, the title of the book in capital letters (A ÁRVORE DO HOMEM). On the back cover, there is a picture of Patrick White followed by three paragraphs describing his literary attitude, style and context.

On the cover of the Brazilian edition (composed in warm colours in shades of orange, brown, red and yellow, together with black), there is the name of the author, with the title immediately under it (in capital letters as well) and no reference to any Nobel award. There is the drawing of a couple (the man supporting a shovel to the ground and the woman holding a child in her arms) in the foreground. In the background, there is a barn, together with trees and a cart. There are not any texts on the back cover, nor are there any flaps. About the cover, Patrick White had some complaints when he saw the first batch sent from the publisher

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> In the original: "Um país se faz com homens e livros". In: KOSHIYAMA, Alice Mitika. **Monteiro Lobato:** Intelectual, Empresário, Editor. São Paulo: Queiroz, 1982. p. 99.

Viking to many reviewers, booksellers and other influential critics. For example, he complained about the paper (it should be thinner), its thickness (it looked like a Bible?) and mainly about the tree: it was not a gum tree, which might be a reason to accuse him of his "un-Australianness" (MARR, 1995, p. 303). Surprisingly, in the Portuguese and Brazilian versions, the entire volume does not look like a Bible, and, to avoid further complication, the trees designed resemble gum trees.

When reading *A árvore do homem*, the text presumably must have gone through a process of "Brazilianisation", as seen in the following exhibit, with the texts presented first in the original in English and then in the version first published in 1973 in Portugal and then the translation for Brazilian readers published in the 1980s. Given this work is about translation, it is appropriate to give a glimpse of what kind of text is presented to the Brazilian reader through a brief comparison of the first paragraph of the translation with the original in English. Certainly the outdatedness of the translation will not be discussed, but some aspects evince the lack of care with important words in the Australian context.

Exhibit 17 - Comparison of editions in Portuguese (of Portugal and of Brazil)

| English                              | Portuguese Edition                    | Brazilian Edition                    |
|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| A cart drove between the two         | A carroça meteu-se por entre os dois  | A carroça parou entre os dois        |
| stringy barks and stopped.           | grandes eucaliptos e parou. Eram      | grandes eucaliptos. Eram árvores     |
| These were the dominant trees        | árvores que dominavam nessa área do   | que dominavam nessa área do mato,    |
| in that part of the bush, rising     | mato, erguendo-se acima dos arbustos  | erguendo-se acima dos arbustos       |
| above the involved scrub with        | emaranhados com a simplicidade da     | emaranhados com a simplicidade da    |
| the simplicity of true grandeur.     | verdadeira grandeza. A carroça parou, | verdadeira grandeza. A carroça       |
| So the cart stopped, grazing the     | roçando o tronco esfarrapado de uma   | parou, roçando o tronco esfarrapado  |
| hairy side of a tree, and the        | árvore, e o cavalo hirsuto e          | de uma árvore, e o cavalo, hirsuto e |
| horse, shaggy and stolid as the      | impassível como a árvore, arfou e     | impassível como a árvore, arfou e    |
| tree, sighed and took root           | imobilizou-se (WHITE, 1973, p. 11).   | imobilizou-se (WHITE, 1980, p. 9).   |
| (WHITE, 1994, p. 9 <sup>146</sup> ). |                                       |                                      |

At first, we can say that there has been a change in the text published in Brazil, as evident in the first verb: "meteu-se por entre" was changed to "parou entre", thus deleting the reference to "stopped", at the end of the sentence. Other than that, the structure remained: "Carroça" is determined since the beginning (the indefinite article which starts the sentence was transformed into a definite article in the translation). Expressly, one of the most difficult words to translate about the Australian context is "bush", and Cárdigos dos Reis opted for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> WHITE, Patrick. **The Tree of Man**. Sydney: Vintage, 1994.

"mato", which continued in the Brazilian text. For "scrub", the option was "arbusto", which sometimes appears as a translation for bush. However, when reading this way, it does not bring any kind of differentiation to this landscape, which is specific to Australian geography (after all, perhaps a person in Sao Paulo will not read the word thinking of the same kind of "mato" as the one characteristic in Australia). About "the hairy side of a tree", the idea of "esfarrapado" as an option to translate "hairy" seems strange, given the noun (tree). The last sentence misses a very important connection, which is characteristic of White's writing: the relevance of the natural elements to form the psychology of the characters influenced by the environment surrounding them. In both versions the link between the horse being enrooted as the trees (and we call attention to the use of "as", and not "like" in the original) is missing because of verb choice: "take root" was translated as "imobilizar" ("immobilize"), thus selecting the "immobile" aspect of the picture, not the creation of roots. Evidently, this was not the ideal option if the connection horse and tree were to be maintained and/or emphasized in the translation. Our options would be "enraizou-se" or "arraigou-se".

As for footnotes, there are three in the whole novel: one refers to the noun "banksia" (a tree which is native to Australia); the other offers an explanation for an intertextual reference to the poem *A Shropshire lad*, by A. E. Housman; and the last one says that "possum" is a marsupial native to Australia.

When the Brazilian reader finishes her/his reading, s/he is then presented with "the author and its oeuvre". In the Portuguese edition, the information about the author is presented at the beginning, on the page opposite to the title page. Basically, it remains to be discussed whether this informative item should appear at the beginning, so as to prepare the reader about what s/he is going to find, or at the end, when s/he already finished her/his reading. In analyzing the texts of both versions, we see few changes. The first information in both texts is that White won the Nobel Prize in 1973, also stressing that he is "a realist writer, always sympathetic to the suffering of man<sup>147</sup>". After reading both introductory texts, it is clear that the Brazilian edition copies and/or selects and adapts some parts of the work presented in the Portuguese edition (evident in the differences in the educational systems and the French term "clerc" italicized). However, when looking for information about a potential proofreader (because the adaptation into Brazilian Portuguese is blatant), no names were found: "Editorial license to Círculo do Livro by courtesy of Publicações Dom Quixote" is what is displayed on the title page.

<sup>147</sup> In the original: [...] "é um escritor realista, sempre sensibilizado pelo sofrimento do homem". p. 551.

There is a small inconsistency about the titles of the novels. The way they are disposed is quite misleading: why are there translations in parentheses for all titles, except *The Solid Mandala*, *The Vivisector* and *The Twyborn Affair*? The impression created with this is that the other titles with translations in parentheses were actually translated into Portuguese (either in the variety from Portugal or from Brazil), but this is not true. And this might have even led the Brazilian researcher Déborah Scheidt to write this in the introduction of her Master's thesis:

One of the reasons that might be contributing to this lack of recognition with the wider public in Brazil is that, as far as I know, only three of White novels have been translated and published here up to now (*Voss*, *The Tree of Man*, and *The Aunt's Story*). In addition to that poor representation, they are no longer commercially available (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 2).

A thorough research has been carried out and nothing has appeared so far about a translation of *The Aunt's Story* into Portuguese (in any of its varieties): the National Libraries of Portugal, Brazil and Australia have been researched and no data were found about that title in translation.

Surely, the note in the Portuguese edition is far more informative than the Brazilian one, even with the introduction of reference works (in English) about the author (something which is not so common in notes in Brazil). This signals that the potential reader might become interested in Patrick White and would then look for these reference works in English (given the inexistence of such works in Portuguese). One thing which is characteristic of Brazilians is a classification of the author being studied: Patrick White receives the label of "realist", which, for us, sounds ambiguous: should we put him together with, say, Machado de Assis and Raul Pompeia (for a Brazilian reader) as a realist writer in terms of literary movements? Or should we consider him a realist, in opposition to "fantasist", i.e., that he depicts reality as it is? Patrick White is quite a modernist, following Joyce and Faulkner, as the note stresses. Thus, would it not be better to change the term "realist" and choose another word for that in Portuguese?

We must call attention to the fact that the title *The Ham Funeral* is mentioned in the text, but, up to now, it has not deserved a translation into Brazilian Portuguese. This play might be used in a rich comparison with, for example, Nelson Rodrigues' *Vestido de Noiva* (Wedding Gown, in a free translation). Ian Alexander makes a parallel between these two plays (and their authors), highlighting their historical placement and importance in the paper

entitled *White and his Brazilian Contemporaries*<sup>148</sup>. This is only one of the many possibilities that might be devised in the field of Comparative Literature and Translation Studies, as it is always a fruitful exercise to observe the different historical events that took place while the novels being translated were written (and about the ones occasionally being depicted in the plot). This is part of any translation process which cares about the target reader (and the translator, i.e., the one whose reading will predominate), in understanding the production contexts and then being able to make the stories more comprehensible for a given audience.

## 3.2.2 Voss

The famous Brazilian writer Monteiro "Lobato believed in developing the Brazilian language, and that after 400 years of subservience to Portugal, it was now time to definitively break away from Lisbon and develop a separate Brazilian language" (MILTON, 2003, p. 215). Perhaps following this idea, the publisher Nova Fronteira decided to launch a Brazilian Portuguese translation of Patrick White (*Voss*) in 1985. Again, a brief paratextual analysis is performed, describing the more noticeable elements.

Starting with the cover, there is the 1854 watercolor painting by Robert Elwes entitled *Gulf at the Weatherboard*. It is a precise image of Australia, more specifically depicting the magnificent Blue Mountains region, in New South Wales, occupying the upper half of the page. Above it, there is the name of Patrick White, and below, the title in a bigger font size. Below the title, the information "Nobel Prize in Literature (1973)". Soon after this, a review (translated) from *The Sunday Times* says, in our free translation, "A writer of whom Tolstoy is the only admissible rival<sup>149</sup>", but, when looking for the original sentence in English, the only thing close to it is the following: "Not quite to believe in the Oz Renaissance is a dangerous business these days. It takes a brave man to say that Tolstoy is a cut above Patrick White [...]<sup>150</sup>", coming from a review by the British art critic John Russell, entitled *Old and Young Australians*, published in *The Sunday Times* on 27 January 1963. The reasoning for this was found in a book about the Australian painter Sidney Nolan, who, at the time, was doing book jackets for Patrick White. On the left side of that sentence, we see a man riding a horse. Then, we open the book to find a text in which the name of the German explorer, not only on the flaps, but also on the back cover of the book, is mistyped (it should be Leichhardt,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> ALEXANDER, I. Patrick White and his Brazilian contemporaries. **Cercles**, Rouen, v. 26, p. 39-56, 2012. Available at: http://www.cercles.com/n26/alexander.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> In the original in Brazilian Portuguese: "Um escritor de quem Tolstói é o único rival admissível".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> RUSSELL, John. Old and Young Australians. Sunday Times, London, 27 Jan. 1963.

but we read "Leichardt"). Additionally, the impression we get is that the story is full of action, even though there is the warning that "the reader will follow, step by step, the slow penetration into a virgin continent", which is reflected in not such a rapid rhythm of reading – indeed, there is not much of any adventurous movement (as implied by the word "epic" in the text of the jacket). The intense emotivity represented by the planotic relationship between Laura and Voss (via letters) is one of the points which is admired by some and hated by others (as some create false expectations about their actual relationship). However, one cannot deny the strength of the language artistically employed by Patrick White (as seen in his "incisive prose"). In effect, this description focuses on the figure of Voss, signaling to the reader his strength of character, courage and will: thus, s/he should be prepared to follow a deep psychological analysis not only of Voss, but also of the other members of the expedition (some praiseworthy philosophical dialogues in the middle of the Australian outback are part of that strategy). At the end of the commentary, there is a summary about the life of the author. However, there is a fact which shows a high level of misinformation: Sydney was not the capital of Australia in 1948 (Canberra became the official capital in 1927). There is the misleading idea that New South Wales is a country, that the story would take place in connection to all the established elements of the country named Australia as we know it nowadays (the Federation happened in 1901). Sydney is the capital of New South Wales (look for the name Australia in Voss and few if any occurrences will come up). As already pointed out, "nation", when mentioned, would have England as the only reference. For example, in the following excerpt, it is clear that the object of study is the colony of New South Wales, and not Australia, as an established political unit (as the character does not seem interested in going to any other colony of Australia):

Exhibit 18 – Excerpt from *Voss* 

| English  | Brazilian Edition                                       |
|--|---|
| At this point the aunt, beaming for her niece's self-  | Foi então que a tia, orgulhosa da conduta e da boa      |
| possession and looks, could not resist announcing:     | aparência da moça, não conseguiu mais se conter,        |
| 'Mr Badgery is anxious to study the geography of       | afirmando:  |
| New South Wales, Laura. He, too, is of an intellectual | – O Sr. Badgery está ansioso por estudar a geografia de |
| turn of mind.'   | Nova Gales do Sul. Ele também tem tendências            |
| Such compliments are apt to become accusations.        | intelectuais.   |
| 'I do not make claims on the strength of one or two    | Elogios como esse às vezes viram acusações.             |
| hobbies.' The surgeon began to bristle (WHITE, 1994,   | - Absolutamente; trata-se apenas de um passatempo       |
| p. 302).   | meu. – O doutor estava atento (WHITE, 1985, p. 320).    |

In a paper presented at the conference Dislocated Readings: Translation and Transnationalism, in 2013, what had become of "country" and related terms in Paulo Henriques Britto's translation into Brazilian Portuguese was examined, since the word "country", in the Brazilian setting described in *Voss*, has yet to gain the idea of an independent political unit, engendering a complex set of relationships between an empire and one of its provinces. In the Brazilian context, "country" alludes to an entity commonly conceived of as an everyday New World republic, but which could be better understood as an empire under another name. In the translation, the play of meanings surrounding the word is missing. We can prove this argument by analyzing some important parts of the novel (since a thorough analysis of the translation would deserve a separate academic work):

Exhibit 19 – Use of "country"

| English   | Brazilian Edition                                       |
|---|---|
| 'I was never in Germany,' said the firm young           | - Nunca estive na Alemanha - disse a jovem com          |
| woman. 'But I find the road to Sydney monotonous,       | firmeza Mas acho monótona a viagem até Sydney,          |
| even from a carriage.'                                  | mesmo de carruagem.                                     |
| 'Do you go much into your country?' asked Voss,         | – A senhorita costuma viajar pelo interior? – perguntou |
| who had found some conviction to lean upon.             | Voss, encontrando algo em que se apoiar.                |
| 'Not really. Not often,' said Laura Trevelyan. 'We      | - Não muito. Não com frequência - respondeu Laura       |
| drive out sometimes, for picnics, you know. Or we       | Trevelyan Às vezes damos um passeio, fazemos            |
| ride out on horseback. We will spend a few days with    | piqueninques, o senhor sabe. Ou então andamos a         |
| friends, on a property. A week in the country makes a   | cavalo. Passamos alguns dias no sítio de uns amigos.    |
| change, but I am always happy to return to this house.' | Uma semana no campo é bom para variar, mas sempre       |
| 'A pity that you huddle,' said the German. 'Your        | é com prazer que eu volto para esta casa.               |
| country is of great subtlety.'                          | – É uma pena – disse o alemão. – Seu país tem muitas    |
| With rough persistence, he accused her of the           | sutilezas.  |
| superficiality which she herself suspected. At times    | Com uma persistência rude, acusou-a de                  |
| she could hear her own voice. She was also afraid of    | superficialidade – acusação que ela mesma já se fizera. |
| the country which, for lack of any other, she supposed  | Parecia-lhe às vezes estar ouvindo sua própria voz. Ela |
| was hers. But this fear, like certain dreams, was       | também tinha medo do país que, à falta de outro, ela    |
| something to which she would never have admitted        | julgava ser o seu. Mas esse medo, como certos sonhos,   |
| (WHITE, 1994, p. 11).                                   | era algo que ela jamais confessaria (WHITE, 1985, p.    |
|   | 11).  |

Voss, when using "your country", suggests that it belongs to the British settlers, not to the German, and the preposition "into" refers to the experience of entering the landscape. These

words, apparently without much importance, are manipulated in the dialogue, evincing a different perspective for each character: for Laura, by replying without the prepositional phrase ("we drive out sometimes"), the landscape is a space outside, beyond the safety of the town, while Voss sees it as a space to be entered. To Voss, Laura is on the edge of her country and could go more deeply into it, and Sydney is part of that country. To Laura, country is in opposition to city, with Sydney not being a part of it. When saying that "a week in the country makes a change", she declines any reference to personal ownership, and when they spend their time "with friends, on a property", that portion of land does not belong to any of them. Voss replies with "your country is of great subtlety", emphasising the physical aspect of the land and the possessive: the subtlety is attributed to British land and not a neutral one. Afterward, when the conversation stops, the narrator says that Laura is "afraid of the country which, for lack of any other, she supposed was hers," combining the two meanings of the word.

The opposition between go into and drive out is absent in the translation, as is the sense that the country belongs to Laura and not to Voss: his question alludes to "interior", which suggests the non-urban part of a territory, making no distinction between rural areas and land left in its natural state. In Laura's reply to Voss, property loses its sense of ownership and becomes sítio, suggesting a small farm which would automatically belong to the friends in question, when in reality, there is no reference to ownership in the original (they were with friends, but these friends do not necessarily own the property). The term used for "week in the country" – campo – refers to the idea of agriculture. In the final "your country", Voss, as already said, stresses the experience of the land, but in the translation, we see "país", which is unhelpful, not only because the country in question clearly is not a country in the geopolitical sense, but also because even if it were, it is not in that sense that it possesses great subtlety: the whole thrust of his comment is associated with the physical land, not with a political unit. A logical consequence of the translator's choice is that Laura is afraid not of an experience of the land, but instead of a political unit. The idea of any such fear would probably sound strange even to the Brazilian reader who has not had access to the original in English.

There are seven footnotes in the edition: the first one refers to the term "emancipist", explaining Rose Portion's condition in Australia; the second explains the meaning of "brickfielder", a strong wind which brings dust and sand; the third item describes the word "cumquats" (same spelling in the translation, and in italics), which is a fruit, found in Brazil too. The Brazilian form would be "cunquate". The fourth note is about "Rhine Towers",

explaining a pun in the text; the fifth is also an explanation for a pun with the verb "turn in" related to the surname of the character Turner; the sixth is about the name of Rose's child, then adopted by Laura Trevelyan: "Mercy"; and the last note is an explanation for the word "corroboree", which is a term coined by the Eruopean colonizers in Australia to refer to the Aboriginal dance festival held at night to celebrate a special occasion, called *caribberie*.

Paulo Henriques Britto, the translator of *Voss*, in several papers and interviews claims that the literary translator needs deep knowledge both of the language to which s/he is translating (in our case, Brazilian Portuguese) and of the language from which s/he is translating. Clearly, the emphasis is given to literary sensitivity and how we should compose well in both languages. However, the sensitivity to historical aspects is vital too, otherwise, we will have a beautiful text in Brazilian Portuguese, correct and stylish, but lacking the important historical information necessary to make sense of the story. In the translation of *Voss*, Britto was starting his career as a translator at the time, thus, a question arises: did the publisher Nova Fronteira apparently disregard the complexity of the text (and Patrick White's name) by giving it to someone who had never translated a literary piece before? The historical neglect, which might have affected the reception of *Voss*, is precisely what we would like to avoid in the translation of *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese.

### 3.2.3 Patrick White's newest translation in Brazil

The most recent work by Patrick White translated into Brazilian Portuguese is the short story "Being Kind to Titina" (from *The Burnt Ones*), translated by Fabíola Werland and Ely Miura. The translation of this short story was part of a fabulous project developed at the University of Sao Paulo, coordinated by professor Stella E. O. Tagnin, involving Australian Literature: the publication of a collection of short stories by Australian authors entitled *Lá da Austrália*, in 2004, translated by the students of the specialization course in translation offered by the university. The following authors were on the list, in addition to Patrick White: Brigid Lowry, Carolyn Leach-Paholski, Christina Stead, David Malouf, Elizabeth Jolley, Elliot Perlman, Eric Otto Schlunke, Ethel Anderson, Frank Hardy, Frank Moorhouse, Glenda Adams, Helen Garner, Henry Lawson, Herb Wharton, James Bradley, Janette Turner Hospital, Jessica Anderson, John Kinsella, John Morrison, Kate Grenville, Kylie Tennant, Matthew Condon, Peter Carey, Peter Goldsworthy, Ruth Park, Tim Winton and Xavier Herbert, thus spanning different periods of literary production about, in and outside Australia. As a matter of fact, it is interesting to notice that usually more than one person was designated to translate the short

stories, given the difficulty posed by any literary piece. The whole reading trajectory of the translators and revisors is available in the project CorTrad<sup>151</sup>, which allows anyone to see the first options chosen by the translators in their first drafts, how the proofreading changed the text (or not), and the final version published. The initiative started at the academy, but it found support in a publishing-house, Folio, which accepted publishing the book to make it reach a broader audience, thus enriching our Brazilian system with an Australian literary contribution.

## 3.2.4 Patrick White and the Brazilian academy

Academically speaking, Patrick White does not have any significant representation in the syllabi of the universities across the country, let alone Australian Literature in general (although, in a recent research on the Brazilian Government's database called Lattes Platform, it was possible to retrieve more results of researchers working with Australian authors, thanks to the initiatives already in effect at UFRGS. It was possible to identify a trend in Brazil in relation to the study of Australian Literature: most academics prefer to work with living and contemporary authors, such as Peter Carey (whose oeuvre deserved recent works in 2006 and 2010 in Sao Paulo) and J.M. Coetzee (whose Australianness is not as straightforward, although his name stands out because of his Nobel Prize and increasing presence in the Southern Hemisphere (as already mentioned in the project in Argentina, Literaturas del Sur). However, where Patrick White is concerned, his oeuvre has gained more attention at the undergraduate level: at UFRGS, for instance, his novels were studied in two subjects (a whole semester of English Literature IV devoted to White) and English Literature III (working with The Aunt's Story). At the postgraduate level (Master's and PhD's), two scholars, curiously located in the Southern portion of Brazil, need mentioning, for being the precursors in White Studies in the country. In chronological order, the first work (a Master's Degree) was produced in Curitiba, the capital of the State of Parana, in 1997 by PhD Déborah Scheidt, entitled 'All the Difference in the World': Alterity in Three Novels by Patrick White, at the Federal University of the State of Parana (UFPR)<sup>152</sup>. The three novels chosen to be analysed were The Aunt's Story, Riders in the Chariot and A Fringe of Leaves. Definitely, it is a

More information on the tool is available at: http://comet.fflch.usp.br/cortrad. There is a brief tutorial on how to use the tool on the website Teorias de Leitura em Tradução, available at: http://www.ufrgs.br/textecc/traducao/teorias/proposta.php, devised by Monica Stefani, and also a whole description of the tool on the e-book *Leitura: um guia sobre teoria(s) e prática(s)*, authored by Maria José Finatto and others, available for download at http://www.ufrgs.br/textecc/traducao/teorias/leiturasdirigidas.php. <sup>152</sup> Thanks to a search using the term "Literatura Australiana" on the Brazilian Lattes platform, I was able to find her name and contact her, in 2010.

resourceful work for anyone interested in getting to know more about Patrick White's oeuvre, under the spectrum of Cultural Studies. According to Scheidt:

As a general objective this thesis aims at making a Brazilian contribution to the research in literatures of former British colonies and to the study of Patrick White, introducing some aspects of Australian literature and White's work, from a post-colonial perspective, to a Brazilian public (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 2).

The other work (another Master's Degree) was done in Porto Alegre, the capital of the State of Rio Grande do Sul, in 2006, at PUC (Pontifical Catholic University), entitled *Novos continentes: relações coloniais em O continente e Voss* by Ian Alexander, which, according to the abstract:

suggests a comparison of literary works from Brazil and Australia in terms of their colonial and post-colonial experiences, using a model of the cultural interactions that characterise colonisation. [...] This model is applied in a comparative analysis of the representation of these colonial and post-colonial relationships in two novels that deal with the formation of new societies in the Latin and British worlds: *O Continente* (1949), by the Brazilian Erico Verissimo, and *Voss* (1957), by the Australian Patrick White. The study demonstrates the analytical utility of the model and identifies a high level of morphological similarity between the cultural relationships represented in the two works (ALEXANDER, 2006, p. 6).

The most recent work (so far) on Patrick White done in Brazil is the Master's thesis entitled "You are what you read": Intertextual Relations in Patrick White's The Solid Mandala, which analysed the critical fortune of Patrick White and the intertextual references presented in the story, focusing on the implications of the references to the novel The Brothers Karamazov, by Fiodor Dostoyevsky, when the twin brothers confront each other at the Mitchell Library, in Sydney. In addition to enhancing the role Literature plays in our everyday life, The Solid Mandala and the dissertation analyzing it generated a positive reception at the academy among other students of Literature (who do not feel comfortable in reading novels in English), therefore motivating the translation of the novel into Brazilian Portuguese and, hence, this dissertation.

Thus, why is it that there are so few studies on Patrick White in Brazil? Déborah Scheidt comments the following in the introduction of her work:

In what concerns Brazilian scholars, a possible explanation for not having yet 'discovered' Patrick White might be the fact that in this country a more far-reaching interest in post-colonial studies is still a very recent – but flourishing – tendency. [...] However, it is possible to notice that Brazilian scholars, possibly due to shared language, African background and/or geographical proximity, are more closely drawn towards the post-colonial literatures of the Portuguese-speaking African

countries (Angola, Mozambique, Cape Verde), Canada and the Caribbean. The contributions of Australian, South African or Indian authors, for instance, are still very little explored in Brazil and that open whole new – and exciting – fields of investigation (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 2).

New thoughts concerning study possibilities arise: an idea which might yield good results at the academies would be to introduce Patrick White in a comparative point of view, i.e., to start contextualizing his existence and his literary work in relation to our country, located in the same Southern Hemisphere, and through our similarities (and differences), see how revealing the exercise of comparing, say, Patrick White to Guimarães Rosa, would be. This would positively shed light on our own literature, in observing our mechanisms of identification, observation and representation, not only of our fiction, but also of our reality. Such efforts have been put into practice at the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS), in the subject English Literature, in which Patrick White's oeuvre was offered in several semesters. Thus, students, by being asked to read and reflect about White novels, can then formalize their thoughts and impressions in essays which can later be published in academic journals in Brazil and abroad.

However, to start that endeavour, it would not be conceivable to introduce titles in English in the syllabi across Brazil without offering translated editions since they are no longer available (or only available through second-hand bookstores in outdated translations). As for the rights of the translation, the two publishing houses mentioned, Círculo do Livro and Nova Fronteira, might have ownership of the rights, though we do need to get know more about the procedures to be followed in order to acquire them and thus allow new editions of those translations (reeditions of both works) to appear in the market. In the case of Círculo do Livro, it is probable that they had the rights to reproduce the translated content in Brazil, though the rights for the translation most probably belong to the Portuguese publisher Publicações Dom Quixote, which is still in operation. However, when contacted about the *The Tree of Man*, the publisher stated they no longer had the title on their list of publications 153.

After this brief analysis, it is evident that Australian Literature in translation is part of the national culture, and it

often aggressively markets the specificity of that national culture, yet paradoxically extends well beyond the borders of the nation, and makes up an integral part of the cultural archive of the nations whose literatures it enters via translation (WEST-PAVLOV; ELZE-VOLLAND, 2010, p. 9).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> E-mail sent on 15 Jul. 2015, and reply received on 16 Jul. 2015.

The experience of reading Patrick White in the United States described below by the American critic James Stern is worth citing, as it is a common situation involving Brazilian readers as well:

The author's name was new to me. Within an hour my whole world has changed... I had never been to Australia, yet here was prose which, by its baroque richness, its plasticity and wealth of strange symbols, made an unknown landscape so real that I felt I could walk into it as into country I had been brought up in. I could see the black volcanic hills, the dead skeleton trees... I could all but touch the rock, scrub, bones, the sheep's carcass, the ox's skull, as they lay bleached in Australia's eternal greyness... under the immense blue of its skies (MARR, 1995, p. 304).

This is this same reaction we would like to instill in the Brazilian readers when they eventually have the book in their hands, or the file open in their reading device, by providing a translation which takes into account the diverse elements of the Australian reality depicted by White, with respect to all the body of knowledge developed on his oeuvre and which has been studied over so many years. When reading Patrick White in the original, the reaction is quite evident, but in translation, the challenge is doubled. The procedures adopted in this meticulous work will be detailed presently.

In the next item, the Australian and Brazilian systems will be described, with the Polysystems Theory as the main theoretical support.

## 3.3 TRANSLATING PATRICK WHITE IN BRAZIL: ITAMAR EVEN-ZOHAR'S POLYSYSTEMS THEORY

This dissertation manifests a desire to fight any negative ideas connected to the uselessness of studying any subject in humanities. We must be reminded that people will go on consuming literature (there will always be an avid reading public, no matter the kind of media the public prefers to access), and translations will keep on being commissioned and appearing in those diverse formats. Itamar Even-Zohar's argument presented in the introduction of his book *Polysystem Studies* detailing his Polysystems Theory becomes a mantra for Translation Studies scholars. Taking into account the fact that many people are disappointed about the "vogue of vague ideas" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 6) and are in search for "thoughts that inspire to some activity and fruitful doing" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 6), we should look for "adequate tools for dealing with problems whose intricate nature cannot be dealt with by means of simplified observations or hazy impressions" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 6).

Before starting the application of the Polysystems Theory to this dissertation, a brief contextualization and the definition of its essential concepts are necessary. The gap opened in the 1970s between linguistics and literary studies was partially closed by the Polysystems Theory, whose emphasis lies in the poetics of the target culture. In essence, this trend represented a revolution which transformed translation theory and translation science into "translation studies", a term coined by the late American theorist J.S. Holmes in a famous 1972 paper (HOLMES, 1972/88, p. 70). Along with Holmes, other scholars started viewing translation in a descriptive light, and no longer in the normative terms employed by the linguistic school. Translated texts were considered, in addition to target texts (i.e. in relation to their sources), texts in their own right. The scholars who embraced this approach questioned the pertinence of the concepts of fidelity and equivalence, since these and other concepts, according to the Polysystem view, are constructed historically. Hence, translation started to be viewed as a "manipulation" rather than a mere textual replacement:

Translation is, of course, a rewriting of an original text. All rewritings, whatever their intention, reflect a certain ideology and a poetics and as such manipulate literature to function in a given society in a given way. Rewriting is manipulation, undertaken in the service of power, and its positive aspect can help in the evolution of a literature and a society (BASSNETT & LEFEVERE, 1990, preface).

For example, the conditions of production of a translation might be tracked down and predicted, as well as the strategies the translator might use. For that purpose, the methodology above was based on case studies of translations across time to validate (or not) such a hypothesis of predicting conditions of production, in addition to consolidating and clarifying its principles. In addition, it might be said that the Polysystems Theory methodology gave rise to the now called descriptive studies in Translation Studies, which helped shape and legitimize it as an autonomous academic field. Indeed, perhaps its great move was to change the focus from the mere comparison of original and translation (concentrating on the losses and betrayals) to the understanding of the changes of emphasis which took palce during the transference of texts from one literary system into another.

There are many names to refer to in this approach within Translation Studies, such as the Manipulation School, Descriptive Studies in Translation, Polysystemic Approach, the Tel Aviv-Leuven Axis, the Low Countries Group and Translation Studies<sup>154</sup>; Theo Hermans tries

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> The American theorist James Holmes decided to use Translation Studies to name the group in the Netherlands, but this is an extremely reducing and restrictive denomination, as basically the ideas developed would find application only in the domain of literary texts. When we study literary texts, we are doing translation

to bring together all these denominations under the term "Descriptive and Systemic Approach" (HERMANS, 1999). In addition to this multitude of denominations, a plethora of theoretical ramifications and divisions is a natural consequence. For example, there is the group based in Tel Aviv, with the main names of Itamar Even-Zohar and Gideon Toury (then with the Polysystems Theory, which is the one used in this dissertation), and the group based in the United States and Europe (mainly in the Netherlands) formed by James Holmes, Theo Hermans, José Lambert, Andre Lefevere, Susan Bassnett, Raymond Van den Broeck, Maria Tymoczko, and others). Theo Hermans and Gideon Toury were responsible for establishing the methodological and theoretical parameters of the subject, whereas Andre Lefevere and Lawrence Venuti sought to explore the implications of translation in broader cultural and historical spheres (in this dissertation, Venuti's concept of the translator's invisibility will be drawn on). Both groups share the descriptive and functional perspective, but this does not mean that the work is restricted to these two circuits: Theo Hermans (1999) ascertains that other theorists affiliated to the approach make investigations in Brazil, Korea, Hong Kong, Spain, etc.

The descriptive and systemic perspective was first introduced in 1985 by Theo Hermans, but had been developing in the 1970s, extended in the 1980s and, after revisions and expansions, consolidated in the 1990s (HERMANS, 1999, p. 9). Three international academic events helped consolidate this investigative trend: a conference at the University of Leuven (in 1976), another at the University of Tel Aviv (in 1978) and the last one at the University of Antwerp (in 1980). The paper written by Theo Hermans, entitled *The Manipulation of Literature* (1985) marks the confluence of the works produced by both groups. The main aspects shared by both groups are: 1) Literature is viewed as a complex and dynamic system; 2) There must be a continuous interaction between theoretical models and practical case studies; 3) Literary Translation requires a functional, systemic, descriptive approach, oriented to the target language text, and 4) There must be an interest in the norms and conditions which govern the production and reception of translations, in the relationship between translation and other kinds of textual processing and in the place and role of such translations at the core of a given literature and at the relationship among literatures.

Expressly, this dissertation follows the approach devised by Itamar Even-Zohar. Thus, these guidelines will appear in the analysis of the translation of Patrick White into Brazilian

studies, but not all translation studies are confined to the domain of literary texts. Thus, in this dissertation we only mention that there is this terminological inconsistency, and from now on, the predominant term will be Polysystems Theory, to avoid any misunderstanding. We follow Amparo Hurtado Albir's disagreement about Holmes's denomination.

Portuguese, but predominantly, the broader ideas of the Polysystems Theory. The term "polysystems" aims at describing the system as dynamic and heterogeneous, opposing the synchronic approach, and calling attention to its multiple intersections, thus inferring its complex structuration. Literature is seen as a dynamic, heterogeneous system, which comprises a great number of subsystems. During its evolution, each stage presents diverse trends, bringing together different literary systems, encompassing many genres. The system interrelates with the other systems pertaining to the socioeconomic and ideological structures of each society. Hence, the Polysystems Theory is pertinent to this dissertation not only because it views translation "as an extension or expansion of the text, not as a second derivation of it, or, at worst, a parasite" (WEST-PAVLOV; VOLLAND-ELZE, 2010, p. 11), but also because the literary analysis takes into account the textual production allied to its reception in a given historical context and its position inside a determined system and its relation to other systems (thus possibly explaining why Britto's translation did not care about the word "country"). In his theory, Itamar Even-Zohar uses binary oppositions, such as canonical vs. non canonical, central vs. peripheral and primary vs. secondary. Translation belongs to the receptor culture (in our case, the Brazilian), and it has a primary function - for example, to create new genres and styles - and a secondary one, to consolidate existing genres and styles. One of the questions which guides our reasoning in this section is: How would the translation of The Solid Mandala work in the Polysystem Theory? Before trying to answer that question, it is necessary to introduce the main concepts pertaining to the Polysystems Theory.

Recalling the model of speech events (or functions of language) developed by Roman Jakobson in the 1960s, there is a context, a code, an addresser, an addressee, a channel/contact and a message. Jakobson devised his model having in mind a single utterance, but Even-Zohar (1990) made some adaptations, trying to account for the complexities of the literary system. For example, the addresser would be the producers (writers), in this case, playwrights, writers, poets and translators; the context would be an institution (in this case, publishing-houses, universities, literary critics), which would govern relations and rules; the code would be the repertoire (i.e., models shared by producer and consumer, the language); the addressee would be the consumer (reader); the channel/contact would be the market; and the message would be the product (i.e., the literary text and its models of production).

Producer was the term chosen by Even-Zohar to create a word that would be different from writer, which sounds rather too specific. The producer is an agent of the system which plays diverse roles: sometimes s/he, in addition to producing things in the system, is a consumer too; sometimes, s/he becomes an agent of the market or of the institution. In reality, when producing, the producer (which can be an individual or groups of individuals) puts into practice a creative function, is subject to the rules of a given institution and interacts with the market, and can either reproduce models or transform them. The repertoire is shared by the producer and consumers, and it is put into practice by the producer. In this work, the position of the translator needs to be highlighted: in the system, s/he is seen as a producer, but the whole production/creation is subject to the rules governing the system, as a publishing-house will be responsible for the choice of a determined title to be translated, and, often, such title represents a legitimized model.

As for the consumers of the product, producers, agents of the market and of the institution are seen as consumers too because, although they do not directly read a literary text, they are indirectly involved in the system, as a part of a community (i.e., a cultural polysystem), interacting with fragments of texts in many ways. Most people in Brazil, for example, recognize the characters of the Brazilian literary canon, such as Capitão Rodrigo Cambará, because they have watched adaptations of novels into movies and television series, and not because they have actually read the novels (in the example cited, the gaucho author Erico Veríssimo's trilogy *O tempo e o vento*). The success of the adaptation (in this case, that of the television channel as a non-literary institution) may move people to try to obtain access to the literary work, thus making publishing-houses (the agents of the market) launch new editions. Then the cycle restarts, signalling the importance of the indirect consumption of the product at many levels.

The institution is responsible for mainting literature as a sociocultural activity, i.e., for organizing the rules of the literary activity. Producers (critics, publishing houses, the academy, literary journals, the media, governmental institutions) are important elements in this respect – for example, the idea of banishing Monteiro Lobato's *O sítio do pica-pau amarelo* from schools in Brazil because of supposed racist connotations in the text is a misconceived example of the power of such governmental institutions. In Brazil, one can say that television is a very strong institution in mainting a literary repertoire. Some groups of writers might be at the centre of literary activity, but the academy, traditionally more conservative, usually goes on reproducing a different repertoire. Literary criticism, still limited to the academy, might be considered peripheric in the system. Publishing-houses, although responsible for selecting what deserves to be published or not, cannot shape people's literary preferences, which, by their turn, are today increasingly influenced by mass media.

The market controls the mechanisms involved in the buying and selling of literary products and the merchandising of patterns of consumption. Libraries, publishing-houses, bookstores, distributors and the Internet fall into this category. In this case, it is interesting to notice the role represented by the university: while seen as a regulator in the system, it can be a very important vehicle in divulging titles and trying to introduce new authors into the system (in a way, this is what this dissertation aims at: to make Patrick White exitthe academy and reach the general Brazilian audience). Television channels are another example, for they reproduce legitimized models but also stimulate the consumption of certain products and, as already metioned, interfere with the editorial market. Without a consumer market, i.e., without people interacting with the literary product, there is nopossibility of survival for any literary system.

The repertoire may be defined as the set of options (elements, laws and models) used by the members who organize the activities in the polysystem, as well as by the rules which govern the production and consumption of any literary product. Furthermore, it is where canonicity is more manifest. The repertoire has both a passive and an active characteristic: it is passive when we look at it as a set of strategies adopted by the consumers to help their interpretation of a given product, and active when we look at it as a set of procedures that a producer can use to create a product at any specific moment.

How is our Brazilian Polysystem constituted? We might say it has acquired its independence from Portugal quite easily, but independence from France has been slower. Brazilian Literature, conceived in the core of the Portuguese Literature (CANDIDO, 2008), was influenced, according to Alexander (2006), by the Neo-Latin, the Italian, the Spanish and the French Literatures: "[...] to both romantics and modernists, Europe was France and European culture was French culture. Neither English, nor German, but only French<sup>155</sup>" (ALEXANDER, 2006, p. 227, my translation).

In terms of language, most of the Brazilian literary production is written in Brazilian Portuguese (and all its linguistic variety). Considering the limitation that Portuguese does not present a range of readers as wide as that offered by English (for instance, an Australian author writing in English has access to millions of readers in English outside Australia), it is quite common for Brazilians to take the literature of their country as the literature of their language. In other words, the idea is that the books written in Portuguese in Brazil supposedly

<sup>155</sup> In the original: [...] tanto para os românticos quanto para os modernistas, a Europa era a França e a cultura europeia era a cultura francesa. Não a inglesa, não a alemã, mas apenas a francesa" (ALEXANDER, 2006, p. 227).

make sense only in the Brazilian literary tradition. This instinct might explain Patrick White's narrow context of reading, restricting it only to Australia.

How is the Australian Polysystem constituted? Australia's, like Canada's, is not quite independent, such as the American one. It is still in a dependent position in relation to the British one. How could translation possibly help change this situation, if it at all? Let's begin with the fact that it is a peripheral subsystem that depends on the British system, and in which the most eminent exponent is William Shakespeare. Patrick White would oftencriticize the fact that the establishment only recommended (or imposed) British reference works on Australia, without valuing or respecting the national and local production. Would this reasoning be responsible and/or account for the difficulty in systematizing Australian Literature not only as a subject in its own territorial domain, but also overseas (particularly in Brazil), in a way explaining the enormous difficulty in creating (and in sustaining the exisiting) departments dedicated to the study of the field at universities? How could we contrast this idea to the American system, which, although sharing William Shakespeare as its most eminent exponent, insisted on cultivating their own literary icons (such as Henry James, Nathaniel Hawthorne, Walt Whitman, Edgar Allan Poe, Emily Dickinson, Herman Melville, and so on)?

We might venture to say that Patrick White, although not as read nowadays as before, remains canonical in a subsystem (in this case, the Australian) of a central system (the English). Even-Zohar calls attention to two uses of the term "canonicity": the first, referring to the level of texts, and the other, to the level of models. To introduce a text into the literary canon is not the same as introducing the text through its model into some repertoire: in the static canonicity (the first case), "a certain text is accepted as a finalized product and inserted into a set of sanctified texts literature (culture) wants to preserve" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 19), whereas in the second case, called dynamic canonicity, "a certain literary model manages to establish itself as a productive principle in the system through the latter's repertoire" (Ibidem), thus being the most important case for the polysystems theory, because to be rejected as a model for living literature (although being recognized as a great writer) is not desired by any writer who is part of the system. The writers who are acutely aware of their position and have a "more flexible and vigorous maneuvering capacity" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 20) always attempt to change that situation when they realize it has come to them. Most writers tend to follow one set of models throughout their career; they may create more accomplished texts than previous ones according to the same models, yet they may change their contemporary position (but not necessarily their public, who moves with them from the center to a periphery of the literary system).

Although they may produce more accomplished texts than previously according to the same (previous) models, they may lose their contemporary position (though not necessarily their public, which thus moves with them from the center to a periphery of the literary system). This is clear-cut evidence that it is not through their texts as such that writers acquire positions in the literary system. A new dominant occupant of the center may not deny them their position in the static canon, while at the same time it may reject them as acceptable models for making new texts. At other times, however, this rejection – at least in its initial stages – also involves a rejection of these dethroned writers, that is of their texts, from the canon as well (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 20).

In Chapter 2, we followed these movements in Patrick White's oeuvre: his rejection, first as a poet and then as a playwright, made him, in a way, change (or perfect) his model and alter his position. Furthermore, because of the French translator's desire to translate one of his novels into French, White reconsidered his literary talent as being useful, and went on writing, eventually being nominated for the Nobel Prize in 1973, which signals White's static canonicity. However, his dynamic canonicity positions him nowadays in the periphery of the Australian subsystem (which is part of the system of English-language Literature). The Australian repertoire is quite dependent on the English-language Literature system, but translation is a good tool not only to renew repertoires, but also to make systems and subsystems evolve.

Notably, the most recent case involving the new Spanish translation of *The Solid Mandala* is quite interesting, as "it is clear that the very principles of selecting the works to be translated are chosen according to their compatibility with the new approaches and the supposedly innovatory role they may assume within the target literature" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 47). Translation helps a literature incorporate new ideas and characteristics, as well as keep traditional taste. Even-Zohar asserts that

[...] This discrepancy between the original central literature and the translated literature may have evolved in a variety of ways, for instance, when translated literature, after having assumed a central position and inserted new items, soon lost contact with the original home literature which went on changing, and thereby became a factor of preservation of unchanged repertoire. Thus, a literature that might have emerged as a revolutionary type may go on exisiting as an ossified système d'antan, often fanatically guarded by the agents of secondary models against even minor changes (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 49).

Thus, the idea of J.M. Coetzee's Biblioteca Personal (and we use this example because it is the most recent situation involving Patrick White's oeuvre) being accepted and put into practice by a publisher in Buenos Aires has that double function: to bring innovativeness and maintain a tradition. However, it should be noted that the "normal position assumed by translated literature tends to be the peripheral one" (EVEN-ZOHAR, 1990, p. 50). All the novels on Coetzee's list were translated again (for example, *Madame Bovary* appears together with *The Solid Mandala*), thus corroborating Even-Zohar's argument that the traditional central position of French Literature takes a peripheral position when translated. Therefore, it remains to be seen how the reception of these novels (but mainly *Las Esferas del Mandala*) will be, not only in the general Spanish-language system, but particularly in one of its peripheral subsystem (Argentina, which is the source of the translation). In effect, we have an author from one subsystem in English (the Australian) being translated into another subsystem (Argentina), a situation which is healthy for both subsystems and which might have repercussions (or not) in another system: the Brazilian.

The knowledge about the mechanics of the editorial publishing area in Australia is non-existent, thus bringing again the confirmation of Venuti's idea of the translator's invisibility: the translation zone in Australian literary scholarship is far from being systematically described. How are translations commissioned there? According to Dixon, contacts aiming at commissioning translations are usually initiated at international book events, such as the Frankfurt and London trade fairs, via publishers and their agents, but he questions whether the commercial arrangements are the same everywhere (do they vary across cultures?). Apparently, there is not any perceptible effort, by Australian organisations, to "market" its culture internationally (although we have mentioned the financial support to boost translation projects in Italy and other countries). However, the explanation for such a lack of interest in promoting the culture of the country lies in the lack of organisations such as the Confucius Institute (promoting China's culture), the Goethe Institut (German), Alliance Française (French) and even the British Council (Britain). In reality, "it is the other cultures which do the 'exporting' of Australian literary culture according to their own criteria" (WEST-PAVLOV; ELZE-VOLLAND, 2010, p. 16), which explains the existence of this dissertation at a Brazilian university, a result of a personal option, without any kind of connection with the presence of any Australian organization promoting its literary culture in Brazil. An attempt to identify the forces acting in the translation market is part of Translation Studies nowadays as well, and will help one be more acquainted with many literary systems, not only the Australian.

Lara Cain, in *Translating Australian Culture: Literary Representations on the World Stage*, claims that the Polysystems theory and the peripheral position of Australian Literature when transferred to "stronger" literatures are

challenged somewhat by the extratextual strategies which accompany the release of books. In the age we live in, marketing, promotion, cover designs and topical issues can influence the international success (and, therefore, social position) of the most technically untranslatable works (CAIN, 2001, p. 3).

This is the expectation regarding the new translation into Spanish and our work in the near future regarding the eventual publication of our translation into Brazilian Portuguese.

To end this sub-item about the Polysystems Theory and then start the analysis of the translation of *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese, some words by the Argentinian translator Marcelo Cohen need to be reproduced. In his book *Musica Prosaica* ("Prosaic Music" in a free translation), he gathers four essays describing his life as a professional translator in Argentina. Specifically, when referring to our role as literary translators, he says, from his place in the world, Buenos Aires, the Spanish-speaking South, that, in the future, the translator will have to provide in her/his writing not only a partial solution, but also an *ad hoc* theory, with translation becoming a "branch of pataphysics, this science of the particular solutions" (COHEN, 2014, p. 53-54, my translation).

[...] In the 19<sup>th</sup> century, *Don Quixote*'s version into English caused a literary seism from which mountains arose, such us *Tristram Shandy*. Onetti's novels would not exist without Faulkner's versions made in the 1940s in Havana and Buenos Aires. Someone would say that trade invigorates languages and that each moment of a literature decides if it wants more inspiration, which branch of its tradition will serve it and what it convenes to graft. Of course, if the decision is made by the industry – which reveres the public, which likes to be fooled –, nothing is regenerated, except the financial circuit of the word which overwhelms the world, often under the garment of beauty. But this is exactly what the issue should be when someone says that language concerns her/him: not the beauty of a dress, but the forms which open up consciousness to the to and fros of the wind <sup>156</sup> (COHEN, 2014, p. 53-54, my translation).

<sup>156</sup> In the original, in Spanish: "[...] En el siglo XVII la versión de *El Quijote* en inglês provocó un sismo literário del cual surgirían montañas como el *Tristram Shandy*. Las novelas de Onetti no existirían sin las versiones de Faulkner hechas en los cuarenta en La Habana y Buenos Aires. Alguien diría que el comercio vivifica las lenguas, y que cada momento de una literatura decide, si quiere más aliento, cuál rama de su tradición le sirve y qué le conviene injertar. Claro que si la decisión la toma la industria – que reverencia al público, al cual le encanta que lo engañen-, nada se regenera salvo el circuito financeiro de la palabra que aplasta el mundo, muchas veces bajo el adulado ropaje de la belleza. Pero de eso debería tratarse justamente cuando alguien dice que le preocupa el linguaje: no de la belleza de un atavío, sino de formas que abran la consciencia a los vaivenes del viento (COHEN, 2014, p. 53-54).

Thus, taking into account Cohen's position as someone who comes from (and works for) a huge community of speakers, and which still suffers from the power of the Royal Spanish Academy in identifying and, therefore, dictating their literary arrangements (mainly in translation), Patrick White's translation in Argentina is already a good initiative to implement the process of opening up consciousness to the new and refreshing winds coming from Australia. We hope the same winds will reach Brazil too.

## 4 THE TRANSLATION OF *THE SOLID MANDALA* AND ITS CULTURAL AND SOCIO-HISTORICAL ASPECTS

As seen in Chapter 3 with the brief analysis of *Voss*, socio-historical awareness is paramount to avoid rendering an incoherent text. Here, coherence is understood according to what Mona Baker defines as

a network of relations which organize and create a text: [...] coherence is the network of conceptual relations which underlie the surface text. [...] In the case of coherence, [stretches of language] are connected by virtue of conceptual or meaning dependencies as perceived by language users (BAKER, 2001, 218).

The following complementary definition states that coherence "[...] is a facet of the reader's evaluation of a text [...] and is subjective and judgements concerning it may vary from reader to reader" (HOEY, 1991, p. 12). About the linguistic concepts of coherence and cohesion, when comparing both of them, the Australian translator Chris Andrews claims that in translation, "cohesion tends to increase while coherence suffers: the network of surface relations is reinforced, while the conceptual relations are loosed or damaged" (ANDREWS, 2014, p. 210). In essence, we are always running the risk inherent in the process of translation: what we state might be converted into something obvious and clear, while what is meant might turn into something indefinite and obscure. This holds true to the writer as well, since a phrase that s/he in her/his innocence believes to be perfectly clear, is revealed to be ambiguous or awkward "by the test of translation" (COETZEE, 2005, p. 146).

In terms of historical events, Patrick White evinces his sound historical background in his novels, given he actually took exams for History at Cambridge before changing to Modern Languages (French and German), and that would (and should) condition the work of any translator beforehand.

Based in Spain, at Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Amparo Hurtado Albir today is perhaps one of the most renowned names in the field of Traductology (or Translation Studies to most English-language scholars). She has dealt with many subjects, from the teaching of translation to the many types of translation and how to address each one in an ever changing environment in which technology plays an increasingly important role. In her book *Traducción y Traductología* (2008), she devotes a small section to literary translation, highlighting its special characteristics. In fact, Hurtado specializes in technical translation, but some of the topics devised in the project developed at PACTE (Procés d'Adquisició de la

Competència Traductora i Avaluació<sup>157</sup>) might apply to the context of literary translation. Ttranslation competence, in terms of its basic theoretical principles, is: 1) the underlying system of knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to translate; 2) not the same as the bilingual competence; 3) an operative expertise, but also containing declarative components; 4) formed by a set of subcompetences with hierarchies, relations and variations (HURTADO ALBIR, 2008, p. 395).

In addition, the model comprises 6 subcompetences: 1) linguistic competence in two languages (or bilingual competence); 2) extralinguistic competence; 3) transfer competence; 4) instrumental and professional competence; 5) psychophysiological competence; and 6) strategic competence. Each one of these is going to be detailed next.

Language competence encompasses the underlying systems of knowledge and skills necessary to perform linguistic communication between two languages, supposing one's capability of understanding the source language and producing in the target language. The following items pertain to this competence: 1) grammatical competence (full comprehension of the linguistic code, via vocabulary, word formation, syntax and semantics, pronunciation, orthography); 2) textual competence, i.e., understanding the mechanisms of cohesion and coherence and the combination of linguistic forms to produce a written or oral text in different genres and types; 3) illocutionary competence, concerning the functions of language; 4) sociolinguistic competence, concerning the appropriate production and comprehension of texts according to various sociolinguistic contexts, which depend on the status of the participants, the purposes of the communication, conventions established in certain fields, so on.

Extralinguistic competence comprises the implicit and explicit knowledge about the world and related to specific domains. The following items are part of this competence: 1) knowledge about the translation; 2) bicultural knowledge, i.e., the culture of the source language and the culture of the target language; 3) general encyclopedic knowledge; 4) thematic knowledge (specific domains).

Transfer competence is central and integrates the others: it is the ability to track down the process of transference from the original text to the elaboration of the final text. In other words, it is the ability to understand the original text and then be able to reproduce it in the target language following its purposes and intended readers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> More information about the research group is found at: http://grupsderecerca.uab.cat/pacte/.

Instrumental and professional competence contains the knowledge and skills related to the professional practice of translation, including: 1) knowledge and use of sources of all kinds; 2) mastering of new technologies; 3) knowledge about the labour market and the professional translator's behavior.

Psychophysiological competence is the ability to apply all the psychomotor, cognitive and attitude mechanisms of any kind; for example, in written translation, psychomotor skills of writing and reading are crucial. The following items are part of this competence: 1) memory and attention; 2) intellectual curiosity, perseverance, critical spirit, knowledge and confidence in one's own ability, measuring one's own possibilities; 3) active creative process, logic reasoning, analysis and synthesis.

Strategic competence embodies the individual, (un)conscious, (non)verbal external or internal procedures employed to sort out problems found during the translation. This competence affects the others inasmuch as it helps detect mistakes, make decisions and find incomplete or forgotten passages. Examples are: to be able to differentiate main ideas from secondary ones, identify conceptual relations, look for information in the right sources, paraphrase, retranslate, reformulate a sentence out loud, organize sources, select information, and so on.

Although Amparo Hurtado Albir claims that transfer and strategic competences are the most important in the model (placing them at the centre), inescapably we are going to see that extralinguistic competence is necessary to translate adequately too. In this work, apparently transfer competence was in effect in the example involving the translation of "country" in *Voss* into Brazilian Portuguese, as one of the meanings of the word was chosen, but not the one which that fit the context of the original (when Australia could not be considered a country) thus making it necessary to resort to the translator's extralinguistic competence.

Patrick White is not very explicit when it comes to historical events, and we can perceive that artistic and intellectual ability in *The Solid Mandala*. In essence, according to David Marr, "White loves to disguise the passage of time in his writing, and the age of a character is often the last mystery to be revealed" (MARR, 1995, p. 473). Historical events intermingle with the reality of the characters, and of the readers too, hence serving as a vehicle for White's criticism about the society he was living in. The mystery related to the year the twins were born in *The Solid Mandala* was solved by the scholar Ian Alexander and described in Stefani (2011, p. 29), and is quite helpful to locate events historically for the translation. Waldo was less than 30 years old in 1922, so he was born no earlier than 1892. He started working at Sydney Municipal Library when he was 17, and it was at that moment that

the First World War broke out (1914). Arthur is 56 years old when he buys his dog and the event prompts Waldo's memory to recollect a dialogue he had overheard 6 years ealier at the Public Library. He was transferred to the Public Library aged 50, and this is confirmed with the Peace, i.e., the end of the Second World War, in 1945, which "had caught up with him a couple of years after his momentous transfer to the Public Library" (WHITE, 1974, p. 182). Hence, Waldo, aged 50, started working there in 1943, giving us the year 1893 for the twins' birth.

The workflow of the translation is not so smooth and linear. Given that the structure of the novel relies on flashbacks and the end immediately leads us back to the beginning, the reading needs to be attentive, otherwise important elements might be missed, or would not be properly connected to the rest of the text.

According to Javier Franco Aixelá, translation is

an activity done by someone inevitably involved in a concrete historical context, which implies that it has a strong sociocultural component and that the norms by which it is governed and the expectations it has to fulfill evolve together with society and language" (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 129, my translation<sup>158</sup>).

Patrick White shows his love for the Australian landscape (which he rediscovered in his teenage years), but that same love cannot be related to Australian society. He was scared of the growing pressure imposed by this society in standardizing people, forgetting the art produced by those who were a part of it. The censorship, the custums - which needed to be similar to the British ones - the middle class and its interest inmaking money, the destruction of the landscape submitted to the law of development: all these ingredients are evident in *The Solid Mandala* and should be evident in the translation as well.

#### 4.1 THE SOLID MANDALA: STRUCTURE

In terms of structure, the novel is divided into four chapters. The first one, "In the bus" ("No ônibus"), shows events in the present of the novel, that is, the postwar period (even though the pre-war period is covered in flashbacks too), with Mrs Poulter and Mrs Dun talking on the bus, when, all of a sudden, one of them sees "the Brothers Brown", already old men, walking hand in hand on the street.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> In the original: "La traducción es una actividad realizada por alguén ineludiblemente implicado en un contexto histórico concreto, lo que implica que tenga un fortíssimo componente sociocultural y que las normas por las que se rige y las expectativas que tiende a cumplir evolucionem a la par que la sociedad y la propia lengua".

The second chapter, "Waldo", depicts important events in the lives of the brothers from Waldo's point of view. Considered the "intellectual of the family", arrogant and self-sufficient, he nourishes a literary ambition, but, paradoxically, the only thing he achieves is a position at the Sydney State Library. In the narrative, we can see that there is no linear temporal progression: facts of the present are mingled with facts of the past. We do not have dates nor ages specifically shown (this is the reader's task, since Patrick White does not tend to detailthis kind of information).

The third chapter, "Arthur", relates facts from Arthur Brown's perspective, a character considered intellectually limited by his twin Waldo and most characters in the story, except Mrs Poulter. Having a head for figures, at the beginning he also seems interested in stories (perhaps because he was a bit jealous of his intellectual brother), but he is not really worried about following a career. He works at Mrs Allwright's warehouse, and is happy to be useful to people. Admired by Dulcie Feinstein, a young Jewish girl who is friends with both twin brothers, and by her family, as well as by their neighbour, Mrs Poulter, Arthur incites Waldo's hatred when he shows up one day at the Sydney Municipal Library to read the Russian novel *The Brothers Karamazov*, by Fiodor Dostoyevsky.

The fourth chapter, "Mrs Poulter and the Zeitgeist" (A Sra. Poulter e o Zeitgeist), begins with descriptions of this secondary character whose name is in the title (her life as a neighbour of the Brown family), who spends a great deal of time with Arthur, to the point of arousing jealousy in her husband, Bill Poulter, and hatred in Waldo, since this relationship is "indecent" to his eyes. At this point in the story, we have the present perspective of the first chapter (the postwar period), since Mrs Poulter is the one who finds out about Waldo's death. When we read the end of the novel, our immediate reaction is to resume our reading, to be able to apprehend the entire picture.

#### 4.2 METHODOLOGY OF THE TRANSLATION

The work with *The Solid Mandala* has been carried out in an ideal environment and time frame, as there have not been any publishers waiting for or demanding that my work should be finished on an agreed day. There were two trips (one to London and the other to Sydney) towards the end of the translation, so I can venture to say my reading of the novel has changed somewhat, given the different perspectives when, for example, you see Pitt Street and start thinking that the episode of the celebration of Peace (the end of the Second World War) took place there.

The translation started at the end of 2011/beginning of 2012, and was finished (the whole first draft, without any previous and detailed/committed revision) in 2013, after my return from Australia. The reading towards translation was done on paper, and then the translated text was all processed on the computer (via Microsoft Word). At the time I started translating the novel, back in 2011, *The Solid Mandala* was not available in digital form (Kindle only had *Voss* on sale). Only when I had finished the whole first draft I was able to get the digital file with the full text, which today is on sale for Kindle users on Amazon.

In relation to the translation of the whole novel, the time constraints were already mentioned: the novel has 316 pages and, for the purpose of this dissertation, it would not be possible to present all of the final product of the translation, only the process and the analysis of the main extracts of the product (and, hence, the most representative of the reasoning and strategies adopted). Important scenes were chosen to be translated, so as to allow for a clearer and better performed analysis. Taking into account that the novel relies on the importance of different points of view to form the whole of the story, a crucial (and rather tense) scene – in addition to the scene of the dance – was chosen: when Waldo confronts Arthur at the Mitchell library. In that part, we feel ready to address how point of view can influence our choices, and how the style differs from one chapter to the other. After the translation, we can compare and see if the translation managed to deal with the many aspects involved, thus maintaining and/or respecting White's style. Additionally, considering that both chapters throw light on each other, with complementing events, we can manage the amount of text to be translated.

#### 4.3 THE REVISION PROCESS

Jana Šunková maintains that "a good translator should never call a translation finished without checking it, as well as a cook would never serve a meal without tasting it" (ŠUNKOVÁ, 2011, p. 5). Basically, revision can be broadly defined as the "function of professional translators in which they identify features of the draft translation that falls short of what is acceptable and make appropriate corrections and improvements" (MOSSOP, 2014, p. 115), aiming at "ensuring that a translation is an accurate and acceptable rendition of a source text for the target readership" (CHAKHACHIRO, 2005, p. 225). The word "acceptable" in both quotes stands out and explains our focus while working on the excerpts after translating them: we were searching for a final version which would satisfy our linguistic and literary/aesthetical taste. Specifically, I counted on the support of my advisors in this process, whose suggestions were fundamental to build the final versions presented here and

provide content for the analysis. A revisor may be considered a "language therapist who improves the text to ensure ease of mental processing and suitability of the text for its future readers" (MOSSOP, 2014, p. 18).

We follow Javier Franco Aixelá when he describes the methodology used in his thorough PhD dissertation on the translation of proper nouns in Spanish (considering many genres and different time frames): the object of study of translation needs to comprise actual translations, and the analysis is to be done based on the procedures adopted in those translations and which will be seen as legitimate from a practical point of view. Certainly such a point of view will differ to a literary critic and to a translation theorist whose postulates need to be confirmed. Translation is a teleological process, with the original text being the invariable element, with the substance which constitutes the discipline of Translation Studies coming first and foremost from translations. This does not mean that the original is to be despised: on the contrary, a starting point is necessary so as to enable a comparative study of the characteristics of the original and of the translation(s). Moreover, it should be highlighted that the original is a sort of guide which displays restrictions and possible linguistic and extralinguistic stimuli whose application in the translated text will be subject to many factors, such as the objective of the translation, its target readers, and the space it is to occupy in history (and about this topic we may well recall the importance of the historical variability of translations because of the original stimulus). The social aspect of translation needs mentioning, as the current practices of translating The Solid Mandala differ not only geographically, but also socially: to be in Italy in the 1970s will reflect a set of decisions made considering the original text; my translation in Brazil in the 21st century will reflect a completely different set of linguistic attitudes towards the text.

In regards to the inherent differences in the reading on the screen and in the traditional reading on paper, some topics need clarification: the translation relied heavily on the transfer of the original printed content to a file on the screen using Microsoft Word as the text processor, thus, generating a mixed version of offline and online reading. The revision process again was performed using this mixed form of reading: part on paper (offline), part on screen (online). Only the final revision was done exclusively with the translated content on the screen (online), using the proofreading resources provided by Microsoft Word. About future prospects for the publication of the whole product in Brazilian Portuguese, the project was devised to be academically divulged at first, and then, the search for publishers will be initiated.

#### 4.4 TARGET AUDIENCE

All translations are supposed to have a goal, and, as a consequence, a target audience. Skopos Theory, proposed by the German linguist Hans Vermeer, needs to be recalled in this work:

The [Skopos] Theory does not state what the principle is... The Skopos Theory merely states that the translator should be aware that some goal exists... The important point is that a given source text does not have one correct or best translation only (VERMEER, 2000, p. 228).

In light of that, our goal, as stated at the beginning of this dissertation, is to make Patrick White's oeuvre known to a Brazilian reader while evincing that his narrative and work with language – in addition to being admirable and explaining his Nobel award – impose challenges not only to the reader in English (and perhaps more to the reader in English who is going to translate it into any language), but mainly to the reader in Portuguese (either of Portugal or Brazil).

Initially for the purposes of this dissertation, the idea for the target audience would be the immediate receptors of this text, i.e., the members of the panel evaluating this research. This sounds like a natural choice, given this work is part of an assessment, and the ideal readers of the selected excerpts are all proficient both in Brazilian Portuguese and English, and know Patrick White's novels. In a second moment, we might start working with the ideal reader (or "virtual reader", as mentioned earlier in this work) of our translation as being the average Brazilian reader, which would immediately limit the use of footnotes in the final product. As the translator of James Joyce's *Ulysses* into Brazilian Portuguese, professor Caetano W. Galindo, writes in the introductory note to the new edition, the reader nowadays has more access to information, so s/he would not feel any difficulty in looking up strange words on the Internet (JOYCE, 2012). Hence, the concern about introducing many footnotes, as manifest in older translations, such as the ones presented in this dissertation, is quite diminished. Our work in Brazilian Portuguese will certainly debate the necessity – or not – of any footnotes (but a concise and informative introductory note is paramount).

Brazil is a continental country and this is reflected in its huge linguistic variety. Variety is generally rich and positive, but in translation, it becomes another hurdle to overcome. Some words which seem quite adequate to us, readers in Rio Grande do Sul, cannot be used in the text which is going to be presented to a reader in Sao Paulo or Rio de

Janeiro, or even in Recife or Aracaju, given the difficulty of interpretation, and/or use of those words in different contexts. These options will be discussed later in this dissertation.

### 4.5 THE TITLE CHOSEN: A SÓLIDA MANDALA

When considering the title of the novel, there must be some respect for what Patrick White said at the time he was proofreading *The Solid Mandala*, according to information provided in his biography written by David Marr:

They [Eyre and Spottiswoode] did try to change the title, but White would not budge: 'The title is the book and the book is the title.' He arranged for the London publishers to commission Desmond Digby to do the cover, and one afternoon the two men returned to Sarsaparilla to find the sort of house the Browns would have lived in. They never found the one White had in mind. Digby recalled a very pleasant day, 'but I have seen much better Greek fronts since' (MARR, 1995, p. 454).

The forms used, namely, *Las esferas del mandala* in Spanish, and *Le Mystérieux Mandala* in French, did not follow this orientation, with the Italian being closer to the original, *Màndala solido*.

The syntagm "solid mandala(s)" appears in 6 occurrences in the original, with their respective translation:

Exhibit 20 – Instances of "solid mandala"

| French              | German                 | Italian            | Spanish 1            | Spanish 2           |
|---------------------|------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------|
| "Ce sont mes        | «Das sind meine        | "Questi sono I     | – Esos son mis       | – Son mis mandalas  |
| fidèles mandalas",  | beiden Mandalas. Man   | miei mandala       | mandalas sólidos –   | – le explicò Arthur |
| expliqua Arthur au  | kann sie anfassen»,    | solidi," Arthur    | había explicado      | (WHITE, 2016, p.    |
| directeur (WHITE,   | erklärte Arthur dem    | spiegò al gestore  | Arthur al            | 103).               |
| 1973b, p. ).        | Geshäftsführer         | (WHITE, 1973c,     | administrador        |                     |
|                     | (WHITE, 1978, p. 65)   | p. 59).            | (WHITE, 1973a, p.    |                     |
|                     |                        |                    | 63).                 |                     |
| C'est alors que lui | Es war dies der        | Fu allora che egli | Fue entonces         | Así, se le ocurrió  |
| vint l'idée de      | Augenblick, in dem er  | concepì l'idea di  | cuando Arthur        | darle un de los     |
| donner un de ses    | den Plan faßte, Dulcie | donare a Dulcie    | concibió la idea de  | mandalas que        |
| fidèles mandalas à  | eines seiner festen,   | Feinstein uno dei  | dar a Dulcie         | guardaba (WHITE,    |
| Dulcie Feinstein    | greifbaren             | suoi mandala       | Feinstein uno de sus | 2016, p. 394).      |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.   | Glasmandalas zu        | solidi (WHITE,     | mandalas sólidos     |                     |
| 288).               | schenken (WHITE,       | 1973c, p. 283).    | (WHITE, 1973a, p.    |                     |

|                        | 1978, p. 311).          |                     | 295).                 |                       |
|------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| "C'est un des          | «Das ist eins von       | "È uno dei          | – Es uno de los       | – Es uno de mis       |
| mandalas dans          | meinem Mandalas –       | mandala solidi: il  | mandalas sólidos. El  | mandalas, el azul –   |
| toute as solidité, le  | das blaue Mandala»,     | mandala             | mandala azul –        | explicò (WHITE,       |
| mandala bleu,          | erklärte er (WHITE,     | azzurro," spiegò    | explico (WHITE,       | 2016, p. 397).        |
| expliqua-t-il"         | 1978, p. 313)           | (WHITE, 1973c,      | 1973a, p. 297).       |                       |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.      |                         | p. 286).            |                       |                       |
| 290).                  |                         |                     |                       |                       |
|                        |                         |                     |                       |                       |
| Ce solide mandala,     | Dieses feste, greifbare | Teneva in mano il   | Siempre que el era    | Cuando estaba en la   |
| il le gardait en main  | Mandala hielt er        | mandala solido      | posible sostenía en   | sala de lectura de la |
| quand il s'installait, | immer in der Hand,      | quando sedeva,      | su mano aquel         | biblioteca, apretaba  |
| chaque fois qu'il le   | wenn er im Leseaal      | ogni volta che gli  | mandala sólido        | en la mano el         |
| pouvait, dans la       | der Öffentlichen        | era possibile,      | cuando se sentaba     | mandala de vidrio     |
| salle de lecture de    | Bibliothek saß. [] Er   | nella sala di       | en la sala de lectura | siempre que era       |
| la Bibliothèque. []    | saß und drehte sein     | lettura della       | de la biblioteca. []  | posible. [] De        |
| Assis à lire, il       | festes Mandala          | biblioteca. []      | Entonces se sentaba   | modo que sentado      |
| faisait tournoyer le   | zwischen den Fingern,   | Quindi sedeva       | girando el mandala    | allí jogueteando      |
| fidèle mandala et,     | und indem er die        | rigirandosi fra le  | sólido entre sus      | con el mandala y      |
| en assemblant les      | Worte einfach wie       | dita il mandala     | dedos y barajando     | barajando palabras,   |
| mots de diverses       | Karten ständig neu      | solido, e           | las palabras,         | obtuvo muchas de      |
| manières, il se        | mischte, gelang es      | rimescolava le      | haciendo la mayoría   | las permutaciones     |
| livrait à de           | ihm, ihnen viele –      | parole nel          | de las                | de sentido, si no     |
| nombreuses sinon à     | wenn auch vielleicht    | tentativo di        | permutaciones de      | todas (WHITE,         |
| toutes les             | nich alle –             | scorprire diverse   | sentido posibles, si  | 2016, p. 432-433).    |
| permutations de        | Möglichkeiten ihrer     | variazioni di       | es que no todas       |                       |
| sens possibles         | Sinngebung              | significato, se non | (WHITE, 1973a, p.     |                       |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.      | abzugewinnen            | tutti i significati | 327).                 |                       |
| 318-319).              | (WHITE, 1978, p.        | possibili           |                       |                       |
|                        | 346).                   | (WHITE, 1973c,      |                       |                       |
|                        |                         | p. 314)             |                       |                       |
| La révolution          | Und so trugen ihn die   | Così le ruote       | Y así, las            | Así, las              |
| somnolente des         | schläfrig rollenden     | sonnolente di       | soñolientas ruedas    | somnolientas          |
| roues dans les         | Räder der Züge und      | treni e di autobus  | de los trenes, y los  | ruedas de los trenes  |
| trains et les autobus  | Busse zurück,           | lo riportarono      | autobuses, lo         | y los autobuses lo    |
| le ramena à son        | während er nur still    | indietro, mentre    | llevaron de nuevo     | llevaron de           |
| point de départ        | dasaß und in der        | sedeva facendo      | hacia allí, sentado y | regresso, mientras    |
| tandis qu'il se        | Tasche sein festes      | roteare il mandala  | haciendo girar el     | él hacía girar en el  |
| laissait emporter en   | Mandala kreisen ließ    | solido nella sua    | mandala sólido en     | bolsillo la esfera    |
| faisant tournoyer      | (WHITE, 1978, p.        | tasca (WHITE,       | su bolsillo (WHITE,   | del mandala           |

| dans sa poche le  | 384).                                      |  | 1973c, p. 348).                    | 197                                     | 73a, p. 362).  | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |
|---|--|--|------------------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|
| fidèle mandala  | ,  |  | _                                  | · • · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |  | 477).                 |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.   |  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
| 354).   |  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
| English   |  | ]  | First Attempt                      |   | Brazilian Por  | tuguese - Revised     |
| "'Those are my solid  | mandalas,"                                 | – Aquelas  | são minhas manda                   | alas                                    | – Essas são minha  | as sólidas mandalas – |
| Arthur explained to t   | he manager                                 | sólidas –  | Arthur explicou                    | ao                                      | Arthur explicou a  | o gerente.            |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 55   | ).   | gerente.   |                                    |   |  |                       |
|   |  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
| It was then he concei   | ved the idea                               | Foi então o  | que ele concebeu a id              | leia                                    | Foi então que ele  | concebeu a ideia de   |
| of giving Dulcie Fein   | stein one of                               | de dar a D   | Oulcie Feinstein uma               | de                                      | dar a Dulcie Fe  | instein uma de suas   |
| his solid mandalas  | (WHITE,                                    | suas sólida  | s mandalas.                        |   | sólidas mandalas.  |                       |
| 1974, p. 253).  |  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
| "It's one of the solid mandalas, the blue mandala," he explained (WHITE, 1974, p. 255). |  | <ul> <li>É uma das mandalas sólidas, a<br/>mandala azul – ele explicou.</li> </ul> |                                    | s, a                                    | <ul> <li>É uma das sólidas mandalas, a mandala azul – ele explicou.</li> </ul> |                       |
| This solid mandala he   | e held in his                              | Esta mandala sólida ele mantinha   |                                    | nha                                     | Esta sólida mandala ele mantinha em  |                       |
| hand as he sat,   | whenever                                   | em sua mão enquanto ele sentava,   |                                    | ıva,                                    | sua mão enquanto sentava, sempre que   |                       |
| possible, in the readi  | ing room at                                | sempre que possível, na sala de  |                                    | de                                      | possível, na sala de leitura da  |                       |
| the Library. []   | So he sat                                  | leitura da Biblioteca. [] Assim  |                                    | sim                                     | Biblioteca. [] Assim ele sentava   |                       |
| twirling the solid m  | andala, and                                | ele sentava  | rodopiando a mand                  | lala                                    | rodopiando a só  | olida mandala, e ao   |
| by shuffling the wor  | ds together,                               | sólida, e ac   | ao embaralhar as palavras          |   | embaralhar as palavras, ele fazia  |                       |
| he made many if no  | ot all of the                              | juntas, ele  | le fazia muitas se não             |   | muitas, se não todas, as permutações   |                       |
| permutations of sense   | permutations of sense. (WHITE, todas as pe |  | ermutações de sentido. de sentido. |   |  |                       |
| 1974, p. 280-281).  |  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
|   |  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
| So the drowsily   | revolving                                  |  |                                    |   |  |                       |
| wheels, of trains,  |  |  | de trens, de ônibus, o             |   | revoltas, de trens, de ônibus, o   |                       |
| carried him back,   |  |  | e volta, enquanto                  |   | levavam de volta, enquanto ele sentava   |                       |
| twirling the solid ma   |  |  | odopiando a mand                   | iala                                    | rodopiando a sólida mandala no seu   |                       |
| pocket (WHITE, 197-   | 4, p. 309).                                | sólida no s  | eu bolso.                          |   | bolso.   |                       |

In the translations, only the Italian translation goes on with the option using "solido" throughout the novel and keeping it in the title too; both Spanish versions deleted the adjective from the title: while the oldest one added nouns, the most recent decided to delete the adjectives, thus ignoring the possible meaning of "solid" in the original. The French uses "fidèles" in most occurrences, with the alternatives "solide", together with "solidité",

appearing as well; however, for some reason the title ended up with the adjective "mystérieux". The German translation keeps the adjectives (only in the first two occurrences the adjective disappears), but the title (*Die ungleichen Brüder*, "the different brothers", in a free translation) is a reference to the twins, not to the idea of the mandala, thus eliminating any reference to this important aspect of the novel. It should be noted that the translator's workflow during the 1970s was quite precarious (compared to ours, in the 21<sup>st</sup> century), so, the idea of keeping the same occurrence might be lost when there are a number of pages to correct at a time when typewriters were still in use (at times, even handwritten excerpts).

In Brazilian Portuguese, it is possible to use the syntactical structure adjective + noun with "sólida" and "mandala" in these fragments, giving a different effect than the initial (and more common) idea, "mandala sólida" (noun + adjective). The option *A sólida mandala* keeps the syntactical and semantic (as the range of meanings for both "solid" in English and "sólida" in Brazilian Portuguese is similar) structure of the original without causing strangeness, provided that the Portuguese language allows for that. Once again, it is important to recall here that publishers have the final word about the title, thus, it remains to be seen whether "*A sólida mandala*" would be a marketable title or not, but, for the purposes of this dissertation, that is the alternative chosen.

The form of the title seems to corroborate the fact that ordinary objects acquire a different meaning to Patrick White's characters. According to Geoffrey Dutton, White would be a "victim of a mysticism of objects – or better still, a mysticism of sensations. Far too many things, objects, are presented as revelations; and it is through an unremitting concern with sensations that they are so presented" (DUTTON, 1964, p. 417). Hence the importance of keeping these objects just as they are in the story (for example, glass marbles could not be replaced by pearls).

We call attention to one small change made in the extracts just presented: in the last occurrence, the verb form "levaram" (perfect past) was changed to "levavam" (imperfect past), because we wanted to maintain the idea of habit manifest in Arthur in connection with his solid mandalas. In the next pages, we are going to perceive that these apparently insignificant changes in verb tenses mean a great deal in the effect created in the rhythm of the narrative in translation.

# $4.6~{\rm HISTORY}$ AND MILITARY (COLONIAL, RELIGIOUS) TOUCHES IN THE SOLID MANDALA

Patrick White distills his bitterness in relation to Australian society and the events which were taking place at the time, in particular the two World Wars, in which Australia took an active part (and decimated its population). It is with this feeling in mind that we read the following extract, making reference to the ones who went to war.

Exhibit 21 – The Boys

| French                        | German             | Italian            | Spanish 1            | Spanish 2         |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------|-------------------|
| Waldo Brown devint à          | Waldo Brown war    | In questo periodo  | Por esa época        | A esa edad,       |
| cette époque un jeune         | zu dieser Zeit auf | Waldo Brown        | Waldo estaba         | Waldo Brown se    |
| home fort distingue. A la     | dem besten Wege,   | stava diventando   | convirtiéndose en    | estaba            |
| Bibliotèque municipale, on    | ein aufgeweckter   | un giovane         | un muchacho          | convirtiendo en   |
| le mit au catalogue. Aussi    | junger Mann zu     | dinamico. Alla     | apuesto. En la       | un joven          |
| la partie la plus             | werden. Die        | Biblioteca         | Bibloteca            | despabilado. En   |
| désagréable de sa vie était-  | Bibliothek hatte   | Comunale           | Municipal lo         | la Biblioteca     |
| elle constituée par la        | ihn inzwischen in  | l'avevano messo    | habían puesto a      | Municipal lo      |
| guerre et tout ce que celle-  | den Katalogsaal    | al catalogo.       | trabajar en el       | habían trasladado |
| ci impliquait. C'est          | versetzt. Num war  | Quindi la parte    | catálogo. De modo    | a la sección del  |
| pourquoi il fuyait            | der Krieg und      | meno desiderabile  | que lo que menos     | catálogo. De      |
| particulièrement les          | alles, was damit   | della sua vita era | deseaba en su vida   | suerte que la     |
| hommes enrôlés dans           | zusammenhing,      | la guerra e tutto  | era la guerra y todo | parte más         |
| l'armée prêts à lui faire des | der                | ciò che la guerra  | lo que ella          | desagradable de   |
| confidences, à étaler au      | unangenehmste      | comportava. In     | implicaba. Rehuía    | su vida era la    |
| grand jour leurs              | Teil seines        | particolare non    | particularmente a    | guerra, y todo lo |
| impressions les plus          | Lebens. Ganz       | sopportava quelli  | aquellos enrolados   | que implicaba;    |
| secrètes, les plus            | besonders          | fra gli uomini     | para la contenda     | En particular,    |
| personelles, les plus         | schreckte er vor   | arruolati che      | que ansiaban hacer   | Waldo rehuía a    |
| chargées d'émotion, les       | jenen Soldaten     | amavano fare       | confidencias y       | los hombres       |
| plus pénibles, comme s'ils    | zurück, die        | confidenze, buttar | revelar todo lo que  | enrolados que     |
| vidaient un sac de papier.    | vertrauliche       | fuori quanto c'era | para ellos era en    | querían hacer     |
| Il cachait naturellement ses  | Gespräche führen   | di più segreto,    | extremo secreto,     | confidencias,     |
| sentiments; sous              | wollten, die ihr   | personale,         | personal, emotivo    | revelar lo más    |
| l'influence de la guerre      | Innerstes nach     | emotivo,           | y doloroso, como     | íntimo, personal, |
| personne n'y aurait cru et    | außen kehrten, als | doloroso, come se  | si vaciaran un saco  | emotivo y         |
| moins que quiconque ces       | wollten sie eine   | stessero vuotando  | de papel.            | doloroso, como si |
| figures grandes ouvertes      | Papiertüte         | un sacchetto di    | Naturalmente, él     | estuvieran        |

en mal de confession, ces faces campagnardes boucanées qui avaient pris la couleur et la consistance du lard fumé, les visages de nos jeunes soldats. Tout le monde, naturellement, aimait les jeunes soldats, chantait des chansons en leur honneur, avec eux, à leur sujet. Les rues se remplirent soudain de blouses au buste avantageux, de jeunes femmes guillerettes qui tenaient des boutiques Martin Place et de jeunes filles, de jeunes filles vendant des insignes de métal et des drapeaux de papier; toutes adoraient l'odeur du kaki (WHITE, 1973b, p. 145).

ausleeren: die tiefsten Geheimnisse, Gefühlsausbrüche, Schmerzliches. Natürlich verbarg Waldo seine eigenen Gefühle sorgfältig, denn unter der Wirkung des Krieges hätte sie ihm keener geglaubt – am allerwenigsten die offenen Gesichter jener, die einfach nur beichten wollten, diese Gesichter vom Land, fest wie geräucherter Schinken und auch von derselben Farbe – die Gesichter UNSERER JUNGS. Natürlich war alles von UNSEREN JUNGS begeistert, sang für sie, sang mit ihnen und über sie. Die straßen wimmelten plötzlich von sich mutig blähenden Uniformblusen und dann die fröhlichen jungen Matronen, die

carta. Naturalmente dissimulava i propri sentimenti, perché sotto l'influenza della guerra nessuno vi avrebbe prestato fede, meno di tutti quei tipi dalle facce eccesivamente aperte che sentivano il bisogno di parlare, quei campagnoli dai volti color prosciutto, i Ragazzi. Com'era ovvio tutti amavano i Ragazzi, cantavano in loro onore, cantavano con loro. cantavano le loro imprese. Tutti quei petti prorompenti dalle camicette che tutt'a un trato riempivano le strade, le allegre giovani signore che presiedevano ai chioschi in Martin Place, e le ragazze, le ragazze che

encubría sus sentimientos, porque bajo la influencia de la guerra nadie creería en ellos, y mucho menos aquellos rostros anhelantes de confesíon, rostros rústicos curados con tintes y texturas de tocino, los rostros de los Muchachos. Por supuesto, todo el mundo queria a los muchachos, les cantaba, cantaba con ellos y acerca de ellos. Todas essas blusas henchidas de busto con que pronto se colmaron las calles, las alegres y jóvenes madres de familia que presidían los puestos en Martin Place, y las chicas, las chicas que vendían insignias de metal y banderas de papel, todas ellas adoraban el caqui de los uniformes (WHITE, 1973a, p. 148).

vaciando una bolsa de papel. Naturalmente, disimulaba sus sentimientos porque, bajo los efectos de la guerra, nadie habría creído en ellos, y menos que nadie todos esos rostros abiertos de par en par, ávidos por confesarse, rostros rústicos. curtidos hasta adquirir el tinte y la textura del tocino, los rostros de los Muchachos. Desde luego, todos querían a los Muchachos, cantaban para ellos, con ellos, acerca de ellos. Todas esas blusas azules que apenas contenían el busto y que colmaban de golpe todas las calles, las optimistas matronas jóvenes que estaban al frente de algún puesto en Martin

| freiwillig in        | vendevano        | Place, y las       |
|----------------------|------------------|--------------------|
| Martin Place für     | distintivi di    | chicas, las chicas |
| das leibliche Wohl   | metallo e        | que vendían        |
| der Soldaten         | bandierine di    | insignias de metal |
| sorgten, und         | carta: tutte     | y banderitas de    |
| verkauften: sie alle | amavano l'odore  | papel: todas ellas |
| waren verliebt in    | del kaki (WHITE, | adoraban el olor   |
| das khakifarbene     | 1973c, p. 140)   | de los uniformes   |
| Tuch der             |                  | (WHITE, 2016,      |
| Vaterlandsverteidi   |                  | p. 210).           |
| ger. (WHITE,         |                  |                    |
| 1978, p. 153)        |                  |                    |

#### English First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised

Waldo Brown at this stage was becoming a smart young fellow. At the Municipal Library they had put him on the catalogue. So the least desirable part of his life was war and all that it implied. In particular he recoiled from those of the enlisted men who wished to make confidences, to turn out all that was most secret, personal, emotional, painful, as though they were emptying a paper bag. Naturally he disguised his feelings, because under the influence of war nobody would have believed in them, least of all those wide-open faces needing to confess, the country faces cured to bacon tints and textures, the faces of the Boys.

Of course everybody loved the Boys, sang to them, with them, about them. All those blouses full of bust with which the streets were suddenly filled, the cheery young

Waldo Brown nessa fase estava se tornando um jovem esperto. Na Biblioteca Municipal eles o haviam colocado no catálogo. Assim a parte menos desejável de sua vida era a guerra e tudo o que ela implicava. Particularmente ele se esquivava daqueles homens alistados que queriam fazer confidências, mostrar tudo o que mais secreto, pessoal, emocional, doloroso, como se eles estivessem esvaziando um saco de papel. Naturalmente ele disfarçava seus sentimentos. porque sob a influência da guerra ninguém teria acreditado neles, menos de tudo naqueles rostos abertos precisando confessar, os rostos do país curados a tinturas e texturas de bacon, os rostos dos Pracinhas.

Claro que todos amavam os Pracinhas, cantavam para eles, com eles, a respeito deles. Todas aquelas blusas cheias de busto com as quais as ruas foram

Waldo Brown nessa fase estava se tornando um jovem considerável. Na Biblioteca Municipal eles o haviam lotado no catálogo. Assim a parte menos desejável de sua vida era a guerra e tudo o que ela implicava. Particularmente ele se esquivava daqueles alistados que queriam fazer confidências, mostrar tudo o que era mais secreto, pessoal, emocional, doloroso, como se eles estivessem esvaziando um saco de papel. Naturalmente ele disfarçava seus sentimentos, porque sob a influência da guerra ninguém teria acreditado neles, muito menos aqueles rostos abertos precisando confessar, os rostos interioranos curtidos a tinturas e texturas de toucinho, os rostos dos Guris.

Claro que todos amavam os Guris, cantavam para eles, com eles, sobre eles. Todas aquelas blusas cheias de peito com as quais as ruas foram repentinamente preenchidas, matrons who presided over stalls in Martin Place, and the girls, the girls selling metal badges and paper flags – all of them loved the smell of khaki (WHITE, 1966, p. 127) repentinamente preenchidas, as jovens enfermeiras que presidiam plateias em Martin Place, e as garotas, as garotas vendendo broches de metal e bandeirolas de papel – todas elas adoravam o cheiro de cáqui.

as jovens enfermeiras responsáveis pelos palanques em Martin Place, e as gurias, as gurias vendendo broches de metal e bandeirolas de papel – todas elas adoravam o cheiro de uniforme.

In this instance, we call attention to the phrase "The Boys". As a matter of fact, it is not possible for us to simply replace that linguistic item with, for example, the most immediate alternative of translation in a Brazilian translator's mind, which would be "Pracinhas", after all, there is a plethora of connotations carried by these expressions (The Boys and Pracinhas) in historical terms, involving the participation of both countries in the Second World War, hence requiring a comparison. About this aspect, J. M. Coetzee maintains that he, as an author, uses "words with the full freight of their history behind them, and that freight is not easily carried across to another language" (COETZEE, 2005, p. 143). Brazil suffered a great deal less with the conflict, because the number of soldiers sent to fight for the Brazilian Expedicionary Force was lower than the number of Australian soldiers who died in the conflict. In effect, it is not a question of an immediate option for translation, given that both countries took part in the War. Here the translator's historical sensitivity needs to be activated. Furthermore, Patrick White was himself one of the boys, and about that he makes the following criticism: "On getting into uniform I could see from the attitude of friends and glances from strangers in the streets that my stock had increased in value" (WHITE, 1983, p. 84). We might have used either "os rapazes" or "os garotos", but to mark our regional locus of enunciation (the South of Brazil, the State of Rio Grande do Sul), "os guris" was chosen, therefore following White's own regionalism in *The Solid Mandala*: he describes the way the inhabitants of Sydney speak and their feelings and impressions about the city in the text, thus, if we want to keep this feature in the translation, being regional in our own language is a possible way out.

We call attention to the lapse involving the word "khaki" being translated as "cáqui" (which is the fruit) instead of military uniform. We should highlight another change made in the extract: instead of the literal translation "menos de tudo" for "least of all", we opted for "muito menos", which is far more natural in Brazilian Portuguese, but only stood out in our reading for revision.

Susan Bassnett mentions, when referring to J. C. Catford's view of untranslatability, the translation of the word "democracy" which, although an international word, has different usages in different contexts. This shows that there is no common ground from which to choose relevant situational characteristics, since "democracy" instills in the reader diverse interpretations. Thus, Brazilian democracy is quite different from French democracy, and the same occurs if comparing to other nations. According to Bassnett's words, "if culture is perceived as dynamic, then the terminology of social structuring must be dynamic also" (BASSNETT, 2005, p. 41). This is seen exactly in the instance of "The Boys": my immediate reaction would be to consider the Australian soldiers who went to war as being the same as the Brazilian who went to war as well, but the situations were quite different. If we follow this immediacy, then the Brazilian reader having access to Patrick White's description of his experience of war will have a domesticated portrait, given s/he will think the realities were the same, which is not the point. This would be an instance of cultural untranslatability, although there are linguistic elements available which allow the translation of the syntagm. Edward Sapir's comment makes sense in the discussion:

No two languages are ever sufficiently similar to be considered as representing the same social reality. The worlds in which different societies live are distinct worlds, not merely the same world with different labels attached (SAPIR, 1956, p. 69).

Striking differences arise from the first to the second version of the translation in terms of vocabulary, rhythm and perception. Again, the adjectives pose challenges of effect and interpretation: "smart", in this English context, makes reference to how stylish, neat and tidy a person's appearance is, while retaining (as a second entry) the meaning that someone is clever as well. Thus, it is not easy to find alternatives in Brazilian Portuguese which keep the same meanings in a single word. The adjective "considerável" sounded better than "esperto", because, in the story, Waldo is far from being clever, thus, if "esperto" remained, it would signal a narrative incoherence.

Still immersed in the war feelings described in the novel, another occurrence which deserves our attention relates to the translation of AIF, which stands for Australian Imperial Forces. There are only two occurrences of this abbreviation in the novel, shown next:

Exhibit 22– AIF

| L'authentique broche A.I.F.¹ qu'elle portait probablement devait à peine contribuer à cacher ses seins.  [] A cet instant il remarqua que Dulcie ne portait pas de broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or. 1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  Die große Brosche der freiwilligen distintivo che aveva portato in quell'occasione le aveva tenuto assieme a malapena i seni. [] Ma si accorse che Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo distintivo che aveva portato in que debía haber q       |
|--|
| probablement devait à peine contribuer à cacher ses seins.  [] A cet instant il remarqua que Dulcie ne portait pas de broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces  [] Dulcie trug zwar nicht die Brosche der Imperial Forces  [] Truppenbetreuung, die sie já sicherlich quell'occasione le aveva tenuto assieme a malapena i seni.  [] Ma si accorse sus pechos.  [] Ma si accorse sus pechos.  [] En cambio, pechos.  [] En cambio, observo que  [] Dulcie trug zwar addosso non il distintivo  [] Dulcie trug zwar appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de (N.d.T.) (WHITE, aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Truppenbetreuung, addosso non il dos veva tenuto assieme aveva tenuto assieme habría podido mantener juntos sus pechos.  [] En cambio, pechos.  [] En cambio, observo que  [] Dulcie llevaba no el broche de la advertir que  AIF, sino la Estrella de David el broche de la el broche d                                     |
| die sie já sicherlich auch getragen haben mußte, hatte amalapena i seni. [] A cet instant il remarqua que Dulcie ne portait pas de broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or. 1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  die sie já sicherlich auch getragen haben mußte, hatte amalapena i seni. [] Ma si accorse che Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  die sie já sicherlich auch getragen haben mußte, hatte aveva tenuto assieme a malapena i seni. [] Ma si accorse che Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  debió usar entonces impedia a duras penas que sus pechos.  [] Che Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  debió usar entonces impedia a duras penas que sus pechos.  [] En cambio, observo que pero acababa de advertir que adell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  distintivo dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  1973c, p. 152).  1973c, p. 152).  16Australian Imperial Force.  |
| auch getragen haben mußte, hatte a malapena i seni.  [] A cet instant il mußte, hatte wahrscheinlich gerade mit Mühe und broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  auch getragen haben mußte, hatte a malapena i seni.  [] Ma si accorse sus pechos.  [] Ma si accorse che Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  auch getragen haben mußte, hatte a malapena i seni.  [] Ma si accorse sus pechos.  [] En cambio, pechos.  [] Dulcie llevaba no el broche de la advertir que  AIF, sino la Estrella de David el broche de la en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  1973c, p. 152).  500  101  102  103  104  105  107  107  107  108  109  109  109  109  109  109  109   |
| [] A cet instant il remarqua que Dulcie wahrscheinlich gerade mit Mühe und broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces  (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  Imperial Forces  (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Imußte, hatte wahrscheinlich gerade mit Mühe und broche de in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Imußte, hatte a malapena i seni.  Imußte, hatte a malapena i seni.  Imantener juntos sus pechos.  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Industralios  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Industralios  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Imantener juntos  Industralios  Imantener juntos    |
| remarqua que Dulcie ne portait pas de broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or. 1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  wahrscheinlich gerade mit Mühe und Not ihren Busen zusammengehalten. [] Ma si accorse che Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  sus pechos. [] En cambio, observo que el broche de la advertir que Dulcie no llevaba el broche de la en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  se le vieran los pechos. [] Pero acababa de advertir que Dulcie no llevaba el broche de la en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  16Australian Imperial Force.   |
| ne portait pas de broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces  (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  Pero acababa de dell'esercito ma, aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Dulcie portava addosso non il distintivo observo que [] En cambio, observo que [] Dulcie llevaba no el broche de la advertir que appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  Dulcie llevaba no el broche de la advertir que appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 166).  Dulcie no llevaba el broche de la en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  [] En cambio, observo que []  Dulcie nollevaba el broche de la el broche de la en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 166).  |
| broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  broche A.I.F., mais une étoile de David à zusammengehalten. [] Dulcie trug zwar dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  dell'esercito ma, appesa a una catenina d'oro, una Stella de di David (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Not ihren Busen  addosso non il distintivo Dulcie llevaba no el broche de la AIF, sino la Estrella de David el broche de la oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  16Australian Imperial Force.  |
| une étoile de David à une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian nicht die Brosche der Imperial Forces  Imperial Force  Im |
| une chaînette en or.  1. AIF: Australian Imperial Forces Imperial Force I |
| 1. AIF: Australian nicht die Brosche der Imperial Forces Imper |
| Imperial Forces  (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 156-157).  Freiwilligen Truppenbetreuung, aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Truppenbetreuung, aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Truppenbetreuung, di David (WHITE, 1973c, p. 152).  Estrella de David el broche de la AIF sino una Estrella de David oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  gue pendía de una cadena de oro.  iféAustralian Imperial Force.   |
| (N.d.T.) (WHITE, Truppenbetreuung, aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  Truppenbetreuung, aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  di David (WHITE, en una cadena de oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  1973c, p. 152).  1973c, p. 152).  1973a, p. 161).  Estrella de David que pendía de una cadena de oro.  16Australian Imperial Force.   |
| aber sie hatte ein goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  1973c, p. 152).  1973c, p. 152).  oro. (WHITE, 1973a, p. 161).  Estrella de David que pendía de una cadena de oro.  oro.  if Australian Imperial Force.   |
| goldenes Kettchen um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  1973a, p. 161). que pendía de una cadena de oro.  16Australian Imperial Force.   |
| um den Hals, an deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  una cadena de oro.  if Australian Imperial Force.  |
| deme in Davidstern pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  oro.  16Australian Imperial Force.   |
| pendelte (WHITE, 1978, p. 166).  16Australian Imperial Force.  |
| 1978, p. 166).  16 Australian Imperial Force.  |
| Imperial Force.  |
|  |
| [N. de la T.]  |
|  |
|  |
| (WHITE, 2016,  |
| p. 226).   |
| English First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese – Revised   |
| The authentic AIF brooch she O broche autêntico da AIF que ela O broche autêntico da Força   |
| must have worn would barely deve ter usado dificilmente teria Expedicionária Imperial que ela deve   |
| have held her breasts together. mantido seus seios juntos. ter usado dificilmente teria segurado   |
| [] Instead he noticed Dulcie seus seios.   |
| was wearing, not the AIF brooch, [] Em vez disso ele notou que [] Em vez disso, notou que Dulcie   |
| but a Star of David on a gold Dulcie estava usando, não o estava usando não o broche da Força  |
| chain. broche da AIF, mas uma Estrela Expedicionária Imperial, mas uma   |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 137-138). de Davi em uma corrente de ouro. Estrela de Davi em uma corrente de   |
| ouro.  |

The French introduced a footnote to account for the abbreviation, which sounds very apt, because this way the reader will know its meaning. The first Spanish translation kept the abbreviation as it was in English, then counting on the reader's world knowledge or her/his will to look for the reference somewhere (this strategy might be used nowadays when our reader has much more access to information than in the 1970s), while the new one inserts a footnote, explaining the meaning of the abbreviation in English, thus using it as it is in the other occurrence. However, an unexpected action was taken by the Italian translator, who simply deleted the reference in its first occurrence: the abbreviation disappears and is replaced by a general or hyperonymic term: "spilla-distintivo", which means "pin badge", but the specific Australian reference is absent. The Czech translation scholar Jiří Levý believes it is immoral to contract or omit any difficult expressions in a translation, for it is the translator's responsibility to look for a solution to the most complicated sentences or expressions, always having a functional perspective in mind. In this case, the Italian translator did not show his extralinguistic competence (for lack of care with a cultural element), as well as its strategic competence (he simply decided to delete the abbreviation, instead of dealing with it). There is only the reference to "army" in the second occurrence in the Italian translation, but no indication of an Australian (or imperial) context. The German merely uses a form to identify the military reference of the brooch (Freiwilligen Truppenbetreuung), without being specific about its origin. In Brazilian Portuguese, we decided to translate the abbreviation and use it in its extended form in both occurrences, which would give a more complete understanding of the context: the Australian Boys going to war, to help the British Forces.

Another change which needs mentioning concerns the verb form chosen to translate "held her breasts together". In English, this construction does not represent any problems, as we understand what it conveys in the context. However, when we look at the options chosen in the first attempt and in the revised version, we can recognize how difficult it was to come up with a satisfactory form. Before choosing "segurado", which is a more frequent collocation to "seios" in Brazilian Portuguese, we had thought of using "controlado", but again collocation played a decisive role in this part, conditioning our final result.

A dialogue extracted from a Canadian TV series called "Murdoch Mysteries", based on the eponymous novels written by Maureen Jennings which unveils the adventures of the young detective William Murdoch in 19<sup>th</sup>-century Toronto, is shown to illustrate the next challenge in our translation. In this specific situation, the dialogue involves the Canadian detective investigating the action of American spies in Canadian territory and the American representative sent to Toronto to help solve the case:

This dialogue is introduced in this part to start the debate about the colonial relations present in *The Solid Mandala* as well. The Canadian point of view sheds light to us, translators in Brazil, to the colonial relations established between Canada and the United States, hence conditioning the interpretation of the scene (observing how the relations of power and subservience still existed, permeating the social and hierarchical aspects of this society). This same relation of power is stressed at the end, when Canada's situation is compared to Scotland's in reference to England. The question is: in referring to the British Empire, we have the four main countries (in terms of political and economic importance), Canada, England, Scotland and the United States mentioned. What about Australia? It does not have, in territorial terms, any connection with England, or the United States. Or should we extend the power of the elephant, the United States, when rolling over might it roll westwards)? Patrick White seems to criticize the power of such an elephant in *The Solid Mandala* (as seen previously in the mapping of the events being portrayed).

The first occurrence of 'Home' is uttered by Mrs Poulter, when talking to Mrs Dun on the bus, at the beginning of the novel.

| French                 | German                   | Italian               | Spanish 1         | Spanish 2        |
|------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------|------------------|
| M <sup>me</sup> Dun se | Mrs. Dun schrumpfte ein  | La signora Dun        | Mrs. Dun          | Mrs. Dun se      |
| recroquevilla          | wenig zusammen.          | parve accartocciarsi. | frunció algo.     | encogió un       |
| quelque peu sur        | »Sie sind aus der alten  | "Vennero dalla        | – Vinieron de     | poco.            |
| elle-même.             | Heimat                   | madrepatria," disse   | Inglaterra – dijo | – Vinieron de    |
| "Ils sont arrivés      | herübergekommen, als die | la signora Poulter,   | Mrs. Poulter –    | Inglaterra –     |
| d'Anglaterre quand     | beiden Jungen noch ganz  | "quando I ragazzi     | cuando los        | siguió la otra – |
| les gosses étaient     | klein waren.«            | erano ancora          | muchachos eran    | cuando los       |
| encore tout petits."   | Das stimmte Mrs. Dun     | bambini."             | apenas unas       | muchachos eran   |

Exhibit 23 – "Home" (Occurrence 1)

<sup>&#</sup>x27;We'd best move quickly, or our friends to the south will come up here and take over this investigation for themselves.'

<sup>&#</sup>x27;The Americans have no authority in this jurisdiction.'

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Detective, in the service we have a saying that goes: living beside the United States is like a mouse living with an elephant. The mouse is protected, but if the elephant decides to roll over, the mouse better move quickly, else he be squashed.'

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Like England and Scotland.'

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Hmm?'159

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Murdoch Mysteries. Season 7, Episode 15, The Spy Who Came Up to the Cold. Script available at: http://transcripts.foreverdreaming.org/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=9998. Accessed on: 12 Aug. 2015.

| M <sup>me</sup> Dun en fut            |                             | s friedlicher.                 | La signora Dun si                                 | criaturas.                             | unas criaturas.  |  |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|---|--|------------------|--|
| partiellement                         | Ȇberall die                 | ese Ausländer«,                | sentì in parte                                    | Mrs. Dun se                            | – Mrs. Dun se    |  |
| apaisée.                              | sagte sie. »Wil lassen aber |                                | tranquillizzata.                                  | tranquilizó en                         | calmó en parte.  |  |
| "Tout ces étrangers                   | auch jeden herein           |                                | "Tutti questi                                     | parte.                                 | –Con todos       |  |
| que nous                              | heutzutage!                 | Obwohl ich                     | stranieri," observò,                              | - Com todo estos                       | esos extranjeros |  |
| accueillons de nos                    | natürlich zugebe, daß es    |                                | "che oggi lasciano                                | extranjeros que                        | que dejamos      |  |
| jours, dit-elle. Les                  | bei Engländ                 | ern etwas                      | entrare nel paese.                                | dejamos entrar                         | entrar ahora –   |  |
| Anglais, je le                        | anderes ist.«               | <                              | Devo ammettere ch                                 | e hoy em día –                         | dijo –. Aunque   |  |
| reconnais, c'est                      | »Oh – ein G                 | entleman war                   | gli inglesi sono                                  | suspiró                                | admito que los   |  |
| different.                            | Mr. Brown                   | senior auf                     | diversi."   | Admito que com                         | ingleses son     |  |
| -Oh, M. Brown père                    | jeden Fall«,                | sagte Mrs.                     | "Oh, il vecchio                                   | los ingleses es                        | otra cosa.       |  |
| était un homme qui                    | Poulter. »Ol                | owohl ihn das                  | signor Brown era                                  | diferente.                             | –Sí, el viejo    |  |
| avait de l'education,                 | natürlich au                | ch nicht besser                | una persona molto                                 | - Oh, Mr. Brown                        | Brown era todo   |  |
| reprit M <sup>me</sup> Poulter,       | machte als unsereinen.«     |                                | distinta," ricordò la                             | padre era un                           | un caballero.    |  |
| mais il ne valait                     | (WHITE, 1978, p. 17).       |                                | signora Poulter. "M                               | a caballero –                          | Pero no mejor    |  |
| quand meme pas                        |                             |                                | non migliore di noi                               | " afirmó mistress                      | que nosotros     |  |
| mieux que nous"                       |                             |                                | (WHITE, 1973c, p.                                 | Poulter Pero no                        | (WHITE, 2016,    |  |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.                     |                             |                                | 14)   | era major que                          | p. 45-46).       |  |
| 18)                                   |                             |                                |   | usted o yo                             |                  |  |
|                                       |                             |                                |   | (WHITE, 1973a,                         |                  |  |
|                                       |                             |                                |   | p. 16)                                 |                  |  |
| English                               | First                       |                                | Attempt   | Brazilian Portug                       | uese – Revised   |  |
| Mrs Dun shrivelled so                 | mewhat.                     | A Sra. Dun d                   | iminuiu de alguma                                 | A Sra. Dun se encolheu um pouco.       |                  |  |
| 'They come out from                   | om Home,'                   | forma.                         |   |  |                  |  |
| Mrs Poulter said, 'wh                 | nen the boys                | – Eles são vindos da           |   | – Vieram da Velha Inglaterra –         |                  |  |
| were only bits of kids                | .,                          | Inglaterra – dis               | sse a Sra. Poulter – disse a Sra. Poulter – quand |  | er – quando os   |  |
| Mrs Dun was partly p                  | acified.                    | quando os meninos eram ainda   |   | menino eram ainda pedacinhos de        |                  |  |
| 'All these foreigners', she said,     |                             | pedacinhos de criança.         |   | gente.                                 |                  |  |
| 'we are letting in nowadays. I        |                             | A Sra. Dun estava              |   | A Sra. Dun estava parcialmente         |                  |  |
| admit the English is different.'      |                             | parcialmente apaziguada.       |   | apaziguada.                            |                  |  |
| 'Oh, Mr Brown senior was a            |                             | - Todos esses estrangeiros -   |   | - Todos esses estrangeiro - disse      |                  |  |
| gentleman,' Mrs Poulter said.         |                             |                                |   | ela – que estamos deixando entrar hoje |                  |  |
| 'But not any better than us' entrar l |                             | entrar hoje em                 | dia. Admito que os                                | em dia. Admito que os inglês são       |                  |  |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 15).                 |                             |                                |   | diferente.                             |                  |  |
|                                       |                             | – Oh, o Sr. Brown sênior era   |   | – Ah, o Sr. Brown sênior era um        |                  |  |
|                                       |                             | um cavalheiro – disse a Sra.   |   | cavalheiro – disse a Sra. Poulter. –   |                  |  |
|                                       |                             | Poulter. – Mas não mais do que |   | Mas não melhor do que nóis.            |                  |  |
|                                       |                             | 1.5.                           |   | 1                                      |                  |  |

nós.

Before addressing the translation of "Home", we would like to call attention to register specificities in this segment, mainly regarding Mrs Dun, who says "the English is different". In all this dialogue with Mrs Poulter, at the beginning of the novel, Mrs Dun speaks informal English, as does Mrs Poulter. Therefore, as part of their mental characterization during our workflow, we had to imagine them speaking Brazilian Portuguese in an informal register as well, a reasoning which explains why we changed their way of speaking in parts which are grammatically correct in the original (particularly in this selected part), for example, by using wrong noun and verbal concord, such as in "os menino", "todos esses estrangeiro" and "os inglês são diferente". Furthermore, we used "nóis" (instead of "nós"), the exclamation form "Ah" (and not "Oh") and the expression "pedacinhos de gente", taking into account what is more common to Brazilian speakers. This strategy is crucial, because it enhances our perception and rendering of these characters since the beginning, while maintaining consistency throughout the translation.

This first occurrence signals a very important issue at the time White was composing *The Solid Mandala*: the immigration flow and the reactions provoked in Australian society. To mark a difference and then add some sort of affectionate, or homesick, load when referring to the "old country", why not introduce the adjective "velha" next to the name of the country in Brazilian Portuguese? That strategy keeps the names of the original, and the whole array of historical feelings we find when looking for the reference "Home" in Australian history. In Brazilian Portuguese, to use "pátria-mãe" (as the Italian translation did) would not sound natural, as the reader might connect the name to Portugal, and not to the Imperial relationship being portrayed in the novel, namely, Australia – British world. The next occurrence of "Home" in the text is shown as follows:

Exhibit 24 – "Home" (Occurrence 2)

| French              | German                 | Italian               | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2          |
|---------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| Dès le début, il se | »Ihr seid mir schon    | In qualche modo,      | De alguna forma     | De alguna          |
| sentait protégé.    | ein merkwürdiges       | almeno, seppe fin     | supo que desde el   | manera, supo       |
| C'etait peut-être   | Para«, sagte die Frau  | dall'inizio che era   | principio él estaba | desde el principio |
| grâce à Waldo.      | in Barranugli, als sie | protetto. Forse       | protegido. Tal vez  | que él estaba      |
| Tout le monde n'a   | die große, braune      | dipendeva da Waldo.   | por Waldo. No todo  | protegido. Tal     |
| pas la chance       | Teekanne               | Non capita a tutti di | el mundo tenía un   | vez era por        |
| d'avoir un jumeau.  | hereinbrachte. »Gibts  | avere um gemello.     | hermano mellizo.    | Waldo. No          |
| Il fallait          | da noch viele wie      | Doveva attacarsi a    | Tenía que           | cualquiera tiene   |
| s'accrocher à       | euch in der Alten      | Waldo.                | mantenerse cerca de | un mellizo. Tenía  |

| Waldo.               | Heimat?«              | "Siete una stranza     | Waldo.                | que aferrarse a   |
|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------|
| "Quelle drôle de     | »Das möchte ich doch  | coppia," disse la      | – Buena pareja sois   | Waldo.            |
| paire vous faites,   | nicht hoffen«, sagte  | donna di Barranugli    | vosotros – dijo la    | −¡Qué par de      |
| leur dit leur        | Waldo. Die Frau       | quando entrò com la    | mujer de Barranugli   | chicos raros! –   |
| logeuse à            | machte ihn ärgerlich. | grande teiera          | mientras traía la     | dijo la mujer de  |
| Barranugli en        | »Ich mövhte eher      | marrone. "Ci sono      | gran tetera marrón –  | Barranugli        |
| apportant la grosse  | annehmen, daß Leute   | molti altri come voi   | . ¿Hay muchos otros   | cuando trajo la   |
| théière brune. Y en  | wie wir überhaupt     | nella madrepatria?"    | así en Inglaterra?    | tetera marrón     |
| a-t-il beaucoup      | einmalig sind.«       | "Spero di no,"         | – Supongo que no –    | grande–. ¿Hay     |
| d'autres comme       | (WHITE, 1978, p.      | rispose Waldo,         | contestó Waldo;       | muchos como       |
| vous dans la         | 266-267).             | irritato. "Voglio      | estaba irritado –.    | ustedes en        |
| métropole?           |                       | sperare che noi        | Creo que somos        | Inglaterra?       |
| - J'espère bien que  |                       | siamo diversi da tutti | diferentes de todo el | –Espero que no –  |
| non, répondit        |                       | gli altri."            | mundo.                | contestó Waldo:   |
| Waldo que cette      |                       | La donna uscì.         | La mujer se marchó.   | la pregunta lo    |
| question irrita.     |                       | Sembrava che non       | No parecía haber      | había irritado–.  |
| J'espère que nous    |                       | capisse il loro        | comprendido su        | Espero que        |
| sommes différents    |                       | linguaggio (WHITE,     | discurso (WHITE,      | seamos distintos  |
| de tout le monde."   |                       | 1973c, p. 244).        | 1973a, p. 255).       | de todo el mundo. |
| La femme sortit.     |                       |                        |                       | La mujer se fue.  |
| Elle ne semblait     |                       |                        |                       | No pareció        |
| pas comprendre       |                       |                        |                       | entenderlo.       |
| leur façon de parler |                       |                        |                       | (WHITE, 2016,     |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.    |                       |                        |                       | p. 343).          |
| 248).                |                       |                        |                       |                   |
|                      |                       |                        | 7 24 7                |                   |

#### **English** First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised Somehow at least he knew from the De alguma forma pelo menos ele De alguma forma pelo menos ele was sabia desde o início que ele estava sabia desde o início que estava beginning he protected. Perhaps it was Waldo. Not protegido. Talvez fosse Waldo. protegido. Talvez fosse Waldo. Nem everybody has a twin. He must Nem todo o mundo tinha um todo o mundo tinha um gêmeo. Ele hang on to Waldo. gêmeo. Ele deve prender-se a tinha a necessidade de prender-se a Waldo. Waldo. 'You're a funny pair,' said the -Vocês par -Vocês são uma dupla engraçada são um woman at Barranugli when she engraçado - disse a mulher em - disse a mulher em Barranugli brought in the big brown teapot. Barranugli quando ela trouxe o quando ela trouxe o grande bule 'Are there many others like you at grande bule marrom. - Há muitos marrom. - Há muitos outros como Home?' outros como vocês na Inglaterra? vocês na Velha Inglaterra? 'I should hope not,' Waldo - Espero que não - Waldo - Espero que não - Waldo answered; it had made him angry. respondeu; isso o havia deixado respondeu; isso o havia deixado furioso. - Espero que sejamos 'I should hope we are different brabo. Espero que sejamos

| from just anybody.'             | diferentes de qualquer um.         | diferentes de qualquer um.     |
|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| The woman went out. She didn't  | A mulher saiu. Ela não             | A mulher saiu. Ela não pareceu |
| seem to understand their speech | pareceu entender o discurso deles. | entender a fala deles.         |
| (WHITE, 1966, p. 218).          |                                    |                                |

Before addressing the translation of the word "Home", we call attention to a modification concerning the modal verb "must" which, in our first translation, was rendered as "deve" ("have to"). After rereading the passage, we decided to increase the idea conveyed by the verb in the original by using the expression "tinha a necessidade" ("had the necessity"), which, in addition to being stronger, more clearly signals the relationship of the twin brothers to the reader in Brazilian Portuguese.

Now, focusing on the use of the word "Home", which appears quite frequently in White's oeuvre, it is necessary to observe what that word means in his world. Susan Bassnett uses the word "home" in its everyday sense to start explaining what is intended in this topic: if the expression "I'm going home" "is spoken by an American resident temporarily in London, it could either imply a return to the immediate 'home' or a return across the Atlantic, depending on the context in which it is used, a distinction that would have to be spelled out in French" (BASSNETT, 2005, p. 40-41). In Patrick White's universe, David Marr expresses that quite well:

He was a child of the Empire, born in London to Australian parents who took pains to see that his upbringing confirmed the puzzling circumstances of his birth. 'It is not that I am not Australian,' he remarked. 'I am an anachronism, something left over from that period when people were no longer English and not yet indigenous.' At whichever end of the Empire he lived, he always knew there was another home for him on the other side of the world. It angered him to be mistaken for English, yet it mattered a great deal to him that he was born in London, and he believed the first months of his life spent in the flat overlooking Hyde Park left their traces. 'It was in a formative period.' He was to live in London and came to love it with the exasperation of a native, returning when he could for as long as he travelled. Yet London was denied him. Australia, he remarked bitterly late in his life, 'is in my blood – my fate – which is why I have to put up with the hateful place, when at heart I am a Londoner' (MARR, 1995, p. 11-12).

London is viewed as the heart of the Empire, and as the centre of a literary system which encompassed the Australian as well. This is quite important to start to understand the importance the city, and hence the metropolis, has in White's oeuvre and, more precisely, in the colonial conflict present in *The Solid Mandala*. Again, David Marr describes the conflict in White's family and that connected to the use of the concept of "home": his father, Dick

White, wanted to live in Australia, and his mother, Ruth, wanted to live in England, which ended up creating the feeling that everyone longed to be somewhere else:

Home was never indisputably *here* for there was always somewhere else where life might be better or might be happier. His childhood was marked by a pattern of small exiles [...]. [...] He had been born in England: Matt and Flo and the News of the World all came from England; it was the world of his mother's imagination; it meant royalty and theatre; history happened in England. He could never be bored there (MARR, 1995, p. 64).

Patrick White's use of "Home" in many of his novels is a captivating resource, which marks his writing and criticism. In the paper *Your Country is of Great Subtlety: Aspects of the Brazilian Translation of Patrick White's Voss*, Alexander and Stefani (2016)<sup>160</sup> show that in the only translation available into Brazilian Portuguese of a White novel (*Voss*, published in 1985), the translation of "country" does not appear to follow any discernable criterion. And, when there is a reference to "Home", what the authors find is the almost automatic translation to "Inglaterra" (England). *Voss*, like *The Solid Mandala*, is a novel which demonstrates the colonial relations in historical and social terms, and the translation of the word without any kind of thought certainly has interpretive implications. Peter Morton, in his essay *Australia's England*, *1880-1950*, says the following about the context of "Home":

Actually 'home' (in the quixotic sense meaning Britain) was a problematic, exploitable term except for a period around the middle of the 19th century. By the 1890 the journalist Francis Adams was reporting that 'ten years ago England was spoken of affectionately as the Old Country or Home. Now it is "home" or more sarcastically "'ome". The inverted commas make all the difference, and the dropped "h" contains a class contempt.' So for the sophisticated Australian-born at least, the word has been used, in some hands, with a certain self-consciousness for a century or more.

Still, whatever the exact resonance of 'home', it certainly needs limiting as far as the visiting and émigré writers are concerned. 'Home' for them never meant Great Britain: that is, neither Scotland, Wales, Ireland nor even provincial England. It meant London (MORTON, 2009, p. 256-257).

Thus, as for *The Solid Mandala*, in terms of options in translation into Brazilian Portuguese, how would "Inglaterra" (England), "Grã-Bretanha" (Great Britain) or "Reino Unido" (United Kingdom) create a tension in the translated story, given that Australia's very particular relationship with its former colonizer is entirely different from that of Brazil with Portugal?

<sup>160</sup> ALEXANDER, Ian; STEFANI, Monica. Your Country is of Great Subtlety: Aspects of the Brazilian Translation of Patrick White's Voss. **Ilha do Desterro A Journal of English Language, Literatures in English and Cultural Studies**, Florianópolis, v. 69, n. 2, p. 107-116, Jun. 2016. Available at: https://periodicos.ufsc.br/index.php/desterro/article/view/2175-8026.2016v69n2p107. Accessed on: 02 Sept. 2016.

Options for "the Old Country" could be accepted, although not the literal forms "o velho país" or "a velha terra" (both equally valid options for "old country"), which would not mean anything to a Brazilian reader. "Terrinha", "pátria-mãe" and "além-mar" are forms which immediately refer to Portugal, but they do not position the former colonial power as a cultural point of reference or even particularly worthy of respect, as do Australian uses of "Home". Could such choices be made to work, or would they represent a distorted view in socio-cultural terms in the translation of Patrick White into Brazilian Portuguese?

A use of the word "terra", which would be similar to "home" in the context of moving from the metropolis to the colony, is found in Brazilian Portuguese in Aluísio Azevedo's novel *O Cortiço* (*The Slum*, translated by David H. Rosenthal, in 2000; the 1926 translation was entitled *A Brazilian Tenement*, by Harry W. Brown, and it is the most cited) published in 1890:

Aos domingos iam às vezes à missa ou, à tarde, ao Passeio Público; nessas ocasiões, ele punha uma camisa engomada, calçava sapatos e enfiava um paletó; ela o seu vestido de ver a Deus, os seus ouros trazidos da terra, que nunca tinham ido ao monte de socorro, malgrado as dificuldades com que os dois lutaram a princípio no Brasil<sup>161</sup>.

Home went on being the place to be when you were successful, but, in the story, we have The Brown family leaving Home and going to Australia. What were they possibly looking for? Better conditions of life, which seem to be the main explanation for any immigration. However, when applied to White's world, according to J.M. Coetzee's introduction to the newest Spanish translation, George Brown is really tempted to believe that there are no shadows in Australia, i.e., that you would be free in the country. That is precisely the feeling Patrick White criticizes in his novel; thus, the translator needs to perceive that and then work with such a feeling in her/his mental processes. In connection with the supposed absence of shadows in the new country, let us observe how the fragment featuring the expression "shadows in Australia" was translated and what it possibly represents:

Exhibit 25 – Shadows in Australia

| French           | German                    | Italian           | Spanish 1         | Spanish 2       |
|------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------|
| Et Papa          | Vaters Gesicht hatte sich | E, quando         | Y el papá,        | Más sombrío, el |
| s'assombrissait, | wieder verdüstert, und er | scendeva la sera, | ofuscado, comenzó | papá empezó a   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> AZEVEDO, Aluísio. **O Cortiço**. Available at: http://www.dominiopublico.gov.br/download/texto/bn000003.pdf. Accessed on: 27 Dec. 2015.

recommençait à tousser. Il ne pardonnait pas à l'Église baptiste. Le campanile couleur chocolat "légèrement penché, mais pas suffisamment" lui restait dans l'esprit. Il ne pouvait l'oublier. "Quel dommage que tu ne sois pas né quaker, dit Waldo. Il y aurait eu moins d'architecture. Et tu aurais pu abandonner leur religion exactement de la même façon." Mais Papa n'appréciait pas les plaisanteries des autres sur les sujets sérieux. "Il y a trop de choses que vous, mes garçons, vous qui avez été élevés dans la lumière. dans un pays désert, ne comprendrez jamais. Il n'y a pas d'ombres en Australie. Ni de discipline. Chaque bonhomme peut faire ce qui lui plaît."

begann zu husten. Er konnte der Kirche der Baptisten einfach nicht vergeben. Der schokoladenbraune Glockenturm, »der ein bißchen schief stand, aber leider nicht schief genug«, stand ewig und immer vor seinem inneren Auge. Er kam einfach nicht davon los. »Es ist schade, daß du nicht wenigstens als Quäker zur Welt gekommen bist«, sagte Waldo. »Dann hättest du dich zumindest nicht auch noch mit soviel Architektur herumschlagen müssen. Und austreten können hättest du bei denen genauso.« Aber Vater mochte es nicht, wenn andere Menschen Witze über ernsthafte Angelegenheiten machten. »Es gibt vieles, was ihr Jungen niemals verstehen werdet. Ihr seid in einem leeren Land aufgewachsen und in der Helligkeit des Lichts. In Australien gibt es keine Düsternis. Und auch keinen Zwang. Jedermann kann hier tun

Papà cominciava a tossire. Non avrebbe mai potuto perdonarla alla Chiesa Battista. Il suo campanile color cioccolato, "un po' pendente, ma non abbastanza", era un chiodo fisso nella sua mente. Non riusciva a liberarsene. "È un peccato che tu non sia nato quacchero," disse Waldo, "Ci sarebbe stata meno architettura. E avresti potuto piantarli in asso come hai fato coi battisti." Ma Papà non dava ascolto alle facezie altrui su argomenti seri. "Ci sono troppe cose che voi ragazzi, allevati nella luce in un paese vuoto, non capirete mai. Non ci sono ombre in Australia. E non c'è nessuna disciplina. Ciascuno può fare

a toser. Nunca perdonaría a la Iglesia Bautista. Su campanario color chocolate "un poco inclinado, aunque no lo suficiente" estaba clavado en su mente. No podía dejarla descansar. Es una lástima que no hayas sido cuáquero – dijo Waldo -. Hubiera habido menos arquitectura. Y de todos modos hubieras podido dejarlos igual. Pero al papá no le gustaban las bromas de los demás sobre problemas serios. Hay muchas cosas que vosotros, muchachos, educados a la luz de un país vacío, nunca comprenderéis. No hay sombras en Australia, Ni disciplina. Todos, sin excepción, hacen lo que les place. Creía en esto, porque queria

creerlo. Pero no lo

toser. No podría perdonar jamás a la Iglesia Baptista. No podia sacarse de la mente el campanário color chocolate, "algo inclinado, pero no lo suficiente". No podia olvidarse de todo ello – Es una lástima que no hayas nacido en una família cuáquera le dijo Waldo – No habría habido tanta arquitectura. Y lo mismo podrías haberlos abandonado. Pero el padre no prestaba atención a las bromas ajenas sobre asuntos serios. -Hay muchas cosas que ustedes. muchachos. criados en la luz de un pais desierto, jamás van a entender. No hav sombras en Australia. Ni disciplina. Todos

| Comme il désirait le                            | und lassen, wa                   | as er will.«                                | ciò che vuole."                                       | pensaba de sí                        | pueden hacer lo              |  |
|---|----------------------------------|---|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|--|
| croire, il le                                   | Er glaubte das                   | s, weil er es                               | Poiché voleva   | mismo (WHITE,                        | que quieren.                 |  |
| croyait même si                                 | glauben wollte – wenn er         |   | crederci, ci  | 1973a, p. 187-188).                  | Porque queria                |  |
| ce n'était pas le cas                           | es auch niema                    | ls auf sich                                 | credeva,  |                                      | creerlo y lo creía,          |  |
| pour lui (WHITE,                                | selbst anwand                    | te (WHITE,                                  | perlomeno per   |                                      | aunque no para               |  |
| 1973b, p. 182)                                  | 1978, p. 194).                   |   | quanto riguardava                                     |                                      | sí mismo                     |  |
|   |                                  |   | gli altri (WHITE,                                     |                                      | (WHITE, 2016,                |  |
|   |                                  |   | 1973c, p. 178-  |                                      | p. 259).                     |  |
|   |                                  |   | 179).   |                                      |                              |  |
| English   |                                  | Fi  | rst Attempt   | Brazilian Portu                      | guese – Revised              |  |
| And Dad, darkenin                               | g, began to                      | E Papai, esc                                | curecendo, começou                                    | a E Papai, escurec                   | endo, começou a              |  |
| cough. He could neve                            | er forgive the                   | tossir. Ele n                               | unca poderia esquece                                  | er tossir. Ele nunca                 | poderia perdoar a            |  |
| Baptist Church. I                               | ts chocolate                     | a Igreja Ba                                 | tista. Seu campanári                                  | o Igreja Batista.                    | Seu campanário               |  |
| campanile 'leaning a l                          | bit, but not far                 | chocolate                                   | "se inclinando ur                                     | n chocolate "se incl                 | inando um pouco,             |  |
| enough' stuck in h                              | is mind. He                      | pouco, m                                    | as não muito  | mas não o suficiente" estava grudado |                              |  |
| couldn't let it rest.                           |                                  | suficiente"                                 | suficiente" grudado em sua em sua                     |                                      | sua mente. Ele não conseguia |  |
|   |                                  | mente. Ele não conseguia deixar             |   | deixá-la em paz.                     |                              |  |
|   |                                  | isso em paz.                                |   |                                      |                              |  |
| 'It's a pity you we                             | eren't born a                    | <ul> <li>É uma pena que você não</li> </ul> |   | o – É uma pena qu                    | e você não nasceu            |  |
| Quaker,' Waldo said.                            | 'There would                     | nasceu Qua                                  | uaker – Waldo disse. –   Quaker – Waldo disse. – T    |                                      | disse. – Teria tido          |  |
| have been less arch                             | itecture. And                    | Teria tido                                  | menos arquitetura.                                    | E menos arquitetura                  | a. E você poderia            |  |
| you could have left                             | them just the                    | você poder                                  | eria tê-los deixado o tê-los deixado do mesmo jeito.  |                                      | mesmo jeito.                 |  |
| same.'  |                                  | mesmo.                                      |   |                                      |                              |  |
| But Dad didn't ca                               | re for other                     | Mas Pap                                     | Papai não gostava das Mas Papai não gostava d         |                                      | ostava das piadas            |  |
| people's jokes on serie                         | ous matters.                     | piadas das                                  | as outras pessoas sobre dos outros sobre assuntos sér |                                      | ssuntos sérios.              |  |
|   |                                  | assuntos sér                                | ios.  |                                      |                              |  |
| 'There's too much you boys, reared              |                                  | - Há muito que vocês garotos,               |   | s, – Há muito qu                     | e vocês rapazes,             |  |
| in the light in an empty country, criados r     |                                  | criados na l                                | luz de um país vazio                                  | o, criados à luz de                  | e um país vazio,             |  |
| will never understand. There aren't nunca enter |                                  | nderão. Não há treva                        | s nunca entenderão.                                   | Não há trevas na                     |                              |  |
| any shadows in A                                | n Australia. Or na Austrália     |   | a. Ou disciplina. Tod                                 | o Austrália. Ou di                   | sciplina. Qualquer           |  |
| discipline. Every man                           | an jack can do cara pode fa      |   | zer o que ele gosta.                                  | fulano pode fazer                    | o que quiser.                |  |
| what he likes.'                                 |                                  |   |   |                                      |                              |  |
| Because he wanted to                            | ted to believe it, he Porque ele |   | queria acreditar nisso                                |                                      | a acreditar nisso,           |  |
| did believe – if no                             |                                  | ele acredit                                 | ou – se não del                                       | 1                                    | ue não servia para           |  |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 160                            | )-161).                          | mesmo.                                      |   | ele mesmo.                           |                              |  |

The Italian translation, when it comes to religious references, seems more open to diversity, and does not show such preoccupation with footnotes, but the language itself provides a form of translation to the expression "it's a pity", which is translated as "È un

peccato". Translated back into Brazilian Portuguese, "è un peccato" would become, literally, "é um pecado", i.e., "it's a sin". The expression thus translated from the Italian is often used in places with a strong Italian background as a synonym for the expression "é uma pena" ("it's a pity"), and in a way helps identify the background of the speaker. If my translation kept the reference in Italian to "é um pecado que você não tenha nascido Quaker" it might be a way to introduce a religious pun in the text, brought about by Waldo, which originally did not exist linguistically (or explicitly) in the original.

The possibilities in Brazilian Portuguese to translate "shadows" vary from "trevas" to "sombras" and "escuridão", but the option chosen ("trevas") seems to be the strongest, while alluding to how some historians (and we) refer in Brazilian Portuguese to a hard period in Medieval history ("Idade das Trevas"), characterized by strong religious conflicts. Therefore, if we want to make connections to such historical events, the option "trevas" would work better to generate that effect.

When comparing the first version in Portuguese to the revised one, we see that a lapse occurred with the verb "forgive", which was first translated as "esquecer" ("forget"), and then changed to the right form, "perdoar". It might be a justifiable lapse, but in this context, the translator might have been too close to the story, and thus might be using what Umberto Eco refers to as "overinterpretation<sup>162</sup>": surely, George Brown could not forget the Baptist Church and, why not, could not forgive it for all that the religious doctrine might have inflicted on his personality, now duly "enlightened" in Australia.

The last sentence in the extract is another challenge: it works perfectly well in English to say "if not of himself", but in Brazilian Portuguese, if translated literally, it is not so clear (as seen in the first attempt, "se não dele mesmo"). In our revision, we had to add a quite long explanation through "só que não servia para ele mesmo": almost the double of words (seven) to account for the fact that, for George Brown, to believe in his freedom in Australia would not be useful, although it was for the others.

As mentioned earlier, this is a regional novel, thus, the appearance of many elements of local colour from Sydney should not come as a surprise. Such occurrences call for the translator's sensitivity, first to perceive them (and their importance) and, then, to think about how to address them in the translated text. One of those examples is the brand of cosmetics Cyclax: depending on the choices in translation, interpretations regarding race and colour

According to Umberto Eco, overintepretation would be the tendency to think that the most obvious elements of a text are more significant than they really are: "the glory of the reader is to discover that texts can say everything, except what their author wanted them to mean. [...] What I want to say is that there are somewhere criteria for limiting interpretation" (ECO, 1992, p.158-159).

stand out through the use of associated adjectives, in this case referring to the main consumer of such product, Mrs Poulter:

Exhibit 26 – Occurrences of Cyclax

| French                        | German                   | Italian               | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2          |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| M <sup>me</sup> Poulter avait | Mrs. Poulter war noch    | La signora Poulter    | Mrs. Poulter tenía  | Ella tenía todavia |
| gardé une                     | eine recht frische       | aveva ancora una      | aún muy buen        | un semblante       |
| physionomie                   | Erscheinung. Ihre Haut   | bella cera.           | aspecto. Tenía      | lleno de vida. La  |
| avenante. Sa peau             | war natürlich völlig     | Naturalmente la sua   | arrugas, claro      | piel se le había   |
| s'était flétrie, bien         | faltig geworden – kein   | pelle era rovinata,   | está, a su edad era | ajado com la edad  |
| entendu, à son âge;           | Wunder bei ihrem         | alla sua età, ma      | lógico, pero        | desde luego, pero  |
| mais elle avait               | Alter – aber sie hatte   | aveva la sua salute,  | conservaba su       | le quedaba la      |
| conservé sa bonne             | noch ihre Gesundheit     | il suo colore, che    | salud, su color; se | salud y el color,  |
| santé et ses couleurs,        | und ihre gesunde         | aiutava col Cyclax,   | ayudaba con         | que resaltaba com  |
| qu'elle corrigeait un         | Gesichtsfarbe, der sie   | più discreto delle    | Cyclax, porque      | Cyclax, más        |
| peu à l'aide de               | ein wenig mit Cyolax     | altre marche. Di      | era más discreto    | dicreto que otras  |
| Cyclax, plus discret          | (sic) nachhalf, einem    | profumo più           | que las otras       | marcas. Con un     |
| que les autres                | Make-up, das ein         | raffinato, più símile | marcas. Tenía un    | perfume más        |
| marques, au parfum            | wenig diskreter wirkte   | a una crema per la    | olor más delicado,  | fino, más          |
| plus raffiné. C'était         | als die anderen          | pelle. Nessuno        | más bién parecia    | parecido a una     |
| plutôt un genre               | Fabrikate. Und es roch   | poteva obiettare      | una espécie de      | crema para la      |
| d'onguent. Personne           | auch vornehmer, mehr     | niente a una          | ungüento para la    | piel. Nadie puede  |
| ne peut reprocher à           | wie eine Hautcreme       | persona che faceva    | piel. Nadie podía   | hacerle reproches  |
| une femme                     | oder sowas. Niemand      | qualcosa per          | reprocharle que     | a una persona      |
| d'empêcher as peau            | konnte schließlich       | migliorare il         | hiciera algo para   | porque haga algo   |
| de se dessécher.              | etwas dagegen haben,     | proprio aspetto.      | mejorar su          | para remediar las  |
| Impossible de se              | wenn man etwas für       | Naturalmente non      | aspecto. Por        | arrugas. Por       |
| changer, bien sûr.            | seine trockene           | poteva cambiare se    | supuesto, no        | supuesto, no       |
| Elle avait le teint           | Gesichtshaut tat.        | stessa. Il suo vero   | podía alterarse a   | podía cambiar del  |
| plutôt brun et un air         | Natürlich konnte sie     | colorito era          | sí misma. Por       | todo. Así había    |
| plein de santé. Si sa         | sich jetzt nicht einfach | piuttosto bruno e     | nacimiento era      | nacido: algo       |
| figure se craquelait          | völlig verändern. Sie    | dall'aria sana. Se    | morena y tenía un   | morena y de        |
| comme le vernis               | war schon mit            | andò in pezzi come    | aspecto saludable.  | aspecto            |
| d'une vieille faïence,        | bräunlicher Haut und     | un vecchio vasetto    | Si se cuarteaba     | saludable. Si se   |
| c'est bien ce qui             | gesundem Aussehen        | di smalto, la colpa   | como un viejo       | cuarteaba como     |
| arrive avec le temps          | zur Welt gekommen.       | fu soltanto del       | tazón de            | una vieja taza de  |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.             | Und wenn sie jetzt       | tempo (WHITE,         | porcelana era       | loza, pues eso es  |
| 339)                          | Risse und Sprünge        | 1973c, p. 333).       | consecuencia        | lo que sucede con  |
|                               | bekam, wie ein alter     |                       | inevitable de la    | el passo del       |

|                            | Emailletop             | f, dann war |                     | edad (WHITE,       | tiempo (WHITE,    |
|----------------------------|------------------------|-------------|---------------------|--------------------|-------------------|
|                            | das einfach            | die         |                     | 1973a, p. 356-     | 2016, p. 457).    |
|                            | natürliche I           | Folge der   |                     | 347).              |                   |
|                            | verrinnende            | en Zeit     |                     |                    |                   |
|                            | (WHITE, 1              | 978, p.     |                     |                    |                   |
|                            | 367).                  |             |                     |                    |                   |
|                            |                        |             |                     |                    |                   |
| M <sup>me</sup> Poulter se | Mrs. Poulte            | er mußte    | Mentre meditava, la | Mientras pensaba   | Mientras pensaba  |
| passait la langue sur      | sich immer             | wieder      | signora Poulter si  | esto, Mrs. Poulter | esas cosas, Mrs.  |
| des lèvres très            | nervös über            | die Lippen  | leccò le labbra, su | se frotaba los     | Poulter se ponía  |
| légèrement enduites        | lecken, wei            | ın sie über | cui era stato       | lábios con una     | Cyclax en los     |
| de Cyclax, en              | solche Ding            | ge          | spalmato um po' di  | ligera capa de     | labios. Mirando   |
| réfléchissant à ce         | nachdachte             | . Die       | Cyclax. Aveva       | Cyclax. Se miraba  | el espejo se daba |
| problème. Elle             | Lippen, auf            | denen       | visto specchiandosi | al espejo; era lo  | cuenta de que era |
| savait, pour s'être        | wirklich nu            | rein ganz   | che il suo colorito | que se decía de    | llamativa, como   |
| regardée dans la           | klein wenig            | Cyclax      | era, come si suol   | colores subidos    | Suelen decir      |
| glace, qu'elle avait       | war. Denn              | sie         | dire, rubizzo       | (WHITE, 1973a,     | (WHITE, 2016,     |
| un teint qualifié de       | betrachtete            | sich ja im  | (WHITE, 1973c, p.   | p. 349).           | p. 460).          |
| très coloré (WHITE,        | Spiegel und wußte, daß |             | 335).               |                    |                   |
| 1973b, p. 341)             | sie von Natura us das  |             |                     |                    |                   |
|                            | war, was man einen     |             |                     |                    |                   |
|                            | Typ von kräftiger      |             |                     |                    |                   |
|                            | Farbe nannte (WHITE,   |             |                     |                    |                   |
|                            | 1978, p. 369).         |             |                     |                    |                   |
| English                    |                        | Fi          | rst Attempt         | Brazilian Portu    | guese – Revised   |

Mrs Poulter was still quite bright of countenance. Her skin had gone to rags of course, at her age, but she had her health, her colour, which she helped out with Cyclax, more discreet than the other brands. More refinedsmelling, more like a kind of ointment for the skin. No one could object to a person doing something for her chaps. Of course she couldn't alter herself. She was born brownish and healthy-looking. If she cracked up like some old enamel pot it was

A Sra. Poulter ainda estava um tanto clara de semblante. A pele dela havia se transformado em trapos claro, na idade dela, mas ela tinha a saúde dela, a cor dela, que ela ajudava com Cyclax, mais discreta do que as outras marcas. De cheiro mais refinado, mais como um tipo de pomada para a pele. Ninguém poderia objetar a uma pessoa fazer algo pelas rachaduras dela. Claro que ela não conseguia se alterar. Ela nasceu amarronzada e de aparência saudável. Se ela se rachasse como

A Sra. Poulter ainda tinha o semblante vivaz. Sua pele havia se transformado em fragalhos, claro, na idade dela, mas ela tinha a saúde, a tez, que ela ajudava com Cyclax, mais discreta do que as outras marcas. De cheiro mais refinado, mais como um tipo de pomada para a pele. Ninguém poderia criticar uma pessoa por cuidar das fissuras. Claro que ela não conseguia se mudar. Ela nasceu amarronzada e de aparência saudável. Se a pele se rachasse como o esmalte de uma chaleira velha, era o que o tempo faz.

| what happens in time (WHITE,       | algum velho vaso de esmalte era o  |                                      |
|------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| 1973, p. 296).                     | que acontece em tempo.             |                                      |
|                                    |                                    |                                      |
| Mrs Poulter would lick her lips    | A Sra. Poulter lambia seus lábios  | A Sra. Poulter lambia seus lábios    |
| thinking it out, with very slight  | pensando, com Cyclax muito         | pensando, com só um toque de         |
| Cyclax. She knew herself by the    | leve. Ela se conhecia pelo espelho | Cyclax. Ela se conhecia pelo espelho |
| glass to be what they call highly- | por ser o que eles chamam de bem   | como sendo o que eles chamam de      |
| coloured (WHITE, 1974, p. 298).    | corada.                            | bem corada.                          |

In Brazilian Portuguese, the adjectives "amarronzada" and "corada" were chosen to describe Mrs Poulter's skin, and this seems to find echo in Patrick White's words about the origin of the character:

A few months later, gossiping with our Mrs Poulter nehind the privet which gave her veranda partial protection, we looked out and saw the Sicilian *signora* advancing up the road. Mrs Poulter waved. The signora waved. [...] Mrs Poulter signed turning to me. 'She's a lovely lady, she's not black at all' (WHITE, 1983, p. 139).

Thus, the question in the translation is not really about the brand being mentioned and how it is kept as it is in the original (being a repetition, following Aixelá's Culture-Specific Items), but in how the adjectives related to the use of the product are rendered in the translated text. Honestly, the options to translate skin colours were a challenge (because Brazilian readers have quite different expectations in relation to skin colour than the average Australian), and mainly related to the brand, which compelled us to send an email to the Australian James Bennett, who keeps a site about cosmetics on the Internet. We asked him about Mrs. Poulter's use of Cyclax to specifically lighten her skin, given the hints in the plot indicating her possible Aborigine descent. Would Cyclax be a cosmetic for lightening the skin during the 1960s and earlier? James replied that cosmetics to lighten the skin were widely used in Australia before the Second World War to counteract sun-tanning, but, specifically connected to our suspicion, White's use of the phrases "her health, her colour" and "brownish and healthy-looking"

fits with the idea (present here in the 1960s and 1970s) that a tanned skin was a healthy-looking skin and something to be encouraged. The skin cancer epidemic here killed that fashion off and heavily tanned individuals are very rare now. This suggests to me that a Cyclax product was being applied to counteract dry, cracked skin rather than as a skin lightener ("No one could object to a person doing something for her chaps") specifically for her lips? Poulter seems concerned about her skin cracking "If she cracked up like some old enamel pot it was what happens

in time." Cyclax had a number of remedies for dry, cracked or reddened skin. [...] I think it is more likely that White is referring to Mrs. Poutler needing an excuse to apply lipstick. "Mrs Poulter would lick her lips thinking it out, with very slight Cyclax." A middle-aged woman using lipstick in the Australian suburbs might be regarded as being a bit salacious and this is perhaps what she was worried about! Lips get very dry and chap easily and lipstick was sometimes applied using the excuse that it was a lip protectant. Also, as the Queen used Cyclax make-up that would help make it  $OK^{163}$ .

Thus, from this information, we proceeded to some changes in our excerpts in Brazilian Portuguese: would "chaps" be better translated as "fissuras" or "rachaduras", or even still, "rugas"? If Mrs Poulter uses Cyclax to counteract the effects of dry skin, then the words closer to that meaning would be "fissuras" and "rachaduras", rather than "rugas" (which was the option used in the most recent Spanish translation). What should not be accepted in these sections would be the deletion of this reference, even though it is a brand.

Other changes presented in our revised text are at the lexical level: "tez" sounds more literary than "cor" (for "colour") in Brazilian Portuguese, and the same can be said about "rags" being translated as "em frangalhos" (and not as "trapos").

In relation to skin colour, the next item refers to a word which is challenging already in its meaning in English, let alone when inserted in Patrick White's universe. We might say it tends to appear more in novels in which the main theme considers Australia already as a country and with a more developed society<sup>164</sup>. The following are examples of the occurrence of this word in other novels. The first one comes from *Happy Valley*, his first novel published in 1939 (Australia was already an independent country and the story takes place in the region of the Snowy Mountains, South of Canberra, during the 1920s):

Hagan rolled his cigarette. You could never say much for a place that was run by Chows. Chows or dagoes. They always took away the profits from anyone else. He spat out over the side of the truck, to emphasise his dislike of Chows (WHITE, 2012, p. 22).

In this context, the idea of foreigners is explicit, as the words appear together with "Chows" referring specifically to the Chinese, which have been a great influence in Australian society. Another occurrence from *Happy Valley*:

And Moriarty went down the street. Were two-and-six the pound. Who said a Chow didn't profiteer, the Chows and the dagoes, and nobody putting a spoke in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> BENNETT, James. Cyclax in a Patrick White novel. Personal message. Message received by *ianalex63@gmail.com*, on 22 Nov. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> We have found three occurrences of the word "dago" in *The Tree of Man* and one in *The Aunt's Story*.

bastards' wheel, or what would she say this little brown mouse of a Chow if you did (WHITE, 2012, p. 250).

The next example comes from *The Aunt's Story*, published in 1948, and the context of the story is about Australia too, but with other countries being described in the plot, as the main character travels to France at some point of the novel:

"Oh, dear, said Marion Neville, if only I could remember if it is a violin or a 'cello the wretched little fellow plays, oh, dear, these dagoes have funny eyes. But she would ask him to her house and get him to autograph a celebrity tablecloth" (WHITE, 2008, p. 119).

Hence, Patrick White in fact corroborates J. M. Coetzee's comment inserted at the beginning of this chapter.

Exhibit 27 - Dago

| French                 | German                  | Italian             | Spanish 1                     | Spanish 2            |
|------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------|
| Maman, qui             | Mutter, die dabeisaß    | Mamma, che stava    | La madre, que                 | La madre, que        |
| reprisait, essaya      | und stopfte, mußte      | rammendando,        | estaba zurciendo,             | estaba zurciendo,    |
| d'aplanir les          | jetzt vermitteln.       | cercò di appianare  | trató de suavizar las         | intentó suavizar las |
| choses.                | »Du möchtest doch       | la situazione.      | cosas.                        | cosas.               |
| "Tu ne voudrais        | nicht einer von den     | "Non vorrai         | – No querrías                 | – No querrás         |
| quand même pas         | Männern warden, die     | diventare uni di    | transformarte en uno          | parecerte a uno de   |
| devenir um de ces      | so <i>bläulich</i> im   | quegli uomini blu," | de esos pobres                | esos hombres         |
| hommes aux joues       | Gesicht aussehen«,      | disse, "che hanno   | hombres – observó –           | morenos que a las    |
| bleutées qui ont un    | sagte sie. »Und die     | la faccia scura lle | que a las cinco de la         | cinco de la tarde ya |
| air ténébreux dès      | um fünf Uhr             | cinque del          | tarde tienen el rosto         | tienen una sombra    |
| cinq heures du soir.   | nachmittags schon       | pomeriggio."        | cubierto por una              | oscura sobre el      |
| – Je n'ai pas le teint | wieder ganz             | "Io non ho quel     | sombra.                       | rostro.              |
| à ça, répondit         | stoppelig sind.«        | colore," dichiarò   | – Yo no soy de esos           | – No tengo ese       |
| Waldo, je ne suis      | »So ein Typ bin ich     | Waldo. "Non sono    | – replicó Waldo –.            | color. No soy        |
| pas un métèque.        | nicht«, sagte Waldo.    | um dago."¹          | No soy um dago <sup>5</sup> . | $dago^7$ .           |
| – Voilà un mot que     | »Schließlich bin ich    | "Questa è uma       | – Esa no es palavra           | – Esa es una         |
| je ne veux pas         | ja kein öliger Itaker.« | parola," intervenne | – dijo el padre – que         | palavra que no       |
| entendre prononcer     | »Derartige Worte«,      | Papà, "che non      | yo quiera oír en mi           | quiero oír jamás en  |
| chez moi, dit Papa"    | sagte Vater, »möchte    | voglio              | casa.                         | mi casa – dijo el    |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.      | ich in meinem Haus      | assolutamente       |                               | papá.                |
| 92)                    | nicht mehr hören«       | sentire in casa     | 5. Extranjero de piel         | 7. Término           |
|                        | (WHITE, 1978, p.        | mia."               | morena (italiano,             | pejorativo de larga  |
|                        | 95).                    |                     | español, português,           | historia en la       |

| spregiativo usato per immigrati di origine mediterranea, specie italiani, spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973a, p. del siglo XVII significaba "español" (se cree que era una deformación de Diego), luego "italiano". En Australia, se lo utiliza para referirse a cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    English   First Attempt   Brazilian Portugues - Revised  |                                       |                |                                  | <sup>1</sup> Termine                            | etc.).   | . (N. del T.)                       | lengua inglesa. En            |
|--|---------------------------------------|----------------|----------------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| origine mediterranea, specie italiani, spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  Tenglish First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'who are all shadow by five o'clock.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'Ten not that colour,' Waldo Shadow in the spagning or the spagning in the mediterranea, specie italiani, specie italiani, specie italiani, spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  Tirst Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised equal estava remendando, to try to smooth things over.  Tirst Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou um latino.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse 'Waldo - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse 'Un apalavra - disse 'Un apala |                                       |                |                                  | spregiativo usato                               | (WH  | IITE, 1973a, p.                     | el siglo XVII                 |
| mediterranea, specie italiani, spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  Tenglish  English  Mamãe, que estava remendando, to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 't'm not that colour,' Waldo o'clock.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not |                                       |                |                                  | per immigrati di                                | 93)  |                                     | significaba                   |
| specie italiani, spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  English  First Attempt  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'who are all shadow by five o'clock.'  'T'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'Table and the spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  'Spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 2016, p. 140)  Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que são todos sombra às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou um latino.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  Spagnoli e Diego), luego  "italiano". En  Australia, se lo  utiliza para  referirse a  cualquier persona  extranjera o nativa  de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).  Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na  Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na  |                                       |                |                                  | origine   |  |                                     | "español" (se cree            |
| spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  English  English  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'then are all shadow by five o'clock.'  'Tm not that colour,' Waldo  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  spagnoli e portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).  Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  Mamäe, que estava remendando, to try to smooth things over.  tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou um latino.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse  'I ever want to hear in my house.'  Diego), luego  "italiano". En  Australia, se lo  utiliza para referirse a  cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).  Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse  'I ever want to hear in my house.'  Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na   |                                       |                |                                  | mediterranea,                                   |  |                                     | que era una                   |
| portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  English  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over. 'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'who are all shadow by five o'clock.' 'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.' 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I'm not a dago.'  Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  portoghesi. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 2016, p. 140)  Brazilian Portuguese - Revised Mamãe, que estava remendando, tutiliza para referirse a cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).  Brazilian Portuguese - Revised Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo. – Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo. – Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na   |                                       |                |                                  | specie italiani,                                |  |                                     | deformación de                |
| T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  Teferirse a cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).  That is not a word,' said Dad, 1973c, p. 87)  T.) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 87)  That is not a word,' said Dad, 1973c, p. 87)  That is not a word, |                                       |                |                                  | spagnoli e                                      |  |                                     | Diego), luego                 |
| 1973c, p. 87)   utiliza para referirse a cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    English   First Attempt   Brazilian Portuguese - Revised     Mother, who was mending, had   Mamãe, que estava remendando, to try to smooth things over.   tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.   'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que são todos sombra às 5 da tarde.   'Who are all shadow by five o'clock.'   utiliza para referirse a cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.   - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.   - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.   - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.   - Não sou cucaracha.   - Esta é uma palavra - disse   - Esta é uma palavra - disse   - Esta é uma palavra - disse   - Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na   - Papai - q   |                                       |                |                                  | portoghesi. (N. d.                              |  |                                     | "italiano". En                |
| referirse a cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.   |                                       |                |                                  | T.) (WHITE,                                     |  |                                     | Australia, se lo              |
| cualquier persona extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    First Attempt   Brazilian Portuguese - Revised   |                                       |                |                                  | 1973c, p. 87)                                   |  |                                     | utiliza para                  |
| extranjera o nativa de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    English   First Attempt   Brazilian Portuguese - Revised   |                                       |                |                                  |   |  |                                     | referirse a                   |
| de piel oscura. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).  First Attempt  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – 'who are all shadow by five o'clock.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  'English  First Attempt  Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse  Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  |                                       |                |                                  |   |  |                                     | cualquier persona             |
| de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 140).    First Attempt   Brazilian Portuguese - Revised   |                                       |                |                                  |   |  |                                     | extranjera o nativa           |
| English First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over. tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  'You not that colour,' Waldo – Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  'T'm not that colour,' Waldo – Não sou um latino.  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'Esta é uma palavra – disse Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na Papai – que nun |                                       |                |                                  |   |  |                                     | de piel oscura. [N.           |
| English  Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, o'clock.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'I'm wou wond as mending, had Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse  Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  - Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  - Revised  Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse  Waldo. – Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse  - Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na   |                                       |                |                                  |   |  |                                     | de la T.] (WHITE,             |
| Mother, who was mending, had to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, o'clock.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  Mamãe, que estava remendando, tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse - Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis - disse ela - que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse - Esta é uma palavra - disse - Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na  |                                       |                |                                  |   |  |                                     | 2016, p. 140).                |
| to try to smooth things over.  'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'who are all shadow by five o'clock.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Não sou um latino.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  tinha de tentar a acalmar as coisas.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na   | English                               |                |                                  | First Attempt                                   |  | Brazilian Po                        | rtuguese - Revised            |
| 'You wouldn't want to turn into one of those blue men,' she said, 'who are all shadow by five o'clock.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'Tever want to hear in my house.'  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que são todos sombra às 5 da tarde.  - Você não quereria virar um daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  - Não sou dessa cor – disse Waldo. – Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra – disse Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na   | Mother, who was me                    | nding, had     | Mamãe,                           | que estava remenda                              | ando,  | Mamãe, que                          | estava remendando,            |
| one of those blue men,' she said, daqueles homens azuis – disse ela – que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da tarde.  'Ye not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'That is not a word,' said Dad,  'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad,   | to try to smooth thing                | gs over.       | tinha de t                       | entar a acalmar as cois                         | acalmar as coisas. tinha de tentar a acalmar a |                                     | acalmar as coisas.            |
| 'who are all shadow by five que são todos sombra às 5 da tarde.  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I'm want to hear in my house.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na   | 'You wouldn't wan                     | t to turn into | – V                              | ocê não quereria vira                           | r um   – Você não quer                         |                                     | ío quereria virar um          |
| o'clock.'  'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I ever want to hear in my house.'  'I arde.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na   | one of those blue men                 | n,' she said,  | daqueles                         | homens <i>azuis</i> – disse ela – daqueles home |  | daqueles homer                      | ns <i>azuis</i> – disse ela – |
| 'I'm not that colour,' Waldo said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I'ever want to hear in my house.'  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo.  - Não sou dessa cor - disse Waldo Não sou cucaracha.  - Esta é uma palavra - disse  - Esta é uma palavra - disse  - Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na  - Papai - que nunca quero ouvir na   | 'who are all shadow by five que são   |                | que são t                        | todos sombra às 5 da tarde.                     |  | que têm que refazer a barba às 5 da |                               |
| said. 'I'm not a dago.'  'That is not a word,' said Dad, 'I'ever want to hear in my house.'  —Não sou um latino.  —Esta é uma palavra — disse Papai — que nunca quero ouvir na  Papai — que nunca quero ouvir na   | o'clock.'                             |                |                                  |   | tarde.   |                                     |                               |
| "That is not a word," said Dad,  - Esta é uma palavra – disse  - Esta é uma palavra – disse  - Esta é uma palavra – disse  Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  | 'I'm not that colour,' Waldo - Não so |                | u dessa cor – disse W            | aldo.   | – Não sou dessa cor – disse                    |                                     |                               |
| 'I ever want to hear in my house.' Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na   | said. 'I'm not a dago.' -Não sou      |                | ı um latino.                     |   | Waldo. – Não se                                | ou cucaracha.                       |                               |
|  | 'That is not a word,' said Dad, – E   |                | Esta é uma palavra – disse       |   | – Esta é ι                                     | ıma palavra – disse                 |                               |
| (WHITE, 1966, p. 80). minha casa. minha casa.  | 'I ever want to hear in my house.'    |                | Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na |   | ir na  | a Papai – que nunca quero ouvir na  |                               |
|  | (WHITE, 1966, p. 80                   | ).             | minha ca                         | sa.   |  | minha casa.                         |                               |
|  | 1                                     |                |                                  |   |  | I                                   |                               |

Even-Zohar's proposes in his first two laws of translatability that 1) the closer the textual traditions involved, the higher the translatability; and 2) translatability increases with the degree of contact between two traditions. "High", in this context, would refer to the existence, in the receiving pole, of solutions accepted by the readers in the target language. To translate the word "dago", precisely referring to race, represents a challenge in the translation into Brazilian Portuguese, perhaps exemplifying that our traditions are not parallel (although Australia and Brazil share parallels in the South Hemisphere). Admittedly, the contact between the two still needs to be enhanced. How would it be possible to keep the offensive tone while rendering the accurate meaning? At the time, Australia had many "dagoes" as part

of its population, trying to help develop the country, and this issue certainly demands more research and careful thinking to explain our choice. For example, in the case of Italian migrants, the ones who came to Brazil were from the North, while the ones who went to Australia came from the South, and they came to occupy different roles in their respective societies. Thus, the social meanings of "Italian" or synonimous terms are very different in the two countries.

The meaning of "dago" in English, as provided by the Oxford Dictionary, is: "(informal, offensive) A Spanish, Portuguese, or Italian-speaking person<sup>165</sup>". In another definition, from The Free Dictionary: "(Offensive Slang) Used as a disparaging term for a person of Italian, Spanish, or Portuguese descent"<sup>166</sup>. As a matter of curiosity, the origin of the name, according to the Oxford Dictionary, is from the mid 19<sup>th</sup> century, from the Spanish name Diego, which would be translated as James.

In reading the translations, the translators from the nationalities referred in the definition decided to keep the word in the original and then added a footnote to explain the offensive meaning to the reader, with the only exception being the French and German translations (nationalities, in this case, exempted from the not so classy definition).

Because many Brazilians descend from Portuguese (by default), Italian and even Spanish cultures, it is hard to find options for the translation here. Moreover, our linguistic system does not present us with adequate options to keep the derogatory load in the translated text. Admittedly, there should be forms of self-offense in Italian, Spanish and Portuguese to achieve that effect.

The form "métèque" used in the French translation has the following meaning in French:

Dans une cité grecque, étranger à cette cité, mais qui y était domicilié. (Les métèques n'avaient pas de droits politiques, pas de biens fonciers, et payaient un impôt spécial. Mais ils participaient à la vie culturelle de la cité et à sa défense. Athènes leur dut en partie as prospérité.). <sup>167</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> DAGO. Oxford definition. Available at: http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/dago. Accessed on: 1 Aug. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> DAGO. The Free Dictionary definition. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/dago. Accessed on: 1 Aug. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> DICTIONNAIRE DE FRANÇAIS LARROUSE. Mètèque. Available at: http://www.larousse.fr/dictionnaires/francais/m%C3%A9t%C3%A8que/50945. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

In English, the immediate option of translation is "metic": "(Historical Terms) (in ancient Greece) an alien having some rights of citizenship in the city in which he lives 168". In Brazilian Portuguese, "meteco", according to the dictionary Aulete Digital, refers to: "1. Estrangeiro, forasteiro autorizado a residir na antiga Atenas, sem gozar, entretanto, de todos os direitos dos cidadãos atenienses. 2. Estrangeiro com residência fixa em um país; imigrante" <sup>169</sup>. Plainly, there is the inference of someone who is not from the place, who immigrates, who does not have the same rights as a native citizen. However, in the Australian context described in the plot, and given the word is spoken by Waldo, the character who is determined to keep his British (hence superior) values and language, to use the form "immigrant" ("imigrante" in Brazilian Portuguese) sounds too naïve and seems to avoid the social implications of the semantic load of the original. To use "meteco", following what the French translation presents, would denote the translator's attempt to escape from the difficulties as well as the social and semantic conflict imposed by the word. Essentially, the sociogeographical implications of the word "meteco" are confined to the Antique World, with Greece and Athens being the reference. The Solid Mandala also deals with topics about the Greek, such as the reference to Tiresias by Arthur and his desire to write and perform in a Greek tragedy, as well as the Greek pediment of the house built on Terminus Road, which demanded a lot of explanation and guidance from the father, George Brown. Certainly, to use this reference might follow the myriad of references, but then the implications coming from the diversity of Australian society which was developing at the time thanks to the immigration flow from many countries (mainly Italy and Ireland) will be lost, or at least will not be revealed to be discussed and thought about by the reader.

The option chosen, and which was suggested by the professor and translator Patrícia Ramos Reuillard during the qualifying exam in 2015, is "cucaracha" (literally, in English, cockroach), which in a way carries the derogatory meaning of the word "dago": the dark colour of the insect and its symbology of repugnance and filthiness. The idea of the footnote would not be discarded at all, perhaps to explain how we arrived at that option in Brazilian Portuguese. However, we do accept the fact that this form might be misleading, since it would direct the contemporary Brazilian reader to the reality of the Latinos in the United States, which is not the same thing. Thus, we feel inclined to leave the word unstranslated and then footnote it.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> METIC. The Free Dictionary definition. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/metic. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> METECO. Definition in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/meteco. Accessed on: 1 Aug. 2015.

The next item in our translation is the word "Pom", whose meaning can be tricky even when embedded in the English-speaking community, such as in the following context. On 6 August 2015, the traditional test cricket series (composed of 5 tests), called The Ashes, was played between England and Australia. The repercussion of the disaster in this 2015 edition in the English-speaking community, as well as internationally, could be seen on the programme World Sport on CNN International: even the anchor had to provide an explanation to the form "Pomicide<sup>170</sup>", which was stamping the front page of the SportsDay supplement of *The Sydney Morning Herald*<sup>171</sup> of that day and which was used to visually describe the dimension of the event. Thus, a question came up: how could we translate (and hence keep the pun) contained in the form "Pomicide" in Brazilian Portuguese? In fact, the other part of the word is available in Portuguese ("homicídio" translates as "homicide", so no problems in that respect). But what should we do with "Pom"? Keep it like that, and use "pomicídio"? This would not make much sense and would demand an explanation, such as what happened to the CNN anchor, who had to say that "Pom is how Australians refer to the English".

Back to the plot of *The Solid Mandala*, colonial relations are a blatant theme. And, of course, the translator is in contact with three social, historical and cultural systems: Britain's, Australia's and Brazil's. How should the translation approach these issues? Sometimes these elements are quite subtle, but they stand out in certain expressions, as in the following:

Exhibit 28 – Pom

| French                 | German             | Italian             | Spanish 1             | Spanish 2            |
|------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| A cette heure, mais    | Sie waren geradezu | A quell'ora, ma     | A esa hora, pero      | A esa hora, y solo   |
| uniquement à cette     | erschreckend braun | solo allora,        | sólo entonces,        | a esa hora, parecia  |
| heure-là, il semblait  | im Licht des       | sembrava che        | parecia poder ver a   | que él veía a través |
| vous transpercer du    | taufeuchten        | potesse vedere      | través de cualquiera. | de uno. Según la     |
| regard. Ses yeux,      | Morgens und unter  | attraverso          | La madre decía que    | madre, los ojos de   |
| disait Maman, étaient  | der schwarzen      | chiunque. I suoi    | sus ojos eran         | George Brown         |
| noirs; mais Waldo      | Melone, die Vater  | occhi, Mamma        | negros, pero Waldo    | eran negros, pero    |
| savait qu'elle         | immer noch trug    | diceva, erano neri, | sabía que eso era     | Waldo sabía que      |
| l'imaginait            | und die ihn als    | anche se Waldo      | pura imaginación;     | esa idea era         |
| seulement; ils étaient | Einwanderer aus    | sapeva che          | eran marrones. Y se   | producto de la       |
| bruns. Ils étaient     | England verriet    | semplicemente se    | veían terriblemente   | imaginación: eran    |

<sup>170 &#</sup>x27;IT'S POMICIDE': Aussie papers punish cricket team for humiliating Ashes collapse (+ highlights). **TVNZ website**. Available at: https://www.tvnz.co.nz/one-news/sport/cricket/-it-s-pomicide-aussie-papers-punish-cricket-team-for-humiliating-ashes-collapse-highlights-q04517. Accessed on: 15 Aug. 2015.

171 The image of the cover can be seen on The Sydney Morning Herald's Twitter account available at: https://twitter.com/smh/status/629415152236937216/photo/1. Accessed on: 15 Aug. 2015.

| terriblement bruns,                      | (WHITE                  | , 1978, p.              | l'imaginava; in         | mar              | rones mientras      | castaños. Tenían     |
|--|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| tandis que Papa                          | 49).                    |                         | realtà erano            | el p             | adre temblaba       | un intenso color     |
| frissonnait dans la                      |                         |                         | marroni. Erano          | con              | el rocío de la      | castaño cuando el    |
| rosée du matin sous                      |                         |                         | terribilmente           | mañ              | íana, bajo el       | padre esperaba el    |
| le chapeau melon                         |                         |                         | marroni, quando         | som              | brero hongo que     | tren tiritando bajo  |
| qu'il continuait à                       |                         |                         | rabbrividiva            | segi             | ıía usando          | el bombín que        |
| porter et qui trahissait                 |                         |                         | nell'alba rugginosa     | sien             | npre y que          | seguía usando y      |
| sa qualité d'Anglais                     |                         |                         | sotto la bombetta       | reve             | elaba               | que revelaba que     |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.                        |                         |                         | che portava             | indi             | scretamente su      | era un inglés de     |
| 49-50).                                  |                         |                         | sempre, e che           | sem              | ejanza con un       | porquería            |
|  |                         |                         | rivelava la sua         | Pon              | nerania             | (WHITE, 2016, p.     |
|  |                         |                         | origine inglese         | (WI              | HITE, 1973a, p.     | 84).                 |
|  |                         |                         | (WHITE, 1973c, p.       | 48).             |                     |                      |
|  |                         |                         | 44)                     |                  |                     |                      |
| English                                  |                         |                         | First Attempt           |                  | Brazilian Por       | tuguese – Revised    |
| At that hour, but only                   | then, he                | Naquela ho              | ora, mas somente então, | ele              | Naquela hora, m     | nas somente então, o |
| seemed to see through                    | anyone.                 | parecia vei             | através de qualquer     | um.              | olhar dele          | parecia atravessar   |
| His eyes, Mother sa                      | id, were                | Seus olhos              | s, a Mamãe dizia, e     | ram              | qualquer um. Se     | eus olhos, a Mamãe   |
| black, though Waldo k                    | new that                | pretos, em              | bora Waldo soubesse     | que              | dizia, eram pre     | tos, embora Waldo    |
| that was imagination; t                  | hey were                | aquilo era              | imaginação; eles e      | ram              | soubesse que aq     | uilo era imaginação; |
| brown. They were terribly castanhos.     |                         | Eles eram terrivelme    | ente                    | eles eram cas    | tanhos. Eles eram   |                      |
| brown as Dad stood shuddering castanhos  |                         | quando o Papai fic      | ava                     | terrivelmente ca | astanhos quando o   |                      |
| in the dewy morning under the tremendo   |                         | na manhã orvalh         | ada                     | Papai ficava tr  | remendo na manhã    |                      |
| billycock hat he cont                    | he continued to debaixo |                         | o chapéu-coco que       | ele              | orvalhada debai     | xo do chapéu-coco    |
| wear, and which gave him away continuava |                         | a usar, e que o denunci | iava                    | que ele continua | ava a usar, e que o |                      |
| as a Pom (WHITE, 196                     | 66, p. 41-              | como um n               | naldito Inglês.         |                  | denunciava como     | o um Inglesinho.     |
| 42).                                     |                         |                         |                         |                  |                     |                      |

As already mentioned, "Pom" represents a challenge in translation, as it seems quite impossible to maintain the same semantic effect in Brazilian Portuguese. The meaning of the word in English, coming from the Australian National Museum website (in the part about Australian English) is reproduced here:

A British person. Also pommy. First recorded in 1912, the term was originally applied to an immigrant from Britain, and was formed by rhyming slang. A British immigrant was called a pommygrant, from the red fruit pomegranate, perhaps referring to the complexion of the new arrivals, which was then abbreviated

to pommy and pom. Although some argue otherwise, it is not an acronym of prisoner of mother England <sup>172</sup>.

Another definition, now found in the Cambridge Advanced Learner's dictionary, is this: "AUSTRALIAN INFORMAL DISAPPROVING: an English person<sup>173</sup>". The Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary puts "pommy" as the entry and then the abbreviated form "pom" as a variant, including the information that the word is used in New Zealand too: "(AustralE, NZE, informal, often disapproving): a British person<sup>174</sup>" (thus opening the definition to a person coming from any of the countries of the British Isles). Regarding the possible (and denied by the Australian source just cited) reference to "Prisoner of Mother England", a news item from the BBC website reveals that:

An enduring myth is that the word pom (as in whinging pom and other more colourful expressions) is an acronym from either "Prisoner of His Majesty" or even "Permit of Migration", for the original convicts or settlers who sailed from Britain to Australia. [...] There is no historical documentation to support these myths (rather like the disproved theory that posh derives from tickets for the upmarket cabins on the old P&O liners - port out, starboard home). Instead the etymology is apparently more circuitous. We start with the word immigrant, well-established by the mid 19th Century as a settler. In a joking way people would play with immigrant from around 1850 or so, turning it into a proper name (Jimmy Grant), to give the strange immigrants a pseudo-personality. Equally playfully, a Jimmy Grant morphed around 1912 into pomegranate and immediately into pom, which it has stuck as till today<sup>175</sup>.

All these jokes are rich in English, but, when it comes to translation, a series of ideas and repercussions need to be taken into account. For example, it would be plausible to represent an imperial relationship between Portugal and Brazil in the excerpt, but considering the major losses involved. However, in this case, when there are countries belonging to the British Empire, it is imperative to think of possible alternatives which would render the effect in the translated text. For instance, the Spanish translation published in 1973 simply did not account for that, failing to grasp the meaning of "Pom", inferring that the word made reference to someone who came from the Baltic region of Pomerania. Therefore, the whole social context disappears, even putting at risk the consistency of the plot. In Brazilian Portuguese, the most plausible solution would be "Inglês" (Englishman), with a capital letter as a way to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> NATIONAL MUSEUM OF AUSTRALIA. Australian English (Pom). Available at: http://www.nma.gov.au/exhibitions/nation/australian english. Accessed on: 5 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> WALTER, Elizabeth. **Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary.** 3.ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, p.1097.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> HORNBY, Albert Sydney. **Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary**. 6.ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. p. 978.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> BBC Magazine. **The Oxford English Dictionary and its chief word detective**. Available at: http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-22378819. Accessed on: 5 May 2016.

differentiate the word, as in the original. However, the intrinsic pejorative meaning, as well as the whole social contextualization, is not kept with that ordinary option, "Inglês", because we lack, as a country, the colonial relations responsible for the creation of such a word in our linguistic system. "Gringo" would be an alternative, but then the whole idea connected to the British Empire vanishes, and that is not the objective of the translation. Probably the addition of a pejorative marker together with the word "Inglês" might help keep the semantic load, as in "maldito inglês", which was the strategy adopted by the new Spanish translation, which managed to identify the mistranslation of the previous edition and then render a plausible (and strong) option ("inglés de porquería", literally "inglês de merda"). In our revised excerpt, we opted to maintain the capital letter of the name and, instead of using an adjective, we chose the diminutive of the word in Brazilian Portuguese, which, in this context, helps convey the pejorative meaning.

Next, some examples are presented of problems/challenges that we have encountered in the process of translation related to religious issues. It is evident that, in this novel, there are many important religious references which come up in very subtle ways (either via linguistic constructions or via gestures clearly described in the plot). Therefore, some of them deserve our attention in this work, as they rely on the translator's reading and choices to be manifest in the narrative, such as the scene in which Arthur is at Sydney's Municipal Library reading and reflecting upon Dostoyevsky's *The Brothers Karamazov*:

Exhibit 29 – Lord's Prayer

| French                | German               | Italian             | Spanish 1          | Spanish 2                 |
|-----------------------|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|
| "Tu as peur, dit      | «Angst», sagte       | "Perché avevamo     | – Temerosos –      | -Temerosos - decía        |
| Arthur, qui sentit    | Arthur und spürte,   | paura," continuò    | decía Arthur, y    | Arthur, que               |
| alors une sorte de    | wie auch in ihm      | Arthur, ed ora      | ahora comenzaba    | comenzaba a sentir        |
| terreur se faire jour | selbst eine Art von  | cominciò a sentir   | a sentir que una   | que lo ahogaba algo       |
| en lui. Comme         | panischer Furcht     | crescere in lui uma | especie de terror  | parecido al terror –.     |
| notre père. Je parle  | aufstieg. «Angst –   | sorta di terrore.   | se alzaba en él –. | Como nuestro padre,       |
| de Papa. Pas de       | wie unser Vater. Ich | "Come nostro        | Como nuestro       | papá quiero decir. No     |
| celui à qui on        | meine – Dad. Nicht   | padre. Non quello   | padre. Me refiero  | el padre a quien le       |
| adresse des prières.  | den Vater, zu dem    | che la gente prega. | a papá. No a ése   | rezan. Papá cuando        |
| Mais de Papa, qui a   | sie alle beten. Ich  | Intendo Papà. Papà  | al que le reza la  | tiro al fuego el libro de |
| livré Dostoïevski     | meine Dad, der       | che dà fuoco a      | gente, sino a papà | Dostoievsky (WHITE,       |
| aux flammes"          | Dostojewski ins      | Dostoevskij"        | echando al fuego   | 2016, p. 438).            |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.     | Feuer werfen         | (WHITE, 1973c, p.   | a Dostoiesvki      |                           |
| 322).                 | mußte» (WHITE,       | 318).               | (WHITE, 1973a,     |                           |

| 1978, p. 350                      | ). p. 33                          | 0).                                 |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| English                           | First Attempt                     | Brazilian Portuguese - Revised      |
| Afraid, Arthur was saying, and    | Medo, Arthur estava dizendo, e    | Medo, Arthur estava dizendo, e      |
| now He did begin to feel a kind   | agora ele começou a sentir uma    | agora ele começou a sentir uma      |
| of terror rising in him. Like our | espécie de terror crescendo nele. | espécie de terror crescendo nele.   |
| father. I mean Dad. Not the one   | Como nosso pai. Quero dizer,      | Como pai nosso. Quero dizer, Papai. |
| they pray to. But Dad putting     | Papai. Não aquele para quem eles  | Não aquele para quem eles rezam.    |
| Dostoyevsky on the fire           | rezam. Mas Papai colocando        | Mas Papai colocando Dostoyevsky     |
| (WHITE, 1969, p. 284).            | Dostoyevsky no fogo.              | no fogo.                            |

The religious reference presented in the scene is not easily detected by a naïve translator. In addition to the variation of the words (the register) in a formal or informal tone, in English, "our father" is simply a normal way for Arthur to refer to his and Waldo's human father, while the same words "Our Father" (with capital letters) form the beginning of The Lord's Prayer. In Brazilian Portuguese, "nosso pai" would be the normal human option to translate "our father", whereas the beginning of the prayer contains a syntactic inversion, that is, the noun appears before the pronoun: "Pai Nosso". In order to maintain the connection between Arthur's words and those of the prayer, the translation would have to employ this syntactic inversion "Como o pai nosso. Quero dizer, Papai", moving Arthur's speech away from everyday use, where he corrects a possible misunderstanding, and actually towards the religious discourse which is precisely not what he intended. The inversion, albeit apparently weird, would at least cause some kind of recognition in the reader in Brazilian Portuguese, who would identify that something was going on in religious terms. The alternative – to render Arthur's sentence "I mean Dad" meaningless by removing the ambiguity and failing to account for the religious discourse that is pervasive in the novel, and quite crucial to understanding this specific passage. The same thing would apply to the Italian version, given the beginning of the prayer reads: "Padre Nostro che sei nei Cieli".

Even though the option sounds bizarre, this possibility of translation (and the challenge of thinking about its feasibility to produce a readable target text) reminds us of a compelling example, found in Andrew Hurley's paper on his experience of dealing with Jorge Luis Borges's translations:

Borges's examples go beyond prepositions, of course, to the tics or "frases hechas" of the language: when Agustín Moreno says "¿Qué hacen todo el santo día?" Borges notes that the holiness of the day comes from the language, not the poet. It would be absurd in English to say anything but "the livelong day" or "all day long" — those are two of the standard idioms. To try to write "holy day" or some

other such literally-translated phrase is to import an æsthetic effect or potential thematic issue into the English where none exists in the Spanish. Of course, sometimes those buried or invisible metaphors of the language do need to be taken into account in a translation, one does need to analyze the constellations of metaphors and motifs that are at work in a text to see whether the *frases hechas* have been (consciously or unconsciously) folded into the mix by the author, but as often as not, for most writers, they are simply part of the machinery that the language has crafted for expressing itself in (HURLEY, 1999, p. 293).

Another crucial differentiation in the novel is related to the use of "Dad" and "Father". The options in Portuguese are "Papai" and "Pai". However, the use of these phrases by the characters should be noted:

Exhibit 30 - Father and Dad

| French               | German            | Italian                     | Spanish 1              | Spanish 2                 |
|----------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|
| Waldo se le rappela  | Mit einemmal fiel | Waldo se n'era              | Waldo lo recordaba     | Waldo recordó             |
| alors; pour          | es Waldo wierder  | dimenticato,                | ahora, y a pesar de    | entonces el episodio y,   |
| désagréable que fût  | ein. Und so       | benché il ricordo           | que el recuerdo era    | aunque era algo           |
| ce souvenir, pour    | unangenehm die    | fosse spiacevole;           | desagradable, a pesar  | desagradable y él         |
| autant qu'il         | Erinnerung auch   | e per quanto                | de que él respetaba    | respetaba por demás       |
| respectât les livres | war, so sehr er   | rispettasse i libri,        | tanto los libros y de  | los libros y              |
| et méprisât leur     | auch Bücher       | e avesse                    | que tantas veces       | despreciaba en muchos     |
| père, si pitoyable   | respektierte, und | disprezzato il loro         | hubiera despreciado a  | aspectos a su             |
| par bien des côtés,  | so stark auch     | padre, per molti            | su padre, en muchos    | lamentable padre, sus     |
| ses sympathies       | seine Ablehnung   | versi miserando,            | sentidos digno de      | simpatias estaban com     |
| allaient à Papa au   | gegenüber ihrem   | le loro simpatie            | lástima, su simpatia   | él en lo que se referia a |
| sujet des Frères     | manchmal          | andavano                    | se inclinaba en cierto | Los hermanos              |
| Karamazov. George    | geradezu          | piuttosto a Papà            | modo hacia él en       | Karamazov. Que            |
| Brown avait saisi le | bemitleidenswert  | per quanto si               | cuanto a <i>Los</i>    | George Brown había        |
| livre avec des       | en Vater gewesen  | riferiva ai <i>Fratelli</i> | hermanos               | llevado a la hoguera      |
| pincettes pour le    | war – im Fall der | Karamazov. Che              | Karamazov. Al que      | sosteniéndolo con un      |
| livrer au bûcher et  | Brüder            | George aveva                | George Brown había     | par de pinzas. Waldo      |
| en faire un feu de   | Karamasowstand    | deposto sul rogo            | puesto en la hoguera   | se estremeció, como si    |
| joie. Waldo frémit   | er irgendwie auf  | con un paio di              | con un par de tenazas  | una porción               |
| comme si quelque     | seiner Seite. Mit | molle. Waldo si             | de chimenea. Waldo     | innombrable de su         |
| morceau inavouable   | der Kohlenzange   | sorprese a                  | se descubrió           | propia carne ardiera,     |
| de sa propre chair   | hatte George      | tremare, come se            | temblando como si      | hedionda, sobre las       |
| grillait sur les     | Brown das Buch    | qualche                     | cierto inmencionable   | ascuas (WHITE, 2016,      |
| charbons ardents     | in den Garten     | innominabile                | bulto de su propía     | p. 314).                  |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.    | getragen und in   | pezzo della sua             | carne estuviera        |                           |
| 225).                | ein eigens        | carne fosse                 | retorciéndose entre    |                           |
|                      | entzündetes Feuer | rimasto a fumare            | las brasas (WHITE,     |                           |

|  | 6 77  |   | 1050 0  | 20)   |
|--|---|---|---|---|
|  | geworfen. Ein   | sui tizzoni   | 1973a, p. 2   | 32).  |
|  | Schauer überlief  | (WHITE, 1973c,  |   |   |
|  | Waldo, als ob es  | p. 223).  |   |   |
|  | irgendein nicht   |   |   |   |
|  | näher zu  |   |   |   |
|  | definierender Te  | il  |   |   |
|  | seines eigenen  |   |   |   |
|  | Fleisches   |   |   |   |
|  | gewesen sei, der  |   |   |   |
|  | damals brenzlig   |   |   |   |
|  | riechend auf der  | ı   |   |   |
|  | glühenden   |   |   |   |
|  | Kohlen gelegen  |   |   |   |
|  | hatte (WHITE,   |   |   |   |
|  | 1978, p. 244).  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |   |
| English  | n   | First Attem   | ot .  | Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  |
| English Waldo did now, unp   |   | First Attemp  |   | Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  Waldo lembrava agora, embora a  |
|  | leasant though  | Waldo lembrava agora  |   |   |
| Waldo did now, unp   | leasant though and much as he   | Waldo lembrava agora  | gradável, e   | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a  |
| Waldo did now, unp   | leasant though ad much as he is had despised  | Waldo lembrava agora  | gradável, e   | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a<br>memória fosse desagradável, e   |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, an<br>respected books, and   | leasant though and much as he had despised pitiful father,  | Waldo lembrava agora<br>memória fosse desa<br>mesmo que ele respeitas   | gradável, e<br>sse os livros,<br>pai, patético  | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a<br>memória fosse desagradável, e<br>mesmo que ele respeitasse os   |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, an<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways   | leasant though and much as he had despised pitiful father, somehow with   | Waldo lembrava agora<br>memória fosse desag<br>mesmo que ele respeitas<br>e tinha desprezado seu  | gradável, e<br>ese os livros,<br>pai, patético<br>na afinidade  | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai,   |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, an<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were  | leasant though and much as he is had despised pitiful father, somehow with a rs Karamazov.  | Waldo lembrava agora<br>memória fosse desag<br>mesmo que ele respeitas<br>e tinha desprezado seu<br>em tantos sentidos, su<br>ficava de certa maneira   | gradável, e<br>ese os livros,<br>pai, patético<br>na afinidade  | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua  |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, and<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were<br>Dad over <i>The Brothe</i>   | leasant though and much as he is had despised pitiful father, somehow with a rs Karamazov.  | Waldo lembrava agora<br>memória fosse desag<br>mesmo que ele respeitas<br>e tinha desprezado seu<br>em tantos sentidos, su<br>ficava de certa maneira   | gradável, e sse os livros, pai, patético a afinidade com o Papai  | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua afinidade ficava de certa maneira  |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, an<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were<br>Dad over <i>The Brothe</i><br>Which George Brow   | leasant though and much as he had despised pitiful father, somehow with a rs Karamazov. It was had carried a pair of tongs.   | Waldo lembrava agora memória fosse desagmesmo que ele respeitas e tinha desprezado seu em tantos sentidos, su ficava de certa maneira em relação a C  | gradável, e sse os livros, pai, patético la afinidade com o Papai os Irmãos orge Brown  | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua afinidade ficava de certa maneira com o Papai em relação a <i>Os</i>   |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, and<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were<br>Dad over <i>The Brothe</i><br>Which George Brow<br>to the bonfire with a   | leasant though and much as he is had despised pitiful father, somehow with a rs Karamazov. It was had carried a pair of tongs. If shivering, as                             | Waldo lembrava agora memória fosse desagmesmo que ele respeitas e tinha desprezado seu em tantos sentidos, suficava de certa maneira em relação a Caramazov. Que Geo  | gradável, e sse os livros, pai, patético na afinidade com o Papai os Irmãos orge Brown com uma                                      | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua afinidade ficava de certa maneira com o Papai em relação a <i>Os Irmãos Karamazov</i> . Que George   |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, and<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were<br>Dad over <i>The Brothe</i><br>Which George Brow<br>to the bonfire with a<br>Waldo found himsel   | leasant though and much as he is had despised pitiful father, somehow with a rs Karamazov. It will had carried a pair of tongs. If shivering, as ionable gobbet             | Waldo lembrava agora memória fosse desaguesmo que ele respeitas e tinha desprezado seu em tantos sentidos, su ficava de certa maneira em relação a Caramazov. Que Geonavia levado ao fogo pinça. Waldo se acho  | gradável, e sse os livros, pai, patético na afinidade com o Papai os Irmãos orge Brown com uma                                      | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua afinidade ficava de certa maneira com o Papai em relação a <i>Os Irmãos Karamazov</i> . Que George Brown havia levado ao fogo  |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, and<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were<br>Dad over <i>The Brothe</i><br>Which George Brow<br>to the bonfire with a<br>Waldo found himsel<br>though some unment                         | leasant though and much as he had despised pitiful father, somehow with a rs Karamazov. It was had carried a pair of tongs. If shivering, as ionable gobbet lain reeking on | Waldo lembrava agora memória fosse desagnesmo que ele respeitas e tinha desprezado seu em tantos sentidos, su ficava de certa maneira em relação a <i>C. Karamazov</i> . Que Geonavia levado ao fogo pinça. Waldo se acho   | gradável, e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e   | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua afinidade ficava de certa maneira com o Papai em relação a <i>Os Irmãos Karamazov</i> . Que George Brown havia levado ao fogo usando uma pinça. Waldo viu que                                |
| Waldo did now, unp<br>the memory was, and<br>respected books, and<br>their in many ways<br>his sympathies were<br>Dad over <i>The Brothe</i><br>Which George Brow<br>to the bonfire with a<br>Waldo found himsel<br>though some unment<br>of his own flesh had | leasant though and much as he had despised pitiful father, somehow with a had carried a pair of tongs. If shivering, as ionable gobbet lain reeking on 1969, p. 199).       | Waldo lembrava agora memória fosse desagmesmo que ele respeitas e tinha desprezado seu em tantos sentidos, su ficava de certa maneira em relação a Caramazov. Que Geonavia levado ao fogo pinça. Waldo se acho como se algum proportion desagrance de como se algum proportion de como se | gradável, e sse os livros, pai, patético la afinidade com o Papai los Irmãos orge Brown com uma la tremendo, pouco não rópria carne | Waldo lembrava agora, embora a memória fosse desagradável, e mesmo que ele respeitasse os livros, e tinha desprezado seu pai, patético em tantos sentidos, sua afinidade ficava de certa maneira com o Papai em relação a <i>Os Irmãos Karamazov</i> . Que George Brown havia levado ao fogo usando uma pinça. Waldo viu que estava tremendo, como se algum |

The first change made in this passage refers to a possible ambiguity when translating "with a pair of tongs" as simply "com uma pinça" in Brazilian Portuguese, as the reader might think that the pair of tongs was also carried to the bonfire, when in fact it was the instrument used to pick the book. The other change concerns the verb "found himself shivering": instead of "se achou tremendo", there was a preference for "viu que estava tremendo", sounding far more natural. For "gobbet", initially we had opted for "algum pouco", but "naco" is a more precise and literary word in this context, and which only came up while reading for revision.

Another important change again with the verb form "had lain reeking": in our first attempt, we dare to say that the literal translation did not work aesthetically, as it represented an awkward construction, with the three verbs slowing the reading. Our final version transformed the verbs "had lain" into a single one in Brazilian Portuguese: estivesse, thus allowing the maintenance of the gerund and improving the flow of the text. As for the treatment forms, we followed a rule established for this novel: Dad as "Papai" and father as "pai" (respecting the capital letters for emphasis).

# 4.7 THE SWEDISH TRANSLATOR'S DOUBTS: (HOW) WERE THEY ADDRESSED?

We start this subchapter with a witty fragment from Iris Murdoch's writing debut, *Under the Net* (1954), in which the main character happens to be a translator (French/English), Jake Donaghue:

Hugo knew nothing about translating, but when he learnt that I was a translator he wanted to know what it was like. I remember him going on and on, asking questions such as: What do you mean when you say that you think the meaning in French? How do you know you're thinking it in French? If you see a picture in your mind how do you know it's a French picture? Or is it that you say the French word to yourself? What do you see when you see that the translation is exactly right? Are you imagining what someone else would think, seeing it for the first time? Or is it a kind of feeling? What kind of feeling? Can't you describe it more closely? And so on and on, with a fantastic patience. This sometimes became very exasperating. What seemed to me to be the simplest utterance soon became, under the repeated pressure of Hugo's "You mean", a dark and confused saying of which I no longer myself knew the meaning. The activity of translating, which had seemed the plainest thing in the world, turned out to be an act so complex and extraordinary that it was puzzling to see how any human being could perform it. Yet at the same time Hugo's enquiries rarely failed to throw an extraordinary amount of light on whatever he concerned himself with. For Hugo each thing was astonishing, delightful, complicated and mysterious. During these conversations, I began to see the whole world anew (MURDOCH, 1954, p. 65-66).

In underlying such an apparently trivial activity, there are a number of issues to be considered, and sometimes they come up in the most unusual circumstances: while rereading an extract just translated, or talking to revisors and editors, or reading other reference books, or watching a movie, or even reading an interview or review in a newspaper, and so on. Simple words become big, almost unsolvable, challenges in a whole universe created and presented in more than 300 pages (as for *The Solid Mandala*).

It is not uncommon to hear translators complain about the task of translating a literary novel (even technical texts often represent challenges). However, this raises a pertinent question: what is a necessary requirement to be a literary translator? The translator's socio-

historical awareness is crucial to deal adequately with some of the challenges presented in the plot of *The Solid Mandala* to provide the Brazilian reader with a careful translation, as has been exemplified so far in this dissertation. We continue the discussion of the competences developed in Amparo Hurtado Albir's model, complementing the socio-historical awareness. Precisely, the Spanish scholar says that the literary translator's attitudes differ from the general translator's because of the "aesthetic overload<sup>176</sup>" of literary texts, which would in a way create a "literary competence", which would comprise:

[...] vast literary and cultural knowledge and some aptitudes related to the functioning of such texts (good writing skills, creativity, etc.). Such competence will allow her/him to face the specific problems which are in her/his translation: problems derived from the aesthetic overload (style, connotations, metaphors, etc.), the author's idiolect itself, the relation to the sociocultural conditions of the source environment, the intervention of the diachronic dimension (the translation of old texts), etc. These special characteristics, along with the specific weight of the author's idiolect, make this the kind of translation in which the creative dimension incides more (HURTADO ALBIR, 2008, p. 63-64, my translation<sup>177</sup>).

We call attention to the use of the word "problem" (used by Aixelá in his theory as well) in her comment: the problems we run into are precisely what make literary translation (and Translation Studies as a whole) a fascinating topic of study. Thus, in this work we have preferred the term "challenge" to allude to examples of the aforementioned aesthetic overload.

To study this fascinating subject of culture, it is necessary to define it first. Coming from the Latin words *cultus*, which means cultivation, and *colere*, which means "to till", the very meaning of the word evokes the idea of seeds, which keep on absorbing nutrients from the environment (sun, water, land) to guarantee their development. The same happens to us, as we go on absorbing elements from the environment surrounding us which have an influence on our development as human beings. Beyond any doubt, finding a comprehensive or accurate definition of culture is as hard as it is to find one about translation. For instance, in 1952, the American anthropologists Kroeber and Kluckhohnhad selected 164 definitions of "culture" -and after that, we are sure they would have much more work to do in compiling

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> In the original: "sobrecarga estética" (Marco Borillo, Verdegal Cerezo y HURTADO ALBIR, 1999, p. 167, apud HURTADO ALBIR p. 63).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> In the original: "[...] amplios conocimientos literarios y culturales y determinadas aptitudes relacionadas con el funcionamento de esos textos (buenas habilidades de escritura, creatividad, etc.). Dicha competência le permitirá enfrentarse a los problemas específicos que plantea su traducción: problemas derivados de la sobrecarga estética (de estilo, connotaciones, metáforas, etc.), del idiolecto próprio del autor, de la relación con las condiciones socioculturales del medio de partida, de la intervención de la dimensión diacrónica (la traducción de textos antigos), etc. Esas características especiales, junto con el peso específico del idiolecto del autor, hacen que quizás sea el tipo de traducción donde más se incide en la dimensión creativa" (HURTADO ALBIR, 2008, p. 63-64).

many more definitions (KATAN, 1999, p. 25). George Steiner claims that "the translator is a bilingual mediating agent between monolingual communication participants in two different language communities" (STEINER, 1975, p. 45). As for the translation of culturemes, many theorists have devised strategies and procedures. The theoretical guidance (or starting point) chosen for this dissertation was devised by another Spanish scholar, based at the University of Alicante: Javier Franco Aixelá, who claims the following in his article *Culture-Specific Items in Translation*:

Cultural asymmetry between two linguistic communities is necessarily reflected in the discourses of their members, with the potential opacity and unacceptability this may involve for the target cultural system. Thus, faced with the difference implied by the *other*, with a whole series of cultural signs capable of denying and/or questioning our own way of life, translation provides the receiving society with a wide range of strategies, ranging from conservation (acceptance of the difference by means of the reproduction of the cultural signs in the source text), to naturalization (transformation of the other into a cultural replica). The choice between these strategies will show, among other factors, the degree of tolerance of the receiving society and its own solidity (AIXELÁ, 1996b, p. 54).

In this instance, Aixelá talks about the receiving society (in this case, the Brazilian one). However, to offer this society a careful translation, it is necessary to examine questions discussed by Patrick White in the original, and which exude in the text. It is clear during the reading of *The Solid Mandala* that there is a constant opposition between Waldo and Arthur: on the one hand, the intellectual who wants to keep British values, to speak correct British English while sustaining a feigned verbal art (while paradoxically hiding his writing with his hand); on the other, someone who has a talent for manual work, making bread and butter, but at the same time nurturing a thrilling will to really know more about humanity through great books (even devising a play on the veranda of the house).

Surely, our activity would have been quite easier could we count on the physical presence and possibility of contact with Patrick White. The Swedish translator, Ingegärd Martinell, luckily had the possibility of sending letters to him during her work with *The Solid Mandala* to ask several questions. As an exercise, we located and separated each of the 7 items mentioned in Martinell's letter (taken from Patrick White's biography by David Marr) to see how the other translators dealt with such culture-specific items (following Aixelá's terminology) in the final product and how the explanations might have been helpful or not, and whether the translators might have felt the same difficulty manifest by the Swedish translator. In this item, we start with the word "boiler", whose explanation, made by White, is

the following: "an old and tough fowl which can only be made eatable by boiling" (MARR, 1995, p. 518). Let us see how it was translated:

Exhibit 31 – boiler

| French                 | Germ                                 | an        | Italian                  |      | Spanish 1         | Spanish 2           |
|------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------|--------------------------|------|-------------------|---------------------|
| Cis avait préparé une  | Cis hatte ein                        |           | Cis si era messa al      | Cis  | preparó huevos    | Cis había           |
| volaille bouillie      | Suppenhuhn                           |           | fornello e aveva         | con  | salsa en una      | conseguido una      |
| qu'elle accommoda à    | aufgetrieben                         | und       | preparato uova in        | cace | erola. Después,   | gallina y había     |
| la sauce poulette.     | dazu Eiersau                         | ce        | salsa. Poi, quando       | en e | el momento del    | preparado una       |
| Ensuite, tandis qu'ils | bereitet. Nac                        | h dem     | furono arrivati al       | opo  | rto y las nueces, | salsa de huevo.     |
| buvaient du porto et   | Essen, bei Po                        | ortwein   | vino di porto e alle     | Wal  | ldo reveló a los  | Al terminar,        |
| grignotaient des       | und Nüssen,                          | ließ      | noci, Waldo rivelò       | pres | sentes que tenía  | cuando ya habían    |
| noix, Waldo leur       | Waldo sich z                         | zu dem    | che aveva una voce       | voz  | (WHITE,           | servido elo porto   |
| révéla qu'il avait de  | Geständnis h                         | inreißen, | (WHITE, 1973c, p.        | 197  | 3a, p. 149-150).  | y las nueces,       |
| la voix (WHITE,        | daß er singer                        | n konnte  | 141).                    |      |                   | Waldo reveló sus    |
| 1973b, p. 146).        | (WHITE, 19                           | 78, p.    |                          |      |                   | dotes vocales       |
|                        | 154-155).                            |           |                          |      |                   | (WHITE, 2016,       |
|                        |                                      |           |                          |      |                   | p. 211).            |
| English                |                                      |           | First Attempt            |      | Brazilian Por     | tuguese - Revised   |
| Cis had got hold of    | a boiler and                         | Cis havi  | ia se apoderado de       | um   | Cis havia conse   | guido uma galinha   |
| done it up in          | egg sauce.                           | cozido e  | o incrementado em mo     | olho | velha e a disfar  | çou com molho de    |
| Afterwards, over the p | rds, over the port and nuts, de ovo. |           | Em seguida, com vinho do |      | ovo. Em seg       | guida, durante o    |
| Waldo disclosed tha    | o disclosed that he had a porto e i  |           | nozes, Waldo revelou     | que  | tradicional vinh  | o do porto e nozes, |
| voice (WHITE, 1974,    | p. 128).                             | ele tinha | uma voz.                 |      | Waldo revelou o   | que ele tinha voz.  |
|                        |                                      |           |                          |      |                   |                     |

The versions in the other languages sometimes deleted the word (like the first Spanish translation and the Italian, which dealt only with the eggs), the French got it right, but left out the egg part of the recipe; the German kept the reference to a chicken being boiled with egg sauce. The most recent Spanish translation follows the Oxford dictionary's second entry for the word: "British informal A chicken suitable for cooking only by boiling<sup>178</sup>", being similar to White's definition. In Brazilian Portuguese, we followed the explanation provided by White's biography, therefore sparing the necessity to mark the meaning of "ferver", which appears in the other versions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> BOILER. Definition in English. Available at: http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/boiler. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

Another expression considered difficult by the Swedish translator is "lamb's fry", with White's explanation being: "lamb's fry" is "lamb's liver" (MARR, 1995, p. 518), thus, let us have a look at this in the context in which it appears:

Exhibit 32 – lamb's fry

| French                 | German             | Italian             | Spanish 1                           | Spanish 2                           |
|------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| "Quand qu'on était à   | Mrs. Poulter       | La signora Poulter  | <ul> <li>Cuando vivíamos</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Cuando vivíamos</li> </ul> |
| Mungindribble, on      | erschien zum       | veniva e diceva:    | en Mungindribble nos                | en Mungindribble                    |
| nous donnait un        | Beispiel und       | "Quando eravamo     | daban um cuarto de                  | nos daban um cuarto                 |
| quartier de mouton,    | erzählte: »Als wir | a Mungindribble,    | carnero, y un poco de               | de oveja y, con                     |
| et un peu d'abats      | in                 | ci davano un        | vísceras, si teníamos               | suerte, algumas                     |
| avec d'la chance.      | Mundingdribble     | quarto di pecora,   | suerte. Bill enfermó y              | vísceras. Bill estaba               |
| Mais Bill, il pouvait  | waren, stand uns   | e se eravamo        | ya no pudo soportar                 | tan harto queno                     |
| plus supporter la vue  | ein Viertel von    | fortunati anche un  | ver las vísceras. De la             | podia soportar las                  |
| des abats. A force     | einem Schaf zu,    | po' di frattaglie.  | matanza diária. Se las              | vísceras ni de vista.               |
| d'avoir tué. Il les    | und dazu kriegten  | Bill non poteva     | tiraba a los perros.                | Por tanta matanza.                  |
| jetait aux chiens.     | wir noch was von   | sopportare la vista | Fritas son muy                      | Las echaba las                      |
| C'est bon la fressure. | den Innereien,     | delle frattaglie.   | buenas. Me gusta                    | achuras a los perros.               |
| J'adore la fressure    | wenn wir Glück     | Ogni volta che      | mucho el cordero                    | Pero fritas son ricas.              |
| d'agneau avant         | hatten. Aber was   | veniva macellata    | frito, antes de que                 | Me gusta el cordero                 |
| qu'elle perde son      | Bill ist, der      | una pecora, le      | pierda frescura                     | frito antes de que se               |
| brillant sur l'étal"   | konnte Innereien   | gettava ai cani.    | (WHITE, 1973a, p.                   | abombe (WHITE,                      |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.      | nicht mehr sehen.  | Ottima la frittura  | 186).                               | 2016, p. 257-258).                  |
| 181).                  | Weil er doch       | di frattaglie. Vado |                                     |                                     |
|                        | immer beim         | matta per una       |                                     |                                     |
|                        | Chlachten          | buona frittura di   |                                     |                                     |
|                        | gearbeitet hat.    | frattaglie          |                                     |                                     |
|                        | Und er hat sie     | d'agnello quando    |                                     |                                     |
|                        | einfach den        | sono ancora         |                                     |                                     |
|                        | Hunden             | freschissime"       |                                     |                                     |
|                        | vorgeworfen.       | (WHITE, 1973c,      |                                     |                                     |
|                        | Dabei kann man     | p. 177).            |                                     |                                     |
|                        | sie so schön       |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        | braten. Innereien  |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        | vom Lamm mag       |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        | ich besonders      |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        | gern. Wenn sie     |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        | Frisch sind. Im    |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        | Fleischerladen     |                     |                                     |                                     |
|                        |                    |                     |                                     |                                     |

|   | verlieren sie so<br>schnell ihre<br>Farbe« (WHITE, |                                      |            |              |  |                                   |           |             |              |
|---|--|--------------------------------------|------------|--------------|--|-----------------------------------|-----------|-------------|--------------|
| English                                 | 1978, p.   | 193).                                | First A    | ttempt       |  | Rrozili                           | ian Da    | ortuguese   | - Revised    |
| Eligiisii                               |  |                                      | rii st A   | tttempt      |  | DI aziii                          | iaii i (  | or tuguese  | - Keviseu    |
| Mrs Poulter would co                    | ome and  | A Sra.                               | Poulter    | vinha e d    | lizia: –                               | A Sra.                            | Poult     | er vinha    | e dizia: –   |
| say: 'When we                           | was at   | Quando                               | nós        | estava       | em                                     | Quando r                          | nóis ta   | ava em M    | ungindribble |
| Mungindribble they all                  | lowed us   | Mungind                              | ribble ele | s dexavam    | pra nós                                | eles dexavam pra nóis o quarto de |           |             |              |
| the quarter of a sheep, a               | and some   | o quarto de ovelha, e uns miúdo se   |            |              | ovelha, e alguns miúdo se nóis tinha   |                                   |           |             |              |
| of the offal if we wa                   | as lucky.  | nós tinha sorte. Bill ficou assim    |            |              | sorte. Bill ficou assim porque ele não |                                   |           |             |              |
| Bill got so as he could                 | n't stand  | porque ele não podia suportar ver os |            |              | podia vei                              | r os i                            | miúdo. Do | abatimento  |              |
| the sight of offal. F                   | From the   | miúdos.                              | Do ab      | atimento     | regular.                               | regular. J                        | logava    | a pros cac  | horro. Baita |
| regular killin. Threw                   | it to the  | Jogava                               | para os    | cachorros.   | Fritada                                | fritada. (                        | Gosto     | de uma      | fritada de   |
| dogs. Lovely fry. I lik                 | ke a nice  | adorável.                            | Gosto de   | uma fritad   | a de um                                | fígado de                         | cord      | leiro antes | d'ele perdê  |
| lamb's fry before it                    | loses its  | bom core                             | leiro ante | s que ele pe | erca seu                               | o brilho n                        | numa j    | prancha.    |              |
| shine on a slab' (WHITE, 1974, brilho e |  | brilho en                            | n uma pra  | ncha.        |  |                                   |           |             |              |
| p. 159).                                |  |                                      |            |              |  |                                   |           |             |              |
|   |  |                                      |            |              |  |                                   |           |             |              |

In this fragment, in addition to the work with the meaning of "lamb's fry", we need to consider that

The ability to delineate his [White's] characters through their manner of expressing themselves and their linguistic individualities – in the spirit of Joyce – is well developed. When Johann Ulrich Voss, Mordecai Himmelfarb, and Lotte Lippmann speak English one is aware of their German background in spite of the fact that their choice of words is correct. Sir Basil Hunter's affected manner of speech reflects his personality. Arthur Brown's speech is not the same as his brother Waldo's (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 120-121).

In this case, we must focus on Mrs Poulter. There is a clear mark of speech with "we was" being repeated twice, thus signaling a popular way of speaking. None of the translations addressed this feature, thus turning Mrs Poulter, by the way she speaks, into an educated or high class woman – when in reality she is a modest woman from the countryside, who likes to watch TV and read the newspaper, who goes to church, who adores her husband, and at the same time represents the modern times reaching Sydney (the chapter which takes her name, Mrs. Poulter and the Zeitgeist, closes the novel). In Brazilian Portuguese, we strive to maintain this feature (together with the regionalism mentioned earlier in this dissertation), though knowing it is a big challenge, given Brazil's linguistic variety. In this case, the most reliable strategy for any translator is to devise how Mrs Poulter would look like in one's mind

(in terms of speech and manners). In this case, we devised Mrs Poulter coming from the countryside of a small town in the State of Rio Grande do Sul (for example, sometimes words in the Italian Venetian dialect mix with Brazilian words, even affecting constructions with verbs, in forms such as "ele fiz" – instead of "ele fez"). In the section, we opted for changing the pronoun "nóis" and the conjugation, and using popular expressions which are not in agreement in Brazilian Portuguese to mark grammatical mistakes (such as "eles dexavam" – which imitates the way we speak in Brazilian Portuguese –, "nóis tinha", "os miúdo", "d'ele perdê") and the informal speech. Furthermore, one big change refers to the collocation of "adorável" with "fritada". In our first attempt, "lovely" was literally translated as "adorável". We had two options: either use a regional form of the word in Brazilian Portuguese, "adoráver", or change the adjective, as it would not be so common to hear the collocation "adorável" as a collocation of "fritada" in Brazilian Portuguese. Therefore, we opted for the word "baita", which gives the idea of something good.

Another expression which required an explanation was "Shower Teas", with White's explanation being the following:

Australian suburban brides are given tea parties by their friends before the wedding, to which the friends bring perhaps something for the kitchen, sometimes at more modest functions just a recipe. C.'s daugthers are always giving such teas, but as they never catch a husband they are never showered upon themselves (MARR, 1995, p. 518).

Exhibit 33 – Shower Teas

| French                 | German              | Italian                  | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2             |
|------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|
| Il était nanti d'une   | Er hatte eine Frau, | Aveva una moglie         | Tenía una esposa    | Tenía una esposa      |
| femme dont les         | die nach            | che puzzava di           | que olía a tinte, y | que olía a ropa       |
| vêtements sentaient    | chemischer          | lavaggio a secco, e      | tres o cuatro hijas | recién salida de la   |
| le nettoyage à sec et  | Reinigung roch,     | tre o quattro figlie dai | que usaban          | tintorería y tres o   |
| de trois ou quatre     | und zwei oder       | cappellini bianchi che   | sombreros           | cuatro hijas que      |
| filles en canotier     | drei Töchter mit    | ogni tanto               | blancos y qye       | usaban sombreros      |
| blanc, qui donnaient   | weißen Hüten.       | organizzavano una        | bañaban en té a     | blancos, organizaban  |
| de nombreuses          | Die veranstalteten  | festicciola in onore di  | sus amigas, sin     | tés de despedida para |
| réceptions pour leurs  | ständig Tees mit    | qualche loro amica,      | que ellas mismas    | las amigas que se     |
| amis, où elles étaient | Geschenküberrasc    | ma che nessuno           | llegaran a bañarse  | casaban sin que       |
| comblées de cadeaux    | hungen für          | invitava mai a casa      | nunca. Pobre        | nunca las hubieran    |
| sans être jamais       | irgendwelche        | sua. Povero              | Crankshaw           | despedido a ellas.    |
| comblées elles-        | heiratenden         | Crankshaw (WHITE,        | (WHITE, 1973a,      | Pobre Crankshaw       |
| mêmes. Pauvre          | Freundinnen,        | 1973c, p. 191).          | p. 201).            | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |

| Crankshaw (WHITE,       | ohne daß s  | ie je in                         |                            |                                     |                 | 275).                 |
|-------------------------|-------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|
| 1973b, p. 195).         | die Lage k  | amen,                            |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | einmal sell | ost aus                          |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | demselben   | Grund                            |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | mit Gesche  | enken                            |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | überrascht  | zu                               |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | werden. A   | rmer                             |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | Crankshaw   | I                                |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | (WHITE,     | 1978, p.                         |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
|                         | 209).       |                                  |                            |                                     |                 |                       |
| English                 |             |                                  | First Attempt              |                                     | Brazilian Po    | ortuguese - Revised   |
| He had a wife who ree   | eked of the | Ele tinha uma esposa que fedia à |                            |                                     | Ele tinha uma   | a esposa que fedia à  |
| dry-cleaner's, and thre | ee or four  | lavande                          | ria, e três ou quatro meni | inas                                | lavanderia, e t | rês ou quatro meninas |
| girls in white hats,    | who gave    | em chapéus brancos, que davam    |                            |                                     | em chapéus b    | rancos, que ofereciam |
| shower teas for the     | ir friends, | chás para suas amigas sem elas   |                            | chás de panela para suas amigas sem |                 |                       |
| without ever being      | showered    | mesmas                           | s nunca serem convida      | ıdas                                | nunca terem     | algum chá de panela   |
| upon themselves.        | Poor        | para cha                         | ás. Pobre Crankshaw.       |                                     | oferecido para  | a elas mesmas. Pobre  |
| Crankshaw (WHITE,       | 1974, p.    |                                  |                            |                                     | Crankshaw.      |                       |
| 172).                   |             |                                  |                            |                                     |                 |                       |

In this extract, looking up the word "shower tea" in the dictionary, the information provided is: "AUSTRALIAN a party held for a woman just before she gets married, at which usually female friends give her presents for her future home<sup>179</sup>", thus matching what was said by White. The translation in Brazilian Portuguese opted for the most common form of the concept, which is "chá de panela". "Chá de cozinha" is used too, but we consider that the reader will have a more immediate idea of the concept when reading "chá de panela". Patrick White transforms the noun into a verb in the extract, which made the translation into Brazilian Portuguese quite difficult (note that in the first translation the idea of "be showered upon" is missing). The option we present in the revised version brings back the idea.

Another expression, this time involving Patrick White's inventive capacity, is "gross business minotaur", which received the following explanation Patrick White: "a certain type of business man with an eye for girls, they often look rather like bulls" (MARR, 1995, p. 518). Let us see how it appears (or not) in the translations picked for this dissertation:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> SHOWER TEA. Definition. Available at: http://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/shower-tea. Accessed on: 10 Jan. 2016.

Exhibit 34 – Gross Business Minotaur

| French                  | German            |          | Italian                | S                  | panish 1      | Spanish 2            |
|-------------------------|-------------------|----------|------------------------|--------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Car à son âge, quel     | Denn in seinem    | Alter    | Infatti, alla sua età, | Porqu              | ie a su edad, | Porque a su edad,    |
| que fût le              | noch geschlechtl  | liche    | qualunque cosa         | abrigar esperanzas |               | abrigar              |
| comportement            | Erwartungen zu    |          | notasse nel            | sexua              | iles no       | expectativas         |
| observé chez un         | hegen, war wede   | er       | comportamento di       | hubie              | ra sido ni    | sexuales no habría   |
| certain type grossier   | ratsam noch       |          | un certo volgare       | prude              | ente ni digno | sido ni prudente ni  |
| de brasseur             | vertretbar, vom   |          | tipo di gaudente,      | (WH                | ITE, 1973a,   | digno, fuera lo que  |
| d'affaires, il eût      | Standpunkt der    |          | non sarebbe stato      | p. 21              | 4).           | fuese lo que         |
| manqué de prudence      | persönlichen Wü   | ürde     | né prudente né         |                    |               | advertía en la       |
| et de dignité à nourrir | aus gesehen – ga  | anz      | dignitoso per lui      |                    |               | conducta ajena       |
| des espérances          | gleich, welches   |          | intrattenere           |                    |               | (WHITE, 2016, p.     |
| sexuelles (WHITE,       | Benehmen ihm a    | auch     | aspettative di         |                    |               | 291).                |
| 1973b, p. 207).         | bei einer gewisse | en       | carattere sessuale     |                    |               |                      |
|                         | Sorte von         |          | (WHITE, 1973c, p.      |                    |               |                      |
|                         | stiernackigen     |          | 204).                  |                    |               |                      |
|                         | Vertretern der    |          |                        |                    |               |                      |
|                         | Geschäftswelt in  | ıs       |                        |                    |               |                      |
|                         | Auge fallen moc   | hte      |                        |                    |               |                      |
|                         | (WHITE, 1978,     | p.       |                        |                    |               |                      |
|                         | 223).             |          |                        |                    |               |                      |
| English                 |                   |          | First Attempt          |                    | Brazilian Po  | ortuguese - Revised  |
| Because at his age,     | whatever he F     | Porque   | na idade dele, qua     | lquer              | Porque na id  | ade dele, seja o que |
| noticed in the behavior | ur of a certain c | coisa    | que ele notasse        | no                 | tivesse notad | o no comportamento   |
| type of gross business  | s minotaur, to c  | compor   | tamento de um certo ti | po de              | de um cei     | to tipo bruto de     |
| entertain sexual expec  | etations would r  | ninotau  | iro de negócio sujo,   | para               | minotauro d   | e negócios, entreter |
| have been neither       | prudent nor e     | entreter | expectativas sexuais   | não                | expectativas  | sexuais não teria    |
| dignified (WHITE, 197   | 74, p. 182).      | eria sid | lo nem prudente nem di | gno.               | sido nem pru  | dente nem digno.     |
|                         |                   |          |                        |                    |               |                      |
|                         |                   |          |                        |                    |               |                      |

The extract evinces White's work with the language, as he explains how he coined the expression. Instead of using "homem de negócios", we chose "minotauro de negócios", given the very concept of "minotaur" coming from the Greek mythology:

(Classical Myth & Legend) *Greek myth* a monster with the head of a bull and the body of a man. It was kept in the Labyrinth in Crete, feeding on human flesh, until destroyed by Theseus<sup>180</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> MINOTAUR. Definition. The Free Dictionary Online. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/minotaur. Accessed on: 3 May 2015.

The challenge remained in relation to the adjective "gross", in capturing the best sense to fit in the sentence in Brazilian Portuguese. We decided to use "bruto" (which encompasses a large array of negative meanings) and positioning it after the noun "type", because it was quite awkward to read "minotauro de negócios bruto". Thus, by positioning "bruto" next to "tipo", we take advantage of the other meanings of "tipo" in Brazilian Portuguese which might arise when reading this construction, such as "man", "character", and so on. These were the strategies devised to deal with the possibilities offered in English, and which were kept (in different degrees and orders) in the translated text, therefore confirming the idea of compensations existing all the time in our activity. This compensation sounds better than simply deleting the expression, for fear of dealing with it and perhaps not presenting something close to its meaning in English in the translated text.

Additional changes refer to verb tenses: the failure in perceiving the right aspect compromised the whole passage in the first translation. The revised text flows better, with the infinitive being used in the right way (without the preposition "para", which would otherwise render a nonsensical text). Furthermore, the past tenses were changed from the original, but for the sake of the naturality of the text in Brazilian Portuguese.

Another instance which represented a challenge to the Swedish translator is the following: "stuff a mutton flap", which was explained by Patrick White as follows:

an economical and not very pleasant dish because breast of mutton is so fatty and there isn't much lean. A stuffing is made out of moistened breadcrumbs and herbs bound with an egg. The flap is rolled up with the stuffing inside, skewers are stuck through the roll to keep it in place, and it is then baked in the oven. Only very primitive cooks in very poor families would eat this nowadays (MARR, 1995, p. 519).

Let us see how it was translated:

Exhibit 35 – Mutton Flap

| French               | German            | German Italian      |                     | Spanish 2          |
|----------------------|-------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| Quelquefois ils      | Manchmal aßen sie | Qualche volta       | A veces tentaban    | Pero a veces       |
| tentaient le sort et | auch Fleisch:     | sfidavano il fato e | suerte y preparaban | desafiaban al      |
| collaboraient pour   | Gelegentlich ein  | si accingevano      | una pierna de       | destino y se       |
| farcir un morceau de | Stück Rind oder   | insieme a farcire   | cordero,            | dedicaban juntos a |
| mouton à l'aide de   | Hammelragout,     | un pezzo di carne   | ensartándola en las | rellenar una       |
| vieilles broches     | ziemlich          | di montone, con i   | viejas brochetas de | porción de cordero |
| d'aluminium          | gummiartig nach   | vecchi e ricurvi    | aluminio curvas,    | com viejas         |

complètement tordues qui prenaient sans cesse de nouvelles formes; ils répandaient de la farce par terre, alors que leurs mains s'évertuaient à la triturer et à la maintenir en place ou qu'ils torturaient en tous sens la chair inerte afin de la rendre docile (WHITE, 1973b, p. 238).

der langen Kochzeit, die minderwertiges Fleisch bis zur Genießbarkeit braucht. Oder sie forderten sogar das Schicksal heraus und wagten sich gemeinsam an die Zubereitung einer gefüllten Hammelschulter, wobei die alten Aluminiumspeißch en beim Zusammenstecken immer wieder neue Formen annahmen oder einfach auf den Boden prasselten, während sie sich darum bemühten. teigartige Massen in eine Form zu bringen und totes Fleisch unter ihren Willen zu zwingen (WHITE, 1978, p.

spiedi di alluminio che assumevano forme sempre nuove o sgocciolavano sul pavimento, mentre le mani si agitavano febbrilmente per modellare una scultura di pasta, o per torturare la carne morta fino a ridurla ala sottomissione (WHITE, 1973c, p. 236).

que siempre tomaban nuevas formas o caían al suelo, mientras las manos peleaban por hacer una escultura de masa o torturar la carne muerta para someterla (WHITE, 1973a, p. 245). brochetas de aluminio retorcidas, que siempre adoptaban formas nuevas, o regaban el piso cuando sus manos intentaban dar forma a una escultura de massa o torturaban carne muerta para someterla (WHITE, 2016, p. 331).

### **English**

258).

#### First Attempt

# **Brazilian Portuguese - Revised**

Or sometimes they would tempt fate, they would join in stuffing a mutton flap, with the old bent aluminium skewers always taking on fresh shapes, or raining on the floor, as hands fought to contain a sculpture of dough, or torture dead meat into submission Ou algumas vezes eles instigavam o destino, eles começariam a rechear um carneiro, com os espetos de alumínio curvados sempre pegando formas novas, ou jorrando no chão, à medida que mãos lutavam para conter uma escultura de massa, ou torturar a Ou algumas vezes eles instigavam o destino, começavam a rechear um matambre de fraldas de carneiro, com os espetos de alumínio curvados sempre adquirindo formas novas, ou jorrando no chão, à medida que as mãos lutavam para conter uma escultura de massa, ou torturar a carne

| (WHITE, 1974, p. 210). | carne morta à submissão. | morta à submissão. |
|------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|
|                        |                          |                    |

One of the many torments for any translator is when s/he has to deal with items connected to food, in this regard following what Peter Newmark suggests: "Food is for many the most sensitive and important expression of national culture; food terms are subjected to the widest variety of translation procedures" (NEWMARK, 1988, p. 97). In this case, we rely on the very detailed explanation of the recipe provided by Patrick White (which might even appear in a footnote in the translation), to make sense of the dish and then render something similar in Brazilian Portuguese. Taking the meat and rolling it gives us the idea of a "rocambole" (whose definition in Brazilian Portuguese is "a thin cake, either sweet or salty, rolled with dressing<sup>181</sup>"). After deciphering the first part of the concept, the next step was to see whether "peito de carneiro" was really a valid construction to fit in the context. When searching on the Internet, a news item connected to mutton flaps came out, thus explaining the concept in Brazilian Portuguese. Thus, knowing that "mutton flaps" would translate as "fraldas de carneiro", we were quite happy to use "rocambole de fraldas de carneiro". However, further readings made us think about another possible option: matambre (from the Spanish "matar hambre", or "kill hunger" 182), which refers to a very thin cut of beef in Argentina and Uruguay but also to a dish made of matambre meat roll stuffed (and which is equally fatty). Indeed, taking into account all the references to the South, we chose that option ("matambre de fraldas de carneiro") because it sharpens the accuracy of this fragment while being close to White's explanation.

Another item which deserved a question by the Swedish translator was the item "Primrose Pompadour", for which White's explanation is as follows:

There is a portrait of Mme de Pompadour by I forget which French painter of the period. I remember when I was a child a rather pretentious Sydney society lady went to a fancy dress ball as the Primrose Pompadour" (MARR, 1995, p. 519).

Let us see how it was translated:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> ROCAMBOLE. Definition. In the original, from Aulete Digital: "Bolo fino, salgado ou doce, enrolado com recheio". Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/rocambole. Accessed on: 4 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> MATAMBRE. Definition. Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Matambre. Accessed on: 17 Dec. 2016.

Exhibit 36 – Primrose Pompadour

| French                        | G  | erman              | Italian                 | Spanish 1            | Spanish 2             |
|-------------------------------|--|--------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|
| Il devait y avoir bal         | Für den                                  | Abend              | Quella sera doveva      | Aquella noche tenía  | Esa noche habría      |
| ce soir-là. Aussi le          | stand ei                                 | n                  | esserci un ballo.       | que celebrarse un    | un baile. De modo     |
| Ver à soie les quitta-        | Kostüm                                   | nfest auf dem      | Perciò poco dopo il     | baile. De modo que   | que Gusano de         |
| t-il pour s'habiller en       | Progran                                  | nm. Deshalb        | Baco da Seta andò a     | al cabo de unos      | Seda se fue para      |
| toilette Pompadour à          | mußte s                                  | sich die           | mascherarsi da          | instantes Gusano de  | disfrazarse de la     |
| fleurs afin de gagner         | Seidenr                                  | aupe jetzt         | Madame                  | Seda marchó a        | Frívola Pompadour     |
| le prix (WHITE,               | entferne                                 | en, um sich        | Pompadour per           | transformarse en     | y ganar el premio     |
| 1973b, p. 246).               | in die P                                 | ompadur            | vincere il premio       | una Alegre           | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |
|                               | der Prir                                 | neln zu            | (WHITE, 1973c, p.       | Pompadour, y ganar   | 340).                 |
|                               | verwan                                   | deln und den       | 242).                   | el premio (WHITE,    |                       |
|                               | Preis fü                                 | r das              |                         | 1973a, p. 252).      |                       |
|                               | originel                                 | lste Kostüm        |                         |                      |                       |
|                               | zu gewi                                  | innen              |                         |                      |                       |
|                               | (WHIT                                    | E, 1978, p.        |                         |                      |                       |
|                               | 264).                                    |                    |                         |                      |                       |
| English                       |  | F                  | First Attempt           | Brazilian Por        | tuguese - Revised     |
| That night there was          | to be a                                  | Naquela no         | ite haveria um bai      | le. Naquela noite ha | veria um baile. Assim |
| ball. So presently            | y the                                    | Assim a Bic        | ho-da-seda logo foi, pa | ıra a Bicho-da-seda  | logo foi, para se     |
| Silkworm went, to get         | Silkworm went, to get herself se arruman |                    | como a Madar            | ne arrumar como P    | ompadour Primavera,   |
| up as the Primrose Pompadour, |  | e ganhar o prêmio. | e ganhar o prêmi        | 0.                   |                       |
| Pompadour, and win the        | ne prize                                 |                    |                         |                      |                       |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 216)         | )  |                    |                         |                      |                       |

The food for thought provided by White's words prompted us to think of how to deal not only with a better alternative than simply "Madame Pompadour" to translate "Primrose Pompadour", because "primrose" is the challenge here. It refers to a flower which, in Brazilian Portuguese, is known as "primavera" (which happens to be the name of the season, Spring). Given the colourful tone derived from the word, and mainly the ironic and why not playful tone of this fragment, considering that it comes from Arthur's chapter, a funny, but at the same time convenient, name should be thought up. In terms of grammatical classes, primrose was seen as an adjective in the Spanish translations (gay and frivolous); in French and German, the flower sense was kept; in Italian, the choice was like ours in the first translation: Madame Pompadour, deleting any reference either to flowers or feelings. Prímula sounds too formal in this context, so perhaps the more common name "primavera" should be preferred. Then, if we wanted to keep an adjective, "primaveril" would be an option.

However, we decided to leave out that adjective and use the name "Primavera" (Pompadour Primavera) because, in our opinion, it captures the feelings and creates some rhythm in the translated text (a preposition would break the flow of reading).

The last item in the Swedish translator's letter concerns the expression "rain-scurries", for which White's explanation is the following: "sounds on an iron roof at night can be frightening in old houses in the country. "mere claws etc" is an attempt to exorcise these fears..." (MARR, 1995, p. 519). Let us have a look at the attempt of the translators, perhaps wanting to exorcise their fears when translating one of Patrick White's demanding texts:

Exhibit 37 – Rain-scurries

| French              | German            | Italian                | Spanish 1                | Spanish 2             |
|---------------------|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| A présent les       | Jetzt tickte nur  | Ora il legno secco     | Ahora la madera seca     | Ahora la madera       |
| boiseries sèches    | noch der          | scricchiolava, il      | golpeaba el hierro       | resseca crujía; el    |
| craquaient toc toc  | Holzwurm im       | ferro arrugginito      | oxidado crujía o         | hierro oxidado        |
| le fer rouillé      | trockenen Gebälk, | cigolava sospinto      | respondía a simples      | chirriaba o se        |
| grinçait ou         | und die rostigen  | da qualche mano o      | zarpas o goterones de    | desintegraba al       |
| résonnait sous de   | Blechplatten des  | da un rovescio         | lluvia de noche el agua  | contacto de unas      |
| simples coups de    | Daches knirschten | notturno di pioggia,   | goteava en el pilón las  | pinzas o, por la      |
| griffe ou des       | oder antworteten  | l'acqua gocciolava     | plantas se reflejaban en | noche, con las        |
| tourbillons de      | auf die           | nell'acquaio, la vita  | el más leve rayo de sol  | filtraciones; el agua |
| pluie la nuit l'eau | krallenbewehrten  | vegetale si rifletteva | sobre las paredes y      | goteaba en la pileta  |
| gouttait dans la    | huschenden        | nella minima           | techos de la casa en la  | de la despensa; con   |
| bassine de          | Schritte          | chiazza di sole sulle  | que no todo el mundo     | el más débil rastro   |
| l'arrière-cuisine   | nächtlicher Tiere | pareti e sul soffitto  | había muerto (WHITE,     | de sol, la vida       |
| la vie végétale se  | oder dröhnten     | di quella casa dove    | 1973, p. 339).           | vegetal afloraba en   |
| reflétait dans la   | unter             | non tutti erano        |                          | las paredes y los     |
| plus petite tache   | Regenschauern in  | ancora morti           |                          | techos de esa casa en |
| de soleil sur les   | der Nacht, das    | (WHITE, 1973, p.       |                          | la cual no todos      |
| murs et les         | Wasser tropfte in | 326-327).              |                          | habían muerto         |
| plafonds de la      | die Schüssel in   |                        |                          | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |
| maison où tout le   | der Waschküche    |                        |                          | 448).                 |
| monde n'était pas   | und pflanzliches  |                        |                          |                       |
| mort (WHITE,        | Leben war es was  |                        |                          |                       |
| 1973, p. 330)       | widerschien auch  |                        |                          |                       |
|                     | im fahlsten       |                        |                          |                       |
|                     | Sonnenlichtspritz |                        |                          |                       |
|                     | er auf den        |                        |                          |                       |
|                     | Wänden und        |                        |                          |                       |

|                     | Decken des Hauses in dem noch nicht alle gestorben waren (WHITE, 1978, p. 360). | ).                                   |           |             |              |               |                          |
|---------------------|---|--------------------------------------|-----------|-------------|--------------|---------------|--------------------------|
| Engl                | ish   |                                      | Fir       | st Attemp   | t            | Brazilian I   | Portuguese - Revised     |
| Now the dry wood    | lwork ticked the  | Agora                                | a         | carpinta    | ria seca     | Agora a       | carpintaria seca         |
| rusty iron creaked  | or responded to   | tiqueta                              | aqueava,  | o ferro     | enferrujado  | tiquetaqueav  | ra o ferro enferrujado   |
| mere claws or rain  | -scurries at night  | rangia                               | ou resp   | ondia às n  | neras garras | rangia ou     | respondia às meras       |
| the water dripped   | in the scullery   | ou a p                               | ressa da  | chuva à n   | oite, a água | garras ou ao  | ruído da chuva batida    |
| basin plant-life wa | s reflected in the  | pingav                               | /a na bao | cia da área | de serviço,  | pelo vento à  | noite a água pingava     |
| thinnest smear of   | sunlight on the   | a vida da planta estava refletida na |           |             | refletida na | na bacia da   | área de serviço a vida   |
| walls and ceilings  | of the house in   | lambuzada mais fina da luz do sol    |           |             | luz do sol   | das plantas e | estava refletida na mais |
| which not every     | one had died  | nas pa                               | aredes e  | nos tetos   | da casa na   | fina nódoa    | de luz do sol nas        |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 2  | 291)  | qual                                 | nem to    | do o mu     | ındo havia   | paredes e no  | os tetos da casa na qua  |
|                     |   | morrio                               | lo.       |             |              | nem todo o r  | nundo havia morrido.     |

The greatest challenge in this section concerns punctuation. In this part, we reproduce a paragraph extracted from Patrick White's biography written by David Marr, about the author's preferences concerning this delicate topic and his conflict with the proofreaders who wanted to change this feature of his eccentric way of composing: "That winter he vowed to put the stage behind him. He told Huebsch he was the wrong kind of writer for collaborations. 'For me even a comma is a piece of sculpture. If I put it, I mean it to be there'" (MARR, 1995, p. 436). Surely, Patrick White was worried about this aspect, but his editors suffered somewhat when they had to prepare the manuscripts for edition. Marshall Best, Patrick White's editor at Viking, exemplifies the situation:

[...] three objections which remained a persistent worry at Viking for the next twenty years: first, White's 'dangling modifiers', those participal phrases at the far ends of sentences left with nothing to cling to; second, the mixed use of both 'that' and 'which' in linked clauses; and third, excessive punctuation (MARR, 1995, p. 321-322).

In Brazilian Portuguese, the change in punctuation is inevitable, and in many instances, even necessary, in favour of common sense, as languages work differently, and effects obtained in English will not be rendered in the same way in translations. In the original, the sentences are not separated by commas, giving the narrative a different rhythm. We see that the French, Italian and first Spanish translation did not use the commas, thus following the original

punctuation. The German used a comma only once in the sentence; the new Spanish translation decided to use a semicolon to clearly separate each sentence. Once separated by commas, the sentences were more manageable, so it was easier to make corrections, which can be seen in the revised version. Scurry appears with many suggestions of translation, mainly referring to rain and snow. In this case, we decided to use "chuva batida pelo vento". Of course, if we come up with better alternatives in the future, this whole extract is subject to changes (as indeed most translations are). Plant-life was translated literally in the first version, but we think that the plural form of "plant" would sound more natural in the translation. Another word which was quite tricky in this portion was "smear", which has a wide array of meanings. In this case, in the revised version we decided to delete the reference to "lambuzada" (which was put in the first attempt just for a reference — which proved wrong during our search) and then choose another option, closer to what we were looking for (something to match "sunlight"): "nódoa" (which has the double meaning of the English "smear", in the sense of a stain, a spot, but also of defamation).

#### 4.8 LOCAL COLOUR AND ITS EFFECT IN TRANSLATION

As already mentioned, many culture-specific items appear throughout *The Solid Mandala*, and they impose challenges to any translator, and even to readers whose native language is English. Let us start with a summary of several proper names (some of them real, others made up) which appear in the novel (focusing on specific cases later on in this subitem) and see how they were dealt with in many readings:

Exhibit 38 – Some Proper Nouns

| Name          | French        | German         | Italian    | Spanish 1     | Spanish 2 | Brazilian  |
|---------------|---------------|----------------|------------|---------------|-----------|------------|
| (Original)    |               |                |            |               |           | Portuguese |
| Peaches-and-  | Jardin Fleuri | Pfirsich-und-  | Pesche e   | Jardín de los | El Vergel | Pêssegos e |
| Plums (name   | (WHITE,       | Pflaumen-      | Prugne     | Ciruelos      | (WHITE,   | Ameixas    |
| of an asylum) | 1973b, p.     | Farm (WHITE,   | (WHITE,    | (WHITE,       | 2016, p.  |            |
|               | 294)          | 1978, p. 318). | 1973c, p.  | 1973a, p.     | 401).     |            |
|               |               |                | 289)       | 301).         |           |            |
| Home of       | Havre de      | Hort des       | Casa della | Hogar de La   | Jardín de | Morada da  |
| Peace         | Paix          | Friedens       | Pace       | Paz (WHITE,   | Paz       | Paz        |
|               | (WHITE,       | (WHITE,        | (WHITE,    | 1973a, p.     | (WHITE,   |            |
|               | 1973b, p.     | 1978, p. 387). | 1973c, p.  | 364).         | 2016, p.  |            |
|               | 356).         |                | 350).      |               | 480).     |            |
| Mount         | Mont Joli     | Mount Pleasant | Mount      | "Mount        | Mount     | Monte      |
| Pleasant      | (WHITE,       | (WHITE,        | Pleasant   | Pleasant"     | Pleasant  | Agradável  |
| (Dulcie's     | 1973b, p.     | 1978, p. 157). | (WHITE,    | (WHITE,       | (WHITE,   |            |
| house)        | 148).         |                | 1973c, p.  | 1973a, p.     | 2016, p.  |            |
|               |               |                | 143).      | 152).         | 214).     |            |

As we can see, Sydney will be translated as "Sydney" in Brazilian Portuguese, thus, representing a repetition, in which "translators keep as much as they can of the original reference" (AIXELÁ, 1996b, p. 61). In the other languages, we have the following: Sídney (in Spanish, p. 59 and p. 98), Sydney (in French) and Sidney (German and Italian). As for the other proper names, we opted for literal translations for all of them.

Virtually all the names of the places remained in English in the translations consulted (the actual names of the streets in Sydney should not be translated); "Sarsaparilla" and "Terminus Road" are fictitious names which would allow and/or demand some creative work from the translator (which, however, would not be compulsory, since the option to maintain the names as the original is acceptable. What cannot be accepted is to translate such names in some sections, and not in others, thus causing an inconsistency vis-a-vis the strategy adopted). On the list of names of places devised by White is "Barranugli":

White's practice of hiding a meaning, of giving directions by the choice of person names and place names, is striking. In translation, this is lost, in English the play on words is more apparent. When he calls one of the Australian suburbs Barranugli it is not only the speech of the Aborigines he has in mind but also something that is barren and ugly (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 121).

The name was not translated in our work. We might have as possible options, to try to keep some kind of aural resemblance to the original: Barra Funda, Barra Feia. As for Terminus Road, at times we tried to work out a possible translation, Rua Fim da Linha, or even Rua Terminal. However, it proves quite difficult to keep this option when other real street names appear in the novel. In this sense, we should translate their names as well, to keep consistency.

According to Theo Hermans in his paper *The Translator's Voice in Translated Narrative*, in relation to the names of the dogs, Scruffy and Runt, these would be ways for the translator to become visible: "[...] others (proper names) are more Dickensian, motivated names holding out an invitation to the reader to activate their latent semantic load" (HERMANS, 2010, p. 203). The names appear in italics in the translation, and maybe they could have been translated as well, since they refer to their potential characteristics ("Sujão" and "Tampinha", respectively). We conjecture that the italics were chosen to call the reader's attention to some idiosyncrasy: the semantic load would be activated by the use of such a resource. The same argument would hold true for the translation of the aforementioned fictitious places. In relation to the aural work with the proper names, it should be noted that

they work perfectly well in English, creating a different effect which, in translation, might not be so visible. For example, Mrs Dun makes reference aurally to "dung", which means manure. The surname Allwright is aurally similar to "all right"; Poulter can easily make a reference to poultry. Thus, in our translation we decided to keep the names as they are, knowing that perhaps in a different, i.e., domesticating strategy, we might translate all of them, changing the text in Brazilian Portuguese considerably. Déborah Scheidt, in her Master's work on Patrick White, claims that the thematic of "uncertainty" created by White intensifies the active role on the part of the reader required by all literature. In his case, that strategy appears through "an unconventional subject matter, a weird, multifaceted protagonist and a parodic element" (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 63).

When proofreading the excerpts, the following served as a guide:

The proofreader is also worried about some of the Australianisms. But I refuse to pander to the American reader to that extent. There is a lot in the American language I have to puzzle out from myself, and am none the worse for doing so. Why can't the American do the same when it comes to ours?" (MARR, 1994, p. 262).

Honestly, the Australianisms presented in the story represent a challenge to the translator, but they need to be kept in the translated text, since simply deleting the references, as suggested by publishing-houses or even put into practice by the translators without a careful proofreading, cannot be accepted. Let us focus on a very interesting case, concerning the translation of one of the settings of the story, the Mitchell Library:

Exhibit 39 – Mitchell Library

| French              | German              | Italian             | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2              |
|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------------------|
| [] Le bâtiment      | [] Al ser seine     | [] Il nuovo         | El nuevo edificio   | [] El flamante         |
| neuf sentait encore | Arbeit dort begann, | edificio conservava | todavía olía a      | edificio tenía todavia |
| le vernis et le     | hatte das neue      | ancora un odore di  | barniz y a goma. En | olor a barnices y a    |
| caoutchouc. Les     | Gebäude immer       | vernice e di        | comparación con     | goma. En               |
| livres, comparés à  | noch nach frischem  | gomma. I libri      | los de la vieja     | comparación con los    |
| ceux de la vieille  | Lack und Gummi      | stessi, a confronto | Biblioteca          | de la Biblioteca       |
| Bibliothèque        | gerochen. Im        | con quelli della    | Municipal, los      | Municipal, los         |
| municipale,         | Vergleich zu denen  | vecchia Biblioteca  | libros parecían     | mismos libros          |
| paraissaient neufs  | in der alten        | Comunale,           | nuevos, o al menos  | parecían nuevos o, al  |
| également, ou du    | Städtischen         | sembravano nuovi,   | las características | menos, las huellas de  |
| moins leurs         | schienen selbst die | o almeno la         | de sus lectores no  | los lectores aún no se |
| lecteurs n'y        | Bücher ganz neu zu  | condizione dei loro | se habían arraigado | habían grabado en      |

sein, zumindestens lettori non aveva en ellos. De modo ellos. De modo que avaient-ils pas encore imprimé les war ihnen das lasciato nessun que Waldo sólo Waldo no podía más marques de leur Wesen ihrer Leser segno su di essi. podía sentirse que sentirse condition. Aussi noch nicht Quindi Waldo poté tranquilamente serenamente aufgezwungen Waldo ne pouvaitsoltanto sentirsi satsifecho. complacido. En blandamente Particularmente. il être que satisfait worden. Und sp particular, le soddisfatto. In em son for konnte Waldo nicht pareciaba la agradaba la anders, als auf seine particolare intérieur. Il atmósfera discreta, atmósfera sacra que appréciait en Art still erfreut zu apprezzava sagrada, del anexo envolvía la adjunta particulier sein. Als besonders l'atmosfera Mitchell, con todas Biblioteca Mitchell: l'atmosphère erhebend, ja, als discreta, quasi esas damas que todas esas damas que estudiaban la estudiaban las discrète et quasi geradezu weihevoll sacra, della sala di tradición religieuse où empfand er die lettura: tutte quelle tradiciones travaillaient les Atmosphäre des signore abbronzate australiana, y los australianas y los personnes attachées angeschlossenen che facevano studi periodistas que criptoperiodistas que aux publications Enzyklopädischen riguardanti buscaban elementos buscaban Mitchell<sup>1</sup>, toutes l'Australia, e quei para sus artículos información para los Insituts mit den ces dames rêveuses vielen braunen. cripto-giornalisti de los suplementos suplementos dominicales qui s'adonnaient à fremdländischen che consultavano i dominicales des études sur Damen, die in das loro articoli per i (WHITE, 1973a, p. (WHITE, 2016, p. l'Australie et tous Studium supplementi del 213). 290). australischer Sitten sabato (WHITE, ces mystérieux journalistes qui se und Gebräuche 1973c, p. 203). documentaient vertieft warren, und pour leurs articles den Krypto-Journalisten, die des suppléments du samedi. ihre Artikel für die 1. Collections de Sonntagsbeilagen documents sur recherchierten l'Australie. (N.d.T.) (WHITE, 1978, p. (WHITE, 1973b, 222). p. 206-207). **English First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised** 

## [...] The new building was still [...] O novo edifício ainda estava [...] O novo edifício ainda estava cheirando a verniz e borracha. Em cheirando a verniz e borracha. Em smelling of varnish and rubber. By comparison with those of the comparação com aqueles da velha comparação com aqueles da velha old Municipal, the books Municipal, os livros mesmo Municipal, livros mesmo themselves appeared new, or at pareciam novos, ou pelo menos, a pareciam novos, ou pelo menos, a the condition of their condição dos seus leitores não condição dos seus leitores não havia readers had not been ground into havia se triturado neles. Então se impregnado neles. Então Waldo

them. So Waldo could only feel quietly pleased. Particularly did he appreciate the discreet, the hallowed atmosphere of Mitchell attached - all those ladies brown studying Australiana, cryptoand journalists looking their articles Saturday supplements (WHITE, 1974, p. 182).

Waldo somente podia se sentir tranquilamente satisfeito. Particularmente ele apreciava a atmosfera discreta, venerada da Mitchell anexa – todas aquelas senhoras marrons estudando elementos australianos, e criptojornalistas melhorando seus artigos para os suplementos de sábado.

só podia se sentir placidamente satisfeito. Em particular, ele apreciava a atmosfera discreta, venerada da contígua Mitchell – todas aquelas senhoras marrons estudando elementos australianos, e criptojornalistas melhorando seus artigos para os suplementos de sábado.

We can see some substantial changes in the revised version: for "ground", we erroneously had opted for "triturado", but a better option is "impregnado", thus making the extract clearer. The changes in the adverbs ("só" instead of "somente" for "only" and "placidamente" instead of "tranquilamente" for "quietly") helped in the rhythm of the sentence, effect which is kept through the translation of the other adverb "particularly" using two words in Brazilian Portuguese ("em particular"/in particular). Another instance which was improved was the translation of "Mitchell attached" as "contígua Mitchell". In this option, instead of using the literal form, with the noun before the adjective (Mitchell anexa), we place another adjective – contígua (contiguous) – before the noun, producing a different effect in reading.

The noticeable element is the footnote in the French version, with some misleading information: the option "people attached to the publications Mitchell" to translate "Mitchell attached" does not seem proper, and the expression defined as "collections of documents about Australia" might apply to Australiana (translated as "studies about Australia"), but not to "Mitchell attached". It might be inferred that "attached" could have misled the translator to read it as if in the expression "be attached to somebody/something", which is what most dictionaries present when we look up for the syntagm "attached". The context in the original gives hints to the referential being the building of the Mitchell wing, and not the collection it contains: "atmosphere" is one of the hints, together with "the new building" at the beginning of the fragment. The Italian, on the other hand, did worse: it simply eliminated the explicit metioning of the cultural item, i.e., the Mitchell Library, and kept a more neutral reference: "a reading room". The Spanish translation was more literate, only transforming the adjective "attached" into a noun "attachment", thus producing "the attachment Mitchell", which is

closer to the reality being portrayed in the novel, when it refers to the Mitchell wing, inaugurated on 8 March 1910, which had its construction commissioned due to the lack of space by the turn of the 18<sup>th</sup> century. The collector of Australian books and documents (reffered to as "Australiana") David Scott Mitchell offered his collection to the people of New South Wales, under the condition that a new building would be erected to store the material as a separate library<sup>183</sup>, which eventually happened in 1906. It is clear that the new Spanish translation captured the meaning, thus conveying it ("la adjunta Biblioteca Mitchell").

"Australiana", as already mentioned, appears in the original and its translation is different in all versions: "studies about Australia" in both French and Italian and "Australian tradition" in Spanish. None of them decided to keep the form in the original as it is. The option in Brazilian Portuguese would be to keep the syntagm as it is, "Australiana", and then perhaps introduce a footnote to highlight that the word refers to, as seen on the website of The Australiana Society Inc., "items of portable heritage relating to or made in Australia<sup>184</sup>". Indeed, this lack of care concerning the Mitchell Library reference might be considered a loss in the French translation: perhaps a lack of perception of the importance of this element of local colour. Hence, this raises the topic: is it necessary to visit the place to be able to deal with Patrick White's oeuvre in translation? Much has been said about the necessity of visiting the location where the story takes places (or where the author dwelt during his life) – in the case of Patrick White, a visit to Sydney would apparently be *sine qua non*. Is that so? We asked this question to other translators, and the answers showed a healthy variation. The Serbian professor Nataša Kampmark replied to that:

The difficulties in translation when PW is concerned would most likely arise from his demanding style and also his vision as a writer. And, of course, there are always the culturally specific contexts that are difficult to translate into another culture. [...] Presence in Australia can certainly help. But for me the social studies about Australian society helped as well as good literary histories and criticism. <sup>185</sup>"

A visit to Sydney in that case during the 1970s might have spared the French translator of the inconsistency and, then, incoherence, of introducing a footnote which does not provide accurate information to the reader in French.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> More information available at the State Library of New South Wales website: http://www.sl.nsw.gov.au/about/history/. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> AUSTRALIANA SOCIETY, THE. **Australiana**. Available at: http://www.australiana.org.au/page-516363. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> KAMPMARK, Nataša. **Questions on translation!** [personal message]. Message received by: *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 28 Feb. 2014.

Another interesting point when comparing the translations refers to the day of the week when the supplements written by the cryptojournalists appears in the newspapers: two of the translations (French and Italian) kept the day of the original, which is Saturday. The other translations (German and the two Spanish versions) changed the day to Sunday. Here we have a question of culture: we might guess that, nowadays, in Brazil it is still traditional to see newspaper supplements being published on Sundays. However, a famous publication based in Porto Alegre, Correio do Povo, publishes its "Caderno de Sábado" (about literature, arts and culture) on Saturdays. Zero Hora, another local newspaper, decided to stop their Sunday edition, because they found out that the Saturday edition had a short life span. Thus, a more extended edition valid for the weekend would reach the reader on a Saturday too. Based on this information, we do not see the necessity of changing the day of the week present in the sentence. If the German and Spanish translations thought it would be more familiar to the reader to use the day in which the newspaper supplements were published in their respective countries, that it is a decision made by the translator following his/her own feelings and culture. Even if we did not have this datum about the newspapers in Porto Alegre changing the days of their supplement publication, we would maintain the original day, Saturday, in the translation, also to signal that things were different in Sydney.

Another word which is very connected to Australia's local colour is "bush", and it is pertinent to talk about it in this work, given it is a very specific natural element of the landscape of the new country for the characters, i.e., the twin brothers who move from England to Australia. As already exemplified, "bush" is one of those words which causes headaches for any translator, as its meaning varies according to the context. In the following exhibit, we present all the occurrences of the word in the novel:

Exhibit 40 - Bush

| French               | German              | Italian               | Spanish 1            | Spanish 2            |
|----------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Waldo continua à     | Waldo ging mit      | Waldo proseguì        | Waldo continuó       | Waldo continuaba     |
| faire crisser le sol | knirschenden        | facendo scricchiolare | haciendo crujir bajo | aplastando las       |
| broussailleux de la  | Schritten weiter    | la superficie mal     | sus pies la          | malezas que          |
| portion de           | über die            | tenuta e invasa dalle | descuidada           | cubrían la           |
| Terminus Road        | vernachlässigte     | erbacce di Terminus   | superficie de        | descuidada           |
| laissée à l'abandon. | Oberfläche der      | Road. Finalmente,     | arbustos de          | superficie de        |
| Ils n'allaient pas   | Terminus Road, die  | poco dopo, misero     | Terminus Road.       | Terminus Road. Al    |
| tarder               | hier eigentlich nur | piede sull'asfalto    | Muy pronto           | menos, pronto        |
| heureusement à       | ein Feldweg war.    | (WHITE, 1973c, p.     | llegarían al         | llegarían al asfalto |
| atteindre la partie  | Noch ein Stück      | 30).                  | pavimento            | (WHITE, 2016, p.     |

eles

menos

| goudronnée           | weiter, und sie      |     |                          | (WHIT    | E, 1973a, p.   | 66).                  |
|----------------------|----------------------|-----|--------------------------|----------|----------------|-----------------------|
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.    | kamen wenigstens     |     |                          | 32).     |                |                       |
| 36).                 | auf Asphalt          |     |                          |          |                |                       |
|                      | (WHITE, 1978, p.     |     |                          |          |                |                       |
|                      | 34).                 |     |                          |          |                |                       |
|                      |                      |     |                          |          |                |                       |
| Finalement les       | Am Ende waren di     | ie  | Alla fine le strade      | A fin d  | e cuentas,     | Al fin y al cabo, las |
| chemns de leur       | holprigen            |     | nela boscaglia della     | los can  | ninos de       | sendas de             |
| enfance taillés dans | Buschpfade der       |     | sua fanciullezza non     | arbusto  | s de su niñez  | matorrales de la      |
| la brousse n'étaient | Kindheit auch nich   | nt  | erano più lente da       | no eran  | más lentos     | niñez no eran más     |
| pas plus lents que   | länger und           |     | percorrere di quelle     | que los  | hechos por     | lentas que las        |
| les routes           | langsamer gewese     | n   | costruite dagli uomini   | los hon  | nbres con      | construídas por los   |
| aménagées par les    | als jene Straßen, d  | ie  | nell'illusione della     | illusion | nes de         | hombres con la        |
| hommes en vue        | sich der Mensch      |     | velocità e nella fretta  | velocid  | ad y de        | ilusión de la         |
| d'une vitesse et     | inzwischen voller    |     | dell'arrivo (WHITE,      | llegar r | nás pronto     | velocidade y de       |
| d'une arrivée        | Illusionen über      |     | 1973c, p. 65).           | (WHTI    | E, 1973a, p.   | llegar rápido         |
| illusoires (WHITE,   | Geschwindigkeit      |     |                          | 70).     |                | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |
| 1973b, p. 70).       | und Ankunft geba     | ut  |                          |          |                | 111).                 |
|                      | hatte (WHITE,        |     |                          |          |                |                       |
|                      | 1978, p. 71).        |     |                          |          |                |                       |
|                      |                      |     |                          |          |                |                       |
| Cette Maudite        | Diese scheußliche    |     | Quell'abominevole        | La hed   | ionda          | A esa horrible        |
| poupée, elle l'avait | Puppe hatte sie      |     | bambola l'aveva          | muñeca   | a que había    | muñeca la llevó al    |
| emportée en même     | dann                 |     | portata giù al canale    | sacado   | del desagüe    | barranco y la         |
| temps qu'une         | hinausgetragen un    | d   | di scarico e l'aveva     | con la a | azada y había  | sepultò con una       |
| bêche et était       | in der lockeren      |     | sepolta in una fossa     | enterra  | do en el       | pala en la tierra     |
| descendue le long    | Buscherde neben      |     | scavata col badile       | suelo b  | lando y        | suelta del matorral,  |
| du ravin afin de     | dem Bach             |     | nella boscaglia, sulla   | húmed    | o bajo los     | junto al arroyo       |
| l'enterrer dans le   | vergraben (WHITI     | Ε,  | riva del corso           | matorra  | ales, junto al | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |
| sol meuble de la     | 1978, p. 371).       |     | d'acqua (WHITE,          | arroyo   | (WHITE,        | 461).                 |
| brousse, près de la  |                      |     | 1973c, p. 336).          | 1973a,   | p. 350).       |                       |
| crique (WHITE,       |                      |     |                          |          |                |                       |
| 1973b, p. 342).      |                      |     |                          |          |                |                       |
| Englis               | sh                   |     | First Attempt            |          | Brazilian P    | ortuguese - Revised   |
| Waldo went on cru    | nching over the      | Wa  | ldo continuou a triturar | o solo   | Waldo cont     | inuou a esmagar o     |
| bush soil of the neg | lected surface of    | do  | <i>bush</i> da suj       | perfície | chão batic     | lo da superfície      |
| Terminus Road. Soo   | on at least they'd 1 | neg | ligenciada de Terminus   | Road.    | negligenciad   | a de Terminus Road.   |

Logo pelo menos eles sairiam no

asfalto.

Logo

pelo

encontrariam asfalto.

come out on tar (WHITE, 1974, p.

29)

After that the road opened out into one of those stretches, a replica of itself at many other points. On the road to Barranugli it was usual for Waldo Brown to forget which bits they had passed, even going quickly in the bus. In the end the bush roads of childhood were no slower than those made by men in the illusions of speed and arrival. (WHITE, 1974, p. 60).

That nasty doll she had took down the gully with the spade and buried it in the loose bush soil beside the creek. And felt a little easier (WHITE, 1974, p. 299).

Depois disso, a rua abriu-se em um daqueles alongamentos, réplica de si mesma em muitos pontos. Na rua para Barranugli era comum que Waldo Brown esquecesse que partes eles tinham passado, mesmo rápido no ônibus. No final as ruas de bush da infância não eram mais vagarosas do que aquelas feitas pelos homens nas ilusões da velocidade e da chegada.

Aquela boneca repugnante que ela havia jogado na valeta com a pá e enterrado naquele solo de *bush* solto ao lado do riacho. E se sentia um pouco mais sossegada.

Depois disso, a rua abriu-se em um daqueles alongamentos, uma réplica de si mesma em muitos outros pontos. Na rua para Barranugli era comum que Waldo Brown esquecesse que partes eles tinham passado, mesmo indo rápido no ônibus. No final as ruas de chão batido da infância não eram mais vagarosas do que aquelas feitas pelos homens nas ilusões da velocidade e da chegada.

Aquela boneca repugnante ela havia jogado na valeta com a pá e enterrado naquele chão batido solto ao lado do riacho. E se sentia um pouco mais sossegada.

Recalling the discussion presented earlier concerning the possibilities of translation for "bush" which mark the opposition between "what is Sydney" and "what is not Sydney", the word "interior" appears as an option. Notwithstanding, we find it quite hard, in this particular instance, to insert the word "interior" in the sentence. In our first attempt we kept the word "bush" and italicized it (perhaps with the possibility of including a footnote). As radical as it might sound, this decision, we believe, is possible because the context allows it. In the whole novel, there are 16 occurrences of "bush", but most of them are connected to other names, such as "gooseberry bush", "rosemary bush" and "blackberry bushes". However, after rereading the extracts, we arrived at the conclusion that the idea conveyed by "bush" in this case might indicate the unpaved road on which they were. Hence, the form "chão batido" immediately came up as an option in Brazilian Portuguese, and ended up being used in the revised version, since it alludes to the native material of the land surface, signaling here the opposition between what is "tarred" and "what is not tarred". As for changes in the fragments, we can highlight in the first scene the use of the form "encontrariam asfalto", instead of "surgiriam no asfalto" or "sairiam no asfalto", which, although being a more literal option to translate "come out", does not sound so natural in Brazilian Portuguese in this context. In the last scene, we call attention to the deletion of the relative pronoun "que" (that), after

"repugante", which, apparently insignificant, greatly added to the accuracy and flow of the whole sentence in the translated text.

As already stated in the previous item concerning the doubts of the Swedish translator, there are additional occurrences concerning food which represented challenges in our translation into Brazilian Portuguese and need some explanation. Food is another element of local colour, and, as such, should be rendered in the translation, even though sometimes it is quite hard (not to say impossible) to find any alternatives which might be convenient. One of the occurrences presented here about food is what Arthur was looking forward to eating: "rock cakes": The origin of these cakes is British. However, they were being prepared in Australia, so, an option for its translation requires some thinking.

Exhibit 41 – rock-cakes

| French                             | Germa               | an        | Italian                | $S_{l}$               | panish 1      | Spanish 2               |
|------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------|------------------------|-----------------------|---------------|-------------------------|
| Maman dit qu'elle                  | Mutter sagte        | , sie     | Mamma disse che        | Entone                | es la madre   | La madre dijo que       |
| confectionnerait des               | wolle Teeku         | chen      | avrebbe preparato      | había c               | licho que     | iba a hacer unos        |
| scones et peut-être                | backen und          |           | dei pasticcini di      | haría b               | izcochos y    | pastelitos, y tal vez   |
| quelques rock-cakes <sup>1</sup> , | vielleicht auch ein |           | farina d'orzo, e       | tal vez               | algunos de    | algunos budincitos      |
| sa spécialité.                     | paar ihrer          |           | magari dei             | sus pas               | stelitos.     | con frutas secas.       |
| "Oh, ouii! dit Arthur.             | besonderen          |           | croccanti.             | −¡Oh, sí! – había     |               | –¡Sí, mamá! – dijo      |
| Des rock-cakes,                    | Zuckerplätze        | chen.     | "Oooh, sì!"            | exclam                | nado Arthur – | Arthur –. Budincitos,   |
| Maman!"                            | »Ooh jaa!« s        | sagte     | esclamò Arthur.        | . ¡Paste              | elitos, mamá! | por favor.              |
| Il aimait le sucre                 | Arthur, »die        |           | "I croccanti,          | Le gus                | taban los que | Le gustaba la           |
| cristallisé dont ils               | Zuckerplätzchen,    |           | mammina!"              | tenían cristalitos de |               | cubierta de cristales   |
| étaient saupoudrés.                | Mum!«               |           | Gli piaceva            | azúcar encima         |               | de azúcar (WHITE,       |
|                                    | Er mochte die       |           | soprattutto lo         | (WHITE, 1973, p.      |               | 2016, p. 95).           |
| 1. Petits gateaux pour             | Zuckerkrista        | ılle, die | zucchero candito       | 56).                  |               |                         |
| le thé, à surface                  | auf ihre Obe        | rfläche   | che c'era sui          |                       |               |                         |
| irrégulière. (N.d.T.)              | gestreut wur        | den       | croccanti              |                       |               |                         |
| (WHITE, 1973, p.                   | (WHITE, 19          | 78, p.    | (WHITE, 1973, p.       |                       |               |                         |
| 58).                               | 58).                |           | 52).                   |                       |               |                         |
| English                            |                     |           | First Attempt          |                       | Brazilian P   | ortuguese – Revised     |
| Mother said she would              | d bake some         | Man       | nãe disse que faria al | lgumas                | Mamãe diss    | e que faria algumas     |
| scones, and perhaps a              | few of her          | broinha   | is, e talvez alguns d  | le seus               | broinhas, e   | talvez alguns de seus   |
| rock-cakes.                        |                     | bolinho   | os de frutas.          |                       | rock-cakes.   |                         |
| 'Ooh, yeees!' said A               | Arthur. 'The        | – Oo      | h, siiim! – disse Ar   | thur. –               | – Aah, siiir  | n! – disse Arthur. – Os |
| rock-cakes, Mum!'                  |                     | Os boli   | nhos de frutas, Mãe!   |                       | rock-cakes, N | ſãe!                    |

Ele gostava dos cristais de

Ele gostava dos cristais de açúcar

He liked the sugar-crystals on them

| (WHITE, 1974, p. 49). | açúcar por cima deles. | por cima deles. |  |
|-----------------------|------------------------|-----------------|--|
|-----------------------|------------------------|-----------------|--|

In Brazil, the kind of cake was translated as "bolinhos do Hagrid" (Harry Potter fans will recall that rock cakes were served when Hagrid received Harry Potter and his friends for a visit – it appears in the first book of the series), but we cannot use this alternative when translating this novel, since they were being prepared in Australia, before Harry Potter was even a reality. To find a possible alternative in Brazilian Portuguese not limited to "bolinho" and different from the first and sad attempt of "bolinhos de frutas" (since there are no any fruits in the recipe) was quite hard. We have the name "scone", which was borrowed from the English, and which differs from the rock cakes in one of its ingredients – since the rock cakes include egg – and in their shape, because the rock cakes really look like rocks when put on a tray – they are without any form, crunchy on the outside and soft on the inside.

In *Harry Potter e a Pedra Filosofal*, the Brazilian translator Lia Wyler opted for "biscoitos" ("cookies" or "biscuits"), as in "os biscoitos quase quebraram os dentes deles, mas Harry e Ron fingiram gostar" (ROWLING, 2000, p. 105) to translate "the rock cakes almost broke their teeth, but Harry and Ron pretended to be enjoying them" (ROWLING, 1997, p. 104), which keeps a broad array of meanings. When looking for possible translations, nothing convincing appeared (not even "bolo de rocha" or "bolo-rocha" as free translations). Given that we have not found any palatable alternative, we will keep the word as it is in English, and perhaps introduce a footnote, thus following what the French did.

## 4.9 LINGUISTIC DIFFERENCES AND NARRATIVE MARKS: THEIR IMPORTANCE IN TRANSLATION

In this part, we will discuss the translation of many excerpts in which the colonial conflict between British values and the new ones being acquired in the new land manifest themselves via linguistic differences which, in turn, are evident via narrative marks. We will list some puns which work quite well in English, but demand thought and creativity from the translator, as well as coherence.

The first extract is about quite a common difference in British culture that English learners become acquainted with at the beginning of their studies: the meals "tea" and "dinner". How one should keep this differentiation in a translation is the subject of much thought, and, because of its apparent simplicity, it might be overlooked:

Exhibit 42 – Tea/dinner

| French              | Germa          | an        | Italian                 |                      | Spanish 1          | Spanish 2              |
|---------------------|----------------|-----------|-------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|------------------------|
| La voix de Papa,    | Dann rief Va   | iter, der | Allora Papà, che        | Entor                | nces el padre,     | Entonces el padre,     |
| qui avait fait la   | im Eßzimme     | r         | aveva acceso la luce    | que h                | abía iluminado     | que había encendido    |
| lumière dans la     | inzwischen I   | Licht     | nella sala da           | el comedor, preguntò |                    | la lámpara del         |
| salle à manger,     | gemacht hatt   | e, von    | pranzo, chiamò          | desde                | e dentro:          | comedor, habló         |
| parvint alors de    | innen: »Wie    | wäre es   | dall'interno: "Non      | –¿Qu                 | é tal si tomamos   | desde adentro.         |
| l'intérieur:        | den mit dem    | Tee,      | prepari il tè?"         | el té,               | mamá?              | -¿No quieres un té,    |
| "Et si tu nous      | Mutter?«       |           | La sua voce aveva       | Su vo                | oz se dejó oír     | mamá?                  |
| donnais notre thé,  | Seine Stimm    | e klang   | di nuovo un tono        | cansa                | ıda otra vez,      | Sonaba cansado de      |
| Maman?"             | jetzt wieder   | müde      | stanco, e paziente.     | pacie                | nte.               | nuevo, y paciente.     |
| D'après son ton,    | und gedulig.   |           | Mamma rispose:          | La m                 | adre dijo          | La madre contestó      |
| il paraissait de    | Mutter sagte   | : »Ja«    | "Sì," ed entrò per      | "Bue                 | no", y fue, como   | que sí, y entró a la   |
| nouveau fatigué     | und ging ins   | Haus,     | preparare il pasto      | si nac               | da hubiese         | casa como si nada      |
| et semblait avoir   | als sei nichts |           | che avevano smesso      | pasad                | lo, a preparar la  | hubiera sucedido,      |
| repris patience.    | geschehen, u   | m sich    | di chiamare "cena"      | comida que había     |                    | para preparar la       |
| Maman répondit      | an die Vorbe   | reitung   | (WHITE, 1973c, p.       | dejado de llamar     |                    | comida que ya no       |
| "oui" et rentra     | der Mahlzeit   | zu        | 43).                    | "cena" (WHITE,       |                    | llamaba "cena"         |
| dans la maison      | Machen, die    | sie       |                         | 1973a, p. 46-47).    |                    | (WHITE, 2016, p.       |
| comme si rien ne    | schon seit la  | ngem      |                         |                      |                    | 83).                   |
| s'était passé, afin | nicht mehr a   | ls        |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| de préparer le      | »Dinner« zu    |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| repas qu'elle       | bezeichnen     |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| avait renoncé à     | versuchte (W   | HITE,     |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| qualifier de        | 1978, p. 48).  |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| "dîner" (WHITE,     |                |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| 1973b, p. 48).      |                |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| Englisl             | n              |           | First Attempt           |                      | Brazilian Po       | rtuguese - Revised     |
| Then Dad, who had   | l brought the  | Então F   | Papai, que havia ilumin | ado a                | Então Papai, qu    | ue havia iluminado a   |
| dining-room to ligh | t, called      | sala de   | jantar, chamou de dentr | o:                   | sala de jantar, ch | amou de dentro:        |
| from inside: 'What  | about tea,     | – Qu      | e tal o chá, Mamãe?     |                      | – Que tal o ja     | antar, Mamãe?          |
| Mother?'            |                | Ele p     | parecia cansado novan   | nente,               | Ele parecia        | cansado novamente, e   |
| He sounded tired ag | gain, and      | e pacier  | nte.                    |                      | paciente.          |                        |
| patient.            |                | Maı       | mãe disse:              |                      | Mamãe diss         | se:                    |
| Mother said:        | 'Yes,' and     | _         | Sim – e entrou, con     | no se                | – Sim – e          | entrou, como se nada   |
| went in, as if      | nothing had    | nada tiv  | vesse acontecido, para  | fazer                | tivesse acontec    | cido, para fazer a     |
| happened, to get t  | he meal she    | a refeiç  | ão que ela havia para   | do de                | refeição que ela   | havia parado de tentar |
| had stopped tryi    | ing to call    | tentar c  | hamar de "jantar".      |                      | chamar de "ceia"   | ,.                     |
| 'dinner' (WHITE,    | 1974, p. 40-   |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |
| 41).                |                |           |                         |                      |                    |                        |

The translators had a somewhat awkward understanding of the word "tea" in English, as all of them used as the immediate options for translation the forms "thé" (French), "Tee" (German), "tè" (Italian) and "té" (both Spanish versions). None of the options tried to make reference to a meal. When looking up the word on the Free Dictionary online in English, we have the following in the 5<sup>th</sup> entry: 5. (Cookery) Brit and Austral and NZ the main evening meal<sup>186</sup>. In Brazilian Portuguese, an option for the translation is "chá", which is the immediate translation for "tea". In the translation, using "chá" does not give the idea of a complete meal, needing some kind of complement, as in "chá das cinco" ("5 o'clock tea") - at least that is the example provided by the dictionary Aulete Digital, in its 6<sup>th</sup> entry<sup>187</sup>. However, in Brazil, coffee is much more consumed than tea, and "coffee" in general encompasses the meaning of a light meal between lunch and dinner. When looking for more alternatives, "ceia188" came up, a word commonly used in my region to refer to dinner (thus giving the idea of a complete meal), and which works to differentiate the times of those meals (one earlier and the other being the last meal of the day, or even the same as dinner). Therefore, we set the discussion between "tea" and "coffee" aside in order to use synonyms for the evening meals. Once again, all these excerpts are subject to change, as these are suggestions of how to deal with the numerous possibilities presented by the literary text.

One more occurrence, in which the speaker (Dulcie) realizes the possible polysemy of "tea", is presented next:

Exhibit 43 - Tea

| French            | German               | Italian Spanish 1     |                       | Spanish 2             |
|-------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| "Il faut que vous | »Du mußt zum Tee     | "Devi venire a        | – Tienes que venir a  | – Tienes que venir a  |
| veniez à la       | kommen.              | prendere il tè. Il tè | tomar el té. Por la   | tomar el té. A la     |
| maison. Pour le   | Irgendwann           | del pomeriggio.       | tarde. Y así podremos | tarde. Y tendremos    |
| gôuter. Et nous   | nachmittags. Und     | Faremo una bella      | charlar largo y       | una charla como se    |
| taillerons une    | dann können wir      | chiacchierata. Ho     | tendido. Tengo una    | debe. Tengo una       |
| bonne bavette.    | uns wieder mal so    | una collezione di     | colección de postales | colección de tarjetas |
| J'ai des cartes   | richtig unterhalten. | cartoline che ho      | que fui reuniendo     | postales que fui      |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> TEA. Definition. The Free Dictionary. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/tea. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> In its 6<sup>th</sup> entry, we have the meaning of a meal: "6. P.ext. Fig. Refeição leve entre o almoço e o jantar, em que a bebida ordinariamente é o chá: Chamou as amigas para o chá das cinco. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/ch%C3%A1. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> CEIA. Defintion in Brazilian Portuguese: "1. A última refeição do dia, entre o jantar e o sono noturno, ou em lugar do jantar." Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/ceia. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

| postales dont j'ai  | Ich habe eine   |        | fato quand'ero in       | mientras   | estábamos    | reuniendo cuando        |
|---------------------|-----------------|--------|-------------------------|------------|--------------|-------------------------|
| fait collection en  | Menge Postkar   | rten   | Europa. I miei          | en Europ   | a. Todos mís | estábamos en            |
| Europe. Mes         | gesammelt,      |        | cugini sono stati       | primos m   | e han        | Europa. Mis primos      |
| cousins ont été     | während wir in  |        | molto buoni con         | tratado m  | uy bien      | fueron muy amables      |
| très gentils pour   | Europa waren.   | Und    | me" (WHITE,             | (WHITE     | , 1973a, p.  | (WHITE, 2016, p.        |
| moi" (WHITE,        | meine Verwan    | dten   | 1973c, p. 145).         | 153).      |              | 216)                    |
| 1973b, p. 149).     | waren wirklich  | n net  |                         |            |              |                         |
|                     | zu mir« (WHI    | ΓE,    |                         |            |              |                         |
|                     | 1978, p. 158).  |        |                         |            |              |                         |
| English             |                 |        | First Attempt           |            | Brazilian I  | Portuguese - Revised    |
| 'You must come      | up to tea. To   | – Vo   | cê deve vir para o chá. | O chá da   | – Você deve  | e vir para o chá. O chá |
| afternoon tea. And  | we'll have a    | tarde. | E teremos uma boa       | história.  | da tarde. I  | E teremos uma boa       |
| good yarn. I've got | a collection of | Tenho  | o uma coleção de cartõe | es-postais | história. Te | nho uma coleção de      |
| post-cards I made   | while we were   | que    |                         |            |              | nis que fiz enquanto    |
| in Europe. My       | cousins were    | Europ  | oa. Meus primos foram   | queridos   | estávamos    | na Europa. Meus         |
| sweet to me' (WH    | IITE, 1974, p.  | comig  | go.                     |            | primos foran | n queridos comigo.      |
| 131).               |                 |        |                         |            |              |                         |

In French, the option "tea" was translated as "goûter", which would mean "an after-school snack". One should observe that Dulcie had to repeat that "it was an afternoon tea" so Waldo, with his British values and language, could understand that he was supposed to extend his stay at her house, and spend the evening there. The Italian translation opted for the literal form "tè", which, in its fifth entry in the dictionary, presents the meaning of a "family reception held in the afternoon in which tea is served".

Marriages are a source of discomfort to Patrick White, being portrayed as forms of convenient unions, rarely being synonymous with happiness. The marriage of Annie Qunatrell - "[...] never a Brown in spite of her love for that sallow little man with the gammy leg" (WHITE, 1966, p. 171) – and George Brown happened when the couple was still in England, but, if they were in Australia, would things perhaps have been different? Furthermore, they belonged to the Fabian Society (referring to the one in England, which was the origin of the movement). The translation of this expression will be marked by the domestication of the issue, since that movement existed in Brazil as well, being known as Sociedade Fabiana (although the name translated this way might cause some estrangement).

Exhibit 44 – Marry Beneath You

| French German Itanian Spainsn 1 Spainsn 2 | French | German | Italian | Spanish 1 | Spanish 2 |
|---|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-----------|
|---|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-----------|

[...] Un jour que celui-ci soufflait, Papa hocha la tête en direction du vent et dit: "On ne fait pas mieux pour réaliser à bon compte les aspirations de chacun." C'etait le type de remarque qui plaisait à Maman. Pour des réflexions de ce genre Elle S'Était Mésalliée (WHITE, 1973b, p. 42).

[...] Einmal, als es besonders warm und angenehm blies, deutete Vater mit dem Kopf in die Windrichtung und sagte: »Die Erfüllung großer Träume, und dazu noch billig.« Das war die Art von Bemerkung, die Mutter gefiel. Um solcher kleinen Pointen willen hatte sie bei ihrer Heirat **UNTER SICH GEGRIFFEN** (WHITE, 1978, p. 42).

[...] Una volta, mentre soffiava il vento australe, Papà mosse di scatto la testa nella direzione del vento, e disse: "Ecco il sistema più a buon mercato per soddisfare le aspettative di tutti." Era il tipo di considerazioni che piacevano a Mamma. Era per particolari del genere che aveva sposato un uomo di classe inferiore (WHITE, 1973c, p. 36-37).

[...] Cierta vez, mientras soplaba el Meridional, el padre giró su cabeza bruscamente havia el viento y comentó: - Prácticamente, ésta es la satisfacción más barata de las expectativas de cualquiera. Esta era la classe de observaciones que subyugaba a la madre. Era por comentários como éste que se había casado com alguien de menor rango social (WHITE, 1973a, p. 39-40).

[...] en especial cuando se levantaba viento del sur. Cierta vez en que soplaba viento del sur, el padre sacudió la cabeza como si lo señalara y comentó: "Una de las satisfacciones más baratas que nos cabe esperar". Era el tipo de comentario que le gustaba a la madre. Por detalles como ese se había casado com Alguien de condición social inferior (WHITE, 2016, p. 74).

## **English** First Attempt Brazilian Portuguese - Revised [...] especialmente no fim do dia, [...] particularly after [...] especialmente no fim do dia, southerly had come. Once when com o vento sul. Uma vez quando o com o vento sul. Uma vez quando o the southerly was blowing, Dad vento sul estava soprando, Papai vento sul se levantou, Papai virou jerked his head in the direction of virou sua cabeça na direção do sua cabeça naquela direção, e disse: the wind, and said 'Just about the vento, disse: cheapest fulfiment of anybody's - Quase a realização das - Não é qualquer expectativa que expectations.' It was the kind of expectativas de qualquer um. Era o pode ser realizada de graça. Era o remark which appealed tipo de comentário que agradava a tipo de comentário que agradava a Mother. For touches like that she Mamãe. Alusões assim eram o Mamãe. Por toques como esse que Married Beneath Her motivo por ela ter aceitado se Casar ela Havia se Casado Aquém (WHITE, 1966, p. 35) Dela/aceitado a Diferença com Alguém de Outra Classe. Classe.

The expression "marry beneath you" is particularly interesting in the case involving different social classes not only in Brazilian Portuguese, but in the other languages presented. Later in the novel, there is a sort of complement to the expression, which helps explain the whole situation: "What is more, Mother changed, as though the moral responsibility of protecting a marriage with a man not her social equal had at last been lifted" (WHITE, 1966, p. 161). In our first (and literal) attempt, we used the expression "aquém de", meaning "inferior" in Brazilian Portuguese, together with the verb "casar" (to marry), but the result was very disappointing. In the first revision, another option came out: "aceitar a diferença de classe" ("accept the class difference"), which would explain the expression while eliminating the idea of "marriage", since the verb connected to that disappears. However, this again was not what we were looking for: a way of saying it in Brazilian Portuguese which would incorporate the meanings involved in the relationship of George and Anne. To sort that out, more words were necessary to render the idea more clearly, therefore, we introduced "eram o motivo" ("were the reason why") and "Casar com Alguém de Outra Classe" ("marry someone of another class") – with "other" already supposing an inferior one –, which enabled us to maintain the capital letters of the words, keeping the emphasis of the original, as well as the hint to the other implied ideas.

In the Italian and Spanish translations, the solution presented is "had married someone from a lower social level". The meaning was kept (as in Brazilian Portuguese, the same idea would be suggested: "havia se casado com alguém de menor nível social"), but there is not a similar expression either in Brazilian Portuguese or in Spanish or Italian which could be replaced properly. The translations did not keep the capital letters of the original, which are clearly used for emphasis. The new Spanish translation, though, italicizes the expression, but only with the first word appearing with the capital letter. The solution, hence, is often to describe, to explain the expression with other words, making it more explicit to the reader, employing what Antoine Berman names "expansion":

an *unfolding* of what, in the original, is "folded". Now, from the viewpoint of the text, this expansion can be qualified as "empty". It can coexist well with diverse quantitative forms of impoverishment. I mean that *the addition adds nothing*, that it augments only the gross mass of text, without augmenting its way of speaking or signifying" (BERMAN, 2000, p. 282).

In the French translation, the expression was not unfolded and kept the capital letters of the original, perhaps because the very meaning of the verb "se mésallier" captures the essence of the expression in English: "Se marier à quelqu'un jugé de condition inférieure<sup>189</sup>".

When translating this part, let us recall that Patrick White's fictional marriages are not described as happy events, with this one in particular being an "unnatural" one which generated "two distorted children" (GIFFIN, 1996, p. 231). How to choose the proper words in Brazilian Portuguese will certainly have significant implications, after all, the social realities between Australia, Britain (as we can infer from the story that they married in England and then moved to Australia) and Brazil (the receptor of the text) were quite different at the time. Simply taking into account the linguistic aspects, without giving due relevance to the social, cultural and historical issues underlying the use of the expression, will generate a poor result which will not reflect the complexity of the novel, evident in these subtleties. The version in Brazilian Portuguese will keep the strategy explained by Antoine Berman: it is necessary to make it long, to explain it, in the absence of an expression which, like the French, captures the function found in English.

We have already seen a scene in which the same kind of construction was used by White to signal a tacit conflict between the old world *versus* the new world, represented, respectively, by Anne Quantrell and Waldo Brown on one side (British values) and Arthur on the other (the new Australian life in the new country). For example, the mother expresses her English upbringing and values via expressions in capital letters which need to be kept in the translation, otherwise this hint to the differences manifest in the way they speak will not be noticed. When asked whether she had more children in addition to the twins – "Well, two is plenty, I think" (WHITE, 1974, p. 32) –, Anne Brown replied: "No, there aren't any others" (WHITE, 1974, p. 31). Let us have a look at the narrator's comment following her reply:

Exhibit 45 - Bad Thing in a New Country

| French              | German               | Italian              | Spanish 1       | Spanish 2           |
|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------|---------------------|
| Maman aurait peut-  | Mutter nicht so eine | Mamma avrebbe        | La madre podría | De no haber tenido  |
| être bougonné, si   | gute Erziehung       | brontolato se non le | haber llegado a | tan buenos modales, |
| on ne lui avait pas | genossen hätte. Sie  | fosse stata          | gruñir si no    | la madre podría     |
| appris les bonnes   | war zu               | insegnata la buona   | hubiera sido    | haber gruñido.      |
| manières dans sa    | zurückhaltend, oder  | educazione. Era      | enseñada a      | Decían que era      |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> DICTIONNAIRE DE FRANÇAIS LARROUSE. Se mésallier. Available at: http://www.larousse.fr/dictionnaires/francais/se\_m%C3%A9sallier/50683?q=m%C3%A9sallier#50574. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

| jeunesse. Elle se       | englisch, wie            | die       | un'immigrata          | guai  | rdar la calma.                      | parca, o inglesa. No   |
|-------------------------|--------------------------|-----------|-----------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|------------------------|
| montrait, comme on      | Leute sagten             |           | dall'Inghilterra.     | -     | lo que la                           | se prodigaba, y eso    |
| disait, évasive, ou     | GING NICH                |           | Non era uscita dal    |       | te llamaba                          | no estaba bien visto   |
|                         |                          |           |                       | -     |                                     |                        |
| anglaise. Elle          | SICH SELBS               | ST        | niente, e questo non  | "bla  | nda", o                             | (WHITE, 2016, p.       |
| Restait Sur La          | HERAUS, u                | nd das    | era um titolo di      | ingl  | esa. No se                          | 70).                   |
| Réserve, Mauvais        | war EINE                 |           | merito in un paese    | entr  | egaba con los                       |                        |
| Point dans un pays      | SCHLECHT                 | E         | nuovo (WHITE,         | dem   | as, lo cual                         |                        |
| neuf (WHITE,            | SACHE, wei               | nn man    | 1973c, p. 33).        | NO    | ES BUENO                            |                        |
| 1973b, p. 39).          | in einer neuen           |           |                       | si se | e está en un                        |                        |
|                         | Heimat seßh              | aft       |                       | país  | que no es el                        |                        |
|                         | warden wollte            |           |                       | prop  | pio (WHITE,                         |                        |
|                         | (WHITE, 1978, p.         |           |                       | 197   | 3a, p. 35).                         |                        |
|                         | 38).                     |           |                       |       |                                     |                        |
| English                 |                          |           | First Attempt         |       | Brazilian P                         | ortuguese - Revised    |
| Mother might have b     | een grunting             | Mamãe     | podia estar grunhi    | indo  | Mamãe podia                         | ter grunhido aquilo se |
| it if she hadn't been t | aught how to             | aquilo s  | e ela não tivesse     | sido  | ela não tivess                      | se aprendido como se   |
| behave. She was         | what people              | ensinada  | a como se comportar.  | Ela   | comportar. Ela era o que as pessoas |                        |
| called vague, or E      | English. She             | era o que | e as pessoas chamavan | n de  | chamavam de                         | vaga, ou Inglesa. Ela  |
| didn't Come Out         | Out of Herself, vaga, ou |           | Inglesa. Ela não Saía | De    | não Saía De Si                      | i, o que era Algo Ruim |
| which was a Bad Th      | ing in a new             | Si, o que | e era uma Coisa Ruim  | em    | em um novo p                        | aís.                   |
| country (WHITE, 197     | 74, p. 32).              | um novo   | país.                 |       |                                     |                        |

When looking at the solutions presented by each translator, different strategies come out: the French used the capital letters, as well as the German, Italian and Spanish versions. However, when we read the new Spanish translation, we see that it deletes the reference to a new country, just keeping the idea that the attitude of the character was inadequate. This apparently goes against the feeling of the novel, which is precisely to emphasize the movement from one place in Europe to a new place in another continent, thus contrasting metropolitan versus colonial behaviours. Therefore, it is fundamental to pay attention to what the text presents, to make the story clear to the reader. Once again, considerations about verb usage need mentioning: to translate "might have been grunting", instead of the continuous form, we opted for the past, giving the idea of the completeness of the action, which worked quite well in Brazilian Portuguese. Furthermore, we call attention to the form "havia aprendido" instead of "havia sido ensinada" as an alternative for "hadn't been taught", which makes all the difference in the flow of the translated text and helps make a verbal connection of the sentences in Brazilian Portuguese. The emphasis through the capital letters was duly kept, as in the original. One last change was made: instead of uma Coisa, we ended up using

"Algo" (deleting the indefinite article in Portuguese), to increase the level of formality (we can hear Anne Quantrell saying that in our mind) while reducing the number of words.

Still connected to the English way of speaking, the next scene describes how Waldo keeps correcting Arthur's speech when they are still schoolboys:

Exhibit 46 – Waldo's English Correction

| French                   | Gern              | nan        | Italian                  |        | Spanish 1         | Spanish 2             |
|--------------------------|-------------------|------------|--------------------------|--------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| "Je suis                 | »Ich bin ab       | er so      | "Sono così stanco,"      | – Esto | y así de          | – Estoy así cansado   |
| énormément               | ganz mude         | «, sagte   | diceva Arthur,           | cansa  | do –              | – solía decir Arthur  |
| fatigué, disait          | Arthur dan        | n immer,   | posando la testa sul     | acostı | ımbraba a decir   | apoyando la cabeza    |
| Arthur en laissant       | legte den K       | opf auf    | banco e facendo un       | Arthu  | r, recostando la  | en el pupitre y       |
| tomber sa tête sur       | die Bank u        | nd         | rumore come se           | cabez  | a sobre el        | haciendo un ruído     |
| son bureau et en         | machte ein        |            | fosse stitico e si       | pupitı | e y haciendo un   | como si estuviera     |
| geignant comme           | Geräusch,         | als hätte  | sforzasse al             | ruido  | como si tuviera   | estreñido e hiciera   |
| s'il était constipé et   | er Verstopf       | ung und    | gabinetto.               | estreñ | imiento y         | fuerza en el retrete. |
| qu'il faisant des        | müsse auf         | dem Klo    | "Non devi dire           | debie  | ra hacer fuerza.  | – No se dice "así     |
| efforts au cabinet.      | heftig drüc       | ken.       | 'così stanco'. È         | – No   | se dice "así de". | de cansado". Solo     |
| – Pas                    | »Es heißt n       | icht «so   | sufficiente              | Se dio | ce sólo           | cansado –             |
| 'énormément'             | ganz>. Entv       | veder      | 'stanco'," lo            | "cans  | ado" – decía      | contestaba Waldo,     |
| fatigué, simplement      | <so> oder ५६</so> | ganz›!«    | correggeva Waldo,        | Wald   | o, más            | tan melindroso        |
| 'fatigué'", corrigea     | korrigierte       | Waldo      | sempre con               | puntil | loso que nunca    | siempre (WHITE,       |
| Waldo d'un ton           | ihn mit Str       | enge       | quell'aria di            | (WHI   | TE, 1973a, p.     | 2016, p. 85).         |
| doctoral (WHITE,         | (WHITE, 1         | 978, p.    | superiorità              | 48).   |                   |                       |
| 1973b, p. 50).           | 50).              |            | (WHITE, 1973c, p.        |        |                   |                       |
|                          |                   |            | 44).                     |        |                   |                       |
| English                  |                   |            | First Attempt            |        | Brazilian Po      | rtuguese - Revised    |
| 'I'm that tired,' Arthu  | ur used to        | – Estou    | tri cansado – Arthur     | dizia, | – Estou tri can   | sado – Arthur dizia,  |
| say, laying his head of  | on the desk,      | deitando   | sua cabeça na clas       | sse, e | deitando sua c    | cabeça na classe, e   |
| and making the noise     | as though         | fazendo    | o barulho como se ti     | ivesse | fazendo o baru    | lho como se tivesse   |
| he had constipation a    | nd was            | constipaç  | ção e estivesse se esfor | çando  | constipação e es  | tivesse se esforçando |
| straining on the dunn    | y.                | na latrina | ı.                       |        | na latrina.       |                       |
| 'It isn't "that". It's j | ust "tired",      | – Não o    | é "tri". É só "cansac    | do" –  | – Não é "tri".    | É só "cansado" –      |
| Waldo used to say, e     | ver so prim       | Waldo di   | izia, muito puritano.    |        | Waldo dizia, ser  | mpre muito metido.    |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 42      | 2).               |            |                          |        |                   |                       |

When analysing the options, all translations kept the difference in the character's speeches, as well as rendering different interpretations (all equally valid) about Waldo's way of demonstrating his superiority in correcting Arthur. My natural option in the use of "tri" as an

alternative to "that" would not be accepted if the translation were going to be edited by a publisher located in Sao Paulo or Rio de Janeiro, because it is a very strong linguistic mark, immediately identifying the origin of the translation: Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil's southernmost state. As alternatives, we would use "cansado pra dedéu" or "cansado pra caramba", which would work in the context for being common informal expressions in standard Brazilian Portuguese. As for the adjective ending the section, our first option "puritano" (puritan) for "prim" is not the best one in this context. From the many options available, we chose "metido" ("big-headed"), as it would be closer to Waldo's personality, according to our reading.

Another item which needs to be dealt with connected to informality appears in the following sentence, with Mr Allwright's Australian (or everyday, informal) speech:

Exhibit 47 – Informal Speech

| French                            | Germa           | n   | Italian                 | S      | panish 1                               | Spanish 2            |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------|---|-------------------------|--------|--|----------------------|
| "Les petits gars,                 | »Diese junger   | n   | "Questi giovanotti,"    | – Los  | jóvenes –                              | – Lo muchacho – se   |
| dit-il, c'est un peu              | Burschen-«er    |   | disse, "sono un po'     | dijo – | son                                    | comía las eses al    |
| trop malin. Trop                  | sprach die Vo   | okale   | troppo intelligenti.    | dema   | siados listos.                         | hablar – son         |
| d'imagination, ça                 | ganz anders a   | ius,  | La troppa fantasia      | Dema   | siada                                  | demasiado pícaro.    |
| pourrait leur causer              | nicht englisch  | ı,  | potrebbe metterli       | imagi  | nación                                 | Pueden verse en      |
| des ennuis"                       | sondern eben    | wie   | nei pasticci."          | podrí  | a acarrearles                          | problema con tanta   |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.                 | hier. in Austr  | alien,  | (WHITE, 1973c, p.       | probl  | emas                                   | imaginación (WHITE,  |
| 253).                             | »diese junger   | ı   | 250).                   | (WHI   | TE, 1973a,                             | 2016, p. 350).       |
|                                   | Burschen        |   |                         | p. 260 | )).                                    |                      |
|                                   | heutzutage sin  | nd  |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | immer ein biß   | 3chen   |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | zu Schlau. At   | ber   |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | wer zuviel      |   |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | Phantasie hat   | , kann  |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | leicht in       |   |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | Schwierigkei    | ten   |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | kommen« (W      | HITE,   |                         |        |  |                      |
|                                   | 1978, p. 272)   |   |                         |        |  |                      |
| English                           |                 |   | First Attempt           |        | Brazilian                              | Portuguese - Revised |
| 'Young fullers,' he pronounced    |                 | - Essa  | a gurizada levada -     | - ele  | ele – Essa gurizada novata – ele       |                      |
| the 'fell-' to rhyme with 'gull', |                 | pronunc   | ciou o "zada" para rima | r com  | com pronunciou o "zada" para rimar com |                      |
| 'young fullers,' he sa            | aid, 'are a bit | "vada"  | - disse ele - tá um     | pouco  | co "vata" – disse ele – tá um pouco    |                      |
| too sharp. Too much               | imagination     | esperta demais. Muita imaginação esperta demais. Muita imagin |                         |        | nais. Muita imaginação                 |                      |

| could get them into trouble' | poderia colocar eles em apuros. | poderia encrencá eles. |
|------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------|
| (WHITE, 1966, p. 223).       |                                 |                        |
|                              |                                 |                        |

When seeing the translations, the German and the newest Spanish translation kept the reference to the way Mr Allwright spoke. The omission would be noticed only by a very special reader, who would take her/his time to make this contrastive reading. Notwithstanding, it was possible to try to work with some aspect of the way the character speaks, so the idea would be kept in the translation, albeit the impossibility of equivalence in terms of meaning and or style. There is a repetition of "young fullers" after the narrator's apposition, maybe to confirm Mr Allwright's way of speaking. "Fullers", already being a colloquial form, would probably require an informal alternative in French and Italian too, to keep the character's level of informality (if we consider only this version, it seems that Mr Allwright has a standard way of speaking). In Brazilian Portuguese, we decided to follow rhymes while using popular words, and the adding one more popular mark of speech by dropping out the "r" at the end of the verbal form "encrencar". Many other alternatives, such as the one used by the new Spanish translation, by dropping out the "s", would be acceptable. We added a regional mark by using "gurizada" (which is another reference to the South of Brazil). Once again, if a less regional alternative is required, "mulecada" (with "u" instead of "o" to mark an informal register and a possible mistake) would be used, since it keeps an interesting aural reference in Brazilian Portuguese too (mulecada levada). About Australian English, the comment by Ken Inglis is significant:

In the society from which [the currency lads and lasses'] parents had come, internal migration was producing rapid changes in patterns of language, including amalgamation of accents and vocabularies. A convict born of Irish immigrants in Liverpool, for example, had grown up learning English of Ireland and of Lancashire. In the colony he migt marry a woman from another part of England, and he would live among people from various regions of the United Kingdom. His own children would be exposed to a very wide range of voices. The currency accent was a new mixture of old sounds, in which particular influences from London, Birmingham, Dublin and elsewhere could be detected by ears familiar with the originals. There were also currency idioms, deriving often from the streets and dens of criminals' world at home, and passed on by convicts not only to their children but to those of free settlers to whom they were assigned as servants (INGLIS, 1993, p. 45).

In the case of the novel, Arthur is the one who seems to be trying to reproduce his new accent, or way of speaking, being frequently corrected by Waldo. Mr Allwright's speech represents an informal register and, in the translation, admittedly there will be some losses, since all the wealth of the linguistic variety might not be duly expressed in our Brazilian Portuguese

variety, as some choices will mean that other options will not be used (for example, if we use a Northeastern variety, this means that the Southern variety will not be chosen). However, to simply delete the informal register by using the standard (and/or formal) register goes against the purpose of the translation in trying, as much as possible, to convey this particular society and all its characteristics to the reader in the foreign language. In the same line of thought, and representing a potential for losses, the translations of the puns presented in the novel are quite challenging, the first being the most salient: the surname Brown.

Exhibit 48 - Colour/surname Brown

| French                | German                | Italian             | Spanish 1                            | Spanish 2             |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| "Nous n'avons pas     | »Was hättest du       | "Non abbiamo        | <ul> <li>No hemos pensado</li> </ul> | – Todavía no          |
| songé à la couleur    | gerne, Annie?« fragte | ancora pensato di   | de qué color                         | pensamos de qué       |
| que nous choisirons   | er.                   | che colore          | pintaremos la casa –                 | color pintarla – dijo |
| pour peindre la       | »Ach – ich!« Und      | dipingeremo la      | dijo subítamente el                  | de pronto el padre.   |
| maison."              | Mutter zeigte den     | casa," venne in     | papá, tan pronto                     | La madre estaba       |
| Maman effilait des    | eleganten Schwung     | mente               | como reparó en ello.                 | pelando unas          |
| haricots dont c'était | ihrer schmalen Kehle. | all'improvviso a    | Como estaban dentro                  | vainas.               |
| la saison.            | »Hast du denn keine   | Papà.               | de la casa, la madre                 | −¿Qué te parece,      |
| "Qu'est-ce qui te     | Ideen?«               | Mamma stava         | enhebraba cuentas.                   | Annie? – dijo él.     |
| plairait, Annie?      | »Ideen?« fragte sie.  | togliendo i fili ai | – Qué color te                       | – ¿A mí? – la         |
| demanda-t-il.         | »Ja«, sagte sie.      | fagiolini.          | imaginas, Annie? –                   | madre estiró el       |
| "Oh, moi!"            | »Ideen – und          | "Che colore         | preguntó el padre.                   | largo cuello.         |
| Maman tendit son      | Illusionen. Genau das | preferiresti,       | – Por qué yo? –                      | −¿No tienes           |
| long cou.             | war es ja.«           | Annie?" chiese.     | repuso la madre                      | ninguna idea?         |
| "Tu n'as pas          | »Aber irgendeine      | "Oh, io"            | irguiendo su largo                   | −¿Ideas? Por          |
| d'idées?              | Farbe muß es doch     | Mamma inarcò        | cuello.                              | supuesto! –           |
| Des idées? dit-elle.  | sein. Rot oder weiß   | all'insù il suo     | - ¿Acaso no piensas?                 | contestò – . De eso   |
| Bien sûr que oui!     | oder grün.«           | lungo collo.        | – ¿Piensar? – dijo ela               | me acusan siempre.    |
| C'est bien ce qu'on   | Arthur fing plötzlich | "Non hai qualche    | ¡Claro! De eso me                    | – Pero tenemos que    |
| m'a reproché.         | an zu zittern und     | idea?" domandò      | acusan.                              | pintarla de algún     |
| -Mais il faut bien    | kicherte.             | Papà.               | – Pues debemos                       | color. Rojo, blanco,  |
| que nous              | Ungefähr das war der  | "Qualche idea?"     | pintar de <i>algún</i> color.        | verde.                |
| choisissions une      | Zeitpunkt, an dem     | essa fece eco.      | Rojo, verde, blanco.                 | Arthur comenzó a      |
| couleur               | Waldo für sich        | "Sì!" disse. "Sono  | Arthur empezó a                      | reírse por lo bajo.   |
| quelconque. Du        | erkannte, daß seine   | infatti stata       | reírse y a sacudirse.                | Fue por esa época     |
| rouge du blanc du     | restlichen            | accusata di avere   | Fue en esa época que                 | cuando Waldo          |
| vert."                | Familienmitglieder    | dele idee."         | Waldo decidió que                    | llegó a la            |
| Arthur commença à     | ebenso hoffnungslos   | "Ma la nostra       | todos los miembros                   | conclusión de que     |

ricaner tout bas et à trembler. C'est à peu près à cette époque-là que Waldo jugea que tous les membres de la famille étaient désespérants, mais inévitables. "Ou du brun, reprit Papa. Le brun est une couleur pratique. Et par saint Georges, c'est tout indiqué dans le cas particulier<sup>1</sup>." Il s'en amusa finalement, lui aussi, parce qu'il avait fait un jeu de mots approprié. "Le brun, c'est pratique, oui", répondit doucement Maman en regardant ses doigts et les haricots effilés. 1. Jeu de mots sur Brown et sur George, intraduisible en français. (N. d. T.) (WHITE, 1973b, p. 45-46)

wie unausweichlich warren. »Oder auch braun«, sagte Vater. «Braun ist eine praktishce Farbe. Und sie würde, bei Gott, auch wirklich passen in unserem Fall, nicht wahr?« Sogar er war amüsiert, denn endlich war es ihm wieder einmal gelungen, einen seiner Witze zu formulieren und anzubringen. »Braun – ja, Braun ist eine praktische Farbe«, sagte Mutter und blickte auf ihre Hände und auf die abgefädelten Bohnen (WHITE, 1978, p. 45).

casa dovrà pur avere un colore. Rosso, bianco, verde..." Arthur cominciò a ridacchiare e ad agitarsi. Fu allora che Waldo decise che ogni membro della sua famiglia era senza speranza ma che questo era inevitable. "O marrone," propose Papà. "Il marrone è un colore pratico. E adatto a noi, non ti pare?"1 Anche lui era finalmente divertito per il suo riuscito gioco di parole. "Sì, il marrone è un colore pratico," confermò Mamma a bassa voce, guardando le proprie dita e i fagiolini mondati. <sup>1</sup> Brown, in

inglese, significa marrone. (*N. d. T.*) (WHITE, 1973c, p. 40) de su familia eran incurables pero inevitables. − O marrón¹ − dijo el papá –. El marrón es un color práctico. Y muy apropriado para nosotros, ¿no? También él se alegró, finalmente, por haber hecho un chiste oportuno. - Marrón, sí; es un color práctico comentó suavemente la madre, mirando sus dedos y sus cuentas. 1. *Marrón*, en inglés: Brown. (N. del T.) (WHITE, 1973a, p. 43)

todos los integrantes de su família eran casos perdidos pero imposibles de evitar. O marrón v dijo el padre –. El marrón es práctico. Y también conveniente, demonios! Estaba sumamente divertido porque había hecho un chiste muy gracioso. -Sí, el marrón es práctico – dijo la madre en voz baja mirando los porotos pelados y sus propios dedos (WHITE, 2016, p. 79).

| English                             | First Attempt                        | Brazilian Portuguese - Revised       |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| 'We haven't thought what colour     | - Não pensamos que cor pintar        | - Não pensamos em que cor pintar     |
| to paint our house,' it suddenly    | nossa casa – ocorreu ao Papai        | nossa casa – ocorreu ao Papai        |
| occurred to Dad.                    | repentinamente.                      | repentinamente.                      |
| Mother was stringing beans          | A Mamãe estava descascando           | A Mamãe estava descascando           |
| because they were in.               | vagens.                              | vagens.                              |
| 'What do you fancy, Annie?' he      | – O que você deseja, Annie? – ele    | – Qual você deseja, Annie? – ele     |
| asked.                              | perguntou.                           | perguntou.                           |
| 'Oh, I!'                            | – Oh, eu!                            | – Oh, eu!                            |
| Mother held up her long throat.     | Mamãe ergueu sua longa garganta.     | Mamãe ergueu sua longa garganta.     |
| 'Haven't you any ideas?'            | – Você não tem nenhuma ideia?        | – Você não tem nenhuma ideia?        |
| 'Ideas!' she said. 'Yes!' she said. | – Ideias! – disse ela – Sim! –disse  | – Ideias! – disse ela – Sim! –disse  |
| 'That is what they accused me       | ela. –Foi disso de que me acusaram.  | ela. – Foi disso de que me acusaram. |
| of.'                                |                                      |                                      |
| 'But we must have some sort of      | – Mas devemos ter algum tipo de      | – Mas devemos ter algum tipo de      |
| colour. Red white green.'           | cor. Vermelho branco verde.          | cor. Vermelho branco verde.          |
| Arthur began to snigger and         | Arthur começou a rir entre os        | Arthur começou a rir entre os dentes |
| shake.                              | dentes e tremer.                     | e tremer.                            |
| It was about this time that Waldo   | Foi nessa época que Waldo decidiu    | Foi nessa época que Waldo decidiu    |
| decided every member of his         | que cada membro de sua família era   | que cada membro de sua família era   |
| family was hopeless but             | irremediável mas inevitável.         | irremediável mas inevitável.         |
| inevitable.                         |                                      |                                      |
| 'Or brown,' said Dad. 'Brown is a   | – Ou marrom – disse Papai. –         | – Ou marrom – disse Papai. –         |
| practical colour. And, by George,   | Marrom é uma cor prática. E, por     | Marrom é uma cor prática. E, por     |
| appropriate, isn't it?'             | Deus, apropriada, não é?             | São Jorge, apropriada, não é?        |
| He too was amused at last           | Ele também estava satisfeito afinal  | Ele também estava satisfeito afinal  |
| because he had made an              | porque ele havia feito uma           | pois havia feito uma brincadeira     |
| appropriate joke.                   | brincadeira apropriada.              | apropriada.                          |
| 'Brown, yes, is a practical         | – Marrom, sim, é uma cor prática –   | – Marrom, sim, é uma cor prática –   |
| colour,' said Mother soflty,        | disse a Mamãe suavemente,            | disse a Mamãe suavemente, olhando    |
| looking at her fingers and the      | olhando para seus dedos e os feijões | para seus dedos e os feijões         |
| pared beans (WHITE, 1974, p.        | descascados.                         | descascados.                         |
| 38).                                |                                      |                                      |

All of the translations used footnotes to explain that there is a pun there, connected to the surname of the characters and the colour. Had we other colours and the pun could have been kept (such as rose or pink for the surname Rosa in Portuguese). We have tried to think of possible alternatives for the surname, such as Castanho. However, were we to adopt such strategy, then all the names would have to be changed, such as Mrs Dun (which is an aural

reference to dung) – the same about Mr Allwright (Sr. Tudo Certo), Mrs Poulter (Sra. Avicultora) and so on. Another pun which was identified only by the French translation refers to the name George. In Brazilian Portuguese, in our revision, we attempted to allude to this reference by putting "por São Jorge", which would introduce a religious tone. The next pun involves the orality of (w)holeness in the following context:

Exhibit 49 – Orality with (W)hole

| French                 | German  | Italian             | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2                             |
|------------------------|---|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------------------------|
| "Quel est le sens      | »Was«, fragte er,   | "Cosa vuol dire,"   | ¿Qué significa      | –¿Qué significa                       |
| du mot "totalité?",    | »bedeutet das Wort  | domandò,            | "totalidad"? –      | "totalidad"?                          |
| demanda-t-il.          | >Gesamtheit «</td <td>"'totalità'?"</td> <td>preguntó.</td> <td>Geroge Brown parecia</td> | "'totalità'?"       | preguntó.           | Geroge Brown parecia                  |
| Cette fois encore,     | Wieder schien es, als   | George Brown        | Nuevamente          | alguien que se                        |
| George Brown eut       | ob George Brown   | parve di nuovo      | George Brown        | recupera de un                        |
| l'air d'avoir reçu un  | sich erst von einem   | riprendersi da un   | dio la sensación    | puñetazo.                             |
| coup dont il           | Schlag erholen  | colpo.              | de que se           | – Bueno, es una de                    |
| essayait de se         | müsse.  | "Be'," disse, "è    | recuperaba de un    | essas palabras tan                    |
| remettre.              | »Nun«, sagte er   | una di quelle       | golpe.              | simples que no es fácil               |
| "Ma foi, c'est um      | dann, »es handelt   | parole tanto        | – Bueno –           | explicarlas. Tan simple               |
| de ces mots qui        | sich hier um einen  | semplici di per se  | contestó –, ésta es | – repitió. Carraspeó, se              |
| paraissent tellement   | von jenen Begriffen,  | stesse quanto       | una de esas         | sacó algo de los                      |
| simples en soi         | die in sich so einfach  | difficili da        | palabras tan        | dientes y terminó por                 |
| qu'ils sont difficiles | sind, daß man sie   | spiegarsi. È        | sencillas en sí     | sonarse la nariz.                     |
| à expliquer.           | andererseits nur  | davvero             | mismas que          | Luego, salió de la                    |
| Tellement simples",    | schwer erklären   | semplicissima,"     | resultan muy        | habitación y Arthur                   |
| répéta-t-il.           | kann. Einer von den   | ripeté.             | difíciles de        | tuvo que seguirlo,                    |
| Il s'éclaircit le      | wirklich  | Si schiarì la gola, | explicar. De tan    | volteando uno o dos                   |
| gosier, desserra les   | grundsätzlichen,  | si passo la lingua  | sencillas que son   | objetos a su paso. De                 |
| dents et se moucha.    | einfachen Begriffen«,   | sui denti, e alla   | – explicó.          | hecho, los dos juntos                 |
| Puis il sortit à       | wiederholte er.   | fine si soffiò il   | Aclaró su           | caminando sacudían                    |
| grandes enjambées      | Und er räusperte  | naso.               | garganta, se quitó  | toda la casa. Papá sacó               |
| de la pièce. Arthur,   | sich, fuhr sich noch  | Poi uscì dalla      | algo de un diente   | el diccionario del                    |
| naturellement, dut     | einmal mit der  | stanza, e           | y, por último, se   | estante.                              |
| lui emboîter le pas    | Zungenspitze über   | naturalmente        | sonó las narices.   | <ul> <li>La precisión ante</li> </ul> |
| et, dans sa hâte, se   | die Zähne und putzte  | Arthur dovette      | Luego salió del     | todo es una virtude –                 |
| heurta à un ou deux    | sich schließlich die  | seguirlo, andando   | cuarto, teniendo    | sentenció George                      |
| meubles au             | Nase.   | a sbattere contro   | Arthur que          | Brown Nunca lo                        |
| passage. Papa et lui   | Dann erhob er sich  | qualcosa nella      | seguirle a          | olvides. Arthur dijo                  |
| ébranlèrent toute la   | und marschierte aus   | fretta. Tutti e due | trompicones. De     | que no, que nunca lo                  |
| maison à eux deux.     | dem Zimmer, und   | stavano scuotendo   | hecho, caminando    | olvidaría y contuvo el                |

Papa descendit le dictionnaire. "De la précision avant tout, voilà une vertu essentielle, recommanda George Brown. Ne l'oublie pas, Arthur." Arthur acquiesça, s'efforçant de retenir son souffle dans l'attente de ce qui allait suivre. Papa lut à haute voix: "Totalité: qualité de ce qui est total." Il regarda Arthur. "C'est-à-dire, poursuivit Papa qui se racla vigoureusement la gorge, ce qui forme um tout, écrit avec un t naturellement", ajouta-t-il (WHITE, 1973b, p. 273)

Arthur mußte ihm natürlich folgen, wobei er in der Eile hier und da an irgendwelche Gegenstände stieß. Das ganze Haus ließen sie geradezu erzittern - Vater und er zusammen. Vater nahm das große Wörterbuch aus dem Regal. »Vor allem ist es die Genauigkeit, die man zunächst einmal als Tugend bezeichnen sollte«, erläuterte er. »Daran mußt du immer denken. Arthur.« Arthur sagte, ja, das würde er natürlich, und hielt in Erwartung des Kommendne den Atem an. Vater las vor: »Gesamtheit ist die >Eigenschaft, ein Gesamtes oder Ganzes zu sein.«« Er blickte Arthur an. »Das heißt also«. sagte er dann, und sein Räuspern wollte nicht enden,» - das bedeutet«, sagte er, »daß das, welches ein Gesamtes oder ein Ganzes ist -« und er

l'intera casa. Papà tirò giù il dizionario. "La precisione innanzi tutto non può essere definita che come una virtù," raccomandò George Brown. 'Ricordalo sempre, Arthur." Arthur disse di sì, e trattenne il respiro per quello che avrebbe potuto saltar fuori. Papà lesse: "Totalità è 'la qualità di ciò che è totale'." Guardò Arthur. "Cioè," spiegò, cercando spasmodicamente di schiarirsi la gola, "vuol dire ciò che è un tutto" (WHITE, 1973c, p. 269).

juntos, el padre y Arthur hacían temblar toda la casa. El padre cogió el diccionario. – En primer lugar, la exactitud debe considerarse como una virtud señaló George Brown -. Siempre debes recordar eso, Arthur. Arthur prometió recordarlo, mientras se concentraba en retener su respiración anticipando lo que venía. El papá leyó: – Totalidad es la "cualidad del ser total". Miró a Arthur. - Es decir continuó el padre, y no conseguía aclararse la garganta –, significa todo aquello que es un conjunto – añadió escrito com w, naturalmente.7 7. Juego de palabras

intraducible:

aliento para lo que se avecinaba. Papá leyó: -"Totalidad: cualidad de ser total" – y lo miró -. "En otras palabras" – prosiguió carraspeando – "lo que forma un todo". En ese momento. Arthur se dio cuenta de que él papá tampoco podía responderle, igual que Waldo. Él mismo era, y seguiría siendo, el guardián de los mandalas, que debía adivinhar su secreto supremo a través del tacto y de la luz. Al salir del cuarto tenía los lábios entreabiertos como para dar libertad a una interpretación que aún no había logrado redondear. Podía ser que su cuerpo cayera, pero solo su cuerpo, mientras reconocía la esfera que llevaba en el bolsillo en un frenesí de descubrimiento (WHITE, 2016, p. 376).

fügte hinzu: »-in Conjunto, en diesem Falle inglés, se escribe natürlich groß whole, pero geschrieben wird, das quitando la w, la schon mal von pronunciación vornherein.« casi no varía, Und da wurde Arthur pudiendo inducir klar, daß auch Vater a uma ortografía die Wahrheit niemals incorrecta (WHITE, 1973a, wissen würde, ebensowenig wie p. 281). Waldo. Er allein war es, jetzt und für alle Zeiten, der die Mandalas hüten und ihr letztendliches Geheimnis durch Berührung im richtigen Licht zu ergründen versuchen mußte. Als er das Zimmer verließ, waren seine Lippen halb geöffnet und bereit, eine Erklärung zu geben, um deren Klarheit er andererseits noch vergeblich kämpfte. Sein Körper war vielleicht schwach und konnte versagen - aber das war nur sein Körper, denn von nun an konzentrierte sich sein ganzer Entdeckungsdrang auf die gläserne Murmel in seiner

|                         | Tasche (WH    | ITE,                               |                         |       |   |  |
|-------------------------|---------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------|---|--|
|                         | 1978, p. 294  | -295).                             |                         |       |   |  |
| English                 |               |                                    | First Attempt           |       | Brazilian Portuguese - Revised            |  |
| 'What,' he asked, 'is   | the meaning   | - (                                | Qual – pediu ele –      | é o   | – Qual – pediu ele – é o significado      |  |
| of "totality"?'         |               | significa                          | do de "totalidade"?     |       | de "totalidade"?                          |  |
| Again George Brown      | might have    | Nova                               | amente George Bro       | own   | Novamente George Brown parecia            |  |
| been recovering from    | a blow.       | poderia                            | estar se recuperando    | de    | estar se recuperando de um golpe.         |  |
| 'Well,' he said, 'it is | one of those  | um golp                            | e.                      |       | – Bom – disse ele – é uma daquelas        |  |
| words so simple in the  | nemselves as  | – Bo                               | m – disse ele – é       | uma   | palavras tão simples em si mesmas         |  |
| to be difficult of exp  | olanation. So | daquelas                           | palavras tão simples    | em    | que são de difícil explicação. Tão        |  |
| very simple,' he repea  | ated.         | elas mes                           | mas como para ser di    | fícil | simples – repetiu ele.                    |  |
|                         |               | de expl                            | icação. Tão simples     | s –   |   |  |
|                         |               | repetiu e                          | le.                     |       |   |  |
| Clearing his throat,    | freeing his   | Limpa                              | ando sua garga          | ınta, | Limpando sua garganta, passando a         |  |
| teeth, finally blowing  | his nose.     | libertand                          | lo seus dentes, finalme | ente  | língua sobre seus dentes, finalmente      |  |
|                         |               | assopran                           | do seu nariz.           |       | assoprando seu nariz.                     |  |
| Then, as he marched     | d out of the  | Então, enquanto ele saía da        |                         | da    | Então, como ele saía da sala,             |  |
| room, Arthur of co      | urse had to   | sala, Arthur claro teve de seguir, |                         | guir, | Arthur claro teve de seguir,              |  |
| follow, bumping o       | ne or two     | tropeçando em uma ou duas          |                         | duas  | tropeçando em uma ou duas coisas na       |  |
| things in the hurr      | y. In fact,   | coisas na pressa. Na verdade,      |                         | ade,  | pressa. Na verdade, juntos, Papai e ele   |  |
| together, Dad and       | he were       | juntos, Papai e ele estavam        |                         | vam   | estavam balançando a casa toda.           |  |
| shaking the whole ho    |               | balançando a casa toda.            |                         |       |   |  |
| Dad took the dictiona   | •             | _                                  | baixou o dicionário.    |       | Papai fez descer o dicionário.            |  |
| 'Accuracy in the first  | _             |                                    | rácia no primeiro luga  |       | Acurácia em primeiro lugar só             |  |
| only be called a virt   | _             | _                                  | chamada uma virtud      |       | pode ser considerada uma virtude –        |  |
| Brown recommende        | •             |                                    | Brown recomendou        | . –   | George Brown recomendou. – Sempre         |  |
| remember that, Arthu    |               | _                                  | lembre isso, Arthur.    |       | lembre isso, Arthur.                      |  |
| Arthur said yes he v    |               |                                    | ur disse sim que        | ele   | Arthur disse sim que ele                  |  |
| concentrating on I      | •             | lembrari                           | •                       | se    | lembraria, enquanto se concentrava        |  |
| breath for what might   | come.         | concentr                           |                         | sua   | em manter sua respiração pelo que         |  |
|                         |               | 1 ,                                | io pelo que poderia vii |       | poderia vir.                              |  |
| Dad read out: 'Tota     | •             | _                                  | i leu: – Totalidade é   | é "a  | Papai leu: – Totalidade é "a              |  |
| quality of being total" | ·.'           | _                                  | e de ser total".        |       | qualidade de ser total".                  |  |
| He looked at Arthur.    |               |                                    | olhou para Arthur.      |       | Ele olhou para Arthur.                    |  |
| 'That is to say,' sa    |               |                                    | sso quer dizer – d      |       | – Isso quer dizer – disse Papai, ele      |  |
| could not clear his th  | •             | 1                                  | le não conseguia lin    | -     | não conseguia limpar sua garganta o       |  |
| 'it means,' he said, "" |               |                                    | ganta o suficiente –    |       | suficiente – isso significa – disse ele – |  |
| a whole",' adding: 'S   | -             | -                                  | – disse ele – "aquilo   | -     | "aquilo que é completo" –                 |  |
| – naturally' (WHIT      | E, 1974, p.   | é inteiri                          | ço" – acrescentando     | ): –  | acrescentando: – Mas não sem pleto –      |  |

Escrito com um *ç* – naturalmente.

naturalmente.

240).

Again, the verb "free" had to be explained with more words, thus alongating the translated version ("passando a língua sobre os dentes"). Of course, without this explanation, the sentence might sound incomplete. Another important change relates to the translation of "as": "como" is a better alternative, instead of "enquanto". The verb "called" used by George Brown to refer to virtue was changed in the revised version: instead of "chamada", we think "considerada" is more emphatic in this context. We see that two translators surrendered and had to admit the impossibility of keeping the pun. In Brazilian Portuguese, if we kept the option "todo", then one possibility would be to change the letter: instead of saying it was spelt with a "t", it was spelled with an "o" instead of an "u", but the aural reference to the reader (and to the character in the story) would be forced and quite artificial. In the revision process, we started to look for a synonym of whole in Brazilian Portuguese which might have a similar effect to the one in the original. The word "inteiriço" seemed the right choice because it enables the pun with the sounds c, s and ç (cedilla), which are the same in Brazilian Portuguese, thus potentially inducing the character (and why not the reader of the translation) to misspelling if s/he is not warned about its orthography. Later on, while rereading and thinking about the possibilities for this part, we decided to choose another option, which adds humor to the scene: "aquilo que é completo – Mas não sem pleto – naturalmente". This is the kind of joke (or remark) that George Brown (according to our mental representation of the character) would make. Here the translator has two options, and her/his choice will depend on the effect s/he aims.

A more complicated pun is presented next, with the word "dill":

Exhibit 50 – pun with dill

| French                | German               | Italian                | Spanish 1         | Spanish 2           |
|-----------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|
| [] On raconta         | Es sprach sich in    | [] A Sarsaparilla si   | [] En             | Por todo            |
| bientôt dans tout     | Sarsaparilla herum,  | sparse la voce che i   | Sarsaparilla se   | Sarsaparilla corrió |
| Sarsaparilla qu'il y  | daß diese Browns     | Brown avevano          | había corrido la  | el rumor de que     |
| avait quelque chose   | doch seht            | qualcosa di strano, e  | voz de que los    | había algo raro con |
| de bizarre chez les   | merkwürdige Leute    | soprattutto che uno di | Brown eran algo   | los Brown, sobre    |
| Brown, en dehors du   | sein mußten.         | loro era un autentico  | raros, sobre todo | todo, que uno de    |
| fait que l'un d'eux   | Abgesehen davon,     | cretino. Arthur non se | uno de ellos, que | ellos era un ganso  |
| était vraiment        | daß bei einem von    | la prese (WHITE,       | era un verdadero  | rematado. Arthur    |
| anormal. Arthur ne    | ihnen offensichtlich | 1973c, p. 252).        | zoquete. Pero a   | no se sentía        |
| s'en chagrina pas. Il | das Gehirn so        |                        | Arthur esto no le | ofendido porque en  |

| préférait penser au                           | weich war     | wie eine                 |                           | importaba en       | los grabados de los    |
|---|---------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|
| fenouil <sup>1</sup> qui poussait             | zu lang ein   | gelegte                  |                           | absoluto           | libros los gansos      |
| en grande quantité à                          | Dillgurke.    | Arthur                   |                           | (WHITE, 1973a,     | parecían patos         |
| l'état sauvage, au                            | störte das r  | icht. Auf                |                           | p. 263).           | blancos, como los      |
| bord de la plupart des                        | den Sticher   | ı im                     |                           |                    | que había en tantos    |
| petits chemins de                             | Botanikbud    | ch sah                   |                           |                    | rincones silvestres    |
| Sarsaparilla.                                 | Dill genaus   | so aus                   |                           |                    | de Salsaparilla        |
| 1. Jeu de mots                                | wie der Fei   | nchel,                   |                           |                    | (WHITE, 2016, p.       |
| intraduisible sur                             | der in imm    | er                       |                           |                    | 354).                  |
| "dill" qui veut dire à                        | stärker       |                          |                           |                    |                        |
| la fois "idiot" et                            | verwildern    | den                      |                           |                    |                        |
| "fenouil". (N. d. T.)                         | Büschen ar    | ı den                    |                           |                    |                        |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.                             | Rändern de    | er                       |                           |                    |                        |
| 256).   | meisten       |                          |                           |                    |                        |
|   | Seitenstaße   | n in                     |                           |                    |                        |
|   | Sarsaparill   | a                        |                           |                    |                        |
|   | wucherte (    | WHITE,                   |                           |                    |                        |
|   | 1978, p. 27   | 5-276).                  |                           |                    |                        |
| English                                       |               |                          | First Attempt             | Brazilian Po       | rtuguese - Revised     |
| [] It got round Sarsap                        | parilla there | Circulou                 | por Sarsaparilla que hav  | via Circulou por S | Sarsaparilla que havia |
| was something queer                           | about the     | algo esc                 | quisito sobre os Brov     | vn, algo estranho  | com os Brown,          |
| Browns, over and about                        | ove one of    | inclusive                | um deles um verdade       | iro inclusive que, | em especial, um deles  |
| them a real dill. It did not worry tirirca. I |               | tirirca. Is              | sso não preocupava Arth   | ur. era um pa      | monha. Isso não        |
| Arthur. Dill in the engravings A tiririca     |               | nos talhos parecia funci | no, preocupava A          | rthur. O picão nas |                        |
| looked like fennel, which grew que cre        |               | que creso                | cia cada vez mais selvage | em gravuras pareci | a funcho, que crescia  |
| increasingly wild down most of nas            |               | nas ruela                | s em Sarsaparilla.        | cada vez mais      | selvagem nas ruelas    |
| the side roads at                             | Sarsaparilla  |                          |                           | em Sarsaparilla    |                        |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 225                          | ).            |                          |                           |                    |                        |

"Dill", in addition to the reference to an aromatic herb, means, in Australian English, an "idiot", a fool. Considering the translations available, only the French admitted the impossibility of keeping the pun in the original. The first Spanish translation and the Italian deleted any reference to this pun in the original, choosing the more immediate (and offensive, in this context) meaning of the word "dill", which is idiot. In the new Spanish translation, we see that there was a total change in terms of interpretation, with the use of Hans Christian Andersen's *The Ugly Duckling* fairy tale, in a way transforming the reference to animals possibly present in the region. In Brazilian Portuguese, the idea to try to keep this pun would be through the use of a vegetable species, such as "picão", which has, among other meanings,

the idea of a person who attracts and has sexual relationships with many partners" or "toughie<sup>190</sup>", because the immediate option, in this case, "endro" or "aneto" does not present the semantic load (and ambivalence) in English. However, when revising the text, we came up with another vegetable species, which carries the connotation of a weed, i.e., something undesirable which grows rapidly: "tiririca". The other meanings associated to the word, according to Aulete Dictionary, are "someone angry" and "someone who steals wallets<sup>191</sup>". In botanical matters, "funcho", "picão" and "tiririca" are relatively similar, thus, it would be possible to keep the reference in the translation. However, after rereading the portion, we decided to lose the pun (for the sake of clearness) and use something more familiar to the Brazilian reader: "pamonha". If only the word in English made reference to food, then our problems would have been solved, since "pamonha" (which is a kind of cake) would be a good option. Because the play of meanings was connected to vegetation, hence the reasoning behind our first choice for "tiririca".

Other changes refer to the addition of a relative pronoun, coupled with the option "em especial" replacing "um verdadeiro" in the revised version to allow the use of the word "tiririca" without sounding an oddity (both at grammar and semantic levels). "Estranho com" sounds more natural in Brazilian Portuguese than "esquisito sobre" (which was a literal translation in our first attempt). Beyond any doubt, all these apparently minor changes enhance the readibilty of the translation.

Patrick White's work with language is revealed when one sits to translate one of his novels. The following quotation describes the reading experience of the Swedish translator Ingergärd Martinell and introduces one more topic to be developed in this dissertation:

When language is inadequate, he creates anew; the poet that Patrick White nowadays disowns conceals himself behind the prose-writer. Sometimes his new words are onomatopoeic. Ingegärd Martinell asked him while she was translating *The Solid Mandala* about the word prestiferous; he uses it in a scene where the *Moonlight* Sonata is being played and talks of "Beethoven's prestiferous night". "A word I coined by uniting *presto* and pestiferous (because the presto of that sonata is fiendishly difficult)" (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 120).

Let us have a look at the options chosen by the translators in other languages before preseting the alternative chosen in Brazilian Portuguese.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Dicionário Aulete Digital. In the original, in Brazilian Portuguese: "indivíduo que atrai e se relaciona sexualmente com inúmeras parceiras" and "indivíduo valentão, sempre disposto a brigar. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/picão. Accessed on: 10 Aug. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Dicionário Aulete Digital. In the original, in Brazilian Portuguese: "Diz-se daquele que está muito irritado" and "Punguista". Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/tiririca. Accessed on: 10 Sept. 2015.

Exhibit 51 – Prestiferous

| French                  | German                 | Italian                    | Spanish 1             | Spanish 2                              |  |
|-------------------------|------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|--|--|
| Dulcie, visiblement,    | Sie war Beethovens     | Dulcie                     | A todas luces,        | A todas luces,                         |  |
| n'était pas prête, et   | Mondnacht der          | semplicemente non          | Dulcie no estaba      | Dulcie no estaba                       |  |
| ne serait jamais prête  | beherrschten           | era preparatta, e          | preparada, ni jamás   | preparada, y                           |  |
| à affronter la nuit     | Fingerfertigkeit       | non lo sarebbe mai         | lo estaría, para la   | nunca lo estaria,                      |  |
| prestifère de           | einfach nicht          | stata, per la              | fatídica noche de     | para la prestíera                      |  |
| Beethoven. Elle         | gewachsen – und        | tempestosa notte di        | Beethoven. Por eso    | noche de                               |  |
| s'élançait sur le       | würde es auch nie      | Beethoven. Essa la         | arremetía contra el   | Beethoven. La                          |  |
| piano comme pour        | sien. Sie stürzte sich | costrinse a spingersi      | piano vertical como   | obligava a                             |  |
| en casser, en faire     | auf das Klavier, als   | in avanti come se          | para quebrarlo,       | embestir el piano                      |  |
| éclater la coque.       | ob sie es              | volesse schiantare il      | como para derribar    | como para                              |  |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.       | zertrümmern, als ob    | piano di noce,             | el erguido nogal      | romperlo, como                         |  |
| 155).                   | sie das                | sventrarlo (WHITE,         | (WHITE, 1973a, p.     | para desgajar la                       |  |
|                         | Nußbaumgehäuse         | 1973c, p. 150).            | 159).                 | madera de nogal                        |  |
|                         | auseinanderreißen      |                            |                       | (WHITE, 2016,                          |  |
|                         | wollte (WHITE,         |                            |                       | p. 223).                               |  |
|                         | 1978, p. 164).         |                            |                       |  |  |
| English                 | В                      | razilian Portuguese        | Brazilian Por         | tuguese - Revised                      |  |
| Dulcie plainly wasn'    | t prepared, Dulcie na  | ío estava preparada, e nu  | nca Dulcie não es     | tava preparada, e                      |  |
| and never would         | be, for estaria,       | para a noite prestífera    | de nunca estaria, pa  | nunca estaria, para a prestífera noite |  |
| Beethoven's prestifero  | us night. It Beethove  | n. Isso a fez investir sob | re o de Beethoven. I  | de Beethoven. Isso a fazia investir    |  |
| made her lunge at the   | piano as if piano co   | mo se para quebrá-lo, p    | para sobre o piano co | a sobre o piano como se para quebrá-   |  |
| to crack, to tear the w | alnut open. abrir a no | Z.                         | lo, para abrir a n    | OZ.                                    |  |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 135    | ).                     |                            |                       |  |  |

In this case, the alternative chosen in Brazilian Portuguese, "prestífera", captures and keeps the scheme of its creation, thankfully because of the Latin origin of the words involved.

As a result of his treatment of language Patrick White clears the way for new possibilities of expression. He departs from the conventional manner of punctuation. The result is not only a new rhythm but also new contents. By means of an unexpected manner of punctuating he directs the attention to certain words, gives them a new sonority and meaning. At the same time they retain what one has earlier learnt to read into them (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 121).

The only change made was to put the adjective before the noun, to give emphasis. Again, aspect is a crucial factor in the passage: instead of using the simple past form "fez", we opted for the imperfect past tense in Brazilian Portuguese "fazia", which sounded better in the

translation (in English, the simple past form "made" presents us with these two options in Brazilian Portuguese, which are quite different in terms of actions being completed or not).

One more aspect to be discussed in this work is how to deal with the Latin options of "amour", already a translation of the English word "love" in Brazilian Portuguese, whose translation option is a form that is morphologically as well as phonetically close: "amor". The event, described according to Waldo's perspective, is shown next:

Exhibit 52 – Amour vs. Love (Waldo Chapter)

| French                 | German                   | Italian               | Spanish 1               | Spanish 2            |
|------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Arthur était           | Arthur war fasziniert    | Arthur era estasiato  | Arthur estaba           | Arthur estaba        |
| subjugué par ce        | von dem, was er          | da quanto udiva e     | extasiado por lo que    | extasiado con lo     |
| qu'il voyait et        | hörte und sah, und       | vedeva, e Dulcie      | oía y veía, y Dulcie    | que oía y veía, y    |
| entendait; quant à     | Dulcie schien            | era cambiata.         | había cambiado;         | Dulcie había         |
| Dulcie, elle avait     | verändert. Schon im      | Quando entrò nella    | cuando entrò en la      | cambiado. Al         |
| changé. En entrant     | Moment des               | stanza, Waldo sentì   | sala Waldo sintió       | entrar en la sala,   |
| dans la pièce,         | Hereinkommens hatte      | per la prima volta    | por primera vez que     | Waldo sintió por     |
| Waldo sentit pour      | Waldo das Gefühl,        | che Dulcie, così, era | Dulcie estaba           | primera vez que      |
| la première fois que   | daß er hier zum          | veramente se          | comportàndose           | esa era Dulcie tal   |
| Dulcie était elle-     | erstenmal die            | stessa. Non si        | como en realidad        | como era. No se      |
| même. On ne            | eigentliche Dulcie       | poteva dire che       | era. No podía           | podía decir que      |
| pouvait vraiment       | sah. Und eigentlich      | fosse proprio brutta. | decirse que fuera       | fuera francamente    |
| pas la qualifier de    | war sie gar nicht so     | O forse si era ormai  | fea exactamente. O      | fea. O tal vez ya se |
| laide. Ou peut-être    | häßlich. Oder            | abituato a lei.       | tal vez a estas         | había                |
| s'habituait-il à elle. | vielleicht natte er sich | "Hai ragione," stava  | alturas él ya se        | acostumbrado a       |
| "Vous avez raison,     | inzwischen nur           | dicendo, in risposta  | había acostumbrado      | ella.                |
| disait-elle,           | einfach an sie           | a qualche             | a ella.                 | –Tienes razón –      |
| répondant à            | gewöhnt.                 | osservazione di       | –Tienes razón –         | decía Dulcie en      |
| quelque remarque       | »Du hast recht«,         | Arthur, ma            | decía ella em           | respuesta a algún    |
| d'Arthur, mais en      | antwortete sie jetzt     | piuttosto rivolta a   | respuesta a algún       | comentario de        |
| ayant l'air de se      | gerade auf irgendeine    | se stessa. "Amour è   | comentário de           | Arthur, aunque       |
| parler à elle. Amour   | Bemerkung Arthurs,       | diverso da love.      | Arthur, aunque          | habando más bien     |
| en français et love    | obwohl sie               | Amour há um che di    | hablando como para      | para sí misma –.     |
| en anglais, ce n'est   | gleichzeitig auch fast   | diverso un            | sí misma–. <i>Amour</i> | Amour no es lo       |
| pas pareil. Amour a    | wie zu sich selbst       | diverso significato"  | no es lo mismo que      | mismo que            |
| un aspect différent,   | sprach.                  | (WHITE, 1973c, p.     | amor. Amour tiene       | "Amor". Amour        |
| un sens différent"     | »Amour ist nicht         | 122)                  | um sonido distinto,     | tiene otra forma     |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.      | dasselbe wie >Liebe<.    |                       | um significado          | otro significado     |
| 127).                  | Amour sieht anders       |                       | distinto (WHITE,        | (WHITE, 2016, p.     |

|                         | aus – hat eine andere |  |                        | 197                                  | 3a, p. 129).                                     | 186).                |
|-------------------------|-----------------------|--|------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|----------------------|
|                         | Bedeutung             | ;«   |                        |                                      |  |                      |
|                         | (WHITE,               | 1978, p.   |                        |                                      |  |                      |
|                         | 133).                 |  |                        |                                      |  |                      |
| English                 |                       |  | First Attempt          |                                      | Brazilian Por                                    | tuguese - Revised    |
| Arthur was entrance     | d by what             | Arthur esta  | va enlevado com o que  | ele                                  | Arthur estava e                                  | nlevado com o que    |
| he was hearing and s    | seeing, and           | estava ouv   | rindo e vendo, e Du    | lcie                                 | ele estava ouvin                                 | do e vendo, e Dulcie |
| Dulcie had changed.     | When he               | havia muda   | ado. Quando ele entrou | ı na                                 | havia mudado. (                                  | Quando ele entrou na |
| came into the room      | Waldo felt            | sala Waldo   | sentiu pela primeira   | vez                                  | sala Waldo sentiu pela primeira vez              |                      |
| for the first time this | s is Dulcie           | que esta Dulcie estava sendo ela                             |                        | que esta era Dulcie sendo ela mesma. |  |                      |
| being herself. You co   | ouldn't say           | mesma. Você não podia dizer que ela                          |                        | ela                                  | Não se podia dizer que ela era                   |                      |
| she was exactly         | ugly. Or              | era exatamente feia. Ou talvez ele só exatamente feia. Ou ta |                        | . Ou talvez ele só                   |  |                      |
| perhaps he was just u   | used to her           | estava acostumado a ela agora.                               |                        |                                      | estava acostumado a ela agora.                   |                      |
| by now.                 |                       | – Você está certo – ela estava                               |                        | ava                                  | <ul> <li>Você está certo – ela estava</li> </ul> |                      |
| 'You are right,' she v  | vas saying,           | dizendo, em resposta a algum dizendo, em resposta            |                        | resposta a algum                     |  |                      |
| in reply to some        | remark of             | comentário   | de Arthur, emb         | ora                                  | comentário de                                    | Arthur, embora       |
| Arthur's, though        | speaking              | falando ur   | n tanto para si mes    | ma.                                  | falando um tan                                   | nto para si mesma.   |
| rather to herself. 'An  | nour is not           | Amour não  | o é o mesmo que an     | ıor.                                 | Amour não é o                                    | mesmo que amor.      |
| the same as love. An    | nour has a            | Amour tem  | uma forma diferente –  | um                                   | Amour tem um                                     | a forma diferente –  |
| different shape - a     | a different           | significado  | diferente.             |                                      | um significado d                                 | iferente.            |
| meaning' (WHITE,        | 1974, p.              |  |                        |                                      |  |                      |
| 111).                   |                       |  |                        |                                      |  |                      |

In this part, our changes are crucial to render a readable text. In our first attempt, the demonstrative pronoun "esta" ("this") induced the translator to produce an awkward structure, because it was unnecessarily emphasing Dulcie's presence in the context (there were not any more Dulcies in the story). In the revision process, the demonstrative pronoun "esta" ("this") was correctly placed after the relative pronoun "que" ("that", which does not appear in the original) in Brazilian Portuguese, thus rendering a more coherent sentence. Another item refers to the translation of "you couldn't say": in our first attempt, we opted for the literal translation using "você", which would erroneously give the idea that the reader was supposed to confirm or be part of Waldo's judgement. However, when rereading the sentence, an equally feasible option, and which increases the level of impersonality (given the narrator in this part is Waldo) is "não se podia dizer", using the pronoun "se" and thus making the sentence more natural and keeping the necessary discoursive distance.

Now, the same event, according to Arthur's perception:

Exhibit 53 – Amour vs. Love (Arthur Chapter)

| French                       | German             |         | Italian                  |           | Spanish 1        | Spanish 2             |
|------------------------------|--------------------|---------|--------------------------|-----------|------------------|-----------------------|
| Car Dulcie                   | Denn Dulcie        | Infa    | atti Dulcie gli          | Porqu     | e Dulcie le      | Porque Dulcie le      |
| racontait à Arthur           | erzählte ihm       | stav    | va raccontando           | estab     | a hablando del   | estaba contando del   |
| l'histoire du <i>pierrot</i> | gerade von dem     | del     | pierrot d'amou           | ır pierre | ot d'amour que   | Pierrot d'amour que   |
| d'amour <sup>1</sup> sur le  | Pierrot d'Amou     | r che   | aveva visto              | había     | en una botella   | había en el frasco de |
| flacon de parfum             | auf der            | sull    | a bottiglia di           | de pe     | rfume en el      | perfume del tocador   |
| dans la salle de             | Parfümflasche in   | n pro   | fumo nel bagno           | cuarto    | de baño de       | de la señora Musto,   |
| bains de M <sup>me</sup>     | Mrs. Mustos        | del     | la signora Must          | o, Mrs.   | Musto, en        | lugar donde él nunca  |
| Musto, où il n'était         | Badezimmer, in     | dov     | e lui, nonostan          | te donde  | e, a pesar de su | había estado pese a   |
| jamais allé malgré           | dem er, trotz      | la s    | ua dimestichez           | za famil  | aridad con la    | que conocía bien la   |
| sa connaissance des          | seiner             | con     | la casa, non er          | a casa,   | él nunca había   | casa.                 |
| lieux.                       | Forschungsexpe     | di ma   | i stato.                 | estad     | ).               | – Qué interesante,    |
| "Voilà qui est               | tionen durch das   | s úrè   | interessante,            | – Es ı    | nuy interesante, | Dulcie – decía él –.  |
| intéressant, Dulcie,         | Haus der alten     | Du      | lcie," disse.            | Dulci     | e – dijo –.      | Amour suena mejor     |
| dit-il. Amour en             | Dame, noch nie     | "Aı     | nour sembra              | Amoi      | r, suena         | que "amor", ¿no es    |
| français et love en          | gewesen war.       | div     | erso da <i>love</i> . El | n? difere | nte a amor,      | cierto?               |
| anglais, ce n'est            | »Das ist aber      | No      | n ti pare?"              | ¿no?      | No crees?        | – Sin duda. Las       |
| pas pareil. Cela             | wirklich           | "Ol     | n, sì," essa             | – Tie     | nes razón –      | palabras son          |
| paraît différent, pas        | interessant,       | con     | venne. "Le due           | afirm     | o Dulcie –, son  | distintas. Tienen     |
| vrai?                        | Dulcie«, sagte e   | r. par  | ole sono divers          | e. palab  | ras diferentes.  | distinta forma. Y     |
| - Oui, tout à fait,          | »Amour – das       | Hai     | nno una radice           | Tiene     | n un sonido      | probablemente         |
| acquiesça-t-elle.            | klingt ganz ande   | ers div | ersa. Forse              | distin    | to. Y            | distinto significado  |
| Les mots sont                | als >Liebe<, wie   | ? han   | no addirittura u         | ın posib  | lemente tengan   | (WHITE, 2016, p.      |
| différents. Ils ont          | Meinst du nicht    | sign    | nificato diverso         | " un sig  | nificado         | 382).                 |
| un aspect différent.         | auch?«             | (W      | HITE, 1973c, p           | . distin  | to (WHITE,       |                       |
| Probablement un              | »Du hast recht«    | , 274   | ł).                      | 1973      | ı, p. 286).      |                       |
| sens différent               | pflichtete sie ihr | n       |                          |           |                  |                       |
| même."                       | bei, »die Worte    |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
| 1. En français dans          | sind auch          |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
| le texte. (N.d.T.)           | verschieden.       |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
| (WHITE, 1973b,               | Amour sieht        |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
| p. 278-279)                  | anders aus – hat   |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
|                              | vielleicht sogar   |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
|                              | eine andere        |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
|                              | Bedeutung«         |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
|                              | (WHITE, 1978,      | p.      |                          |           |                  |                       |
|                              | 301).              |         |                          |           |                  |                       |
| English                      | 1                  | -       | First Attemp             | t         | Brazilian 1      | Portuguese - Revised  |
| For Dulcie was was           | telling Arthur P   | ois Du  | lcie estava c            | ontando   | a Pois Dulcie    | e estava contando a   |

about the *pierrot d'amour* on the scent-bottle in Mrs Musto's bathroom where, in spite of his familiarity with the house, he had never been.

'That's interesting now, Dulcie,' he said. 'Amour sounds different from love. Eh? Doesn't it?'
'Oh yes,' she agreed. 'The words are different. They have a different shape. Probably even a different meaning' (WHITE,

1974, p. 245).

Arthur sobre o *pierrot d'amour* no frasco de perfume no banheiro da Sra. Musto onde, apesar de sua familiaridade com a casa, ele nunca havia estado.

- Agora isso é interessante, Dulcie –
   disse ele. Amour soa differente de amor. Né? Não soa?
- Oh sim ela concordou. As palavras são diferentes. Elas têm uma forma diferente. Provavelmente até um significado diferente.

Arthur sobre o *pierrot d'amour* no frasco de perfume no banheiro da Sra. Musto onde, apesar de sua familiaridade com a casa, ele nunca havia estado.

- Sabe, isso é interessante, Dulcie –
   disse ele. Amour soa differente de amor. Né? Não soa?
- Ah, sim ela concordou. As palavras são diferentes. Elas têm uma forma diferente.
   Provavelmente até um significado diferente.

In this porton, we see that the changes made are connected to how Arthur speaks in the novel, making his language in Brazilian Portuguese sound more natural by using "Sabe" instead of "Agora" to translate "now" after "That's interesting". Furthermore, after rereading the translation, we noticed that people seldom exclamate using that form (oh, sim!) in Brazilian Portuguese, preferring "Ah, sim" instead.

David Bellos claims that "Foreign-soundness is therefore only a real option for a translator when working from a language with which the receiving language and its culture have an established relationship" (BELLOS, 2011, p. 19). Basically, he cites the case of French in the English-speaking world and Spanish recently in the United States. For example, according to him, there are many ways to represent Frenchness in English, as there are ways to express Spanishness in American English. However, the same array of possibilities of representation of Germanness and Italianness in English, for example, is more restricted. In this case, Bellos argument works: "The project of writing translations that preserve in the way they sound some trace of the work's 'authentic foreigness' is really applicable only when the original is not very foreign at all" (BELLOS, 2011, p. 19). In our case, the proximity is so considerable that it ends up becoming the issue: "amour" and "amor" are so close in their Latin origin that the effect of foreigness which is quite visible in English would not produce the same effect in Brazilian Portuguese.

In the translations available, both Spanish translations decided to keep the Spanish word, which is quite similar morphologically and phonetically to "amor" in Brazilian Portuguese. The Italian has the word "amore", which gives a different tone in pronunciation, but morphologically it has only the addition of the final "e". The French option is quite

interesting, given the translator had to think about a possibility to differentiate the translated word from an "original", or even work with close synonyms in French, but this option is quite rescricted, because of the semantic array for the word "amor/amour" in both languages.

## 4.10 INTERTEXTUALITY AND TRANSLATION IN THE SOLID MANDALA

One of the stunning aspects of Patrick White's novel is the integration between literature and the life of ordinary characters in Sarsaparilla, the fictional suburb of Sydney. The insertion of a character (Waldo) working at the Municipal Library already functions as a backdrop to the discussion about the importance that literature should have in one's life (and the irony, by making Arthur, the character considered mentally retarded, the one who pursues not only physical contact with books, but also their actual understanding).

In this context, the presence of intertextual references, mainly by the reference to the titles of the books, is something which enriches our understanding of the characters, after all, "you are what you read"<sup>192</sup>. Thus, this would be one more issue in the translation: must the titles without a translation into the respective language be translated, or remain in English? The strategies adopted in the translations are shown below:

Exhibit 54 – Titles in English

| French                    | German              | Italian             | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2                     |
|---------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------|
| Mais ils étaient fiers de | Auf Waldo jedoch    | Però erano fieri di | Pero estaban        | Aunque estaban                |
| lui. Resté faible en      | waren sie stolz. In | Waldo. Anche se     | orgullosos de       | orgullosos de Waldo.          |
| mathématiques, il         | Mathematik blieb er | rimase debole in    | Waldo. Si bien      | Seguía flojo en               |
| remporta des prix dans    | zwar schwach, aber  | matematica, fu      | seguía flojo en     | matemáticas, pero se          |
| d'autres matières. Il     | in anderen Fächern  | premiato per altre  | Matemáticas, se     | llevaba todos los             |
| reçut les Idylles du roi, | gewann er ständig   | materie. Ricevette  | llevaba las palmas  | premios en las otras          |
| les Voyages en            | Preise. Er besaß    | Gli idilli del Re e | en las demás        | materias. Tenía Los           |
| compagnie d'une âne       | Idylls of the King, | Viaggi con un       | asignaturas. Tenía  | idilos del rey <sup>8</sup> y |
| et Tacite en deux         | Travels with a      | asino, e Tacito in  | Los idílios del     | Viajes con mi                 |
| volumes. Il les avait     | Donkey und den      | due volumi. E       | rey, Viajando con   | borrica9, y a Tácito          |
| même lus. Il lisait sans  | ganzen Tacitus in   | perfino li lesse.   | un burro y dos      | en dos volúmenes.             |
| cesse des livres, mais    | zwei Bänden. Und    | Leggeva sempre      | volúmenes de        | Incluso los leía.             |
| comme Papa était le       | er las diese Bücher | dei libri, ma dato  | Tácito. Incluso los | 8. Idylls of the King,        |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> For more information on the subject, see: STEFANI, Monica. *'You are what you read': intertextual relations in Patrick White's* The solid mandala. 2011. 118 f. Dissertação de Mestrado – Instituto de Letras, UFRGS, Porto Alegre.

| grand lecteur de la                           | sogar. Ei            | gentlich             | che Papà era il           | leía           | (WHITE,              | ciclo de poemas                 |
|---|----------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------------|
| famille, il le faisait                        | las er ständig, aber |                      | lettore dela              | 1973a, p. 94). |                      | narrativos de Lord              |
| presque frutivement                           | da Vater             | nun schon            | famiglia lo faceva        |                |                      | Tennyson, que                   |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.                             | einmal d             | en Ruf des           | per lo più di             |                |                      | retoma la leyenda               |
| 93).  | eifrigen l           | Lesers in            | nascosto                  |                |                      | del rey Arturo. [N.             |
|   | der Fami             | lie hatte,           | (WHITE, 1973c,            |                |                      | de la T.]                       |
|   | las Wald             | o meistens           | p. 88).                   |                |                      | 9. Travels with a               |
|   | eher Hei             | mlich                |                           |                |                      | Donkey in the                   |
|   | (WHITE               | , 1978, p.           |                           |                |                      | Cévennes de Robert              |
|   | 96).                 |                      |                           |                |                      | Louis Stevenson. [N.            |
|   |                      |                      |                           |                |                      | de la T.] (WHITE,               |
|   |                      |                      |                           |                |                      | 2016, p. 141).                  |
| English                                       |                      | ]                    | First Attempt             |                | Brazilian Po         | ortuguese - Revised             |
| But they were proud of V                      | Valdo.               | Mas eles ti          | nham orgulho de Wa        | ldo.           | Mas eles tinha       | am orgulho de Waldo.            |
| While remaining weak at                       | Maths,               | Enquanto             | permanecia fraco          | em             | Enquanto pe          | rmanecia fraco em               |
| he carried off prizes for o                   | other                | matemática           | a, ele conquist           | ava            | matemática, el       | e conquistava prêmios           |
| subjects. He had Idylls of                    | f the                | prêmios p            | or outras matérias.       | Ele            | em outras mat        | térias. Ele tinha <i>Idylls</i> |
| King, and Travels with a Donkey, tinha Idylls |                      | s of the King e Viag | ens                       | of the King e  | Viagens com um burro |                                 |
| and Tacitus in 2 vols. He                     | He even   com um bi  |                      | urro, e Tácito em 2 vols. |                | pelas Cevena.        | s, e Tácito em dois             |
| read them (WHITE, 1974                        | 4, p. 80-            | Ele até os l         | ia.                       |                | volumes. Ele a       | té os lia.                      |
| 81).  |                      |                      |                           |                |                      |                                 |

The new Spanish translation has the strategy of identifying the authorship of the intertextual references in footnotes and of translating the titles, regardless of their actual translation into Spanish or not. In Brazilian Portuguese, we carried out a thorough research on the Internet to find the translated titles. To our surprise, there is a recent translation by Cristian Clemente (2016) of *Viagem com um burro pelas Cevenas*, by the Brazilian publisher Carambaia, based in Sao Paulo, thus, accounting for the change in our translated passage. As for Tennyson's *Idylls of the King*, no translation has been found into Portuguese, yet, so the title remains in English in the translated version (the only difference is that these titles appear italicized in our translation).

The songs played at the piano by Dulcie, as well as the ones sung by Waldo, had their titles translated in the French, and in both Spanish versions, as shown next:

Exhibit 55 – Songs Played by Dulcie

| French | German | Italian | Spanish 1 | Spanish 2 |
|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-----------|

| C'est ce qu'elle fit en                                     | Und er san         | g In the               | Cosa che fece dopo              | Y               | así lo hizo                            | Y así lo hizo      |
|---|--------------------|------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------|--|--------------------|
| entendant les titres. Il                                    | Gloaming, The Tide |                        | aver sentito i titoli.          | de              | spués de oír los                       | cuando oyó los     |
| leur chanta A la brune,                                     | <i>will Turn</i> u | nd                     | Egli cantò In the               | títı            | ulos. Waldo les                        | títulos. Les cantó |
| Les Lendemains qui  | Singing Vo         | ices,                  | Gloaming, The Tide              | ca              | ntó Al                                 | "En el ocaso",     |
| chantent, Voix  | Marching I         | Feet –                 | Will Turn, Singing              | an              | ochecer,                               | "Cambiará la       |
| mélodieuses, Chanson  | alles leicht       | e,                     | Voices e Marching               | Vo              | olverá la marea                        | marea" y "Voces    |
| de marche (WHITE,   | populäre, i        | n die Zeit             | Feet (WHITE, 1973c,             | у١              | Voces que                              | que cantam, pies   |
| 1973b, p. 156).   | passende L         | ieder                  | p. 151).                        | ca              | ntam, pies que                         | que marchan"       |
|   | (WHITE, 1978, p.   |                        |                                 | mo              | archan                                 | (WHITE, 2016,      |
|   | 155).              |                        |                                 | (W              | VHITE, 1973a,                          | p. 225).           |
|   |                    |                        |                                 | p.              | 160).                                  |                    |
|   |                    |                        |                                 |                 |  |                    |
| English   |                    |                        | First Attempt                   |                 | Brazilian Port                         | tuguese - Revised  |
| And did when she heard                                      | d the titles.      | E ajudo                | u quando ela ouviu              | os              | E ajudou quar                          | ndo ela ouviu os   |
| He sang them <i>In the Gloaming</i> , <i>The</i> títulos. E |                    | títulos. E             | ele cantou para eles In t       | he              | e títulos. Ele cantou para eles In the |                    |
| Tide Will Turn, and Singing Voices, Gloa                    |                    | Gloamin                | Gloaming, The Tide Will Turn, e |                 | Gloaming, The                          | Tide Will Turn, e  |
| Marching Feet (WHITE, 1966, p.   Singing V                  |                    | Voices, Marching Feet. |                                 | Singing Voices, | Marching Feet.                         |                    |
| 137).   |                    |                        |                                 |                 |  |                    |

Our translation in Brazilian Portuguese followed the strategies adopted by the German and Italian versions: the titles were kept in English, as we have looked for potential actual references for them, but no results have been found.

Another point related to titles refers to the novel Waldo was supposedly writing. In the original, we have:

Exhibit 56 – Tiresias a Youngish Man

| French             | German               | Italian             | Spanish 1            | Spanish 2            |
|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| C'était l'année où | Das war im           | Fu quello l'anno in | Fue en ese año que   | Ese año Waldo        |
| Waldo Brown        | gleichen Jahr, in    | cui Waldo Brown     | Waldo Brown          | Brown comenzó lo     |
| commença ce qui    | dem Waldo mit der    | cominciò quello che | comenzó lo que       | que habría de        |
| devait devenir un  | Arbeit begann, die   | diventò un          | llegó a considerar   | transformarse en un  |
| fragment important | sich zu dem          | considerevole       | como un importante   | fragmento            |
| de son roman       | umfangreichen        | frammento del suo   | fragmento de su      | importante de su     |
| Tirésias, homme    | Fragment eines       | romanzo Tiresia da  | novella Tiresias, un | novela: Tiresias, un |
| juvénile (WHITE,   | Romans mit dem       | giovane (WHITE,     | joven (WHITE,        | joven (WHITE,        |
| 1973b, p. 197).    | Titel Tiresias – Ein | 1973c, p. 193).     | 1973a, p. 203).      | 2016, p. 277).       |
|                    | Noch Junger Mann     |                     |                      |                      |
|                    | entwickelte          |                     |                      |                      |

|                      | (WHITE, 1  | 978, p.   |            |           |                |              |            |        |     |
|----------------------|--|-----------|------------|-----------|----------------|--------------|------------|--------|-----|
|                      | 211).  |           |            |           |                |              |            |        |     |
| English              |  | First At  | tempt      |           | Brazilian P    | ortugues     | e - Revise | ed     |     |
| This was the year Wa | This was the year Waldo Brown   Este foi o ano que Waldo |           | ie Waldo I | Brown     | Este foi o ano | em que V     | Waldo Br   | own    |     |
| began what be        | ecame a  | começou   | o que      | se tornou | ı um           | começou o    | que se     | tornou | um  |
| considerable fragme  | ent of his   | considerá | vel frag   | mento de  | seu            | considerável | fragmen    | to de  | seu |
| novel Tiresias a You | ngish Man  | romance   | Tirésias   | quando    | (algo)         | romance Ti   | résias i   | ım Hor | nem |
| (WHITE, 1974, p. 17  | 3).  | jovem.    |            |           |                | Jovenzinho.  |            |        |     |

In English, it is possible to infer that the title is a reference (a parody) to James Joyce's *The* Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man (and the ironic tone would apparently be in the suffix "ish" in "youngish") and to the poem *The Waste Land*, written by T.S. Eliot in 1922, which revolves around the figure of Tiresias and indicates the sort of modernism aspired by Waldo in his writing career). At any rate, the translation into Spanish is just "Tiresias, un joven" (WHITE, 1977, p. 203). We would question if there is not any way to keep the suffix, and the possibilities in Spanish are interesting: ito, cillo, nito (albeit they are for diminutives). In Brazilian Portuguese, James Joyce's title is currently translated as "O retrato do artista quando jovem", so, the option which keeps the reference in the translation would be "Tirésias quando jovem". However, as a suggestion, we first opted to add "algo" ("somewhat") in parethenses before "jovem", to emphasise it in Brazilian Portuguese (and represent the effect produced by the suffix "ish" in the original). Yet, after rereading the fragment, we decided to focus on the suffix "ish", therefore preferring the form "Tirésias um Homem Jovenzinho", because it would match Waldo's position as the author of this novel, with his disdain being reflected in the diminutive form "jovenzinho" in Brazilian Portuguese, thus accounting for the suffix "ish".

About the titles, it is important to emphasize the strategy of the French translation in introducing footnotes to explain the authorship of the novels mentioned, for instance, *Around the Boree Log* and *The Golden Bough*:

Exhibit 57– Authorship identified

| French                | German           | Italian           | Spanish 1          | Spanish 2                  |
|-----------------------|------------------|-------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|
| Il avait lu plusieurs | Er hatte mehrere | Aveva letto       | Había leído varios | Había leído algunos libros |
| livres et connaissait | Bücher gelesen   | parecchi libri, e | libros y tenía     | y conocía personalmente    |
| personnellement le    | und war          | conosceva         | amistad personal   | al sacerdote que había     |
| cure qui écrivit      | persönlich mit   | personalmente il  | com el sacerdote   | escrito Around the Boree   |

| Autour de la Bûche               | dem Priester    |                               | prete che scrisse      | que escril | oiera                      | $Log^{17}$ .                |
|----------------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| de Borée <sup>1</sup> .          | bekannt, der    |                               | Intorno al tronco      | Alrededo   | r del                      | 17. Poema publicado en      |
| 1. Around the                    | Around the Bore | ee                            | d'acacia               | tronco de  | l alma                     | 1921 por Jhn O'Brien,       |
| Boree Log: recueil               | Log geschrieber |                               | (WHITE, 1973c,         | (WHITE,    | 1973b,                     | cuyo nombre verdadeiro      |
| de petits poems de               | hatte (WHITE,   |                               | p. 191).               | p. 201).   |                            | era Patrick Joseph          |
| John O'Brien.                    | 1978, p. 208).  |                               |                        |            |                            | Hartigan, sacerdote         |
| Boree: sorte                     |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | católico nacido en Nueva    |
| d'acacia répandu                 |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | Gales del Sur. Los versos   |
| en Australie.                    |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | evocan reiteradamente el    |
| (N.d.T.) (WHITE,                 |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | hogar de leños a la antigua |
| 1973a, p. 195).                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | usanza, símbolo de          |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | hospitalidade. El título    |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | hace referencia al boree,   |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | nombre vulgar de la         |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | Acacia pendula, árbol       |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | autóctono de Australia      |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | cuya madera es óptima       |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | como leña [N. de la T.]     |
|                                  |                 |                               |                        |            |                            | (WHITE, 2016, p. 275).      |
| English                          |                 |                               | First Attempt          |            | Brazil                     | ian Portuguese - Revised    |
| He had read several              | l books, and E  | le h                          | avia lido diversos liv | ros, e era | Ele hav                    | ia lido diversos livros, e  |
| was personally acq               | uainted with co | nh                            | ecido pessoal daque    | ele padre  | conhecia                   | pessoalmente aquele padre   |
| that priest who wrote Around the |                 | que escreveu Around the Boree |                        | que escre  | eveu Around the Boree Log. |                             |
| Boree Log (WHITE, 1974, p.       |                 | og.                           |                        |            |                            |                             |
| 171-172).                        |                 |                               |                        |            |                            |                             |

Surely, since it is a very specific reference to Australian Literature, it would be quite surprising to find this title translated into any language. However, we see that most translators translated the title without giving any kind of information about it, except the French and the new Spanish translation. In our case, following what we did with the songs sung by Waldo, we kept the title in English, and the option of inserting a footnote is not at all discarded, so as not to leave the reader without any reference to understand the sentence and feel Waldo's "literary importance".

It should be noted that there are many extracts from other works in *The Solid Mandala*, starting with the epigraph (which appears translated in most novels presented here), then moving to fragments by Carl Jung (with the meaning of "mandala" read by Arthur) and some stanzas from the poem *Fatima* by Alfred Tennyson:

Exhibit 58 – Tennyson's poem *Fatima* 

| French  | German  | Italian  | Spanish 1  | Spanish 2  |
|---|---|--|--|--|
| Un jour, Waldo  | Einmal hatte Waldo  | Una volta Waldo  | En una ocasión Waldo   | En cierta occasion,  |
| Brown trouva  | Brown dies gefunden:  | Brown aveva  | Brown había  | Waldo Brown había  |
| les vers  |   | trovato:   | encontrado:  | encontrado estos   |
| suivants:   |   |  |  | versos:  |
| Dans mon cerveau desséché mon esprit galope, Se rue de chute en chute, de syncope en syncope, Et s'evanouit comme lune au matin achoppe.  | Mein Geist<br>verdurstet, und mein<br>Herz wird bald<br>Ohnmächtig sinken:<br>wie des Monds<br>Gestalt<br>Blaß weicht am<br>Morgen vor des<br>Lichts Gewalt.                    | Nel mio arido cervello, lo spirito sprofonda di deliquio in deliquio e manca come una luna abbagliata all'albeggiare.  | En mi mente seca mi<br>espíritu pronto<br>Ahondando entre<br>desmayo y desmayo<br>Desfallece como la<br>encandilada luna en la<br>manãna   | En mi seca mente<br>pronto mi espíritu,<br>Ahondando entre<br>desmayo y desmayo,<br>Sucumbe como la<br>deslumbrada luna de<br>la mañana.   |
| Le vent vibre et tinte comme corde d'argent, Et, s'élevant à midi, le feu phosphorescent Inonde les collines de son embrasement, Les cieux vers elles se penchent dans leur désir ardent (WHITE, 1973b, p. 139) | Der Wind klingt wie auf Silbersaiten; Von hinterm Tag die Feuer gleiten Her auf die Hügel. Und des Himmels Weiten Sich sehnsuchtsvoll tief niederbreiten (WHITE, 1974, p. 146). | Il vento risuona come un filo d'argento, e dal meriggio un fuoco si riversa sui colli, e non lontano i cieli si protendono in giù dal desiderio (WHITE, 1973c, p. 134) | El viento suena como um alambre de plata Y desde el más allá del mediodía um fuego Se derrama sobre las colinas, y más cerca Los cielos se inclinan con deseo (WHITE, 1973a, p. 142) | El viento suena como una cuerda de plata y más allá del melodia un fuego se derrama sobre las Colinas, y más acá, los cielos se rinden en su deseo 13  13. Fragmento de "Fatima", poema de lord Alfred Tennyson: In my dry brain my spirit soon,/ Down-deepening from swoon to swoon,/ Faints like a dazzled morning moon.// The wind sounds like a silver wire,/ And from beyond the noon a fire/ Is pour'd upon the hills, and higher/ |
|   |   |  |  | The skies stoop down in their desire. [N. de la T.] (WHITE, 2016, p. 201-202).   |

| English   | First Attempt  | Brazilian Portuguese - Revised  |
|---|--|---|
| On one occasion Waldo Brown   | Em uma ocasião, Waldo havia  | Em uma ocasião, Waldo havia   |
| had found:  | encontrado:  | encontrado:   |
| In my dry brain my spirit soon,<br>Down-deepening from swoon to<br>swoon,<br>Faints like a dazzled morning<br>moon.   | No meu árido cérebro meu espírito<br>sem demora,<br>Afundando de desmaio em desmaio,<br>Desfalece como uma deslumbrada<br>lua da manhã.                      | No meu árido cérebro meu espírito em um raio,<br>Afundando de desmaio em desmaio,<br>Desfalece como uma deslumbrada<br>lua ao fim da madrugada.               |
| The wind sounds like a silver wire, And from beyond the noon a fire Is pour'd upon the hills, and nigher The skies stoop down in their desire (WHITE, 1974, p. 121-122) | O vento soa como um fio de prata,<br>E desde além do meio-dia uma<br>chama<br>Se derrama sobre os montes, e mais<br>perto<br>Os céus se curvam em seu desejo | O vento soa como um fio de prata,<br>E desde além do meio-dia uma<br>chama<br>Se derrama sobre os montes, e mais<br>sobejo<br>Os céus se curvam em seu desejo |

Our option would be to find whether those works have been translated and then duly identify the reference of such works in our translation, which was the procedure adopted by the new Spanish translation, even adding the original stanzas. In the epigraph of the novel, for example, we would right away make a reference to the new translation of *Os Irmãos Karamazov*, by Paulo Bezerra (from the Russian), published in 2009. As for the poem, we have searched on the Internet and no-one in Portuguese (either of Portugal or of Brazil) has attempted to translate it, evincing the same unsuccessful results when we were looking for a translation for *Idylls of the King*. Thus, this certainly signals the kind of work that needs to be done with the poetry present in this novel, which would be enough to be addressed in another thesis or dissertation.

Now, we will move on to see how the translation of important scenes represented a challenge in terms of word choice to keep tension: the mandala dance, the meeting at the library and Waldo's death.

### 4.11 IMPORTANT SCENES IN THE SOLID MANDALA

In this sub-chapter, we will show the translation of very complex scenes which we carried out, and that might be considered three high points (not to say climaxes) of the novel: Waldo's death (which ends Waldo's and Arthur's chapters), the meeting at the library and the mandala scene.

In "The Prodigal Son" Patrick White writes: "Always something of a frustrated painter, and a composer *manqué*, I wanted to give my book the textures of music, the sensuousness of paint, to convey through the theme and characters of *Voss* what Delacroix and Blake might have seen, what Mahler and Liszt might have heard". His melodious language is charged with emotion and replete with metaphor. It is rich in contrasts and full-toned, often on a poetic level. The use of antithesis, paradoxes, the ability to call forth a smile in the midst of the serious contribute to its vigour. His light and colour arrangements are filled with symbols that appeal to the senses. He uses them both in a direct and in a transferred sense. (BJÖRKSTÉN, 1976, p. 120).

White's language is musical, ryhtmical. His descriptions intermingle the scenery with the feelings of the ones who experience them, often contrasting the bright of the landscape to the gloom of a given character, or vice-versa. For instance, the simplicity of Arthur's tasks of baking bread and milking a cow is contrasted to the complex reading of *The Brothers Karamazov*, or the understanding of people or the arrangements of a funeral. The direct and transferred senses mentioned by Björkstén in the quotation surely are the main challenges in translation.

Let us start with the scene in which Waldo dies, which demands extra sensitivity, care and attention to detail when choosing the words, since the same scene appears in the novel depicted according to each twin's point of view. The first perspective comes from Waldo's Chapter:

Exhibit 59 – Waldo's death (according to himself)

| French                    | German                 | Italian               | Spanish 1          | Spanish 2           |
|---------------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| Et dire que Waldo         | Immer hatte Waldo      | E dire che Waldo si   | Cuando Waldo se    | En tanto que        |
| s'était toujours          | schon überlegt – jetzt | era semre chiesto,    | había preguntado   | Waldo siempre se    |
| demandé, bien que la      | allerdings waren       | molto più di ora, se  | siempre, más       | había preguntado,   |
| question s'estompât à     | seine Gedanken fast    | Arthur fosse          | debilmente ahora,  | últimamente         |
| présent, si Arthur avait  | verstummt – ob         | sensibile alle parole | si Arthur se       | mucho menos, si     |
| remarqué cette            | Arthur etwas von       | pronunciare con       | enteraría del mal  | Arthur se daba      |
| intention de lui faire du | dem Schmerz ahnte,     | l'intenzione di       | que pensaba        | cuenta de la        |
| mal. Ou Dulcie. Jamais    | der letztendlich ihm   | ferirlo. Lo stesso    | hacerle. O Dulcie. | herida que          |
| il ne montra à Dulcie     | bestimmt war. Oder     | poteva dirsi di       | Nunca le había     | pensaba infligirle. |
| qu'il avait remarqué      | Dulcie – dasselbe bei  | Dulcie. Waldo non     | dejado notar que   | O Dulcie. Él        |
| cette moustache. Et la    | ihr. Er hatte ihr nie  | aveva mai dato        | había reparado en  | nunca le había      |
| moustache de Dulcie       | zu verstehen           | segno di essersi      | su bigote. Pero el | dado muestras de    |
| aurait pu devenir         | gegeben, daß ihm ihr   | accorto dei suoi      | bigote de Dulcie   | que había           |
| l'instrument de sa        | Schnurrbart            | baffi. Qudno          | posiblemente       | reparado en su      |
| destruction.              | aufgefallen war. Wo    | avrebbe forse         | hubiera sido el    | bigote. Y el        |

Mais Arthur était dieser Schnurrbart bigote de Dulcie potuto usarli per motivo de su imberbe ou presque. doch möglicherweise distruggerla. destrucción. posiblemente das Mittel gewesen Ma Arthur, così Y Arthur tan había sido el Tout à la peine de wäre, mit dem man mellifluo. prácticamente instrumento de su détruire Arthur, il perçut vaguement, sie hätte vernichten Nel dolore che suave. destrucción. können. provava per la En medio del Pero Arthur era plutôt qu'il n'entendit, les dernières paroles de Aber Arthur hatte necessità di dolor de destruir a prácticamente keinen Schnurrbart. celui-ci. distruggere Arthur, Arthur, más que lampiño. "Je sais que cela ne Sein Gesicht war notò, più che udire, oír percibía las A través de la ressemblait pas paktisch glatt. In le sue ultime parole. últimas palabras pena que le seinem Schmerz über "Los o che non era beaucoup à un poème, de su hermano. causaba destruir a die Notwendigkeit, una bela poesia." Sé que jamás plaida Arthur pour as Arthur, intuyó fue un poema défense. J'aurai dû le Arthur jetzt Arthur stava más que oyó sus détruire vernichten zu elaborando la sua decía Arthur últimas palabras. immédiatement. Te müssen, registrierte difesa. "Avrei esbozando su Sé que no era demande pardon, er die letzten Worte dovuto distruggerla defensa –. Debí un buen poema – Waldo." seines Bruders eher súbito. Scusami, haberlo destruido Arthur armaba su Waldo." Des mots, pierres mur, als daß er sie inmediatamente. defensa -. réchauffées. Le pietre riscaldate Perdona, Waldo. Tendría que hörte. "Un poème, cela? Ce «Ich weiß ja, daß e delle parole. Las cálidas haberlo destruido skein besonders "Quella poesia? piedras de apenas lo escribí. repugnant mythe du sang!" gutes Gedicht war. « Quel disgustoso palabras. Discúlpame Waldo haleta en Arthur mühte sich mito del sangue!" −¿Ese poema? Waldo. Ese inmundo verzweifelt, eine Waldo rimase senza Las entibiadas entendant sa propre piedras de las Verteidigungsstrategi fiato al suono della mito de sangre! voix. palabras. "Je t'aurais donné çe e zu entwickeln. »Ich propria voce. jadeó Waldo para "Ti avrei dato mandala, mais tu ne hätte es gleich wieder oír su propia voz. − ¿Ese poema? manifestais aucune wegwerfen sollen. volentieri il -Te hubiera dado Ese repugnante envie de l'avoir. Entschuldige mandala, ma tu non el mandala, pero mito de *sangre*! – Je n'ai jamais aimé Waldo.« hai mai dimostrato tú nunca Waldo se les billes. Je ne suis Worte. Die warmen di volerlo." demostraste sobresaltò al oír Steine der Worte. jamais arrivé à leur "Non ho mai dato quererlo. su propia voz. importanza alle »Gedicht? Du donner le coup de -Nunca me Te habría dado meinst, diesen pouce qu'il fallait." palline. Non ho mai importaron las el mandala, pero diesen widerwärtigen bolitas. Mi pulgar Il était subjugue par le saputo controllarle nunca visage d'Arthur, on Blut-Mythos!« cool pollice." nunca pudo demostraste que aurait dit un grand Waldo stockte beim Era affascinato da dominarlas. lo querías. bouton d'or sur le point quella grande Estaba fascinado Jamás me Klang seiner eigenen de s'ouvrir. De Stimme vor Schreck calendula che era la por la gran interesaron las s'ouvrir. De fast der Atem. faccia di Arthur e caléndula que bolitas. Nunca

| s'epanouir. De tomber.   | »Ich hä             | tte dir ja das | che cominciava ad    | comenzaba a            | pude jugar bien.    |
|--------------------------|---------------------|----------------|----------------------|------------------------|---------------------|
| "Lâche-moi! Wald!        | Mandal              | a gegeben,     | aprirsi. Ad aprirsi. | abrise en el rosto     | Lo fascinaba        |
| Waldo!"                  | aber du             | hast nicht     | A frammentarsi. A    | de Arthur. A           | observar que esa    |
| De choir. Plus bas. Plus | einmal              | angedeutet,    | sgretolarsi.         | abrirse. A             | gran caléndula      |
| bas (WHITE, 1973b, p.    | daß du              | es haben       | "Lasciami andare!    | separarse. A caer.     | que era la cara de  |
| 241-242).                | wolltest            | t.«            | Wald! Waldo!"        | -¡Suéltame!            | Arthur              |
|                          | «Mit M              | urmeln         | La sua faccia crollò | ¡Waldo! <i>¡Waldo!</i> | comenzaba a         |
|                          | spielen             | – das hat      | in pezzi (WHITE,     | Mientras caía.         | abrirse. A abrirse. |
|                          | mich sc             | hon immer      | 1973c, p. 239-240).  | Caía. Caía             | A deshacerse. A     |
|                          | gelangv             | veilt.         |                      | (WHITE, 1973a,         | caer.               |
|                          | Außerd              | em waren       |                      | p. 248-249).           | –¡Suéltame!         |
|                          | meine F             | inger dafür    |                      |                        | ¡Wald! ¡Wald-o!     |
|                          | zu unge             | eschickt.«     |                      |                        | Mientras se         |
|                          | Er war              | fasziniert von |                      |                        | hundía. Más y       |
|                          | der gro             | Ben, gelben    |                      |                        | más (WHITE,         |
|                          | Ringelb             | lume. Von      |                      |                        | 2016, p. 335).      |
|                          | Arthurs             | Gesicht.       |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | Arthurs             | Gesicht -      |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | eine gro            | oße, gelbe     |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | Ringelb             | lume. Die      |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | jetzt be            | gann, sich zu  |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | öffnen.             | Die sich       |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | öffnete.            | Und zerfiel.   |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | Und eir             | ıfach fiel.    |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | »Laß m              | ich los!       |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | Waldo!              | Wal-do!«       |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | Und ein             | fach fiel, wie |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | fallenge            | elassen. Nach  |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | unten. Immer weiter |                |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | nach unten (WHITE,  |                |                      |                        |                     |
|                          | 1978, p             | . 262).        |                      |                        |                     |
| English                  |                     | Fir            | st Attempt           | Brazilian Portu        | guese - Revised     |

Quando Waldo sempre havia se

# wondered, fainter now, whether Arthur noticed the hurt which was intended for him. Or Dulcie. He had never shown her he had noticed that moustache. And Dulcie's moustache might possibly have been the means of perguntado, mais débil agora, se Arthur notava a mágoa destinada para ele. Ou Dulcie. Ele nunca havia mostrado a ela que ele havia notado aquele bigode. E o bigode de Dulcie possivelmente teria sido o meio da destruição dela.

always

had

When

Waldo

Quando Waldo sempre havia se perguntado, mais débil agora, se Arthur notava a mágoa destinada para ele. Ou Dulcie. Ele nunca havia mostrado a ela que ele havia notado aquele bigode. E o bigode de Dulcie possivelmente teria sido o meio da destruição dela.

her destruction.

But Arthur so practically smooth.

Through the pain of destroying Arthur he noticed more than heard Arthur's last words.

"I know it wasn't much of a poem." Arthur was shaping his defence. "Oughter have destroyed it at once. Apologise, Waldo."

The warmed stones of words.

"That poem? That disgusting blood myth!" Waldo gasped to hear his own voice.

"I would have given the mandala, but you didn't show you wanted it."

"I never cared for marbles. My thumb could never control them."

He was entranced by Arthur's great marigold of a face beginning to open. Opening. Coming apart. Falling.

"Let me go! Wald! Waldo!"
As dropping. Down. Down.
(WHITE, 1974, p. 213-214).

Mas Arthur tão praticamente tranquilo.

Pela dor de destruir Arthur ele notou mais do que ouviu as últimas palavras de Arthur.

Sei que não era muito um
 poema - Arthur estava formando
 sua defesa. - Devia ter destruído
 aquilo de uma vez. Desculpa,
 Waldo.

As pedras quentes de palavras.

- Aquele poema? Aquele mito
   nojento de sangue! Waldo
   arquejou para ouvir sua própria voz.
- Teria dado a você a mandala,
   mas você não mostrou que a queria.
- Nunca gostei de bolas de gude.
   Meu dedo nunca conseguia controlá-las.

Ele estava extasiado pelo grande cravo-de-defunto do rosto de Arthur começando a se abrir. Abrindo. Se esfacelando. Caindo.

Deixe-me ir! Wald! Waldo!Como pingando. Para baixo. Para baixo.

Mas Arthur tão praticamente tranquilo.

Pela dor de destruir Arthur ele notou mais do que ouviu as últimas palavras de Arthur.

Sei que não era um grande
 poema - Arthur estava formando sua
 defesa. - Devia ter destruído aquilo de
 uma vez. Desculpa, Waldo.

As pedras quentes de palavras.

- Aquele poema? Aquele mito nojento de sangue! – Waldo arquejou para ouvir sua própria voz.
- Teria dado a você a mandala,
   mas você não mostrou que a queria.
- Nunca gostei de bolas de gude.
   Meu dedo nunca conseguia controlálas.

Ele estava extasiado pelo grande cravo-de-defunto do rosto de Arthur começando a se abrir. Abrindo. Se esfacelando. Caindo.

Me deixe ir! Wald! Waldo!Como caindo. Para baixo. Para baixo.

In this fragment, we had to be careful about possible ambiguities, such as in the part referring to Dulcie's moustache. In English, the references are quite clear, but in Brazilian Portuguese, we need to repeat the pronouns to avoid any conflicts with the narrator of the story ("E o bigode de Dulcie possivelmente teria sido o meio da destruição dela"). Another instance which required changes was the structure "much of a poem": in our first attempt, we translated it literally, but when rereading that phrase, we could feel its strangeness in Brazilian Portuguese. In the revision process, we used only the adjective "grande" (before the noun "poema"), which clarified Arthur's line in translation using a single word. After that, recalling Björkstén's previous comment – as we can see vegetation in the form of an existing species in

Brazil being intermingled with the character's features, contrasting beautiful natural elements to the mood of the scene –, "marigold" was translated as "cravo-de-defunto", and notice that it appears along with "extasiado" ("entranced") in the same sentence, referring to Waldo's reactions to his own death. We made a syntactical change in Arthur's words, when he asks Waldo to let him go: since Arthur tends to speak in an informal way, we decided that it would be more natural to use the ungrammatical structure in Brazilian Portuguese with the possessive pronoun appearing before the verb: "me deixa". At last, the end was translated literally, with "para baixo" being repeated (or alongated, as we need two sintagms, in this case, to translate the meaning of "down" in Brazilian Portuguese). The first Spanish version had a good solution, using the verb "cair" (fall down) to render the same meaning with just one word, although repeating it three times, instead of twice. After rereading the passage, we preferred to use the form "caindo" in Brazilian Portuguese, because it sounded better than the previous option "pingando" and matched well with the form "para baixo".

Let us observe the same scene, now seen through Arthur's perspective:

Exhibit 60 – Waldo's death (according to Arthur)

| French               | German                 | Italian               | Spanish 1         | Spanish 2           |
|----------------------|------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------|---------------------|
| Arthur craignait     | Arthur fürchtete, daß  | Arthur aveva paura    | Arthur temía que  | Temía que Waldo     |
| que Waldo ne         | Waldo sich             | che Waldo si          | Waldo estuviese   | se estuviera        |
| meure de la haine    | anschicken könnte,     | preparasse a morire   | preparándose a    | preparando para     |
| qu'il avait          | an dem Haß zu          | dell'odio che egli    | morir por el odio | morir, morir presa  |
| engendrée en lui.car | sterben, den er in ihm | aveva sempre          | que había         | del odio que había  |
| c'était lui et non   | erweckt hatte. Denn    | scatenato in lui.     | alimentado en él. | cultivado en su     |
| Waldo qu'il fallait  | er war schuld, nicht   | Perché lui, non       | Porque él, y no   | interior. Porque el |
| blâmer. Arthur       | Waldo. Er, Arthur      | Waldo, era da         | Waldo, era el     | culpable era él, no |
| Brown, générateur    | Brown, Bote des        | biasimare. Arthur     | culpable. Arthur  | Waldo. Arthur       |
| de haine.            | Schmerzes.             | Brown, la causa del   | Brown, el         | Brown, el que       |
| Waldo épouvanté      | Und dann griff         | dolore.               | procurador de     | procura el dolor.   |
| par leur découverte  | Waldo Brown in der     | Allora Waldo, nello   | dolores.          | En la agonía de ese |
| commune, avança      | Agonie ihrer           | spasimo della loro    | Entonces Waldo,   | descubrimiento      |
| la main et saisit le | gemeinsamen            | comune scoperta,      | en el calvario de | que habían hecho    |
| poignet d'Arthur,    | Entdekkung zu und      | allungò la mano e lo  | su descubrimiento | los dos, Waldo      |
| pour le marquer à    | packet seinen Bruder   | afferrò per il poslo, | conjunto, se      | extendió el brazo y |
| tout jamais de       | bei den                | per imprimere in lui  | incroporò y lo    | le asió la muñeca,  |
| l'empreinte du       | Handgelenken, um       | per sempre l'ultimo   | agarrò por la     | para estampar allí  |
| dernier moment.      | ihm für immer diesen   | momento.              | muñeca, para      | para siempre la     |
| "Waldo! Lâche-       | letzten Augenblick     | "Waldo! Lasciami      | imprimir en él,   | marca del último    |

moi! Wald!" Pour massif et épais qu'il fût, le frère de Waldo, ce grand idiot d'Arthur, était capable de perdre la tête par amour et, à présent, par la mort de cet amour. Waldo ne bougeait plus, mais restait attaché à Arthur par le poignet. Quand Arthur s'aperçut du meurtre qu'il avait commis sur son frère, il essaya de s'en dégager. Mais il n'y réussit pas immédiatement, car les doigts de ce mort le retenaient dans l'étreinte de leurs cercles d'acier, décidés à le soumettre à cruelle épreuve. Aussi dutil lutter pour se libérer. Il réussit finalement à briser l'étau de fer. Alors Arthur, pris de panique, courut en tous sens dans la Maison où ils vécurent leur vie ou leur commune existence. Par miracle, les cris

aufzuprägen. »Waldo! Laß mich los! Waldo!« So groß und so schwammig er auch war, Arthur, der Bruder Waldo smit der weichen Birne, konnte einfach auseinanderfallen, koonte auseinanderfallen aus Liebe und fiel jetzt auseinander, weil die Liebe starb. Waldo lag still, aber immer noch an Arthurs Handgelenke gekettet. Als Arthur den Mord erkannte, den er an seinem Bruder begangen hatte, versuchte er, sich freizumachen. Das gelang ihm nicht sofort, den die Finger dieses toten Mannes schienen enschlossen, ihn in ihren stählernen Reifen festzuhalten und vor Gericht zu zerren. Also mußte er kämpfen. Und schließlich gelang es ihm, die metallenen Ringe aufzubrechen. Und dann stürmte

Arthur blindlings

andare! Wald." Per quanto fosse corpulento ed elastico, Arthur, il grosso fratello scemo di Waldo, poteva essere estremamente fragile di fronte all'amore ed ora fonte all morte dell'amore. Waldo giaceva immobile, ma ancora attaccato al polso di Arthur. Quando Arthur si rese conto di aver assassinato suo fratello, tentò di liberarsene. Non ci riuscì subito, erché le dita del morto erano decise, coi loro anelli metallici, a trascinarlo in giudizio. Allora dovette lottare. E all fine spezzò la morsa d'acciaio. Poi Arthur corse in preda al panico per la casa dove le loro vite, o meglio la loro vita, era stata vissuta fino in fondo. Per poco le sue urla non feero crollare l'edificio. Prima che sbattesse una porta davanti alle facce sbalordite dei

indeleblemente, el último momento. - ¡Waldo! ¡Suéltame! Wald. Aunque era grueso y fofo, Arthur, el hermano grande de Waldo, podía desmoronarse como un objeto por amor, y ahora el amor moría. Waldo yacía inmóvil, pero sin soltar la muñeca de Arthur. Cuando Arthur vio el asesinato que había perpetrado en su hermano comenzó a tratar de liberarse. No lo logró en seguida, porque los dedos de aquel hombre muerto estaban decididos, firmes como un puño de acero, a llevarlo a juicio. Así, tuvo que luchar contra él. Y finalmente logró abrir el metal. Luego Arthur corrió por la casa en la que sus vidas, o la vida,

momento. - ¡Waldo! ¡Suéltame, Wald! Grandote y fofo como era, el corpulento hermano ganso de Waldo podía desmoronarse por amor, y ahora porque el amor moría. Waldo no se movía, pero aún aferraba la muñeca de Arthur. Cuando Arthur vio el asesinato que había cometido. intentó librarse. No lo consiguió de inmediato porque los dedos del hombre muerto eran círculos de acero resueltos a llevarlo a juicio. De modo que tuvo de luchar. Y por fin pudo romper el metal. Entonces, huyó despavorido por las habitaciones en que habían transcurrido sus vidas, o la vida, hasta el final. Milagrosamente, los gritos

| déchirants ne firent               | durch das Haus, in          |                                     | cani (WHITE, 1973c,                | hab                                 | ía sido vivida                     | arrancados de su    |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------|
| pas s'écrouler la                  | dem ihr Leben, oder         |                                     | p. 329-330).                       | hast                                | ta el fin. Fue                     | pecho no            |
| bâtisse. Puis il                   | das Leben überhaupt,        |                                     |                                    | extr                                | año que los                        | derrumbaron la      |
| claqua la porte sur                | sich bis zum Ende           |                                     |                                    | grite                               | os que                             | casa. Antes de que  |
| les chiens éberlués                | abgespielt hatte. Es        |                                     |                                    | brot                                | taron de él no                     | la cerrara de un    |
| (WHITE, 1973b, p.                  | war ein Wunder, daß         |                                     |                                    | deri                                | rubaram la                         | portazo en el       |
| 333-334).                          | die Schreie, die aus        |                                     |                                    | estr                                | uctura. Antes                      | hocico de los       |
|                                    | ihm hervorbra               | chen,                               |                                    | de c                                | que cerrara con                    | sorprendidos        |
|                                    | nicht das gesamte           |                                     |                                    | un p                                | ortazo ante                        | perros (WHITE,      |
|                                    | Gebäude                     |                                     |                                    | los                                 | sobresaltados                      | 2016, p. 452).      |
|                                    | zusammenstürz               |                                     |                                    | rost                                | ros de los                         |                     |
|                                    | ließen. Bis er              |                                     |                                    | peri                                | ros (WHITE,                        |                     |
|                                    | schließlich die             | Tür                                 |                                    | 197                                 | 3a, p. 342-                        |                     |
|                                    | von außen zuschlug          |                                     |                                    | 343                                 | ).                                 |                     |
|                                    | die erschrockenen           |                                     |                                    |                                     |                                    |                     |
|                                    | Gesichter der Hunde         |                                     |                                    |                                     |                                    |                     |
|                                    | hinter sich lassend         |                                     |                                    |                                     |                                    |                     |
|                                    | (WHITE, 1978, p.            |                                     |                                    |                                     |                                    |                     |
|                                    | 363-364).                   |                                     |                                    |                                     |                                    |                     |
| English                            | English                     |                                     | First Attempt                      |                                     | Brazilian Po                       | rtuguese - Revised  |
| Arthur was afraid                  | Waldo was                   | Arthur estava com medo de que       |                                    | Arthur estava com medo de que       |                                    |                     |
| preparing to die of                | the hatred he               | Waldo estava se preparando para     |                                    | Waldo estivesse se preparando       |                                    |                     |
| had bred in him. Be                | ecause he, not              | morrer do ódio que ele havia criado |                                    | para morrer do ódio que ele havia   |                                    |                     |
| Waldo, was to b                    | Waldo, was to blame. Arthur |                                     | nele. Porque ele, e não Waldo,     |                                     | criado nele. Porque ele, e não     |                     |
| Brown, the getter of p             | Brown, the getter of pain.  |                                     | devia ser culpado. Arthur Brown, o |                                     | Waldo, devia ser culpado. Arthur   |                     |
| Then Waldo, in the agony of their  |                             | obtenedor da dor.                   |                                    | Brown, o obtenedor da dor.          |                                    |                     |
| joint discovery, reached out and   |                             | Então Waldo, na agonia da           |                                    | Então Waldo, na agonia da           |                                    |                     |
| grabbed him by the wrist, to       |                             | descoberta conjunta deles, esticou- |                                    | descoberta conjunta deles, esticou- |                                    |                     |
| imprint him for ever with the last |                             | se e pegou-o pelo pulso, para       |                                    |                                     | se e pegou-o pelo pulso, para      |                     |
| moment.                            |                             | imprimir nele para sempre o último  |                                    |                                     | imprimir nele para sempre o último |                     |
| "Waldo! Let me go! Wald."          |                             | momento.                            |                                    |                                     | momento.                           |                     |
|                                    |                             | – Waldo! Me deixa ir! Wald.         |                                    |                                     | – Waldo! Me deixa ir! Wald.        |                     |
| Big and spongy though he was,      |                             | Embora fosse grande e esponjoso,    |                                    |                                     | Embora fosse grande e esponjoso,   |                     |
|                                    | ough he was,                | Lilloo                              | ra rosse grande e esponj           | 050,                                | Emoora rosse                       | grande e esponjoso, |

Waldo, conseguia ir desmoronando

como uma coisa por amor e agora a

Waldo was lying still, but still

Waldo estava deitado imóvel,

mas ainda ligado a Arthur pelo

pulso.

could go crumbly as one thing for

love and now the death of it.

– Waldo! Me deixa ir! Wald.
Embora fosse grande e esponjoso,
Arthur, o grande irmão pamonha de Waldo, conseguia ir desmoronando como uma coisa por amor e agora a morte disso.

Waldo estava deitado imóvel, mas ainda ligado a Arthur pelo pulso. When Arthur saw the murder he had committed on his brother he began to try to throw him off. He did not immediately succeed, because the fingers of this dead man were determined, in their steel circlets, to bring him to trial. So he had to fight against it. And finally snapped the metal open.

Then Arthur went stampeding through the house in which their lives, or life, had been lived until the end. It was a wonder the cries torn out of him didn't bring the structure down. Before he slammed a door on the shocked faces of dogs (WHITE, 1974, p. 293-294).

Quando Arthur viu o crime que ele havia cometido no seu irmão ele começou a tentar se livrar dele. Ele não conseguiu imediatamente, porque os dedos deste homem morto estavam determinados, nos seus anéis de aço, para levá-lo a julgamento. Então ele teve de lutar contra isso. E finalmente rompeu o metal e o abriu.

Então Arthur saiu em debandada pela casa na qual as vidas deles, ou vida, haviam sido vividas até o fim. Era um assombro que os gritos tirados dele não derrubavam a estrutura. Antes que ele batesse uma porta nas caras chocadas dos cachorros.

Quando Arthur viu o assassinato que havia cometido contra o seu irmão ele começou a tentar se desvencilhar dele. Ele não conseguiu imediatamente, porque os dedos deste homem morto estavam determinados, nos seus anéis de aço, a levá-lo a julgamento. Então ele teve de lutar contra isso. E finalmente rompeu o metal e o abriu.

Então Arthur saiu em debandada pela casa na qual as vidas deles, ou vida, haviam sido vividas até o fim. Era um assombro que os gritos tirados dele não derrubassem a estrutura. Antes que ele batesse uma porta nas caras chocadas dos cachorros.

Again, the possibility of ambiguity appears in the translation in Brazilian Portuguese in the first sentence, but as we move on in our reading, the references of the pronouns become clearer. Notice that several changes in verb tenses had to be made to refine the text: instead of an imperfect past, we should use the idea of a near future, or subjunctive (as in "estivesse" and "derrubassem"). The deletion of some pronouns was necessary as well, although it does not diminish the potential ambiguity verified in the penultimate paragraph: in English, the references are clear; however, in our first translation in Brazilian Portuguese, the verb "livrarse" (for "throw off") has as its object the pronoun "ele", which can be dubious, because it may refer to the noun "crime" (livrar-se de um crime, livrar-se do irmão morto, do cadáver). The procedure adopted was to change the verb to "desvencilhar", so as to reduce the possibility of an ambiguity – the collocation of the verb "desvencilhar" in Portuguese is more natural with the noun corpo ("body") in this context, rather than "assassinato" ("murder"). This last word was changed too: it is stronger to use "assassinato" (which is more specific) in this context, rather than crime (which is more general).

In the fragment, the word "dill" reappears, and notice that we first translated it as "tiririca", following our first strategy. However, we are going to use the alternative

"pamonha" again in this section, assuming that it worked well previously in conveying the polysemy of the original word in English.

Now we will analyze one of the climaxes of the novel: when the twin brothers meet at the Mitchell Library and start discussing over *The Brothers Karamazov*. Again, the scene is presented according to two different perspectives. Let us start with Waldo's:

Exhibit 61– Scene at the Library (Waldo's perspective)

| French               | German                   | Italian              | Spanish 1                                | Spanish 2                            |
|----------------------|--------------------------|----------------------|--|--------------------------------------|
| "Tu viens            | »Was soll das? So        | "Vieni qua           | – ¿Vienes a menudo?–                     | −¿Vienes a                           |
| souvent?             | hast du mich noch nie    | spesso?"             | preguntó.                                | menudo?– preguntó.                   |
| demanda-t-il.        | genannt – warum also     | "Soltanto i giorni   | <ul> <li>Sólo los días en que</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Sólo cuando hago</li> </ul> |
| -Seulement           | jetzt?«                  | che faccio           | traigo algún recado de                   | un recado para Mrs.                  |
| quando j'ai une      | » Weil ich mich so       | qualche              | Mrs. Allwright. Hoy                      | Allwright. Hoy me                    |
| corse à faire        | freue, dich zu sehen.    | commissione per      | me ha mandado llevar                     | envió a buscar los                   |
| pour M <sup>me</sup> | Hier in der              | la signora           | sus gafas para que les                   | vidrios de las                       |
| Allwright.           | Bibliothek. Wo du        | Allwright. Oggi      | pongan un nuevo                          | ventanas porque les                  |
| Aujourd'hui elle     | arbeitest. Bis jetzt     | mi ha mandato a      | armazón.                                 | colocaron marcos                     |
| m'a envoyé           | habe ich mich lieber     | prenderle gli        | Palpó su bolsillo.                       | nuevos – y se puso a                 |
| chercher ses         | nicht bei dir gezeigt,   | occhiali con una     | – Eso me recuerda –                      | buscar algo en el                    |
| lunettes, qui        | weil ich dachte, daß     | montatura            | agregó – que me he                       | bolsillo –. Eso me                   |
| avaient besoin       | es dich vielleicht stört | nuova." Si tastò la  | olvidado de ellas. No                    | recuerda que me                      |
| d'une nouvelle       | und daß du es nicht      | tasvca. "Questo      | veía el momento de                       | olvidé de los vidrios.               |
| monture."            | magst.«                  | mi fa ricordare      | llegar aquí para seguir                  | No veía la hora de                   |
| Il tãta sa poche.    | Das war ein              | che finora me li     | con Los hermanos                         | seguir leyendo <i>Los</i>            |
| "Cela me fait        | vernünftiger             | sono dimenticati.    | Karamazov.                               | hermanos                             |
| penser que j'ai      | Gedankengang, daß        | Ho preferito         | Arthur mencionó el                       | Karamazov.                           |
| oublié d'aller       | es Waldo nur leid tat,   | venire subito qua    | título de un modo muy                    | Mencionó el título                   |
| les chercher.        | seinem Bruder nicht      | per continuare I     | natural y fluido, como                   | con tanta naturalidad                |
| J'etait trop         | trotzdem über den        | fratelli             | si sirviera un chorrito                  | como si estuviera                    |
| pressé de venir      | Mund fahren zu           | Karamazov."          | de leche consensada a                    | mostrando una                        |
| ici pour             | können.                  | Arthur disse iil     | un cliene en lo de                       | marca de leche                       |
| continuer Les        | »Kommst du oft           | titolo con la stessa | Allwright.                               | condensada a un                      |
| Frères               | hierher?« fragte er.     | naturalezza con      | – Pero – dijo Waldo,                     | cliente en el alamcén                |
| Karamazov."          | »Nur an den Tagen,       | cui avrebbe          | haciendo caso omiso                      | de Allwright.                        |
| Arthur prononça      | an denen ich für Mrs.    | esibito del latte    | del aspecto más                          | – Pero – dijo Waldo                  |
| le titre avec        | Allwright                | condensato a un      | siniestro de todo el                     | pasando por alto el                  |
| autant de naturel    | Besorgungen Machen       | cliente di           | asunto –, ¿necesidad                     | aspecto más siniestro                |
| que s'il allait      | muß. Heute hat sie       | Allwright.           | tienes de venir a la                     | del asunto – ¿es                     |
| livrer une série     | mich weggeschickt,       | "Ma," obiettò        | Biblioteca Pública?                      | necesario que vengas                 |

de boîtes de lait condensé à un cliente de chez Allwright. "Mais, dit Waldo, en passant sur l'aspect sinistre de la question, est-ce qu'il est absolument nécessaire que tu viennes à la Bibliothèque de la ville? Tu pourrais acheter le livre pour quelques shillings. Nous en avons en tout cas un exemplaire à la Maison. Celui de Papa. - J'aime venir à la Bibliothèque, parce que je suis assis parmi des tas de gens et que je peux les regarder quand j'en ai assez de lire. Quelquefois je parle à mes voisins. Ils paraissent étonnés et contentes de

toutes les

um ihre Brille abzuholen. Sie kriegt nämlich ein neues Gestell. « Er suchte in seiner Tasche herum. »Dabei fällt mir ein – die Brille habe ich ja bis jetzt ganz vergessen. Ich wollte nur einfach ganz schnell hierher kommen, damit ich Die Brüder Karamzow weiterlesen kann.« Arthur brachte den Buchtitel so natürlich heraus, als ob es sich nur um den Namen einer besonders guten Kondensmilch handele, die er einem Kunden bei Allwright anbot. » Aber «, sagte Waldo und ignorierte das eigentlich Beunruhigende an der ganzen Sache einfach, »mußt du den deswegen extra in die Bibliothek kommen? Für ein paar Schillinge kannst du das Buch doch auch kaufen. Und überhaupt – wir haben es doch zuhause, oder? Noch

von Vater her.«

Waldo, ignorando l'aspetto più sinistro della faccenda, "è proprio necessario che tu venga alla Biblioteca Pubblica? Ti potresti comperare il libro per pochi scellini. E a ogni modo, a casa ne abbiamo una copia. Quella di Papà." "Mi piace venire in biblioteca. perché posso sedermi in mezzo a tutta questa gente e guardarla quando sono stanco di leggere. Certe volte mi metto a parlare con quelli che mi stanno vicino. Loro mi sembrano sorpresi e lieti di ascoltare tutto quello che gli racconto." [...] "Non posso leggere la copia che avevamo in casa," disse dolcemente Arthur, ancora più

dolcemente di

Puedes comprarlo por un par de chelines. En cualquier caso, en casa hay un ejemplar. El de papá. – Me gusta venir a la Biblioteca Pública – explicó Arthur – porque así puedo sentarme entre toda esta gente y mirarla cuando me canso de leer. A veces hablo con los que están cerca de mí. Parecen sorprenderse y recibir con gusto las noticias que les doy. Se interrumpió y echó un vistazo a la bolita, a la brillante rueda de líneas intersectadas que había en su interior. – No pudo leer el ejemplar de casa continuó; él, que había estado hablando suavemente, hablaba ahora con más suavidad aún –: Papá lo quemó. ¿No lo recuerdas? [...] Yo creo que Papá le temía – opinó Arthur –. Había párrafos que comprendía muy bien. Eran bastante difíciles de aceptar. Los párrafos que no

entendía eran peores.

a la Biblioteca Pública? Podrías comprarlo por unos chelines. Además, hay un ejemplar en casa. El de papá. – Me gusta venir a la Biblioteca – contestó Arthur – porque, cuando me canso de leer, puedo mirar a la gente. A veces hablo con algunos que están cerca. Parecen sorprendidos y complacidos de escuchar lo que les digo. Se detuvo y echó una mirada a la esfera de vidrio, al brillante remolino de líneas que se entrecruzaban. Además, no puedo leer el ejemplar de casa – aunque antes había hablado con suavidad, esta vez lo hizo en voz más baja aún –. Papá lo quemó. ¿No te acuerdas? [...] Creo que le tenía miedo - dijo Arthur Yo creo que Papá le temía –. Estaban las partes que él entendía. Y eso ya era bastante malo.

nouvelles que je » Ich komme gern prima. "Papà l'ha Todo el disgusto de Pero las partes que él leur donne." hierher in die bruciata. Non Waldo se centraba en no entendía eran ricordi?" Il s'arrêta et Öffentliche Los hermanos peores. loucha sur la Bibliothek«, sagte [...] Toda la aversión que Karamazov y la bolita "Penso che ne bille, en Arthur. de vidrio que Arthur sentía Waldo se »Dann kann ich avesse paura," concentraba en Los contemplant la tenía el la mano. nämlich zwischen - ¡Y tú sí los entiendes! spirale disse Arthur. hermanos scintillante aux "C'erano le parti – le dijo a Arthur con den vielen Leuten Karamazov y en la lignes hier sitzen und sie che capiva. Erano toda maldad. esfera de vidrio que entrelacées. mir betrachten, wenn abbastanza brutte. Arthur no se sintió rodaba en las manos "Je ne peux pas ich keine Lust mehr Ma le parti che herido. de Arthur. lire l'exemplaire zum Lesen habe. - Muchos no - repuso - ¡Y tú si lo non capiva erano qui était à la Manchmal unterhalte peggiori." -. Y El Gran entiendes! – le dijo Maison, dit-il en ich mich mit denen in Inquisidor tampoco. Tutto il disgusto con ferocidad. meiner Nähe. Die prenant une di Waldo era Por eso es que hoy me Arthur no se sintió voix plus douce sind dann accentrato sui he olvidado de las herido anscheinend Fratelli gafas de Mrs. No demasiado. encore überrascht und hören qu'auparavant. Karamazov e Allwright. Porque tenía Desde luego no Papa l'a brûlé. gerne zu, wenn ihnen sulla biglia di que venir aquí a leer entiendo al Gran Tu ne te erzähe, was ich so vetro che Arthur otra vez El Gran Inquisidor. Por eso Neues weiß.« rappelles pas?" teneva in mano. Inquisidor. me olvidéde los Er hielt inne und "E tu capisci!" vidrios de Mrs. [...] Waldo estaba a punto "Je crois qu'il blickte mit disse ad Arthur in de reposar su cabeza en Allwright hoy. zusammengekniffene tono aggressivo. Porque tenía que en avait peur, la mesa; la vida junto a dit Arthur. Il y n Augen auf die Arthur non sccusò su hermano lo había venir a releer al Gran Inquisidor. avait les weißschimmernden extenuado. il colpo. Verschlingungen im "Non molto," – ¿De qué te serviría? Waldo se sentía tan passages qu'il comprenait. Inneren seiner ammise. "Per ¿Entender? ¿El Gran agobiado que podría C'était déjà Murmel. esempio non Inquisidor? haber apoyado la suffisant. Mais »Zuhause kann ich capisco il Grande Aunque estaba por cabeza sobre la das Buch nicht lesen Inquisitore. Ecco mesa. La vida entera les passages abrir la boca como para de ellos dos lo había qu'il ne «, fuhr er dann fort, perché oggi ho bostezar, no se sentía ni adormecido ni comprenait pas und seine Stimme, dimenticato gli agotado. occhiali della −¿De qué te va a étaient bien die schon bis jetzt sosegado. pires." ungewöhnlich sanft signora Allwright. servir a ti? Podría ayudar a la Perché dovevo ¿Entender? ¿Al Gran Tout geklungen hatte, gente – dijo Arthur l'écoeurement wurde noch sanfter. venire qua a comenzando a devorar Inquisidor? de Waldo se »Vater hat doch das rileggermi il las palabras –. A Mrs. Estaba a punto de Buch verbrannt -Grande Poulter. A ti. A Mrs. concentra sur bostezar, pero no se erinnerst du dich Les Frères Inquisitore." Allwright. Aunque sentía más sereno ni

Karamazov et sur la bille de verre d'Arthur. "Et toi, tu comprends peut-être!" dit-il rageusement à Arthur. Arthur ne fut pas vexé. "Pas tellement, dit-il. Et pas le grand Inquisiteur. C'est pourquoi j'ai oublié les lunettes de Mme Allwright aujourd'hui. Car il a fallu que je revienne pour lire l'histoire du grand Inquisiteur." Waldo eut envie de poser sa tête sur la table; leur vie en commun l'avait épuisé. "Pour quoi faire? Pour le comprendre? Tu veux comprendre le grand Inquisiteur?" Bien qu'il fût près de bâiller. il ne se sentit ni assoupi ni

nicht? « [...] »Ich glaube, er hat Angst vor dem Buch gehabt«, sagte Arthur. »Ein paar Sachen hat er verstanden. Und die waren schlimm genug. Aber was er nicht verstanden hat, das war noch schlimmer.« Aller Abscheu, den Waldo in sich spürte, konzentrierte sich auf Die Brüder Karamasow und die Glasmurmeln in Arthurs Händen. »Aber du verstehst alles«, sagte er gehässig zu Arthur. Der aber gar nicht getroffen schien. »Nein – eigentlich nicht so sehr viel«, sagte er. »Und die Sache mit dem Großinquisitor überhaupt nicht. Deshalb habe ich ja auch Mrs. Allwirghts Brille vergessen. Weil ich schnell hierher mußte, um das nochmal zu lessen«. Waldo hätte am

liebsten einfach

seinen Kopf auf die

Waldo sentì il desiderio di posare il capo sul tavolo; la loro vita in comune l'aveva distrutto. "A cosa ti potrebbe servire? Capire. Il Grande Inquisitore." Lo disse quasi sbadigliando, ma non si sentiva né placato né interessato. "Potrei essere in grado di aiutate qualcuno," rispose Arthur, cominciando a mangare le parole. "La signora Poulter. Te. La signora Allwright. Anche se la signora Allwright ha la Scienza Crisitana, e non dovrebbe aver bisogno di aiuto. Ma tu sì, Waldo," La faccia di Arthur era così convulsa che Waldo sperò che non gli venisse un attacco, anche se finora non era mai successo. E

perché mai Arthur

un perro. O... -

Mrs. Allwright tiene su Ciencia Cristiana y no debería necesitar ayuda. Pero tú, Waldo... La cara de Arthur estaba en tal estado de arrobamiento que Waldo esperó que no le fuera a dar un ataque, si bine hasta ahora no le habían dado nunca. ¿Pero por qué seguía mezclándolo a él con casi toda la gente que conocía? Afortunadamente parecía haber pesado por alto a los Saporta. -Es la necesidad de "encontrar alguien a quien venerar" - citó Arthur -. Como dice él. Bueno, eso es bastante sencillo. Había empezado a cerrar el libro y a elevar su voz alarmantemente. - Eso está claro prosiguió -. Pero, ¿qué es todo eso del pan? ¿Por qué la emprende con el pobre pan? Golpeaba con su puño el libro abierto. −¿Eh? Todo el mundo tiene que concentrarse en algo. Aunque sea en

apaciguado. Podría ayudar a la gente - dijo Arthur devorando las palabras –. A Mrs. Poulter. A ti. A Mrs. Allwright. Aunque Mrs. Allwright. tiene la Ciencia Cristiana y no debería necesitar ayuda. Pero tú sí, Waldo. El rostro de Arthur estaba tan alterado que Waldo deseó con todas sus fuerzas que no tuviera un ataque, aunque nunca había tenido ataques antes. Además, ¿por qué Arthur seguía mezclándolo con casi toda la gente que conocía? Felizmente, parecía haberse olvidado de los Saporta. - "La necesidad de hallar alguien a quien venerar", como dice él. Eso está bastante claro -. Arthur había empezado a dar palmadas sobre el libro y elevar la voz de manera alarmante. Esa parte está clara. Pero ¿qué

adouci. "Cela me permettrait d'aider les gens, dit Arthur en commençant à manger ses mots. Mme Poulter. Toi. M<sup>me</sup> Allwright. M<sup>me</sup> Allwright, il est vrai, a la Science chrétienne, elle ne doit pas avoit besoin d'aide. Mais toi. Waldo." Le visage d'Arthur se convulsa au point que Waldo craignit une attaque, bien que ce ne fût jamais arrive jusque-là. Et pourquoi Arthur l'associait-il avec la plupart des gens qu'ils connaisssaient? Il semblait heureusement oublier les Saporta. "Ce besoin de trouver "quelqu'un à adorer". comme

Tischplatte sinken lassen; ein ganzes Leben zusammen mit Arthur, nur sie beide... jetzt war er einfach am Ende. »Und was hast du dann davon? Wenn du es verstehst? Wenn du die Sache mit dem Großinquisitor verstehst?« Er konnte kaum ein Gähnen unterdrücken, obwohl er weder schläfrig war noch auch nur friedfertig. »Dann könnte ich anderen Menschen helfen«. sagte Arthur und begann wieder wie sonst, seine eigenen Worte geradezu zu verschlingen. »Mrs. Poulter. Dir. Mrs. Allwright. Obwohl Mrs. Allwright bei den Christlichen Wissenschaftlern ist. und deshalb braucht sie ja eigentlich keine Hilfe. Aber du brauscht vielleicht welche, Waldo.« Arthurs Geischt war plötzlich so

aufgewühlt, daß

continuava a trattarlo alla stessa stregua di quasi tutte le persone che conoscevano?Per fortuna parve essersi dimenticato dei Saporta. "Il bisogno di 'trovare qualcosa in cui credere'. Come lui dice. Be', è abbastanza semplice." Arthur aveva incominciato a shattere il libro sul tavolo e ad alzare la voce in modo allarmante. "È chiaro. Ma cosa vuol dire tutto quel discorso sul pane? Che cosa intendeva parlando del povero vecchio pane?" Stava sgualcendo il libro aperto con i pugni. "Ciascuno, deve concentrarsi su qualcosa, no? Un cane, oppure," balbettò, "oppure una pallina di

vetro. O un

balbuceó -, o en una bolita de vidrio. O en un hermano, por ejemplo. O en Nuestro Señor, como dice Mrs. Poulter. Waldo tenía medo de que el sudor que sentía en la frente, el sudor brillante que imaginaba corriendo alrededor de sus ojos, llamara la atención aún más que la histeria de Arthur. - Miedo - dijo Arthur –, por eso es que papá tenía miedo. No era por la sangre, por horrible que fuera, brotando de donde penetraban los clavos. Tenía medo de venerar algo. O a alguien. Que es lo que yo creo que este Dostoievsky trata de decir en parte. Súbitamente Arthur rompió a llorar, y Waldo miró en derredor a todas esas caras opacas que esperaban para acusarlo, a él, a él, no a Arthur. Pero tan súbitamente como había empezado, Arthur dejó de llorar. – Eso es algo que nosotros no tenemos

que tener nunca,

es todo eso acerca del pan? ¿Por qué se metió con el pan? Y daba puñetazos sobre el libro abierto. - ¿Eh? Todos tenemos que concentrarnos en algo. Aunque sea en un perro. O en una bolita de vidrio balbuceó -. O en un hermano, por ejemplo. O en Nuestro Señor, como dice Mrs. Poulter. Waldo temía que el sudor que sentía sobre su frente, el sudor que podía ver chorreando por el rabillo del ojo, llamara la atención aún más que la histeria de Arthur. - Miedo - Arthur se mecía en la silla-. Por eso tenía miedo papá. No tanto por la sangre, por horrorosa que sea, que mana de las heridas donde penetran los clavos. Tenía miedo de venerar algo. O a alguien. Que es lo que you creo que dice Dostoievsky en parte.

il dit. Voilá qui est assez simple." Arthur s'était mis à taper sur le livre et à élever la voix de façon alarmante. "Voilá qui est clair. Mais qu'est-ce qu'est-ce que c'est que cette histoire de pain? Où veut-il en venir avec ce malheureux pain?" Il tambourinait du poing sur le livre ouvert. "Hé? Il faut que chacun s'attache à quelque chose. Que ce soit à un chien ou à une bille de verre. Ou à un frère, par example. Ou à Notre-Seigneur, comme dit Mme Poulter." Waldo craignait que la sueur qu'il sentait couler sur son front et ruisseler toute brillante autor de ses

Waldo zu fürchten begann, sein Bruder könne vielleicht einen Anfall bekommen. Obwohl er eigentlich bis jetzt noch nie einen gehabt hatte. Und warum warf Arthur ihn eigentlich mit so ziemlich allen Menschen in einem Topt, die sie kannten? Gnädigerweise schien er wenigstens die Saportas auszulassen. »Das Bedürfnis, >iemanden zu finden. den man anbeten kann«. So driickt er das aus. Nun – und das ist ja klar genug.« Arthur hatte begonnen, mit dem Buch auf den Tisch zu schlagen, und seine Stimme wurde dabei auf beunruhigende Weise immer lauter. »Eigentlich ist es völlig klar. Aber was ist den nur das mit dem Brot? Was hat er nur die ganze Zeit gegen einfaches, gewöhnliches Brot?« Seine Faust schmetterte auf das aufgeschlagene Buch

herab.

fratello, per exempio. O Nostro Signore, come dice la signora Poulter." Waldo ebbe paura che il sudore che si sentiva sulla fronte, il sudore che poteva veder scorrere e lucciare intorno ai suoi occhi, attirasse ancora di più l'attenzione dell'isteria di Arthur. "È una questione di paura." Arthur faceva oscillare la sua sedia. "E sai perché nostro padre aveva paura? Non tanto per il sangue, per quanto raccapricciante, che sgorgò quando i chiodi entrarono nella carne. Aveva paura di credere in qualcosa. O in qualcuno. Dostoevskij parla anche di questo: ecco perché m'interessa." Improvvisamente Arthur scoppiò in

Waldo. Miedo. Hemos aprendido demasiado tarde todo ese asunto de Cristo. Además, por lo que hemos leído no parece dar resultado. Pero nos tenemos el uno al otro. Se inclinó hacia adelante y pareció pronto a tomar las manos de Waldo. Waldo retiró su propiedad a tempo. - ¡Es mejor que te vayas! – gritó –. Esto es un salón de lectura. No se puede gritar aquí. Estás llamando la atención hacia nosotros. Arthur permaneció sentado, mirando el libro, murmurando, aparentemente preparándose para lanzar otro despropósito. Pero no entiendo. Todo. - Fuera de este lugar, por favor, inmediatamente – ordenó Waldo en un tono más alto-. Por favor – repitió, y con voz potente añadió: – señor. Arthur se sorprendió

tanto que miró

De pronto, Arthur se echó a llorar y Waldo miró a su alrededor a todas esos rostros opacos listos para acusarlo, a él, él. él, no a Arthur. Tan repentinamente como había empezado, Arthur dejó de llorar. Eso es algo que nosotros dos tenemosque evitar, Waldo. El miedo. Nos enteramos demasiado tarde de todo ese asunto de Cristo. Pero por lo que pudimos leer, no parece que sirva tampoco. Pero nos tenemos el uno al otro. Se inclinó sobre la mesa con la aparente intención de tomar las manos de Waldo. Waldo las retiró justo a tiempo. - Es mejor que te vayas – gritó –. Esta es una sala de lectura. No puedes ponerte a gritar aquí. Estás llamando la atención. Arthur seguía sentado mirando el

yeux n'attirât encore plus l'attention que l'état de surexcitation d'Arthur. "Il avait peur, reprit Arthur en se balançant sur sa chaise. Voilà pourquoi notre père avait peur. Ce n'etait pas tant à cause du sang qui coulait des plaiesoù s'enfonçaient les clous, et c'était cependant un spectacle effroyable. Il avait peur d'adorer quelque chose. On quelqu'un. Je crois que c'est de cela que ce Dostoïesvki veut parler en partie." Soudain Arthur fondit en larmes, et Waldo jeta un coup d'oeil autour de lui pour regarder tous ces visages opaques qui

»Ha? Jeder muß sich eben auf irgendwas konzentrieren. Vielleicht auf einen Hund. Oder«. schwätzte er hemmungslos weiter, »-oder eine Glasmurmel. Oder auch einen Bruder, zum Beispiel. Oder auf Gott den Herrn. wie das Mrs. Poulter immer sagt.« Waldo begann zu fürchten, daß der Schweiß, den er auf seiner Stirn spürte, der Schweiß, den er aus seinen Augenwinkeln heraus in ganzen Bächen schimmernd an sienen Schläfen herunterrinnen sah, möglicherweise noch mehr Aufmerksamkeit erregen könnte als Arthurs hysterisches Benehmen. »Angst«, sagte Arthur und schwankte in seinem Stuhl hin und her. »Angst hat unser Vater gehabt, deshalb. Nicht so sehr wegen dem Blut, das

da rausläuft, wo die

lacrime, e Waldo guardò intorno a sé tutte le facce ottuse, che fra poco avrebbero accusato lui, lui, non Arthur. Ma, improvvisamente come aveva cominciato, Arthur smise di piangere. "È qualcosa che tu ed io non dovremo mai provare, Waldo. La paura. Noi abbiamo imparato troppo tardi tutte queste storie cristiane. Stando a quanto abbiamo letto, comunque, sembra che non funzionino. Ma io ho te, e tu hai me." Si sporse sul tavolo e parve sul punto di prendere le mani di Waldo fra le sue. Waldo fece appena in tempo a ritirare ciò che gli apparteneva. "Farai meglio ad uscire." gridò. "Questa è una sala

di lettura. Non

fijamente a Waldo. – Está bien – dijo con la boca tan abierta que apenas podía pronunciar las palabras. Pero el Inquisidor – dijo, recobrándose. Y volviendo a mirar hacia abajo empezó a arrancar varias hojas del libro. - ¡No tienes derecho! chilló Waldo, y trató de apoderarse de lo que más tarde descubrió que había guardado en su propio bolsillo. -Esta es una biblioteca pública – farfulló Arthur. A quien Waldo empezó a perseguir y empujar de un modo que se aproximaba al profesional, a través de los batientes interiores. Atrhur no se volvió para mirar sino que caminó hundido en su impermeable por el piso entarimado del vestíbulo (WHITE, 1973a, p. 231-234).

libro, balbuceando, procurando en apariencia extraer de él algo más. - Pero no lo entiendo todo. Por favor, retírese del edificio enseguida – ordenó Waldo en voz baja -. Por favor – repitió y agregó en voz muy alta –, ¡señor! Arthur se sorprendió tanto que lo miró a los ojos. - Esta bien - dijo con la boca tan abierta que apenas podía pronunciar las palabras-. Pero el Inquisidor... – agregó recuperándose. Bajó los ojos y comenzó a arrancar varias páginas del libro. - ¡No tienes derecho! – chilló Waldo y dio un manotazo para arrebatarle eso que, según descubrió después, terminó guardando en su propio bolsillo. Es una biblioteca pública – murmuró Arthur.

allaient Mientras, Waldo lo Nägel eigenschlagen puoi gridare qua l'accuser, lui, sind. Er hat Angst dentro. Stai empujaba de una davor gehabt, irgend attirando manera casi ui, et non pas Arthur. Mais etwas anzubeten. l'attenzione su di profesional a través noi." Arthur s'arrêta Oder irgend de las puertas Arthur rimase batientes interiores. tout aussi jemanden. Und das ist es, wovon dieser seduto, con gli Arthur no miró hacia brusquement. "C'est quelquer Dostojewskij redet. occhi sul libro, atrás: enfundado en cose qui ne nous Zum Teil wenigstens, borbottando, e su impermeable, arrivera ni à soweit ich das sembrava che atravesó el vestíbulo l'un ni à l'autre, verstehe.« Plötzlich sorbisse della de piso decorado Waldo, Nous brach Arthur in feccia rimasta sul (WHITE, 2016, p. n'avons pas Tränen aus. Und fonod di una 313-317). Waldo blickte sich besoin d'avoir tazza. "Ma io non peur. Mous nach all den avons, connu weißlichen. capisco... tutto." undeutlichen "Lei farà il favore trop tard toutes ces histoires de Gesichtern um, die di andarsene. christianisme. nur darauf warteten, subito," ordinò D'après ce que ihm – ihm, ihm! die Waldo alzando la voce. "Per Schuld zu geben, und nous en savons par nos lectures, nicht etwa seinem favore," ripeté, e les résultats ne Bruder. Aber ebenso aggiunse a voce plötzlich faßte Arthur molto alta: semblent pas sich wieder. "signore." bien merveilleux en »Du und ich, Waldo, Arthur rimase tout cas. Mais così sbalordito wir haben das nicht au moins avonsnötig. Wir brauchen che lo guardiò nous la keine Angst zu haben diritto in faccia. consolation nie. Dieses ganze "Va bene," disse, d'être ensemble. con la bocca così Zeug Christus, davon toi et moi." haben wir sowieso aperta che gli Il se pencha auerst viel zu spat riusciva difficile dessus de la gehört. Und nach articolare parola. "Ma table et sembla dem, was man so l'Inquisitore," vouloir liest, hilft es ja s'emparer des sowieso nicht. Aber wir haben uns.« rianimandosi. mains de Riabbassò lo Waldo. Er lehnte sich über Waldo eut tout den Tisch, und es sguardo sul libro e

juste le temps schien so, als ob er cominciò a de retirer son Waldos Hände strapparne bien. ergreifen wollte. parecchie pagine. "Tu ferais Gerade noch "Lei non ha diritto!" urlò mieux de t'en rechtzeitig zog Waldo sie zurück: sein aller, cria-t-il. Waldo ghermendo Nous sommes Eigentum. le pagine, che in dans une salle »Du solltest jetzt seguito si accorse de lecture. Tu schleunigst hier di essersi cacciato ne peux pas verschwinden «, in tasca. mettre à hurler schrie er, »den das "Ouesta è una ici. Tout le hier ist ein Leseaal. biblioteca monde nous und da kannst du pubblica," regarde." nicht einfach so mugolò Arthur. Arthur ne herumschreien! Die Waldo gli fece bougea pas, il Leute werden schon atttaversare di continuait à aufmerksam auf corsa, a spintoni, contempler le uns.« con piglio quasi Aber Arthur blieb livre en professionale, le marmonnant, en einfach sitzen, blickte porte a vento ingurgitant, wieder in das Buch, interne. murmelte vor sich hin Arthur non si semblait-il, quelques und schien die Worte voltò indietro, ma dernières bribes bis zur Neige in sich se ne andò nel suo de savoir. aufzusaugen. impermeabile, sul »Aber ich verstehen e pavimiento "Mais je ne simmer noch nicht. intarsiato, fuori comprends pas. Pas tout. Nicht alles.« della sala - Quitte cette (WHITE, 1973c, »Du wirst jetzt, salle bitteschön, sofort von p. 223-225). immédiatement. hier verschwinden«. je t'en prie, lui befahl Waldo mit enjoignit Waldo wiederum gedämpfter à voix basse, je Stimme. »Bitte «, t'en prie", wiederholte er und répéta-t-il. fügte dann ganz laut Puis il ajouta à hinzu: »Ich muß haute voix: schon bitten, mei "Immédiatemen Herr!« t, monsieur." Arthur war so

| Arthur fut         | überrascht, daß er     |
|--------------------|------------------------|
| tellement          | seinem Bruder einen    |
| interloqué qu'il   | Augenblick lang starr  |
| regarda Waldo      | ins Gesicht blickte.   |
| droit dans les     | »Okay«, sagte er, und  |
|                    | sein Mund stand        |
| yeux.              |                        |
| "Bien", dit-il, la | dabei do weit offen,   |
| bouche si          | daß er das Wort kaum   |
| grande ouverte     | herausbrachte.         |
| qu'il put à peine  | »Aber der              |
| articuler.         | Großinquisitor«,       |
| Il recouvra        | sagte er dann, indem   |
| cependant son      | er sich wieder fing.   |
| sang-froid.        | Und senkte wieder      |
| "Mais              | die Augen und          |
| l'Inquisiteur",    | begann, eine Reihe     |
| protesta-t-il.     | von Seite naus dem     |
| Baissant de        | Buch herauszureißen.   |
| nouveau le         | »Das ist ja unerhört!« |
| regard, il         | kreischte Waldo, riß   |
| arracha            | seinem Bruder die      |
| plusieurs pages    | Seiten aus der Hand    |
| du livre.          | und steckte sie in die |
| "On n'a pas le     | eigene Tasche – wie    |
| droit de faire     | er erst später         |
| cela!" glapit      | feststellte.           |
| Waldo en           | »Aber das ist doch     |
| s'emparant des     | eine öffentliche       |
| feuillets. Il      | Bibliothek«, murmele   |
| découvrit par la   | Arthur.                |
| suite qu'il les    | Während Waldo ihn      |
| avait fourrés      | fst im Laufschritt und |
| dans sa poche.     | beinahe schon mit der  |
| "C'est une         | Technik eines          |
|                    |                        |
| bibliothèque       | geübten                |
| ouverte à tout le  | Ordnungshüters         |
| monde",            | durch die Pendeltüren  |
| marmonna           | des Lesesaales nach    |
| Arthur.            | draußen schob.         |
| Adoptant une       | Arthur sah nich um,    |

| attitude quasi   | sondern ging   |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
|------------------|----------------|---------------|--|--|--------------------------------|--|--|
| professionelle,  | gemessenen So  | chritts       |  |  |                                |  |  |
| Waldo            | in seinem      |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| l'emmena au      | Regenmantel i  | iber          |  |  |                                |  |  |
| pas de course    | den Parkettboo | len der       |  |  |                                |  |  |
| vers les portes  | Vorhalle (WH   | ITE,          |  |  |                                |  |  |
| battantes de la  | 1978, p. 243-2 | 46).          |  |  |                                |  |  |
| salle et le      |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| poussa dehors.   |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| Arthur ne se     |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| retourna pas,    |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| mais traversa,   |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| toujours vêtu de |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| son              |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| imperméable, le  |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| vestibule        |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| parqueté         |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| (WHITE,          |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| 1973b, p. 225-   |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| 228).            |                |               |  |  |                                |  |  |
| English          |                | First Attempt |  |  | Brazilian Portuguese – Revised |  |  |

## "Do you come here often?" he asked.

"Only on days when I run a message for Mrs Allwright. Today she sent me to fetch her glasses, which are being fitted with new frames." He felt in his pocket. "That reminds me, I forgot about them so couldn't come here quick enough to get on with The Brothers Karamazov."

Arthur made his mention of the title sound so natural, as though trotting out a line of condensed milk to customer Allwrights'.

"But," said Waldo, ignoring the more sinister aspect of it, "is

### - Você vem aqui muitas vezes? pediu ele.

- Somente nos dias quando levo mensagens para a Sra. Allwright. Hoje ela me mandou buscar os óculos dela, que estão tendo uma nova armação. - Ele sentiu em seu bolso. -Isso me lembra, esqueci deles até agora. Não conseguiria vir aqui rápido o suficiente para continuar com Os Irmãos Karamazov.

Arthur fez sua menção do título soar como estivesse tão natural, se de recitando linha leite uma condensado para um cliente nos Allwright.

- Mas - disse Waldo, ignorando o aspecto mais sinistro disso - há

# Brazilian Portuguese - Revised

- Você vem aqui muitas vezes? perguntou. - Somente nos dias em que faço
- tarefas para a Sra. Allwright. Hoje ela me mandou buscar os óculos dela, que vão ganhar uma nova armação. - Ele sentiu em seu bolso. - Isso me lembra, esqueci eles até agora. Não conseguia esperar pra vir até aqui e continuar com Os Irmãos Karamazov.

Arthur fez o título soar tão natural saindo de sua boca, como se estivesse demonstrando uma linha de leite condensado para um cliente no armazém dos Allwright.

- Mas - disse Waldo, ignorando o aspecto mais sinistro disso - há there any necessity to come to the Public Library? You could buy for a few shillings. In any case, there's the copy at home. Dad's copy."

"I like to come to the Public Library," said Arthur, "because then I can sit amongst all these people and look at them when I'm tired of reading. Sometimes I talk to the ones near me. They seem surprised and pleased to hear any news I have to give them."

He stopped, and squinted into the marble, at the brilliant whorl of intersecting lines.

"I can't read the copy at home," he who had been speaking gently enough before, said more gently. "Dad burned it. Don't you remember?" [...]

"I think he was afraid of it," said Arthur. "There were the bits he understood. They were bad enough. But the bits he didn't understand were worse."

All the loathing in Waldo was centred on *The Brothers Karamazov* and the glass marble in Arthur's hands.

"And you understand" he said to Arthur viciously.

Arthur was unhurt.

"Not a lot," he said. "And not the Grand Inquisitor. That's why I forgot Mrs Allwright's glasses today. Because I had to get here to read the Grand Inquisitor again." qualquer necessidade de vir à Biblioteca Pública? Você pode comprar por uns xelins. Em qualquer caso, tem a cópia em casa. A cópia do Papai.

Gosto de vir à Biblioteca Pública
 disse Arthur – porque então posso sentar entre todas essas pessoas e olhar para elas quando estou cansado de ler. Algumas vezes eu converso com os que estão perto de mim. Eles pareciam surpresos e contentes por ouvir qualquer novidade que eu tenho para dar a eles.

Ele parou, e semicerrou a vista na bolinha de gude, na espiral de linhas entrecruzantes.

- Não posso ler a cópia em casa –
   ele que estava falando gentilmente o suficiente antes, disse mais gentilmente. –Papai a queimou. Você não lembra? [...]
- Acho que ele tinha medo dele –
   disse Arthur. Havia os pedaços que ele entendia. Eles eram ruins o suficiente. Mas os pedaços que ele não entendia eram piores.

Todo o ódio em Waldo estava centrado em *Os Irmãos Karamazov* e na bolinha de gude nas mãos de Arthur.

E você entende! – disse ele para
 Arthur ferozmente.

Arthur não estava ferido.

Não muito. – disse ele. –E não o
 Grande Inquisidor. É por isso que me esqueci dos óculos da Sra. Allwright hoje. Porque eu tinha que vir aqui para ler o Grande Inquisidor de novo.

qualquer necessidade de vir à Biblioteca Pública? Você pode comprar o livro por uns xelins. De qualquer forma, tem a cópia em casa. A cópia do Papai.

Gosto de vir à Biblioteca Pública
 disse Arthur – porque então posso sentar entre todas essas pessoas e olhar para elas quando estou cansado de ler. Algumas vezes converso com os que estão perto de mim. Eles parecem surpresos e contentes por ouvir qualquer novidade que eu tenho para contar a eles.

Ele parou, e mirolhou para dentro da bolinha de gude, para a espiral de linhas entrecruzantes.

- Não posso ler a cópia em casa –
  ele que estava falando suavemente o suficiente antes, disse mais gentilmente. Papai a queimou.
  Você não lembra? [...]
- Acho que ele tinha medo do livro – disse Arthur. – Havia as partes que ele entendia. Isso já era ruim. Mas as partes que ele não entendia, pior ainda.

Todo o ódio em Waldo estava centrado em *Os Irmãos Karamazov* e na bolinha de gude nas mãos de Arthur.

E você entende! – disse ele para
 Arthur ferozmente.

Arthur não ficou magoado.

 Não muito. – disse ele. – E não o Grande Inquisidor. É por isso que me esqueci dos óculos da Sra.
 Allwright hoje. Porque eu tinha que vir aqui para ler o Grande Inquisidor de novo. Waldo could have laid his head on the table; their lifetime had exhausted him.

"What will it do for you? To understand? The Grand Inquisitor?"

Though almost yawning, he felt neither lulled nor softened.

"I could be able to help people," Arthur said, beginning devour the words. "Mrs Poulter. You. Mrs Allwright. Though Mrs Allwright's Christian Science, and shouldn't be in need of help. But you, Waldo." Arthur's face was in such a state of upheaval, Waldo hoped he wasn't going to have a fit, though he had never had one up till now. And why did Arthur keep on lumping him together with almost all the people they knew? Mercifully he seemed to be overlooking the Saportas.

"The need to 'find somebody to worship'. As he says. Well, that's plain enough." Arthur had begun to slap the book and raise his voice alarmingly. "That's clear. But what's all this about bread? Why's he got it in for poor old bread?"

He was mashing the open book with his fist.

"Eh? Everybody's got to concentrate on something. Whether it's a dog. Or," he babbled, "or a glass marble. Or a brother, for instance. Or Our Lord, like Mrs Poulter says."

Waldo poderia ter deitado sua cabeça na mesa; suas vidas o haviam esgotado.

O que fará a você? Entender? O Grande Inquisidor?

Embora quase bocejando, ele não se sentia nem calmo nem sereno.

Podia ajudar as pessoas – disse
 Arthur, começando a devorar as palavras. – A Sra. Poulter. Você. A
 Sra. Allwright. Apesar da Ciência
 Cristã da Sra. Allwright, e não deveria estar precisando de ajuda.
 Mas você, Waldo.

O rosto de Arthur estava em um tal estado de reviravolta, que Waldo esperava que ele não fosse ter um ataque, embora ele nunca havia tido um até agora. E por que Arthur mantinha agrupando ele junto com quase todas as pessoas que eles conheciam? Misericordiosamente ele parecia estar esquecendo os Saporta.

A necessidade de "encontrar alguém para venerar". Como ele diz.
 Bom, isso é claro o suficiente.
 Arthur havia começado a dar tapinhas no livro e a levantar sua voz de forma alarmante.
 Isso está claro. Mas o que é tudo isso sobre o pão? Por que sobrou para o pobre do *pão*?

Ele estava amassando o livro aberto com seu punho.

Hein? Todos têm de se concentrar em alguma coisa. Se é um cachorro. Ou – ele babou – ou uma bolinha de gude. Ou um irmão, por exemplo. Ou Nosso Senhor, como a Sra. Poulter diz.

Waldo tinha vontade de deitar sua cabeça na mesa; suas vidas o haviam esgotado.

– Que diferença vai fazer para você? Entender? O Grande Inquisidor?

Embora quase bocejando, ele não se sentia nem calmo nem sereno.

Podia ajudar as pessoas – disse
Arthur, começando a devorar as palavras. – A Sra. Poulter. Você. A
Sra. Allwright. Apesar da Sra.
Allwright ser da Ciência Cristã, e por isso não deveria precisar de ajuda. Mas você, Waldo.

O rosto de Arthur estava em tal estado de reviravolta, que Waldo torcia para que ele não tivesse um ataque, embora ele nunca havia tido um até agora. E por que Arthur insistia em juntá-lo a quase todas as pessoas que eles conheciam? Graças a Deus ele parecia ter esquecido os Saporta.

A necessidade de "encontrar alguém para venerar". Como ele diz.
 Bom, isso está bem claro. – Arthur havia começado a dar tapinhas no livro e a levantar sua voz de forma alarmante. –Isso está claro. Mas o que é tudo isso sobre o pão? Por que sobrou para o pobre do pão?

Ele estava amassando o livro aberto com seu punho.

Hein? Todos têm de se concentrar em alguma coisa. Se é um cachorro. Ou – ele balbuciou – ou uma bolinha de gude. Ou um irmão, por exemplo. Ou Nosso Senhor, como a Sra. Poulter diz.

Waldo was afraid the sweat he could feel on his forehead, the sweat he could see streaming shining round his eyes, was going to attract even more attention than Arthur's hysteria. "Afraid." Arthur was swaying in his chair. "That is why our father was afraid. It wasn't so much because of the blood, however awful, pouring out where the nails went in. He was afraid to worship some thing. Or body. Which is what I take it this Dostoevsky is partly going on about."

Suddenly Arthur burst into tears, and Waldo looked round at all the opaque faces waiting to accuse him, him him, not Arthur. But just as suddenly, Arthur stopped.

"That's something you and I need never be, Waldo. Afraid. We learned too late about all this Christ stuff. From what we read it doesn't seem to work, anyway. But we have each other."

He leaned over across the table and appeared about to take Waldo's hands.

Waldo removed his property just in time.

"You'd better get out," he shouted. "This is a reading room. You can't shout in here. You're drawing attention to us." Arthur continued sitting, looking at the book, mumbling,

Waldo estava com medo de que o suor que ele conseguia sentir na sua testa, o suor que ele conseguia ver fluindo brilhando ao redor dos olhos dele, fosse atrair muito mais atenção do que a histeria de Arthur.

– Medo. – Arthur estava balançando em sua cadeira. – É por isso que nosso pai estava com medo. Não era tanto por causa do sangue, embora horrível, vertendo onde os pregos entraram. Ele estava com medo de venerar alguma coisa. Ou corpo. Que é o que entendo que esse Dostoyevsky está em parte falando.

Repentinamente Arthur desabou em lágrimas, e Waldo olhou ao redor para todos os rostos opacos esperando para acusar ele, ele ele, não Arthur. Mas assim tão repentinamente, Arthur parou.

 Isso é algo que você e eu nunca precisamos ter, Waldo. Medo.
 Aprendemos um tanto tarde sobre toda essa coisa de Cristo. Do que lemos não parece funcionar, de qualquer forma. Mas temos um ao outro.

Ele se inclinou até o outro lado da mesa e parecia prestes a pegar as mãos de Waldo.

Waldo removeu sua propriedade bem a tempo.

- É melhor você sair - ele gritou. -Esta é uma sala de leitura. Você não pode gritar aqui dentro. Você está chamando atenção para nós.

Arthur continuou sentado, olhando para o livro, resmungando, parecendo

Waldo estava com medo de que o suor que ele conseguia sentir na testa, o suor que ele conseguia ver fluindo brilhando ao redor dos olhos dele, fosse atrair muito mais atenção do que a histeria de Arthur.

– Medo. – Arthur estava balançando em sua cadeira. – É por isso que nosso pai estava com medo. Não era tanto por causa do sangue, embora horrível, vertendo onde os pregos entraram. Ele estava com medo de venerar alguma coisa. Ou alguém. Que é o que acho que esse Dostoiévski está falando em parte.

Repentinamente Arthur desabou em lágrimas, e Waldo olhou ao redor para todos os rostos opacos esperando para acusar ele, ele ele, não Arthur. Mas assim tão repentinamente, Arthur parou.

– Isso é algo que você e eu nunca precisamos ter, Waldo. Medo. Aprendemos tarde demais sobre toda essa coisa de Cristo. Pelas nossas leituras não parece funcionar, de qualquer forma. Mas temos um ao outro.

Ele se inclinou por sobre a mesa e parecia prestes a pegar as mãos de Waldo.

Waldo removeu sua propriedade bem a tempo.

– É melhor você sair – ele gritou.
– Esta é uma sala de leitura. Você não pode gritar aqui dentro. Você está chamando atenção para nós.

Arthur continuou sentado, olhando para o livro, resmungando,

seeming to suck up some last dreg.

"You will leave this place, please, at once," Waldo commanded in a lower voice. "Please," he repeated, and added very loudly: "sir."

Arthur was so surprised he looked straight into Waldo's face.

"Okay," he said, his mouth so open it could scarcely form words.

"But the Inquisitor," he said, recovering himself.

And again looking down, he began to tear several pages out of the book

"You have no right!" Waldo screamed, and snatched at what he discovered afterwards he had stuffed in his own pocket.

"This is a public library," Arthur mumbled.

Whom Waldo was shoving running in something approaching the professional manner through the inner swing doors.

Arthur did not look back, but walked in his raincoat, over the inlaid floor, through the hall. (WHITE, 1974, p. 198-201).

chupar algum dos últimos resíduos.

- Mas não entendo. Tudo.
- Você deixará este lugar, por favor, imediatamente Waldo comandou em uma voz mais baixa. –
   Por favor ele repetiu, e acrescentou muito mais alto: Senhor.

Arthur estava tão surpreso que ele olhou direto para o rosto de Waldo.

- Tudo bem disse ele, sua boca tão aberta que mal poderia formar palavras.
- Mas o Inquisidor disse ele, se recuperando.

E novamente olhando para baixo, ele começou a rasgar diversas páginas do livro.

- Você não tem direito! Waldo gritou, e arrebatou o que ele descobriu depois que ele havia enfiado em seu próprio bolso.
- Esta é uma biblioteca pública –
   Arthur murmurou.

A quem Waldo estava empurrando correndo em algo se aproximando da maneira profissional através das portas de vai-vem internas.

Arthur não olhou para trás, mas caminhou com sua capa de chuva, sobre o piso decorado, através do hall.

parecendo absorver algum resíduo remanescente.

- Mas não entendo. Tudo.
- Deixe este lugar, por favor,
  imediatamente Waldo comandou
  em uma voz mais baixa. Por favor
   ele repetiu, e acrescentou muito
  mais alto: Senhor.

Arthur ficou tão surpreso que olhou direto para o rosto de Waldo.

- Tá bom disse ele, sua boca tão aberta que mal conseguiria formar palavras.
- Mas o Inquisidor disse ele, se recuperando.

E novamente olhando para baixo, começou a rasgar diversas páginas do livro.

- Você não tem direito! Waldo gritou, e arrebatou o que descobriu depois havia enfiado em seu próprio bolso.
- Esta é uma biblioteca pública –
   Arthur murmurou.

A quem Waldo estava empurrando correndo em algo se aproximando da maneira profissional através das portas de vai-vem internas.

Arthur não olhou para trás, mas caminhou com seu impermeável, sobre o piso decorado, pelo hall.

Before describing the most prominent challenges and modifications involved in this scene, we should address an element which calls our attention when reading the most recent Spanish translation: Mrs Allwright's glasses became window glasses, which makes the sentence somewhat strange, given that Arthur puts his hands on his pocket. In fact, there is the

reference to something small, such as eye glasses, which was the option used in the first Spanish translation. This suggests that the translator probably did not look at the previous work before doing her own translation. In both versions in Spanish we see changes in verbal tenses, punctuation and the use of different expressions. This is precisely the eye-catching wealth of analyzing translations, as we are always reading equally possible alternatives. It would be marvelous (and we would be glad) to compare different versions (readings) in Brazilian Portuguese in the near future.

Hurtado Albir's aesthetic overload previously mentioned in this work lies in how to find alternatives of translation in Brazilian Portuguese to keep the intensity of the scene in English, which is manifest, for instance, in the precise choice of verbs, like "trot out". In Brazilian Portuguese, we had first opted for "recitando", but, after rereading the passage and thinking about its possible meanings in English, we changed to "demonstrando" ("displaying"), which would give a better idea of what Arthur was doing in his job, adding to the ironic aspect of the narrative from Waldo's point of view. Another verb was "babbled", which was roughly translated as "babou", and then modified to "balbuciou", increasing the literariness of the excerpt.

The first change concerns the expression "run a message", which would be a synomym to "run errands" and encompassing more activities than just sending a message to someone. Thus, we opted for "fazer tarefas" ("perform tasks") in this context. Another change again involves register. Considering that the first version sounded too artificial to Arthur (with a future tense and the unabbreviated preposition), the chosen form "não conseguia esperar pra vir até aqui" captures his informal way of speaking.

Syntactical changes were paramount to make the excerpt flow. Honestly, we must admit that these changes were only possible after working literally with the sentences. In "Arthur made his mention of the title sound so natural", our first attempt was "Arthur fez sua menção do título soar tão natural", but, in literary translation, we always recall the necessity of the "aesthetic overload", which is responsible for the new, and elaborate alternative: "Arthur fez o título soar tão natural saindo de sua boca": we added words (some might argue that there is not any reference to "mouth" in the original), however, the idea becomes more noticeable with this addition, and suits well in the context. The same reasoning applies to the insertion of "no armazém" to translate "at Allwrights". Other instances in which the addition plays the same role are "You can buy for a few shillings", translated as "Você pode comprar o livro por uns xelins", and "I think he was afraid of it" translated as "Acho que ele tinha medo

do livro": without the object, the reader might miss the referent, although the sentences work quite well in English.

Another substantial change involves "and squinted into the marble", which was first translated as "e semicerrou a vista na bolinha de gude". Admittedly, this again was too literal and a better alternative, which pictures the activity (and Arthur's effort) quite well, was through "e mirolhou para dentro da bolinha de gude", accounting for the form "squint" in English using the noun "mirolho" ("cross-eyed") as a verb in Brazilian Portuguese. This change enhances the characteristic of the whole excerpt in the original: the precise word choice.

The word "bits", as in "There were the bits he understood" conditioned our first attempt, and somewhat distorted the whole sentence. Certainly that "pedaços", in Brazilian Portuguese, might be used to refer to parts of a book (although it is more often related to food), but in this instance the use of "partes" seemed more suitable. The form "they were bad enough" might be kept in the translation, but we decided to change the whole referent to "isso já era ruim", to account for the situation: the fear of understanding the bad parts which were revealing the reality of the members of the Brown family. The same happening in the next sentence, in which we translated "but the bits he didn't understand were worse" as "mas as partes que ele não entendia, pior ainda", thus keeping "isso" as the referent and again alluding to this whole event of personal discovery involving the Browns.

To translate "Waldo could have laid his head on the table", we dare to say that our first alternative lacked intensity, perhaps because we overlooked the modal verb "could", i.e., we were more worried about aspect without really noticing its semantic load. To mark the intensity, we had to add words to cover Waldo's will in this context, thus choosing the form "Waldo tinha vontade de deitar sua cabeça na mesa" ("Waldo was willing to lay his head on the table").

Another occurrence in which we added words was "What will it do for you?": the literal translation made us think that something was missing, therefore, we opted for "que diferença vai fazer para você?", which is more emphatic and more common in Brazilian Portuguese. In "Though Mrs Allwright's Christian Science, and shouldn't be in need of help", again, we had to explain to the reader the fact that Mrs Allwright belonged to a Church, other than that, we might run the risk of missing the referent: "Apesar da Sra. Allwright ser da Ciência Cristã, e por isso não deveria precisar de ajuda". It should be noted that we keep a grammatical mistake ("apesar da" instead of "apesar de a") to mark Arthur's informal speech.

An awkward instance which demanded some thinking involved "And why did Arthur keep on lumping him together with almost all the people they knew?". Our first translation was quite hard to understand. Then, after many rereadings, we came up with "E por que Arthur insistia em juntá-lo a quase todas as pessoas que eles conheciam?", using the verb "insistir" ("insist"), instead of "keep", and then eliminating the redundancies of the first attempt in Brazilian Portuguese ("agrupar" and "junto com" becoming "juntá-lo a"). Then, in "Mercifully he seemed to be overlooking the Saportas, "mercifully" was literally translated as "misericordiosamente", but this did not fit, because it is quite rare to hear that in Portuguese, thus being replaced by the more popular expression "Graças a Deus". Then, a question of aspect raised: instead of "parecia estar esquecendo" (which is a gerundism), we opted for "parecia ter esquecido", making the sentence shorter, and more accurate in Brazilian grammatical terms as well.

Talking about accuracy, to compensate for the addition of words in some parts, we made deletions in others, thus coming up with succint, although extremely powerful, solutions, as in "Well, that's plain enough", which was first translated as "Bom, isso é claro o suficiente", and then as "Bom, isso está bem claro": the rhythm of the reading changes completely, emphasing Arthur's words. Another occurrence in which that happened was in "He leaned over across the table", which was first translated as "Ele se inclinou até o outro lado da mesa" and then as "Ele se inclinou por sobre a mesa": an economy of two words which doubled the clarity and flow of the translation.

A lapse was seen with the word "body": our first translation only accounted for the first meaning of the word, without paying attention to its function in the excerpt. In a second reading, we realized that that word sounded strange, making us look for a better alternative, such as "alguém" ("someone"), because we had failed to grasp that the reference in English was to "some thing" or "some body".

Relative and personal pronouns are quite important in translation, and in this scene, we can see that their deletion represents a huge semantic gain: in "and snatched at what he discovered afterwards he had stuffed in his own pocket", our first translation was "e arrebatou o que ele descobriu depois que ele havia enfiado em seu próprio bolso". By deleting the relative and personal pronouns ("ele" before "descobriu" and "que ele" after "depois"), we see that the sentence makes perfect sense: "e arrebatou o que descobriu depois havia enfiado em seu próprio bolso".

Another improvement in the translation can be seen in the following: "Arthur continued sitting, looking at the book, mumbling, seeming to suck up some last dreg", which

was first translated as "Arthur continuou sentado, olhando para o livro, resmungando, parecendo chupar algum dos últimos resíduos". The modifications concerned the verb "suck up" ("chupar"), which gave room to the form "absorver" ("absorb"), and the structure "algum dos últimos resíduos", which was reduced to "algum resíduo remanescente". Soon after that, in "You will leave this place", again we notice how reduction has the effect of enhancement: "Você deixará este lugar" was changed to "Deixe este lugar".

Another difference is about the Russian surname Dostoyevsky, which is written in various forms. In our translation, we preferred the Brazilian option, which is Dostoiésvki.

We move on to the same scene, now narrated from Arthur's point of view.

Exhibit 62 – Scene at the Library (Arthur's perspective)

| French                            | German                  | Italian              | Spanish 1           | Spanish 2            |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| Mais il lui fallait               | Aber dann mußte er      |                      | _                   | Pero tenía que       |
|                                   |                         | Ma doveva poi        | Pero tuvo que       | -                    |
| revenir à ce qui était            | doch wieder zu dem      | ritornare a quello   | retornar a lo que   | volver a lo que se   |
| devenu, non un sujet              | zurückkehren, was       | che era diventato,   | se había            | había                |
| d'étude, mais une                 | für ihn nicht direkt zu | se non la sua        | convertido, si bien | transformado, no     |
| obsession. Il y avait             | einem Thema             | materia di studio,   | no en su estudio,   | ya en materia de     |
| tout ce tintouin à                | geworden war, um        | la sua ossessione.   | sí en su obsesión.  | estudio, sino de     |
| propôs du Christ. M <sup>me</sup> | das sich alles zu       | C'erano tutte        | Era todo aquello    | obsesión. Toda esa   |
| Poulter lui en avait              | drehen schien: diese    | quelle confuse       | del Jesuscristo.    | historia de Cristo   |
| expliqué des bribes.              | ganze Geschichte da     | storie cristiane,    | Algo sobre lo que   | que Mrs. Poulter le  |
| Mais il ne pouvait pas            | mit Christus und den    | che in parte gli     | Mrs. Poulter le     | había explicado en   |
| rattacher cela aux                | Christen. Etwas         | erano state          | había hablado.      | parte. Algo que      |
| hommes, sinon à la                | davon hatte Mrs.        | spiegate dalla       | Pero no podía       | Arthur no podia      |
| cruauté que montrent              | Poulter ihm ja schon    | signora Poulter.     | relacionarlo        | relacionar con los   |
| certains hommes,                  | erklärt, aber er konnte | Ma egli non          | exactamente con     | hombres, except      |
| malgré eux, en tant que           | es nicht so recht in    | poteva pore bene     | los hombres,        | con la crueldad que  |
| religion dans laquelle            | Beziehung zu den        | in relazione con     | salvo con la        | algunos de ellos     |
| ils sont élévés. En               | Menschen bringen –      | gli uomini,          | crueldad que        | practican como una   |
| lisant <i>Les Frères</i>          | abgesehen davon, daß    | fuorché con la       | practican algunos   | religión, a pesar de |
| Karamazov, il aurait              | bestimmte Menschen      | crudeltà che         | hombres, a          | sí mismos.           |
| voulu comprendre de               | offensichtlich wider    | alcuni di loro       | despecho de sí      | Esperaba que         |
| quel côté se rangeaient           | besseres Wissen         | praticano, a         | mismos, como        | leyendo <i>Los</i>   |
| les uns et les autres.            | grausan waren – und     | dispetto di se       | una religión en la  | hermanos             |
| Qui était le grand                | das schien eigentlich   | stessi, come la      | que han sido        | Karamazov            |
| Inquisiteur?                      | die Religion zu sein,   | religione in cui     | formados.           | lograría             |
| Puis soudain, un beau             | mit der sie von         | sono stati allevati. | Leyendo Los         | comprender de qué    |
| matin, Waldo s'assist à           | Jugend an               | Nel leggere I        | hermanos            | lado estaba cada     |

la Bibliothèque en face de lui à la même table et lui fit cette scène. Arthur fut incapable par la suite de se rappeler tous les details des paroles prononcées. Il n'était pas tout à fait exact de dire qu'ils parlaient, car leurs réflexions sortaient pêle-mêle, entrecoupées de larmes et d'accès de suffocation, arrachées tells des pognées de chair. Les mots étaient si crus, les reproches si sanglants que Waldo ne cessait de jeter des regards autour de lui pour voir si personne ne les remarquait. Ouant à Arthur, c'était le cadet de ses soucis. Leurs relations mutuelles sueles lui importanient, problême combien accablant. "Je ne te demande pas si tu es venu ici, si tu me fais cette scène pour m'humilier, lui dit Waldo, car la réponse saute aux yeux. Cela a toujours été ton premier objectif dans la vie. Si tu veux bien être sincère.

aufgewachsen waren. Wenn er in Die Brüder Karamasow las, wünschte er sich sehnlichst, doch verstehen zu können, wer denn da eigentlich auf wessen Seite stand. Wer war der Großinquisitor? Und dann saß eines Morgens in der Bibliothek ganz plötzlich Waldo am selben Tisch, direkt gegenüber, und machte ihm eine Szene. Hinterher konnte Arthur sich gar nicht mehr erinnern, was sie im einzelnen alles gesagt hatten. Und man hätte auch nicht davon reden können, daß sie im eigentlichen Sinn miteinander sprachen, denn jeder einzelne Satz wurde zwischen Tränen und Augenblicken keuchender Atemlosigkeit wahllos entweder aus ihm oder aus Waldo wie ein Fleischfetzen herausgerissen. Und die bluttriefenden, unverhüllten Worte

fratelli Karamazov desiderò di poter capire da che parte fosse ciascuno. Chi era il Grande Inquisitore? Poi, una mattina, in biblioteca, si trovò improvvisamente di fronte Waldo, seduto al suo stesso tavolo, che gli fece quella scenata. In seguito Arthur non risucì a ricordare nei particolari quello che fu detto. Non si sarebbe potuto dire con esattezza che parlassero, perché le parole vennero strappate da loro confusamente, fra le lacrime e la morsa dell'affanno. come brandelli di carne. Parole così crude e sanguinanti che Waldo continuò a guardarsi intorno per vedere se qualcuno stesse

osservando la

Karamazov, deseaba poder entender de qué lado estaba cada uno. ¿Quién era el Gran Inquisidor? Luego, de pronto, una manãna en la biblioteca, Waldo se había sentado en la misma mesa. frente a él, y había hecho aquella escena. Después Arthur no podía recordar con detalle lo que se había dicho. No podía decirse exactamente que ellos estuviesen hablando porque las frases brotaban de ellos confusamente. entre lágrimas y gruñidos de desaliento, como puñados de carne. Aquellas frases ásperas y crueles eran de tal naturaleza que Waldo miraba de reojo para ver si alguien los miraba. En cuanto a Arthur, no se preocupaba. Su

uno. ¿Quién era el Gran Inquisidor? Y de pronto, cierta mañana en la biblioteca, se encontró con que Waldo estaba sentado frente a él haciéndole una escena. Más tarde, Arthur no podía recordar exactamente lo que se habían dicho. Imposible decir que hablaron porque las palabras brotaban atropelladamente, entre lágrimas e instantes en que se quedaban sin aliento, como jirones de carne. Palabras crudas. sangrantes, de tal índole que Waldo no paraba de mirar a su alrededor para ver si alguien las oía A Arthur no le importaba. El único hecho importante era la relación entre ellos, un hecho abrumador. - No voy a preguntarte si viniste aquí, si

- Pourquoi te faire toimême du mal, Waldo? eut la force de répliquer Arthur. Donner des coups de pied aux chiens et te faire toi-même du mal. C'est ton portrait tout craché. - Pour l'amour du ciel, ne viens pas mêter les chiens à cette affaire! Qui, je voudrais bien le savoir, a eu envie de ces sales bêtes? Et pourquois, on se le demande! - Nous en avons eu envie tous les deux, pour avoir quelque chose à chérir, quelque chose à quoi noun puissions nous fier. Car nous n'avions pas tellement confiance l'un dans l'autre. Nous sommes, ne l'as-tu pas dit toi-même, Waldo, des gens anormaux et d'égoïstes narcissistes." [...] "Tu as peur, dit Arthur, qui sentit alors une sorte de terreur se faire jour en lui. Comme notre père. Je parle de Papa. Pas de celui à qui on adresse des prières. Mais de Papa, qui a livre

waren derart, daß Waldo sich mehrfach umblickte, ob nicht vielleicht jemand zuhörte. Was Arthur anbelangte – ihm war das gleichgültig. Für ihn zählte ihre Beziehung zueinander, und die war ihm wichtig wichtiger als alles andere. »Ich will gar nicht einmal fragen, ob du nur deswegen hierher kommst, nur deswegen hier Szene machst, um mich zu demütigen«, sagte Waldo, »denn eine Antwort auf diese Frage erübrigt sich ja wohl. Das ist schon dein ganzes Leben lang dein einziges Ziel gewesen. Sei doch endlich einmal ehrlich und gibe s zu!« »Warum willst du dir immer selbst weh tun. Waldo?« Von irgendwoher bezog Arthur die Kraft für diese Antwort. »Sogar wenn due einem von den Hunden einen Tritt

veretzt, verrenkst du

scena. In quanto ad Arthur, non si preoccupava di questo. L'unico fatto importante, e di un'importanza enorme per lui, era la sua relazione con Waldo. "Non ti chiederò se sei venuto qui, se stai facendo questa scena, per umiliarmi," lo aggredì Waldo, "perché la risposta è troppo ovvia. Questo è stato lo scopo principale della tua vita. Ammetti che è la verità." Arthur ebbe la forza di rispondere: "Perché vuoi farti del male, Waldo? Dai un calcio a un cane, e sei tu stesso a farti male. Sei fatto così." "Per amor di Dio, lascia stare i cani! E poi, chi è che ha voluto, quei miserabili animali? E perché?" miserables

relación mutua era el único hecho importante, un hecho notoriamente abrumador. - No necesito preguntarte si has venido aquí, si estás haciendo esta escena, para humiliarme decía Waldo -, porque la respuesta es demasiado evidente. Ese ha sido tu principal objetivo en la vida. Si fueras sincero lo reconocerías. − ¿Por qué te hieres a ti mismo Waldo? - dijo Arthur apenas sin fuerzas para contestar – . Das una patada a un perro, y te hieres a ti mismo. Eso es todo. - ¡Por amor de Dios, no mezcles a los perros en esto! ¿Pero quién, me gustaría saber, quién demonios quiso a esos

estás haciendo esta escena para humiliarme – decía Waldo –. Porque la respuesta es evidente. Ese ha sido tu principal objetivo en la vida. Si fueras sincero, lo reconocerías. −¿Por qué te lastimas, Waldo? -Arthur tuvo fuerzas para preguntar-. Andas dando patadas a los perros y haciéndote daño a ti mismo. Esa es tu vida. - ¡Por amor de Dios, no hables de los perros! Me gustaría saber quién quiso traer esos miserables animales. ¿Y por qué? Los dos quisimos, para tener algo más, algo de confianza, para amar. Porque no confiábamos el uno en el otro. Porque somos, ¿no es eso lo que dijiste, Waldo?, gente anormal, narcisistas egoístas. [...]

Dostoïesvki aux flammes." Il savait que le feu de la discussion devait avoir embrasé son visage et lui avoir donné cet aspect qui effrayait tant les étrangers, et même Waldo. Mais en cet instant il fut presque heureux de ne pas pouvoir se dominer. "Peur du sang et des clous, et c'est, si je comprends bien, ce dont tout le monde a peur, mais ce que tout le monde reclame, et c'est ce que dénonce en partie Dostoïevski. Tu vois, Waldo, ce que nous devons éviter?" explosa-t-il. Tout à coup Arthur fondit en larmes parce qu'il comprit que Waldo était ce que les livres appellent une âme en perdition. Pour lui aussi, la partie était pedue dans le cas particulier. Il aurait beau prender Waldo dans ses bras, I ne pourrait jamais dispenser cet amour accumulé dans son âme prêt à se dépenser. Aussi son frère restaitdir dabei noch das eigene Bein. Typisch für dich.« »Hör um Himmelswillen auf. jetzt auch noch die Hunde hier mit hereinzuziehen! Übrigens – wer war es denn, der diese scheußlichen Tiere unbedingt anschaffen mußte, wer denn, und überhaupt - warum?« »Wir wollten sie alle beide haben«, sagte Arthur, » weil wir nämlich alle beide noch etwas Zusätzliches - und auch Zuverlässiges – brauchten, was wir lieben konnten. Weil wir nämlich kein Vertrauen zueinander hatten. Denn wir sind - hast du das nicht selbst gesagt, Waldo? wir sind abnormale Menschen. selbstsüchtig und narzißtisch.« [...] »Angst«, sagte Arthur und spürte, wie auch in ihm selbst eine Art von panischer Furcht aufstieg. »Angst wie unser Vater. Ich

meine - Dad. Nicht

"Li abbiamo voluti tutti e due," disse Arthur, "per avere qualcosa di più, e di degno di fiducia. Perché non credevamo l'uno nell'altro. Perché noi siamo - non l'hai detto proprio tu, Waldo? – persone anormali ed egoisit narcisisti." "Perché avevamo paura," continuò Arthur, ed ora cominciò a sentir crescere in lui una sorta di terrore. "Come nostro padre. Non quello che la gente prega. Intendo Papà. Papà che dà fuoco a Dostoevskij." Sapeva che il fuoco della discussione doveva imporporargli il viso nel modo che metteva a disagio gli sconosciuti e perfino Waldo. Ma per il momento era

quasi lieto di non

animales? ¿Y por qué? - Nosotros dos los quisimos – dijo Arthur – para poder tener algo más, y algo fiel, que amar. Porque no teníamos fe uno en otro. Porque somos – ¿no lo decías tú mismo, Waldo? personas anormales y ególatras narcisistas. [...] - Temerosos decía Arthur, y ahora comenzaba a sentir que una especie de terror se alzabe de él -.Como nuestro padre. Me refiero a papá. No a ése al que le reza la gente, sino a papá echando al fuego a Dostoiesvki. Sabía que las llamas de la discusión debían estar coloreando su rostro de aquel modo que tanto incomodaba a los extraños, e incluso a Waldo. Pero en aquel

– Temerosos – decía Arthur, que comenzaba a sentir que lo ahogaba algo parecido al terror –. Como nuestro padre, papá quiero decir. No el padre a quien le rezan. Papá cuando tiró al fuego el libro de Dostoievsky. Tenía conciencia de que el calor de la discusión debía de reflejarse en su rostro de esa manera que inquietaba tanto a los extraños. incluso a Waldo. Pero en ese momento se sentía casi contento de no poder dominarse. Temerosos de la sangre y los clavos que, por lo que alcanzo a ver, es lo que todos temen pero necesitan, y de eso habla Dostoievsky en parte. ¿No lo ves, Waldo? - sentía que iba a estallar -. ¿No ves lo que debemos evitar? De pronto, Arthur

il sec et froid. Arthur s'arrêta presque aussitôt de pleurer, car la raison qui l'avait incite à le faire était d'une importance tellement immense qu'elle faisait paraître l'acte lui-même insignificante. Il eut honte. "Mais il faut persévérer dans nos tentatives, Waldo, de même que nous nous levons tous es matins et que nous laçons nos chaussures." Je ne sais pas ce que tu veux dire, aurait pu rétorquer Waldo. Mais il paraissait si irrémédiablement perdu à ce moment-à qu'Arthur dut se pencher par-dessus la table pour essayer de l'attraper par les mains.Il voulait, lui qui était perdu, saisir les mains de son frère, en perdition. Mais, d'un geste brusque, Waldo retira son bien. "Tu attires l'attention sur nous!" Arthur ne comprit pas au premier moment. "Quitte cette salle

den Vater, zu dem sie alle beten.Ich meine Dad, der Dostojewski ins Feuer werfen mußte.« Er wußte, daß die Hitzigkeit der Auseinandersetzung inzwischen seinem Gesicht denjenigen Farbton verliehen haben mußte, der Fremde – und auch Waldo! – am allermeisten abstieß. Für den Augenblick aber war er fast froh. daß er sich nicht mehr beherrschen konnte. »Angst vor dem Blut und Angst vor den Nägeln, und das ist soweit ich das beurteilen kann wovor sich alle Leute fürchten, aber gleichzeitig sehnen sie sich auch danach, und zum Teil ist das alles, wovon Dostojewski redet. Verstehst du denn nicht - «, und es wollte ihn fast zerreißen, »verstehst du denn nicht. Waldo, erkennst du nicht, wovor wir uns

hütten müssen?«

riuscire a controllarsi. "Per paura del sangue e dei chiodi, che, a quanto mi risulta, è ciò che ciascuno teme, ma vuole, e Dostoevskij parla in parte di tutto questo. Capisci, Waldo," esplose, "che cosa dobbiamo evitare?" Improvvisamente Arthur scoppiò in lacrime perché vide che Waldo era ciò che i libri definivano un'anima perduta. Ache lui, per questo, era un'anima perduta. Poteva tenere Waldo fra le braccia, ma non avrebbe mai potuto trarre dalla propria anima abbastanza di quell'amore che doveva dare. Perciò suo fratello rimase freddo e impassibile. Arthur cessò di piangere quasi

subito, perché la

momento casi se sentía contento de no poder controlarse. -Temerosos de la sangre y los clavos, que es a lo que, según he podido ver, todo el mundo tiene miedo, pero todo el mundo necesita, y de lo que Dostoiesvki trata en parte. Ves, Waldo – las palabras estallaban en su boca – ¿lo que debemos evitar? De pronto Arthur rompió a llorar porque vio que Waldo era lo que el libro llamava un alma perdida. En realidad, también él estaba perdido. Aunque pudiera sostener a Waldo en sus brazos, no podía extraer nunca de su propia alma lo bastante de aquel amor, aquel amor que estaba allí para darlo. Y así. su hermano

permanecía frío y

rompió a llorar porque se dio cuenta de que Waldo era eso que los libros llaman un alma perdida. Por otra parte, él también estaba perdido. Aunque estrechara a Waldo en sus brazos, no podía brindarle todo el amor que tenía en su interior para dar. De modo que su hermano seguía frío y seco. Cesó de llorar casi de inmediato porque la razón para hacerlo era tan inmensa que el llanto mismo parecía insignificante. Se sentía avergonzado. Pero tenemos que seguir intentándolo, Waldo. Así como nos levantamos todas las mañanas y nos ponemos los zapatos. Tal vez Waldo haya estado al borde de contestar: no sé lo que quieres decir. En ese momento parecía

immédiatement", ordonna Waldo. Puis il ajouta à haute voix: "Immédiatement, monsieur!" Il indiqua ainsi qu'Arthur, son frère, as chair, son souffle, était un complet étranger. C'est alors qu'Arthur se mit à arracher les pages sur le grand Inquisiteur du volume des Frères Karamazov. tant il était bouleversé. Waldo le secouait comme une malheureuse loque qu'il était, il en convenait. Il était né ainsi, il n'y avait pas là motif à le chaser et à lui faire franchir à coups de pied dans le derrière les portes battantes de la salle. Comme si on pouvait se débarrasser de son frère de cette façon-là (WHITE, 1973b, p. 321-323).

Und Arthur brach plötzlich in Tränen aus, dennn er erkannte, daß Waldo das war, was man in den Büchern eine verlorene Seele nannte. Auch er selbst, wenn es darauf ankam, auch er selbst war verloren. Denn ob er auch seinen Bruder in den Armen halten konnte – es würde ihm nie und nimmer gelingen, aus seiner eigenen Seele genug von der Liebe, die sort schlummerte und sich zu verströmen bereit war, auf ihn zu übertragen. Und so mußte Waldo kalt bleiben, unfruchtbar und trocken. Arthur hötte ebenso schnell zu weinen auf wie er begonnen hatte. Denn der Grund für seine Tränen war so ungeheuerlich und wesentlich, daß die Tränen selbst dagegen lächerlich erschienen. Er schämte sich. »Aber wir müssen

immer weiter unser

ragione del suo pianto era così immensa da far sembrare l'atto stesso insignificante. Si vergognò di se stesso. "Ma dobbiamo continuare a tentare, Waldo, così come tutte le mattine ci svegliamo e torniamoad allacciarci e scarpe." Non capisco che cosa vai dicendo. parve che Waldo fosse sul punto di obiettare. In quel momento aveva un'aria così smarrita che Arthur dovette sporgersi sul tavolo e cercare di prenderlo per le mani. Lui, l'anima perduta, avrebbe preso fra le sue le mani di suo fratello. Ma Waldo tirò indietro le sue. "Stai attirando l'attenzione della gente su di noi!"

Arthur non capì

seco. Arthur dejó de llorar casi inmediatamente, porque la razón por la que había empezado a hacerlo era tan inmensa que hacía que el acto mismo pareciese insignificante. Se sintió avergonzado. Pero tenemos que seguir intentándolo. Waldo, lo mismo que nos levantamos cada mañana y nos atamos las botas otra vez. "No sé lo que quieres decir", pareció haber estado a punto de decir Waldo, En aquel momento daba tanta impresión de estar perdido, que Arthur tuvo que inclinarse por encima de la mesa e intentar cogerle por las manos. El, el perdido, cogiendo a su perdido hermano

tan desamparado que Arthur etendió los brazos sobre la mesa y trató de tomarle las manos. Él, el perdido, sostenía las manos de su perdido hermano. Y entonces Waldo comenzó a reunir apresuradamente sus cosas. Nos están mirando! – pero Arthur no comprendió al principio. -¡Retírese del edificio! - Waldo hablaba como si diera una orden – . ¡Señor! Con estas palabras proclamaba que él, Arthur, su hermano, sangre de su sangre, era un perfecto extraño. Arthur se sintió tan confundido que comenzó a arrancar las páginas del Gran Inquisidor del libro de Dostoievsky. Waldo lo sacudía como si fuera un inservible, cosa que era, lo reconocía,

Bestes tun, Waldo, wir müssen jeden Tag alles versuchen, genau wie wir ja auch jeden Morgen aufstehen und unsere Schuhe zuschnüren müssen.« Wovon du redest, das weiß ich wirklich nicht – fast schien es, als ob Waldo das jetzt sagen wollte. Und er sah so verloren sau, daß Arthur sich über den Tisch lehnte und versuchte, seine Hand zu ergreifen. Er, der Verlorene, suchte seines Bruders Hand. Aber Waldo riß sie zurück: sie war sein Eigentum. »Die Leute warden schon auf uns aufmerksam!« Arthur verstand das zunächst überhaupt nicht. »Du wirst jetzt hier verschwinden«. befahl Waldo, und dann ganz laut: »Ich muß schon bitten, mein Herr!« Womit er deutlich machte, daß er, Arthur, sein Bruder. sein Fleisch und sein Atem, nichts weiter

subito. "Se ne vada," ordinò Waldo, e a voce molto alta aggiunse: "signore!" Indicando che lui, Arthur, suo fratello, la sua carne, il suo respiro, era un completo estraneo. Fu allora che Arthur cominciò a strappare il Grande Inquisitore dai Fratelli Karamazov: era così confuso. E Waldo lo scrollò come un vecchio straccio, come il vecchio straccio que era, lo ammise: era nato così, ma non per essere scaraventato a spintoni nel sedere attraverso le porte a vento. Come se ci si potesse sbarazzare di un fratello a quel modo. Attraversò la sala, con passo

abbastanza sicuro,

por las manos. Pero Waldo comenzó a arrebatarle su propiedad. -¡Estás atrayendo la atención de todos hacia nosotros! Arthur no comprendió al principio. -¡Fuera de aquí! le ordenó Waldo, y en voz muy alta: ;"Señor!" Indicando que él, Arthur, su hermano, su carne, su aliento, era un completo extraño. Fue entonces cuando Arthur comenzó a arrancar al Gran Inquisidor de Los hermanos Karamazov; tan confundido se sentía. Y Waldo empezó a sacudirlo como si fuese un trapo viejo; lo que era, y admitía, había nacido así, pero no para ser arrojado contra las puertas

desde que había nacido, pero no tanto como para que lo sacaran a empujones a través de las puertas giratorias. Como si alguien pudiera librarse de un hermano de esa manera. Atravesó el hall con paso bastante firme y luego salió por la entrada principal. Su propia sombra lo seguía bajo el sol pero él llevaba consigo en su interior... a su hermano (WHITE, 2016, p. 437-439).

als ein völlig Fremder con la sua ombra giratorias. Como che lo seguiva nel si de aquel modo Und das war der sole, portando quisiese Punkt, an dem Arthur dentro di sé suo deshacerse él de fratello (WHITE, begann, die Seiten su hermano. 1973c, p. 317mit dem Caminó a lo largo Großinquisitor aus 319). del vestíbulo con Die Brüder suficiente Karamasow firmeza, cruzó la herauszureißen. So entrada principal, verwirrt war er. Und y su sombra le Waldo schüttelte ihn siguió bajo del wie ein nutzloses sol, tal como él Lumpenbündel; und arrastaba en su das war er ja auch, interior a su das wollte erg ern hermano zugeben, so war er (WHITE, 1973a, p. 329-332). eben geboren, aber das ging nicht soweit, daß man ihn enfach beim Kragen packen und zur Drehtür schleifen und wie einen Landstreicher hinauswerfen konnte. Und seinen Bruder wurde man auf diese Art sowieso nicht los. Er ging durch die große Halle, sogar mit einigermaßen festen Schritten, trat durch das Hauptportal ins Freie, und sein Schatten folgte ihm im Sonnenschein, während er in seinem Inneren... seinen Bruder mit sich trug

(WHITE, 1978, p. 349-351).

**English** 

## First Attempt

## **Brazilian Portuguese - Revised**

But he had to return to what had become, if not his study, his obsession. There was all this Christ jazz. Something of which Mrs Poulter had explained. But he couldn't exactly relate it to men, except to the cruelty some men practise, in spite of themselves, as a religion they are brought up in. Reading *The Brothers Karamazov* he wished he could understand whose side anyone was on.

Mas ele tinha de retornar ao que havia se tornado, se não seu estudo, sua obsessão. Havia toda essa coisa de Cristo. Algo sobre o qual a Sra. Poulter havia explicado. Mas ele conseguia exatamente relacionar isso aos homens, exceto à crueldade que alguns homens praticam, apesar deles mesmos, como uma religião com a qual eles são criados. Lendo Os Irmãos Karamazov ele queria poder entender de que lado cada um estava.

Mas ele tinha de retornar ao que havia se tornado, se não seu estudo, sua obsessão. Havia toda essa coisa de Cristo. Sobre o qual a Sra. Poulter havia explicado um pouco. Mas ele não conseguia exatamente relacionar isso aos homens, exceto à crueldade que alguns homens praticam, apesar deles mesmos, como uma religião na qual eles são Lendo Oscriados. Irmãos Karamazov ele queria poder entender de que lado cada um estava.

Who was the Grand Inquisitor? Then quite suddenly one morning at the Library Waldo was sitting at the same table, opposite him, making that scene. Afterwards Arthur could not remember in what said. detail was You couldn't exactly say they were speaking, because the remarks were being torn out of them helter skelter, between tears and gusts of breathlessness, like handfuls of flesh. The raw, bleeding remarks were such that Waldo kept looking round to see who might be noticing. As for Arthur, he did not care. Their relationship was the only fact of importance, and

such an overwhelming one.

Quem era o Grande Inquisidor?

Então um tanto repentinamente em uma manhã na Biblioteca Waldo estava sentado na mesma mesa, em oposição a ele, fazendo aquela cena. Posteriormente Arthur conseguia lembrar em detalhes o que fora dito. Você não conseguia exatamente dizer que eles estavam conversando, porque os comentários estavam sendo rasgados deles rapidamente e em todas as direções, lágrimas rajadas e ofegância, como punhados de carne. Os comentários crus, sangrentos eram tais que Waldo se manteve olhando ao redor para ver quem poderia estar notando. Quanto a Arthur, ele não se importava. O relacionamento deles era o único

fato de importância, e esmagadora.

Quem era o Grande Inquisidor?

Então um tanto repentinamente em uma manhã na Biblioteca Waldo estava sentado na mesma mesa, na frente dele, fazendo aquela cena. Arthur não conseguia lembrar em detalhes o que foi dito. Você não poderia dizer exatamente que eles estavam conversando, porque os comentários estavam sendo arrancados deles de qualquer maneira, entre lágrimas e lufadas ofegantes, como punhados de carne. Os comentários crus, sangrentos eram tais que Waldo ficou olhando ao redor para ver quem poderia estar notando. Quanto a Arthur, ele não se importava. O relacionamento era única coisa esmagadoramente – de importância.

"I shan't ask if you've come here, if you're making this scene, to humiliate me," Waldo was saying, "because the answer is too obvious. That has been your chief object in life. If you would be truthful."

"Why hurt yourself, Waldo?" Arthur was given the strength to reply. "Kick a dog, and hurt yourself. That's you all over."

"For God's sake don't drag in the dogs! And who, I'd like to know, waned the miserable animals? And why?"

"We both did," said Arthur, "so that we could have something additional - reliable - to love. Because we didn't have faith in each other. Because we are didn't you say yourself, Waldo? abnormal people and selfish narcissvists." "Afraid." [...] Arthur was saying, and now he did begin to feel a kind of terror rising in him. "Like our father. I mean Dad. Not the one they pray to. But Dad putting Dostoevsky on the fire."

He knew the flames of argument must be colouring his face in the way which distressed strangers, even Waldo, most. But for the moment he was almost glad he couldn't control himself.

"Afraid of the blood and the nails, which as far as I can see, is what everyone is afraid of, but wants,

- Não devo pedir se você veio aqui, se você está fazendo esta cena, para me humilhar Waldo estava dizendo porque a resposta é óbvia demais. Aquele tem sido seu principal objetivo na vida. Se você fosse verdadeiro.
- Por que magoar a você mesmo,
  Waldo? a Arthur foi dada a força
  para responder. Chute um
  cachorro, e se magoe. Assim é você
  por toda a parte.
- Pelo amor de Deus não envolva os cachorros! E quem, eu gostaria de saber, queria os míseros animais? E por quê?
- Nós dois quisemos disse
  Arthur de modo que tivéssemos algo a mais confiável para amar.
  Porque não tínhamos fé um no outro. Porque somos você mesmo não disse, Waldo? pessoas anormais e narcisistas egoístas. [...]
  Com medo Arthur estava dizendo, e agora ele começou mesmo a sentir um tipo de terror crescendo nele. Como o nosso pai.
  Quero dizer Papai. Não aquele para quem eles rezam. Mas Papai colocando Dostoyevsky no fogo.

Ele sabia que as chamas da discussão deveriam estar colorindo o rosto dele de uma maneira que afligia os estranhos, mesmo Waldo, principalmente. Mas no momento ele estava quase contente que ele não conseguia se controlar.

Medo do sangue e dos pregos,
 que até onde consigo ver, é o que
 todo o mundo tem medo, mas quer,

- Não vou perguntar se você veio aqui, se você está fazendo esta cena, para me humilhar Waldo estava dizendo porque a resposta é óbvia demais. Esse tem sido seu principal objetivo na vida. Se você fosse sincero.
- Por que se magoar, Waldo? a
   Arthur foi dada a força para responder. Chute um cachorro, e se magoe. Isso é bem você.
- Pelo amor de Deus não envolva os cachorros! E quem, eu gostaria de saber, queria os infelizes animais? E por quê?
- Nós dois quisemos disse
  Arthur de modo que tivéssemos algo a mais confiável para amar.
  Porque não tínhamos fé um no outro. Porque somos você mesmo não disse, Waldo? pessoas anormais e narcisistas egoístas. [...]
  Com medo Arthur estava dizendo, e agora ele começou mesmo a sentir algo como terror crescendo nele. Como o pai nosso.
  Quero dizer Papai. Não aquele para quem eles rezam. Mas Papai colocando Dostoiévski no fogo.

Ele sabia que as chamas da discussão deveriam estar colorindo seu rosto de uma maneira que afligia os estranhos, mesmo Waldo, principalmente. Mas no momento ele estava quase contente que ele não conseguia se controlar.

Medo do sangue e dos pregos,
 que até onde entendo, é de que todo
 o mundo tem medo, mas quer, e o

and what Dostoevsky is partly going on about. Do you see, Waldo," he was bursting with it, "what we must avoid?"

Suddenly Arthur burst into tears because he saw that Waldo was what the books referred to as a lost soul. He, too, for that matter, was lost. Although he might hold Waldo in his arms, he could never give out from his own soul enough of that love which was there to give. So his brother remained cold and dry.

Arthur stopped crying almost at once, because the reason for his beginning was so immense it made the act itself seem insignificant. He was ashamed.

"But we've got to keep on trying, Waldo, just as we get up every morning and lace our boots up again."

I don't know what you mean, Waldo could have been on the point of saying. At that moment he looked so lost, Arthur had to lean across the table and try to take him by the hands. He, the lost one, taking his lost brother by the hands.

When Waldo started snatching back his property.

"You're drawing attention to us!"

Arthur did not understand at first.
"You will leave this place,"
Waldo was commanding, and
very loudly: "sir!"

e o que Dostoyevsky em parte está tratando. Você vê, Waldo – ele estava rebentando com isso – o que devemos evitar?

De repente Arthur rompeu em lágrimas porque ele via que Waldo era o que os livros se referiam como uma alma perdida. Ele, também, aliás, estava perdido. Embora conseguisse segurar Waldo em seus braços, ele nunca poderia dar de sua própria alma o suficiente daquele amor que estava lá para ser dado. Assim seu irmão se mantinha frio e seco

Arthur parou de chorar quase imediatamente, porque a razão para o seu início era tão imensa que fez o ato mesmo parecer insignificante. Ele estava envergonhado.

 Mas temos que nos manter tentando, Waldo, assim como levantamos todas as manhãs e amarramos nossas botas de novo.

Não sei o que você quer dizer, Waldo poderia estar ao ponto de dizer. Naquele momento ele parecia tão perdido, Arthur teve que se inclinar do outro lado da mesa e tentar pegá-lo pelas mãos. Ele, o perdido, pegando seu irmão perdido pelas mãos.

Quando Waldo começou a arrebatar sua propriedade.

 Você está chamando a atenção para nós!

Arthur não entendeu no início.

Você vai sair desse lugar –
 Waldo estava comandando, e muito
 alto: - senhor!

que Dostoiévski em parte está tratando. Você vê, Waldo – ele estava explodindo com isso – o que devemos evitar?

De repente Arthur rompeu em lágrimas porque ele via que Waldo era o que os livros chamavam de uma alma perdida. Ele, também, aliás, estava perdido. Embora pudesse segurar Waldo em seus braços, nunca poderia dar de sua própria alma o suficiente daquele amor que estava aí para ser dado. Assim seu irmão se mantinha frio e seco.

Arthur parou de chorar quase imediatamente, porque a razão para ter começado era tão imensa que fez o ato em si parecer insignificante. Ele estava envergonhado.

-Mas temos que continuar tentando,
 Waldo, assim como levantamos
 todas as manhãs e amarramos
 nossas botas todos os dias.

Não sei o que você quer dizer, Waldo parecia estar prestes a dizer. Naquele momento ele parecia tão perdido, que Arthur teve que se inclinar por sobre a mesa e tentar pegá-lo pelas mãos. Ele, o perdido, pegando seu irmão perdido pelas mãos.

Quando Waldo começou a arrebatar sua propriedade.

Você está chamando a atenção para nós!

Arthur não entendeu no início.

Você vai sair daqui - Waldo estava comandando, e muito alto: - senhor!

Indicating that he, Arthur, his brother, his flesh, his breath, was a total stranger.

It was then Arthur began to tear the Grand Inquisitor out of *The Brothers Karamazov*, he was so confused. And Waldo shaking him like any old rag, which he was, he admitted, he was born so, but not to be bum-rushed against and through the swing-doors. As if you could get rid of your brother that way.

He walked across the hall, steady enough, and out the main entrance, his shadow following him in the sun, as he carried away inside him – his brother (WHITE, 1974, p. 283-285).

Indicando que ele, Arthur, o irmão dele, sua carne, sua respiração, era um completo estranho.

Foi então que Arthur começou a rasgar o Grande Inquisidor de *Os Irmãos Karamazov*, ele estava tão confuso. E Waldo sacudindo-o como qualquer trapo velho, que ele era, ele admitia, ele nascera assim, mas não para ter forçada a passagem contra e através das portas de vaivém. Como se você conseguisse se livrar de seu irmão daquele jeito.

Ele caminhou pela entrada, sóbrio o suficiente, e para a entrada principal, sua sombra o seguindo no sol, enquanto ele levava dentro dele – seu irmão.

Indicando que ele, Arthur, o irmão dele, sua carne, sua respiração, era um completo estranho.

Foi então que Arthur começou a rasgar o Grande Inquisidor de *Os Irmãos Karamazov*, ele estava tão confuso. E Waldo sacudindo-o como qualquer trapo velho, que ele era, ele admitia, ele nascera assim, mas não para ser forçado a passar contra e através das portas de vaivém. Como se fosse possível se livrar de seu irmão daquele jeito.

Ele caminhou pela entrada, com firmeza o suficiente, e para a entrada principal, sua sombra o seguindo no sol, enquanto ele levava dentro de si – seu irmão.

In our description of the most relevant translation challenges and modifications, we start highlighting the following: "There was all this Christ jazz. Something of which Mrs Poulter had explained", first translated as "Havia toda essa coisa de Cristo. Algo sobre o qual a Sra. Poulter havia explicado". In truth, this sounded strange in Brazilian Portuguese, because it has a broken rhythm. To recover that, we decided to make a syntactical alteration, by putting the adverb – connected to the verb "explain" – at the end of the sentence: "Sobre o qual a Sra. Poulter havia explicado um pouco". Another improvement relates to prepositions, which are fundamental in any composition: "a religion they are brought up in" was translated as "uma religião com a qual eles são criados", but in fact, in Brazilian Portuguese, we are more inclined to say "uma religião na qual eles são criados", thus indicating, in a clearer way, religion as a basis of education. Again connected to prepositions, in "Waldo was sitting at the same table, opposite him", our rough translation as "Waldo estava sentado na mesma mesa, em oposição a ele" does not work properly when we compare to the alternative chosen, "Waldo estava sentado na mesma mesa, na frente dele", which enhances the importance of the moment by emphasizing the location of the characters.

In "because the remarks were being torn out of them helter skelter, between tears and gusts of breathlessness", we can feel the load of the words, the increasing tension, which, in our first attempt, was not really kept: "porque os comentários estavam sendo rasgados deles rapidamente e em todas as direções, entre lágrimas e rajadas de ofegância". In our reading for revision, we were able to detect that "helter skelter" and "gusts of breathlessness" deserved better alternatives: "de qualquer maneira" and "lufadas ofegantes", respectively, which added to the literariness of the excerpt. Another strategy, which this time involved punctuation, relates to "Their relationship was the only fact of importance, and such an overwhelming one", translated as "o relacionamento deles era o único fato de importância, e esmagadora". After recognizing that we might increase the effect sensed in the original structure, we decided to play with our linguistic resources in Brazilian Portuguese via punctuation (by adding dashes and turning the adjective "esmagadora" into an adverb), thus resulting in "o relacionamento deles era a única coisa - esmagadoramente - de importância". Another modification following the same strategy was in "but not to be bum-rushed against and through the swing-doors", first translated as "mas não para ter forçada a passagem contra e através das portas de vaivém". In this instance, we again admit that this arrangement was not good, thus, we decided to keep the focus on the narrator, Arthur, as in the original, by adjusting the use of the infinitive forms in Brazilian Portuguese: "mas não para ser forçado a passar contra e através das portas de vaivém". In the next sentence, we can see that we changed our perception of the narrator's words: "as if you could get rid" was translated as "como se você conseguisse se livrar", perhaps suggesting, in our rereading in Brazilian Portuguese, some sort of interaction with the reader (alluding to Machado de Assis's technique), which is not the case. However, we decided to follow the reduction strategy, to confer impersonality to the excerpt, by choosing "como se fosse possível se livrar".

Another change concerning verbs and nouns is seen in "because the reason for his beginning was so immense it made the act itself seem insignificant", first presented as "porque a razão para o seu início era tão imensa que fez o ato mesmo parecer insignificante". Small changes, such as in the use of a verb (instead of the noun) and the expression "em si" (instead of "mesmo") resulted in a far better structure in Brazilian Potuguese: "porque a razão para ter começado era tão imensa que fez o ato em si parecer insignificante".

Reduction again played its important role, as seen in "Why hurt yourself, Waldo?", which was roughly translated as "Por que magoar a você mesmo, Waldo?", and then simply changed to "Por que se magoar, Waldo?", thus keeping the conciseness of the original line. Another instance concerns "That's you all over", which was first rendered as "Assim é você

por toda a parte" and then as "Isso é bem você". The form "which as far as I can see, is what everyone is afraid of" was reduced too: from "que até onde consigo ver, é o que todo o mundo tem medo" to "que até onde entendo, é de que todo o mundo tem medo", with the addition of a grammatical correction, with the use of the preposition "de" before "que todo". Furthermore, to translate "you will leave this place", we decided to reduce from the literal form "você vai sair desse lugar" to "você vai sair daqui", adding to emphasis.

Another lapse occurred, this time involving the expression "kind of terror rising in him": the first translation was "sentir um tipo de terror crescendo nele", but then aptly changed to "a sentir algo como terror crescendo nele", improving the whole sentence.

In connection to the change in the demonstrative pronoun "isso" (referring to the excerpts of *The Brothers Karamazov* that they were pursuing to understand and to the whole situation of a hard personal discovery) in the scene from Waldo's perspective, we call attention to the structure "he was bursting with it": we first translated it as "ele estava rebentando com isso", but, after rereading the excerpt, we had to think of a better alternative, considering Arthur's situation and reactions in our own language: in English we perceive the meaning quite clearly, but when we feel anxious and in pain, we do not usually say "rebentar", but "explodir" in Brazilian Portuguese, thus, this was the reasoning which guided our decision.

In terms of repetition, we call attention to the presence of modal verbs in the following: "although he might hold Waldo in his arms, he could never give out", first translated as "embora conseguisse segurar Waldo em seus braços, ele nunca poderia dar". Our first attempt was guided by the fact that we did not want to repeat verbal forms, but when rereading the excerpt, we sensed that repetition would really create a better effect, emphasizing Arthur's incapacity and hopelessness: "embora pudesse segurar Waldo em seus braços, nunca poderia dar".

Like the additions described in the scene from Waldo's perspective, in this part we used that resource to translate the following: "but we've got to keep on trying, Waldo, just as we get up every morning and lace our boots up again". Honestly, our literal translation simply used the closest meanings to render the sentence, but these choices were rather ineffective. The modified result used a reduction ("continuar" instead of "nos manter") and explained the meaning of "again" by replacing "de novo" with "todos os dias" ("every day").

Another occurrence which deserved a brief description and was again connected to a modal verb is "Waldo could have been on the point of saying", roughly translated as "Waldo poderia estar ao ponto de dizer". Given that we have freedom to use more creative forms in

literary translation, we opted for "Waldo parecia estar prestes a dizer", once again evincing how conciseness increases the flow of a translation. A providential inclusion occurred soon after that, in "he looked so lost, Arthur had to lean across the table", translated as "ele parecia tão perdido, (que) Arthur teve que se inclinar".

In vocabulary terms, we underline the modification of "sóbrio o suficiente" in our first attempt (which could mistakenly suggest that Arthur might have been drinking) to "com firmeza" to translate "steady enough", at the end of the excerpt.

We now present the scene which is considered the climax of the novel: the Mandala dance. Found in the Arthur chapter, it portrays the linguistic features pointed earlier by the Swedish scholar Ingmar Björkstén, such as the poetic tone and contrasts, and confirms J. M. Coetzee's impression written in the introduction to the newest translation in Spanish: it "shows White at the height of his powers of artist of the prose<sup>193</sup>" (WHITE, 2016, p. 27-28, my translation). The twin brothers are sexagenarians, and have their epiphanies. Waldo faces his life of appearances, of sad truths: the recognition of his failure, of his lack of literary talent, of the fallacy of his proclaimed "genius". Contradictorily, the creative genius comes from the least expected source: Arthur.

Exhibit 63 - Mandala dance

| French             | German               | Italian               | Spanish 1            | Spanish 2              |
|--------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|------------------------|
| "Je vais danser    | »Ich werde jetzt für | "Ora danzerò per lei, | – Voy a bailar para  | – Voy a bailar para    |
| pour vous, Mme     | sie tanzen, Mrs.     | signora Poulter,"     | usted, Mrs. Poulter  | usted, Mrs. Poulter.   |
| Poulter, je vais   | Poulter«, sagte er.  | anunciò. "Danzerò     | – dijo –. Voy a      | Voy a bailar un        |
| danser un          | »Ich werde ein       | um mandala." []       | bailar una mandala.  | mandala. []            |
| mandala." []       | Mandala tanzen.«     | "Il mandala?" essa    | []                   | – ¿El mandala? –       |
| "Un mandala?       | Er konnte sehen,     | disse pacatamente.    | – ¿El mandala? –     | dijo bastante seria –. |
| demanda-t-elle,    | daß sie fast gelacht | "Non ho mai sentito   | preguntó ella con    | Nunca oí hablar de     |
| assez calmement.   | hätte und es nur     | parlare di un ballo   | bastante sobriedad-  | un baile con ese       |
| Je n'ai jamais     | deswegen nicht tat,  | con questo nome.      | . Nunca oí hablar de | nombre. Al menos       |
| entendu parler de  | weil sie ihn gern    | Non dev'essere un     | un baile llamado     | no de los modernos.    |
| cette danse. Ce    | hatte.               | ballo moderno."       | así. No debe ser de  | Él no intentó explicar |
| n'est toujours pas | »Mandala?« fragte    | Egli non cercò di     | los modernos.        | nada porque sentía     |
| une danse          | sie mit fast völlig  | spiegare: le avrebbe  | Arthur no intentó    | que podia lograr que   |
| moderne."          | ruhiger Stimme,      | fatto vedere.         | explicárselo porque  | ella viese.            |
| Il ne tenta pas de | »ich habe noch nie   | Così Arthur Brown si  | pensó que podría     | De modo que Arthur     |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> In the original: "La escena de la danza, que muestra a White en la cumbre de sus poderes de artista de la prosa" (WHITE, 2016, p. 27-28).

lui donner des explications, il sentait qu'il valait mieux lui faire une démonstration. Aussi Arthur Brown se mit-il à danser. Prenant son départ dans l'un des angles, il en arriva, par étapes successives, au quatrième, qu'il dépassa. Lui, si lourd et si mastoc, trouva spontanément la grâce du mouvement sur la pente de la colline parmi les mûres. Les manchettes de sa chemise étaient ouvertes et pendaient. Les ombres bleutées des parties moins exposées de sa peau, de ses poignets, se couvrirent bientôt de perles de sueur. Dans le premier angle, prélude à tout ce qu'il allait révéler, il dansa

von einem Tanz gehört, der so heißt. Jedenfalls kann es keiner von den modernen sein.« Er machte gar nicht erst den Versuch einer Erklärung, denn er hatte das Gefühl, daß sie bei seinem Tanz schon alles verstehen würde. Und Arthur Brown tanzte. Er began mit dem ersten Kreis, von dem er dann stufenweise bis zum vierten Kreis und noch weiter vordringen wollte. Er, der doch so groß war und so unbeholfen, stellate plötzlich fest, daß ihm auf dem Hügel zwischen den Brombeerbüschen die Bewegungen wie von selbst zuflogen. Seine Hemdmanschetten hingen offen um die Handgelenke, und die bläulichen Schatten in den Tiefen seiner Haut waren bald ebenso mit feinen

Tröpfchen

mise a danzare. Cominciò dal primo angolo, da dove sarebbe passato per gradi fino al quarto, e oltre. Lui che era così massiccio, così dinoccolato, si mosse con naturalezza, là sulla collina, nella radura fra i rovi. Le maniche gli pendevano sbottonate intorno ai polsi. Le ombre bluastre sulle parti meno esposte della sua pelle, dei suoi polsi, e il solco in mezzo al suo petto, furono ben presto imperlati di sudore. Nel primo angolo, come un preludio a tutto quello che aveva da rivelare, eseguì la danza di se stesso. Per metà goffa, per metà elettrica. Danzò gli dei morenti su un campo di velluto cremisi, fra il suono discordante di voci umane. Anche nell'assenza di dei, la sua vita, o danza, era sempre devota. Anche se non gli era stato insegnato, a differenza del droghiere, a mettersi

hacérselo ver. De manera que Arthur Brown bailó, empezando por una primer esquina, desde la cual continuaría por etapas hasta la cuarta, y más allá. El, que era tan grande, tan torpe, descubrió que el movimiento llegaba a él en aquel lugar de la colina entre la bahía de zarzas. Los puños de sus mangas colgaban, abiertos, junto a sus muñecas. Las sombras azuladas de las partes menos expuestas de su piel, en sus muñecas y en el valle entre sus pechos, se cubrieron con perlas de sudor. En la primer esquina, como un preludio a todo lo que tenía que expresar, bailó la danza de sí mismo. Medio torpe, casi fogoso. Representó a los dioses muriendo en un campo de terciopelo

Brown danzó, comenzando en el primer ángulo, desde el cual avanzó por etapas hasta el cuarto y más allá. Él, tan grandote, tan sin gracia, sintió que el movimiento se apropiaba de él allí en la ladera del cerro, entre las zarzamoras. Los puños de la camisa flotaban desprendidos. La sombra azulina de las zonas menos expuestas de su piel – las muñecas y la hendidura del pecho – pronto se cubrió de diminutas perlas. En el primer ángulo, como preludio de todo lo que tenía que revelar, ejecutó la danza de sí mismo. Semitorpe, semieléctrica. Danzó a los dioses que morían en un campo de terciopelo rojo, entre discordes de vocês humanas. Aun en ausência de dioses, su vida, o su danza, era siempre una plegaria. Aunque nadie le hubiera enseñado, como al

une danse ayant trait à lui-même. Tantôt pesant, tantôt électrique. Il dansa la danse des dieux qui meurent dans un champ de velours pourpre, parmi la discorde des voix humaines. Même en l'absence de dieux, sa vie, ou la danse, s'emplissaient de prière. Bien qu'on ne lui eût pas appris, comme à l'épicier, à s'agenouiller et à joindre les mains, il offrait sa prière connaissances qu'il avait puisées dans la lumière ou les silences. Il dansa la danse des habitants d'une maison des bois. geignant sous l'accablement du sommeil. enfouissant prudemment leurs secrets au plus profond d'euxmêmes, avant

überperlt, wie das Tal zwischen den beiden Hälften seiner Brust. Und im ersten Kreis tantze er, als Vorspiel für alles, was er ins Licht der Erkenntnis zu ziehen gedachte, zunächst den Tanz seines eigenen Selbst. Halb noch unbeholfen, und halb wie elektrisiert tanzte er die Götter. die auf einem Feld aus purpurrotem Samt unter den streitenden Disharmonien menschlicher Stimmen dahinstarben. Aber auch in Abwesenheit der Götter war sein Leben, oder sein Tanz, von ständigem Gebet erfüllt. Auch wenn er nicht, wie der Gemischtwarenhän dler, beigebracht bekommen hatte, sich auf die Knie zu werfen und die Hände zusammenzulegen.

Stattdessen bot er

in ginocchio e a congiungere le mani. Lui offriva la sua preghiera a ciò che aveva appreso dalla luce o dai silenzi. Danzò il sonno delle persone in una casa di legno, gementi sotto la pressione del sonno, i loro segreti messi prudentemente al sicuro, finché i loro pensieri parlati, o i loro peti, li tradivano. Danzò la luna, anestetizzata da cestro imbottigliato. Danzò il disco del sole arancione sopra gli iceberg, che era in un certo senso il suo inizio, e forse sarebbe stato la sua fine. Intanto la signora Poulter guardava, giocando con l'estremità dei suoi capelli neri. A tratti sospirava. Poi abbassava gli occhi. Nel secondo angolo dichiarò il suo amore per Dulcie Feinstein, e per suo marito, che lo possedeva in ugual misura, tramite il suo amore per Dulcie. così che erano tutti e ter uniti, loro i loro

carmesí frente a los desacuerdos de las voces humanas. Aun en la ausencia de dioses, su vida, o su danza, era siempre piadosa. Aun cuando a él no le hubieran enseñado, como al tendero, a arrodillarse y poner las manos juntas. En cambio, ofrecía su oración fundada en lo que sabía por la luz o los silencios. Bailó el sueño de la gente de una casa de madera, gruñendo bajo la presión del sueño, con sus secretos profundamente encerrados. seguros, hasta que sus pensamientos verbalizados, o sus pedos, los delataban. Danzó la luna, anestesiada por un cestrum embotellado. Danzó el disco del sol anaranjado encima de los témpanos de hielo, que era en cierta manera su

principio, y tal vez

almacenero, a hincarse de rodillas y juntar las manos. En cambio, él ofrecía su plegaria a lo que conocía por la luz o los silencios. Danzó a los dormidos habitantes de una casa de madera, que rezongaban por el peso del sueño, con sus secretos prudentemente guardados, seguros bajo llave, hasta que los pensamientos expresados em palabras o sus pedos, los delataban. Danzó a l aluna, aletargada por la fragancia de la dama de noche. Danzó el disco anaranjado del sol suspendido sobre los icebergs, que en algún sentido era su comienzo y quizá sería su fin. Entretanto, Mrs. Poulter lo miraba jogueteando con las puntas de su oscuro cabello. Suspirando a veces. Y mirando el suelo después. En el segundo ángulo, declaró su amor por Dulcie

d'être trahis par les pensées ou les pets qui leur échappaient. Il dansa la danse de la lune, anesthésiée par du cestreau mis en flacon. Il dansa la danse du disque solaire orangé au-dessus des icebergs, qui représentaient en un certain sens son début dans la vie, et peut-être sa fin. Tandis que M<sup>me</sup> Poulter le regardait en jouant avec la pointe de ses cheveux noirs. Parfois elle soupirait. Puis elle baissait les yeux. Dans le second angle, il déclara son amour pour Dulcie Feinstein et pour son mari, possédé qu'il était par celui-ci également grâce à leur amour pour Dulcie: aussi se trouvèrent-ils unis tous trois, et

sein Gebet mit dem Wissen dar, das er von der Stille hatte, oder vom Licht. Er tanzte den Schlaf der Menschen in einem hölzernem Haus, das hin und wieder wie gequält aufstöhnte. Und die Gedanken der Menschen waren sorgfältig eingesperrt, sicher verwhart, bis sie versehentlich im Traum ausgesprochen wurden oder sich durch die Fürze verrieten, die den Schlafenden entfuhren. Er tanzte den Mond, betäubt vom Duft exotischer Pflanzen. Und er tanzte die Scheibe der orangeroten Sonne über den Eisbergen, die in gewissem Sime ja sein Anfang war und vielleicht auch sein Ende sein würde. Während Mrs. Poulter still dasaß und zusah. Mit den Spitzen ihres

dunklen Haares

figli non ancora concepiti. Nell'angolo del suo mandala intessé la loro Stella, su cui in parte si basava la loro relazione triangolare. Turbini di musica simili a cascate di ortensie composero una cerimonia di bianche note che prendevano esattamente il posto delle contorte corde di oscura musica che Waldo aveva imposto a Dulcie il pomeriggio del su strangolamento. Essa era là, ossuta, seduta sulla sedia dall'alto schienale, in nero. E la carne le veniva restituita dalla carne del suo amante. I suoi occhi inestinguibili e sempre più rivelatori. I segreti di Dulcie egli poté rendersene conto – erano stati messi a nudo di fronte alla signora Poulter, che altrimenti avrebbe potuto diventare la statua di una donna. avvolta nei suoi capelli, accanto al cespuglio di more.

fuera su final. Mientras, Mrs. Poulter miraba, sentada, jugando con las puntas de su cabello oscuro. Suspirando a veces. Bajando la mirada. En el segundo rincón declaró su amor por Dulcie Feinstein, y por su marido, por quien, a través de su amor a Dulcie, era igualmente poseído, de tal modo que los tres estaban unidos, y los hijos del matrimonio aún sin concebir. En esa esquina de su mandala tejió la Estrella, sobre la cual se basaba, em cierto modo, su relación triangular con ellos. Ráfagas de una música precedida de hortensias proporcionaban una ceremonia de notas blancas que caían exactamente en su sitio y no más allá, tiempo atrás, en las cuerdas torcidas de la música oscura que Waldo había

Feinstein, y por el marido de ella, por quien también estaba poseído a través del amor de cada uno por Dulcie, de suerte que los três formaban una unidad, junto con los hijos que ellos aún no habían concebido. En ese ángulo del mandala, Arthur entretejió la Estrella de ellos, sobre la cual descansaba en parte su relación tricúspide. Ráfagas de música precedidas de hortênsias encarnaban una ceremonia de notas blancas que sonaban al compás, y no mucho después, las retorcidas sogas de música oscura que Waldo había impuesto a Dulcie la tarde en que la torturó. Allí estaba ella, reducida a puro hueso, erguida sobre la silla, vestida de negro. Devuelta luego a la carne por obra de la carne de su amado. Los ojos inextinguibles, cada vez más reveladores. Él se daba cuenta de

leurs enfants restaient à concevoir. Dans leur angle du mandala, il tissa leur Étoile, sur laquelle se fondaient en partie leurs relations à trois branches. Une envolée de musique couronnée d'hortensias fournit les éléments d'une cérémonie de notes blanches qui se trouvaient exactement à leur place et, peu après, les cordes enchevêtrées de la musique sombre dont Waldo avait garrotté Dulcie en cet après-midi d'asphyxie. Réduite à l'état de squelette, assise sur une chaise, rigide, elle était toute vêtue de noir. Puis elle apparaissait avec la plénitude de sa chair retrouvée

spielte und hin und wieder seufzte. Und dann die Augen senkte. Im zweiten Kreis tanzte er seine Liebe zu Dulcie Feinstein. und auch zu ihrem Mann, von dem er durch ihre gemeinsame Liebe zu Dulcie ebenso besessen war wie er ihr gehörte, und sie waren also alle drei vereint und warteten gemeinsam auf die Früchte ihrer Bindung. In diesen Kreis wob er den Stern, auf dem ihre dreigeeinte Beziehung ja zum Teil beruhte. Flüchtige Schauer hortensienblütiger Musik erschufen eine Zeremonie weißer Töne, die sich alle an genau der richtigen Stelle einfügten, während sich nicht weit davon die verknoteten Lianen der dunklen Musik krümmten, die Dulcie von Waldo

am Tage des

Anche se oscillava leggermente quando egli cominciò a intessere la sua figura nell'apposito angolo. Nell'angolo della signora Poulter danzò il rito delle pere che si maturavano, e dei grufolanti porcellini neri. Spire di miele dorato pendevano sfavillanti dalla sua bocca ebbra. Finché giunse il momento più immobile. Egli era il bambino che essa non aveva mai portato nell'oscurità del suo corpo, sotto il suo cuore, che col suo battito gli insegnava già che cosa avrebbe potuto aspettarsi. Le mura della sua fortezza circolare rabbrividirono. A questo punto la signora Poulter era così evidentemente commossa che avrebbe voluto allontanare la visione. o farla cessare del tutto, ma egli non gliel'avrebbe permesso. Arthur aveva

cominciato a battere i

forzado a tocar a Dulcie en aquella tarde sofocante. Allí estaban sus huesos, allí estaba Dulcie, sentada en la silla recta, vestida de negro. Y luego reintegrada a su carne por la carne de su amante. Con sus ojos imborrables, cada vez más reveladores. Los secretos de Dulcie, veía Arthur. habían despertado el eco de su desnudez en el rostro de Mrs. Poulter, quien de otra manera se hubiese convertido en una estatua de mujer, bajo su cabelo, junto a las zarzas. Aunque se había estremecido ligeiramente cuando él empezó a tejer la figura de ella en él ángulo que le estaba destinado. En la esquina de Mrs. Poulter bailó el rito de las peras madurando y los cerditos mamones

que había descubierto los secretos de Dulcie ante Mrs. Poulter, quien, de no haber sido por eso, podría haberse transformado en la estatua de una mujer sentada bajo un pabellón de cabelo junto a las zarzamoras. Aunque ella se mecía suavemente cuando él comenzó a tejer su figura, la de ella, en el ángulo que el correspondia. En la esquina de Mrs. Poulter, él danzó el rito de las peras que maduran y de los lechoncitos mamones que andam hozando la tierra. De su boca embriagada pendían madejas de miel dorada que se balanceaban y coruscaban. Hasta que alcanzó el momento de calma suprema. Él era el niño que ella nunca había llevado en su seno, bajo su corazón, cuyos latidos y ale estaban diciendo lo que le cabía esperar. Los

grâce à la chair de celui qui l'aimait. Des veux inextinguibles, de plus en plus révélateurs. Les secrets de Dulcie, il s'en apercut, venaient d'être mis à nu devant Mme Poulter, qui autrement aurait pu se changer en statue de femme, sous ses cheveux. à côté des mûriers. Quoiqu'elle oscillât légèrement lorsqu'il commença à tisser le motif qui la concernait dans l'angle approprié. Dans le coin de M<sup>me</sup> Poulter, il dansa le rite des poires mûrissantes et des petits cochons de lait qui fouillaient le sol. De longs fils de miel doré pendaient tout scintillants de as bouche enivrée.

Erstickens aufgezwungen worden war. Und da war sie selbst, war ganz aus Knochen, aufrecht sitzend auf einem hartem Stuhl und in einem schwarzen Kleid. Und dann wieder zu Fleich geworden durch das Fleisch ihres Geliebten. Mit ihren unauslöschlichen. immer die Wahrheit enthüllenden Augen. Dulcie Geheimnisse. erkannte er, waren jetzt auch offen auf dem Gesicht Mrs. Poulters abzulesen. Die sonst vielleicht nur noch die Statue einer Frau gewesen wäre, unter ihrem Haar neben den Brombeerbüschen. Obwohl sie sich leicht hin - und herwiegte, als er jetzt begann, ihre Gestalt in den dafür vorgesehenen Kreis einzuweben. In Mrs. Poulters Kreis

tanzte er das Ritual

piedi, in modo rígido, sprezzante. Nel quarto angolo, che era quello di suo fratello, i giunchi ondeggiavano avanti e indietro. C'era un tramestio di fango secco, un fruscio di bandiere, o di carte, morte. Di parole o d'idee affidate alla carta. I vecchi, ricurvi spiedi di alluminio tropo usati. Così trafitto e perseguitato, ciò che avrebbe dovuto ascendere in pura luce, ridotto a un arido stato d'ansia, a una contrazione dissimulata. Non poteva danzare suo fratello col proprio corpo, non completamente. Erano troppo vicini perché potesse funzionare, più vicini e più lontani quando, con tutte e due le braccia, tenne entrambi uniti, com le dita gocciolanti di cera. Non era in grado di salvare. Tutt'al più una lieve consolazione sgorgò con aria colpevole dalla loro duplice

que arrancaban raíces. Madejas de miel dorada se balancearon brillando en su boca embriagada. Hasta que llegó el momento más quieto. Arthur fue el niño que ella nunca había llevado en la oscuridad de su cuerpo, bajo su corazón, por cuyo latido él supo entonces qué era lo que podía esperar. Las paredes de su fortaleza circular temblaron. Mrs. Poulter estaba en ese punto tan claramente conmovida, que le hubiera gustado deshacerse de aquella visión, o detener por completo a Arthur, pero él no se lo permitiría. Había comenzado a taconear, pero con una frágil rigidez, marchitándose. En la cuarta esquina, que era la de su hermano, las cañas se serraban entre sí.

muros de la fortaleza circular del danzante se estremecieron. A esa altura, Mrs. Poulter estaba evidentemente tan conmovida que habría preferido borrar lo que veía, detenerlo totalmente, pero él no se lo iba a permitir. Se marchitaba, y en su marchitarse piafaba, pero rígido, crispado. En el cuarto ángulo, que era el de su Hermano, los juncos se raspaban entre sí como lijas. Había un rumor de barro seco, un murmullo de estandartes, o papeles, muertos. De palabras o ideas ensartadas en el papel. En viejos pinchos de alumínio, doblados y gastados. Así ensartado y perseguido, lo que debió haberse elevado en puro vuelo, se desbarato en un cotorreo seco, un tic convulso. Bailando, no podia extraer de sí a su hermano, no del

Jusqu'à ce qu'il atteignît le paroxysme de la sérénité. Il était l'enfant qu'elle n'avait pas porté dans les ténèbres de son corps, sous le coeur, dont les battements apprenaient déjà à Arthur ce à quois il fallait s'attendre. Les murailles de sa forteresse circulaire en tressaillirent. M<sup>me</sup> Poulter, en cet instant, en fut si visiblement émue qu'elle aurait souhaité rejeter cette vision, ou le prier de s'arrêter complêtement, mais il ne lui permit pas. Il se mit à marteler le sol de ses pieds, gardant une rigidité fragile dans ses contorsions. Dans le quatrième angle, celui de son frère, les flûtes se

der reifenden Birnen und das kleine, im Garten herumschnüffelnde Ferkel. Strähnen von goldenem Honig schwangen glitzernd von seinen trunkenen Lippen. Bis er den Augenblick erreichte, an dem alles zu Stille wurde. Jetzt war er das Kind, das sie niemals im Dunkel ihres Körpers getragen hatte, dicht unter ihrem Herzen, dessen Schlag ihn bereits lehrte, was ihm in Zukunft bestimmt war. Und die Wälle der ihn kreisrund umhegenden Festung erzitterten. Mrs. Poulter war jetzt offensichtlich so bewegt, daß sie am liebsten ihre Faszination einfach abgeschüttelt oder ihn überhaupt zum Aufhören veranlaßt hätte. Aber er ließ das nicht zu. Er hatte begonnen. mit den Füßen zu

stampfen, steif und

immagine, dalla loro figura mai perfettamente unita. In quell'angolo dela danza i suoi piedi angosciati avevano calpestato l'erba fino a portarvi il deserto. Allora la signora Poulter si sporse in avanti. Si teneva i capelli fra le mani, in attesa, come egli comprese. Finché nel centro del loro mandala egli danzò la passione di tutte le loro vite. mentre il sangue gli colava dal dorso delle mani, e l'acqua dai fori nelle sue costole. La sua bocca era un orifizio silenzioso. perché nessun suono era necessario per spiegare (WHITE, 1973c, p. 296-297-298).

Hubo un revuelo de barro seco, un repiqueteo de banderas muertas, o papeles. De palabras e ideas ensartadas en papel. Las viejas brochetas de aluminio, dobladas, gastadas. Así clavado y perseguido, lo que debería haberse alzado en puro vuelo, gotéo en un seco gorjeo, en un atrapado crispamiento. No podía, bailando, extraer de sí a su hermano: no plenamente. Estaban demasiado unidos para que fuera posible, demasiado unidos y demasiado lejanos cuando, con sus dos brazos, los mantuvo unidos, con los dedos resbaladizos de cera. No había podido evitarlo. A lo sumo, de su doble imagen brotaba culpablemente un pequeño alivio, de su figura jamás unida totalmente.

todo. Eran demasiado cercanos para que pudiera hacerlo, demasiado cercano y demasiado lejanos mientras, con los dos brazos, él los mantenía juntos y la cera de las velas le chorreaba por los dedos. Él no podía salvar. A lo sumo, logro que un pequeno consuelo brotara con culpa de su imagen doble, esa figura nunca unida del todo. En esa cuarta esquina, los angustiados pies de Arthur pisotearon la hierba hasta que no quedó más que un espacio baldío. Entretanto, Mrs. Poulter se había inclinado hacia adelante. Se sostenía el cabelo – él podía verla – con los puños apretados como nudos... esperaba. Hasta que en el centro del mandala, él danzó la pasión de todas sus vidas, la sangre que corría por el dorso de sus manos, el agua que manaba del hoyo de

knöchern, und es En aquella esquina sus costillas. Y su répondaient en reprenant sans war, als ob er de la danza, sus boca era un agujero cesse leur scie dahindorre. Im pies angustiados mudo porque para lancinante. On vierten Kreis, und habían pisoteado la explicar no era entendait un das war der seines hierba hasta necessário ningún piétinement de convertirla en un Bruders, sägten sonido (WHITE, boue séchée, un knirschend páramo. 2016, p. 410-413). bruissement Schilfhalme Y Mrs. Poulter se d'étendards flétris aneinander. Da war inclinó hacia ou de papiers das dumpfe Poltern adelante. Pudo ver froissés. Des ausgetrockneten cómo ella sujetaba brochettes de Lehms, das su cabello en Rascheln toter mots et d'idées pequeños moños. rivés sur papier. Fahnen oder Esperando. Les vieilles vergilbter Papiere. Hasta que en el broches Da waren Worte centro del mandala d'aluminium. und Ideen, trocken Arthur bailó la tordues, usées. auf Papier pasión de todas Cloué de la sorte aufgespießt. Mit aquellas vidas, et pérsecuté, alten, verbogenen, dejando que la l'élan qui aurait abgenutzten sangre brotara de dû monter vers le los dorsos de sus Aluminiumspießen. ciel en un envol Und was sich zu manos, y el água extatique se brausendem del orifício de su rompait, devenait Höhenflug hätte pecho. Su boca era balbutiement erheben sollen, un agujero desséché, se erstarb - derart silencioso, porque traînait à ras du durchbohrt und no necesitaba sol. Il ne réussit gefesselt – zu sonidos para pas à se délivrer trockenem Flüstern explicar (WHITE, de son frère par la und zuckender 1973a, p. 308-309danse, pas Hilflosigkeit. Er 310). konnte seinen complètement. Ils Bruder nicht voll étaient trop aus rich proches pour qu'il y réussît, à heraustanzen la fois le plus nicht ganz. Dazu waren sie einander proches et le plus éloignés quand de zu nahe. Waren sich ses deux bras il am nächsten und

| les maintenait             | gleichzeitig am      |  |  |
|----------------------------|----------------------|--|--|
| accolés, les doigts        | weitesten entfernt,  |  |  |
| ruisselant de cire.        | wenn er ihre Leiber  |  |  |
| Il était incapable         | mit beiden Armen     |  |  |
| d'apporter le              | zusammenhielt und    |  |  |
| salut: tout au plus        | seine Finger von     |  |  |
| un peu de                  | flüssigem            |  |  |
| réconfort chargé           | Kerzenwachs          |  |  |
| de culpabilité,            | tropften. Er konnte  |  |  |
| jaillissait-il de          | kein Retter sein. Im |  |  |
| leur image                 | besten Falle war es  |  |  |
| jumeléé, mais qui          | ein bißchen Trost,   |  |  |
| ne se fondit               | der sich             |  |  |
| jamais en une              | schuldbewußt aus     |  |  |
| figure                     | ihrem Doppelbild     |  |  |
| entièrement unie.          | ergoß, aus ihren nie |  |  |
| Dans cet angle de          | ganz vereinten       |  |  |
| la danse, ses              | Gestalten. Und       |  |  |
| pieds angoissés            | Arthur tanzte, und   |  |  |
| piétinèrent                | seine schmerzlich    |  |  |
| l'herbe et firent          | verzweifelten Füße   |  |  |
| de ce coin un              | zertrampelten das    |  |  |
| désert.                    | Gras zur Steppe.     |  |  |
| M <sup>me</sup> Poulter se | Als Mrs. Poulter     |  |  |
| pencha en avant.           | sich plötzlich       |  |  |
| Elle tenait ses            | vorbeugte. Und er    |  |  |
| cheveux par                | sah, daß sie jetzt,  |  |  |
| paquets dans ses           | ganze Handvoll       |  |  |
| poings serrés              | ihres Haares mit     |  |  |
| Elle attendait.            | krampfhaft           |  |  |
| Alors, au centre           | geschlossenen        |  |  |
| du mandala, il             | Fäusten              |  |  |
| dansa la passion           | umklammerte – und    |  |  |
| de toutes les vies.        | sie wartete.         |  |  |
| Le sang lui                | Bis e rim Zentrum    |  |  |
| coulait des mains,         | des Mandala die      |  |  |
| l'eau giclait du           | Passion des Lebens   |  |  |
| trou qu'il avait           | aller Menschen zu    |  |  |
| dans le flanc. Sa          | tanzen begann. Das   |  |  |
| bouche était un            | Blut troff vom       |  |  |
|                            |                      |  |  |

| gouffre béant et                  | Rücken seine                    | r                                    |                                       |  |  |                     |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|--|---------------------|
| silencieux, car                   | Hände, und V                    |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| nul son n'était                   | rann aus dem                    |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| nécessaire en                     | Lanzenstich                     |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   |                                 |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| guise                             | seiner Seite. Sein              |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| d'explication                     | Mund war ei                     | n                                    |                                       |  |  |                     |
| (WHITE, 1973b,                    | stummes,                        |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| p. 301-302-303).                  | schwarzes Loch,                 |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   | denn Worte,                     | Töne                                 |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   | waren zur                       |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   | Erklärung nic                   | cht                                  |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   | mehr nötig                      |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   | (WHITE, 19 <sup>2</sup>         | 78, p.                               |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   | 326-328).                       |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| English                           | h                               |                                      | First Attempt                         |  | Brazilian Po                           | ortuguese - Revised |
| I'm going to dance                | I'm going to dance for you, Mrs |                                      | – Vou dançar para você, Sra.          |  | – Vou dançar para você, Sra. Poulter,  |                     |
| Poulter, he said. I               | I'm going to                    | Poulter, disse ele. Vou dançar uma   |                                       | disse ele. Vou dançar uma mandala.     |  |                     |
| dance a mandala. []               |                                 | mandala. []                          |                                       | []                                     |  |                     |
| The mandala? she                  | said, soberly                   | - A mandala? - disse ela, um tanto   |                                       | – A mandala? – disse ela, um tanto     |  |                     |
| enough. I never                   | enough. I never heard of a      |                                      | seriamente. – Nunca ouvi uma          |  | séria. – Nunca ouvi falar de uma dança |                     |
| dance called that. Not any of the |                                 | dança chamada assim. Não alguma      |                                       | chamada assim. Nenhuma das             |  |                     |
| modern ones.                      |                                 | das modernas.                        |                                       | modernas.                              |  |                     |
| He did not attempt to explain,    |                                 | Ele não tentou explicar, porque      |                                       | Ele não tentou explicar, porque sentiu |  |                     |
| because he felt he would make     |                                 | sentiu que ele ia fazê-la ver.       |                                       | que a faria ver.                       |  |                     |
| her see.                          | her see.                        |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |
| So Arthur Brown danced,           |                                 | Então Arthur Brown dançou,           |                                       | Então Arthur Brown dançou,             |  |                     |
| beginning at the                  | beginning at the first corner,  |                                      | começando no primeiro canto, do       |  | começando no primeiro canto, do qual   |                     |
| from which he would proceed       |                                 | qual ele prosseguiria em estágios    |                                       | prosseguiria em estágios até o quarto, |  |                     |
| by stages to the                  | by stages to the fourth, and    |                                      | até o quarto, e além. Ele que era tão |  | e além. Ele, que era tão grande, tão   |                     |
| beyond. He who v                  | beyond. He who was so large,    |                                      | grande, tão desajeitado, achou o      |  | desajeitado, sentiu o movimento vindo  |                     |
| so shambly, found movement        |                                 | movimento vindo para ele na colina   |                                       | para ele na colina na baía de amoras.  |  |                     |
| coming to him on the hillside in  |                                 | na baía de amoras. As faixas das     |                                       | Os punhos das mangas da camisa         |  |                     |
| the bay of blackberries. The      |                                 | mangas de sua camisa estavam         |                                       | estavam caídos sobre os pulsos. As     |  |                     |
| bands of his shirtsleeves were    |                                 | abertas nos pulsos. As sombras       |                                       | sombras azuladas nas partes menos      |  |                     |
| hanging open at the wrists. The   |                                 | azuladas nas partes menos expostas   |                                       | expostas de sua pele, de seus pulsos e |  |                     |
| bluish shadows in the less        |                                 | de sua pele, de seus pulsos e o vale |                                       | o vale em seu peito, logo ficaram      |  |                     |
| exposed parts of his skin, of his |                                 | em seu peito foram logo lustras de   |                                       | lustros de suor.                       |  |                     |
| wrists, and the valley between    |                                 | suor.                                |                                       |  |  |                     |
|                                   |                                 |                                      |                                       |  |  |                     |

his breasts, were soon pearled

over.

In the first corner, as a prelude to all that he had to reveal, he danced the dance of himself. Half clumsy, half electric. He danced the gods dying on a field of crimson velvet, against the discords of human voices. Even in the absence of gods, his life, or dance, was always prayerful. Even though he hadn't been taught, like the grocer, to go down on his knees and stick his hands together. Instead, offering his prayer to what he knew from light or silences. He danced the sleep of people in a wooden house, groaning under pressure of sleep, their secrets locked prudently up, safe, until their spoken thoughts, or farts, gave them away. He danced the moon, anaesthetized by bottled cestrum. He danced the disc of the orange sun above icebergs, which was in a sense his beginning, and should perhaps be his end.

While Mrs Poulter sat looking, playing with the tips of her dark hair. Sighing sometimes. Then looking down.

In the second corner he declared his love for Dulcie Feinstein, and for the husband, by whom, through their love for Dulcie, he was, equally, possessed, so they were all three united, and their children still to be conceived. Into their corner

primeiro canto, como um prelúdio a tudo o que ele tinha para revelar, ele dançou a dança de si mesmo. Meio desajeitado, meio elétrico. Ele dançou os deuses morrendo em um campo de veludo púrpura, com as discórdias das vozes humanas no fundo. Mesmo na ausência de deuses, sua vida, ou dança, tinha sempre ares de oração. Mesmo que ele não tenha sido ensinado, como o comerciante, a se ajoelhar e a juntar as mãos. Em vez disso, oferecendo sua prece ao que ele sabia da luz ou dos silêncios. Ele dançou o sono das pessoas em uma casa de madeira, roncando sob a pressão do sono, seus segredos prudentemente trancados, seguros, até seus pensamentos falados, ou seus peidos, os liberarem. Ele dançou a lua, anestesiado pela dama-da-noite engarrafada. dançou o disco cor de laranja do sol acima dos icebergs, que era de alguma forma seu início, e talvez devesse ser seu fim.

Enquanto a Sra. Poulter estava sentada, olhando, brincando com as pontas de seu cabelo escuro. Algumas vezes suspirando. Depois olhando para baixo.

No segundo canto, ele declarou seu amor por Dulcie Feinstein, e por seu marido, por quem, através do amor deles por Dulcie, ele era igualmente possuído, sendo então os três unidos, e seus filhos ainda a serem concebidos. No canto de sua mandala ele teceu a Estrela deles,

No primeiro canto, como um prelúdio a tudo o que ele tinha para revelar, dançou a dança de si mesmo. Meio desajeitado, meio elétrico. Dançou os deuses morrendo em um campo de veludo púrpura, com as discórdias das vozes humanas ao fundo. Mesmo na ausência de deuses, sua vida, ou dança, tinha sempre ares de oração. Mesmo que não tenha aprendido, como o comerciante, a se ajoelhar e a juntar as mãos. Em vez disso, oferecendo sua prece ao que ele sabia da luz ou dos silêncios. Dançou o sono das pessoas em uma casa de madeira, gemendo sob a pressão do sono, seus segredos prudentemente trancados, seguros, até seus pensamentos falados, ou seus peidos, os liberarem. Dançou a lua, anestesiado pela dama-da-noite engarrafada. Dançou o disco cor de laranja do sol acima dos icebergs, que era de alguma forma seu início, e talvez devesse ser seu fim.

Enquanto a Sra. Poulter estava sentada, olhando, brincando com as pontas de seu cabelo escuro. Algumas vezes suspirando. Depois olhando para baixo.

No segundo canto, ele declarou seu amor por Dulcie Feinstein, e por seu marido, por quem, através do amor deles por Dulcie, ele era igualmente possuído, sendo então os três unidos, e seus filhos ainda a serem concebidos. No canto de sua mandala ele teceu a Estrela deles, na qual a relação

of his mandala he wove their Star, on which their three-corner relationship was partly based. Flurries of hydrangea-headed music provided a ceremony of white notes falling exactly into place, and not far behind, the twisted ropes of dark music Waldo had forced on Dulcie the afternoon of strangling. There she was, the bones of her, seated on the upright chair, in black. And restored to flesh by lover's flesh. her The inextinguishable, always more revealing eyes.

Dulcie's secrets, he could see. had been laid bare in the face of Mrs Poulter. who might otherwise have become the statue of a woman, under her hair, beside the blackberry bushes. Though she was swaying slightly as he began to weave her figure into appropriate corner. In Mrs Poulter's corner he danced the rite of ripening pears, and little rootling suckling pigs. Skeins of golden honey were swinging and glittering from was the child she had never carried in the dark of her body, under the heart, from the beat of which he was already learning his drunken mouth. Until he reached the stillest moment. He what he could expect. The walls of his circular fortress shuddered.

na qual a relação triangular deles estava em parte baseada. Barulhos de música com cabeça de hortênsia proporcionaram uma cerimônia de notas brancas caindo exatamente no lugar, e não muito atrás, as cordas torcidas de música escura de Waldo tinham se imposto em Dulcie na tarde do sufocamento. Lá estava ela, os ossos dela, sentada na cadeira, de preto. E restituída a carne pela carne de seu amante. Os olhos inextinguíveis, sempre mais reveladores.

Os segredos de Dulcie, ele podia ver, tinham sido desvendados no rosto da Sra. Poulter, que de outra forma poderia ter se tornado a estátua de uma mulher, sob o seu cabelo, ao lado das moitas de amora. Embora ela balançasse um pouco à medida que ele começou a entrelaçar a silhueta dela no canto apropriado. No canto da Sra. Poulter ele dançou o rito das peras amadurecendo e pequenos leitões a focinhar. Madeixas de mel dourado estavam balançando e brilhando, sua boca bêbada. Até que ele chegou ao momento mais calmo. Ele era a criança que ela nunca tinha carregado na sombra de seu corpo, sob seu coração, a partir da batida da qual ele já estava aprendendo o que ele poderia esperar. As paredes de sua fortaleza circular estremeceram.

triangular deles estava em parte baseada. Torvelinhos de música com cabeça de hortênsia proporcionaram uma cerimônia de notas brancas caindo exatamente no lugar, e não muito atrás, as cordas torcidas de música escura que Waldo havia forçado sobrem Dulcie na tarde do sufocamento. Ali estava ela, os ossos dela, sentada na cadeira, de preto. E restituída a carne pela carne de seu amante. Os olhos inextinguíveis, sempre mais reveladores.

Os segredos de Dulcie. conseguia ver. tinham sido desvendados no rosto da Sra. Poulter, que de outra forma poderia ter se tornado a estátua de uma mulher, sob o seu cabelo, ao lado das moitas de amora. Embora balançasse um pouco à medida que ele começou a entrelaçar a silhueta dela no canto apropriado. No canto da Sra. Poulter ele dançou o rito das peras amadurecendo e pequenos leitões a focinhar. Madeixas de mel dourado estavam balançando brilhando da era a criança que ela nunca carregou na sombra de seu corpo, sob seu coração, a partir da batida com a qual ele já estava aprendendo sua boca inebriada. Até que chegou ao momento mais calmo. Ele o que ele poderia esperar. Os muros de sua fortaleza circular estremeceram.

Mrs Poulter was at that point so obviously moved, she would have liked to throw the the vision off, or stop him altogether, but he would not let her.

He had begun to stamp, but brittly rigid, in his withering. In the fourth corner, which was his brother's, the reeds sawed at one another. There was a shuffling of dry mud, a clattering of dead flags, or papers. Of words and ideas skewered to paper. The old, over-used, aluminium Thus pinned skewers. persecuted, what should have risen in pure flight, dropped to a dry twitter, a clipped twitching. He couldn't dance his brother out of him, not fully. They were too close for it to work, closest and farthest when, with both his arms, he held them together, his fingers running with candlewax. He could not save. At most a little comfort gushed out guiltily, from out of their double image, their never quite united figure. In that corner of the dance his anguished feet had trampled the grass into a desert.

When Mrs Poulter leaned forward. She was holding her hair by handfuls in knots of fists, he could see – waiting.

Till in the centre of their

A Sra. Poulter estava naquele momento tão obviamente emocionada, ela teria gostado de jogar a visão fora ou pará-lo completamente, mas ele não ia deixar.

Ele tinha começado a bater o pé, mas fragilmente rígido, em seu embaraço. No quarto canto, que era o de seu irmão, os juncos se serravam. Havia um arrastamento de lama seca, um estardalhaço de bandeiras secas ou papéis. De palavras e ideias espetados no papel. Os espetos de alumínio antigos, tortos, por demais usados. Assim alfinetado e perseguido, aquilo que deveria ter subido em puro voo caiu em um gorjeio seco, um estremecimento cortado. Ele não conseguia externar seu irmão na dança, não completamente. Eles eram muito próximos para que isso funcionasse, o mais próximos e o mais afastados quando, com os dois braços, ele os juntou, seus dedos escorrendo com cera. Ele não conseguia salvar. No máximo um conforto culposamente, da imagem dupla deles, da sua silhueta nunca bem unida. Naquele canto da dança, seus pés angustiados tinham pisoteado a grama até que ficou um deserto.

Quando a Sra. Poulter se inclinou para frente. Ela estava segurando seu cabelo aos punhados em nós de punhos, ele podia ver – esperando.

Até no centro da mandala deles

A Sra. Poulter estava naquele momento tão obviamente emocionada, ela teria gostado de jogar a vista fora ou pará-lo completamente, mas ele não ia deixar.

Ele tinha começado a bater o pé, fragilmente rígido, em seu embaraço. No quarto canto, que era o de seu irmão, os juncos se serravam. Havia um arrastamento de lama seca, um estardalhaço de bandeiras secas ou papéis. De palavras e ideias espetados no papel. Os espetos de alumínio antigos, tortos, por demais usados. Assim alfinetado e perseguido, aquilo que deveria ter subido em puro voo caiu em um gorjeio seco, um estremecimento cortado. Ele não conseguia externar seu irmão na dança, não completamente. Eles eram muito próximos para funcionasse, os mais próximos e os mais afastados quando, com os dois braços, ele os juntou, seus dedos escorrendo não com cera. Ele conseguia salvar. No máximo um pequeno conforto jorrava culposamente, da imagem dupla deles, da sua silhueta nunca bem unida. Naquele canto da dança, seus pés angustiados tinham pisoteado a grama até ficar um deserto.

Quando a Sra. Poulter se inclinou para frente. Ela estava segurando seu cabelo aos punhados em nós de punhos, ele conseguia ver – esperando.

Até que, no centro da mandala, ele

mandala he danced the passion of all their lives, the blood running out of the backs of his hands, water out of the hole in his ribs. His mouth was a silent hole, because no sound was needed to explain (WHITE, 1969, p. 265-266).

ele dançou a paixão de todas as suas vidas, o sangue escorrendo das costas de suas mãos, a água pelo buraco nas suas costelas. Sua boca era um buraco silencioso, porque nenhum som era necessário para explicar.

dançou a paixão de todas as suas vidas, o sangue escorrendo das costas de suas mãos, a água pelo buraco nas suas costelas. Sua boca era um buraco silencioso, porque nenhum som era necessário para explicar.

Again, according to J. M. Coetzee, Arthur aims at identifying the four people (the four avatars of the divine) who are the owners of the mandalas he carries with him (WHITE, 2016, p. 27-28). He is the true spiritual hero of the novel, and this paradoxically shows how hopeless and powerless the art of the writer, i.e., White's own art, is: it will not take him to the heart of the mystery of life. It is not the writer, but the fool and holy dancer, whose totality is found in the concept of the mandala, who will show us the way, without using any words. J. M. Coetzee maintains that, "as hideous as Waldo can be, it is Waldo, and not Arthur who represents the writer, that is, Patrick White" (WHITE, 2016, p. 28, my translation). It is not by chance that White's next novel, *The Vivisector*, features a painter, and not a writer, as the main character, exploring the multitude of "shapes and figures which dive deeply into psyque" (WHITE, 2016, p. 28, my translation).

In the mandala scene, we start describing the first change made, regarding "I never heard of a dance called that", underlining the verb "hear": in our first attempt, we translated it literally as "nunca ouvi uma dança chamada assim". This structure would not be considered wrong, however, when rereading the sentence in Brazilian Portuguese, we detected a possibility of ambiguity: the instance does not refer to the fact that Mrs Poulter actually listened to that rhythm, but that she is not familiar with this kind of dance. In our option "Nunca ouvi falar de uma dança chamada assim", we manage to signal the latter meaning by adding the verb "falar de". In the next line, for "Not any of the modern ones", the change from "Não alguma" to "Nenhuma" adds to the flow of the reading and better characterizes Mrs Poulter's way of speaking.

The classical perception of the verb "taught", as in "even though he hadn't been taught", is interesting in the scene, as the perspective of the character changes (from patient to agent of the action): it sounds quite better (and more natural) in Brazilian Portuguese to use "mesmo que ele não tenha aprendido" (learnt) instead of the literal form "tenha sido ensinado".

Once again, aspect is one of the factors responsible for the good or bad result of a given scene in translation: the use of verbs in the imperfect or perfect past tenses is crucial to change meanings and perspectives. Vocabulary in Brazilian Portuguese in the excerpt is a challenge, because of the many equally acceptable possibilities the text offers. In the original, for instance, we can detect repetitions, as in sleep (translated as "sono"). When translating, we have two options: we can either maintain the repetition or use synonyms, such as "repouso" or "descanso". Another case, involving an adjective, is "drunken", which gives us several options in Portuguese: "embriagada" and "inebriada", both of which collocate well with "boca" (mouth). Admittedly, this wealth of options is quite disturbing, as we will always end up choosing one word, while being aware that other ones, equally possible, had to be left aside, which alludes to the idea of the "work of mourning" (RICOEUR, 2006, p. 3) referred to by the French philosopher Paul Ricoeur: the feeling of failure when we cannot find a satisfactory alternative in the target language, the sort of stiffness when we see that the effort to try to maintain what was detected as different (or creative) in the source text does not work properly in our translated version. The footnotes save the translator, by giving him/her some breath of life, a possibility to defend his/her dignity. Moreover, this "work of mourning" (RICOEUR, 2006, p. 3), albeit bitter, has a compensating nature, which allows the translator to become happy, as s/he is "bringing the reader to the author, bringing the author to the reader" (RICOEUR, 2006, p. 23-24).

In this excerpt, perhaps more than in the previous ones, the deletion of personal pronouns in Brazilian Portuguese is quite determining in conveying the literary strength and intensity of the scene, following the crescendo in Arthur's discovery in the form of a dance. The first instance which deserves to be highlighted is the following: "So Arthur Brown danced, beginning at the first corner, from which he would proceed by stages to the fourth, and beyond", which, in Brazilian Portuguese, became "Então Arthur Brown dançou, começando no primeiro canto, do qual (ele) prosseguiria em estágios até o quarto, e além". The word "canto" for "corners" keeps the reference to other words connected to dance: music (song) and literature (parts of a long poem), thus, in this part we can at least try to play with meanings, which would not be entirely possible if we used "recanto" or even "ângulo" (which do not have the same polysemic possibilities). Another providential modification occurred in "so shambly, found movement coming to him", which was first awkwardly translated as "tão desajeitado, achou o movimento vindo para ele". In our rereading, though, a far better option was recalled, and which conferred fluency to the translation: "tão desajeitado, sentiu o movimento vindo para ele". Another part which gained in fluency was "the bands of his

shirtsleeves were hanging open at the wrists". Apparently, this sentence is not so problematic to translate, however, we must admit that the words we were looking for in Brazilian Portuguese were only recalled while revising: instead of "as faixas das mangas de sua camisa estavam abertas nos pulsos", which would not really give the same idea of the original, a few changes generated a more natural and efficient outcome: "Os punhos das mangas da camisa estavam caídos sobre os pulsos". Once again, we accentuate the deletion of the possessive pronoun ("sua") and the use of the definite article + preposition "de" ("da") for emphasis. And, a question of accuracy in interpretation: the original gives us the idea of "hanging open" which, in Brazilian Portuguese, becomes more evident with "caídos" ("fallen on") rather than "abertos" ("opened"). Another change which added to accuracy refers to "groaning under the pressure of sleep", which was first translated as "roncando sob a pressão do sono". Indeed, we were led to think that "roncar" ("snore") might work in this context, since it would keep the idea of sounds being made while sleeping. However, in our revision, we thought that "gemendo" would be a more suitable choice for "groaning", because it would be closer in meaning to the level of noise being made while sleeping (moving from disturbing to something more natural in a semantic scale).

In "flurries of hydrangea-headed music", we had to think of a literary alternative which would render a more elaborate translation than the first option "barulhos de música com cabeça de hortênsia" (which was rather too simple, without really evincing a deep work with the language, which is demanded in this part, due to its poeticity). After the revision process, we opted for "torvelinhos" to translate "barulhos", which greatly improved the translated passage.

The last relevant modification in this scene concerns punctuation. In "till in the centre of their mandala he danced the passion of all their lives", our first attempt was: "Até no centro da mandala deles ele dançou a paixão de todas as suas vidas". We must admit that this option, in addition to being quite literal, lacks some sense. Hence, major modifications were required, such as the addition of the pronoun "que" and the commas, which then clarified the content in Brazilian Portuguese. One thing which might be discussed in this correction is that the possessive pronoun "their" accompanying "mandala" is deleted, therefore, possibly undetermining the mandala, i.e., this would no longer be Arthur's (and the chosen ones's) mandala. As exemplified earlier, the definite article "a" + the preposition "de" results in "da", which was used to determine Arthur's shirt, and is employed again here to signal Arthur and his friends's mandala. Given that the chapter is already named after Arthur, we might presume that the emphasis is clearly on his position in the scene. Were the pronoun to be kept

in the translation, we would have to delete the pronoun "ele" before "dançou", to avoid the repetition of the sounds "ele" (deles, ele), resulting in: "até que, no centro da mandala deles, dançou a paixão de todas as suas vidas".

There is a flow of consciousness in the scene, which was erroneously transformed in the first translation into Portuguese, i.e., we changed and corrected the structure of the sentences, making some work for the reader. In fact, this is not the ideal procedure, therefore, in our revised version, the flow of consciousness is preserved, conveying this creative aspect of the original in the translation, and leaving the way open to the reader. Furthermore, this increases the realism of the scene in which Arthur exudes his trance, finally managing to combine the four elements of his life.

After commenting on the translation of this final scene of *The Solid Mandala*, Marcelo Cohen's words come to mind, as we can compare the writer to a performer, because, in the end, "the reader has to reach the end of the story. Not exactly the performer, but the artist of the show<sup>194</sup>" (COHEN, 2014, p. 21, my translation).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> In the original: "El lector tiene que llegar al final de la historia. No exactamente intérprete, sino artista del espectáculo" (COHEN, 2014, p. 21).

## **5 CONCLUSION**

We started this work introducing some topics in Translation Studies and stating our objectives with this dissertation, which presents the unpublished translation (and analysis) of selected excerpts from *The Solid Mandala* into Brazilian Portuguese, with the Polysystems Theory as a background. In that chapter, we performed a brief paratextual analysis of the French, German, Italian and Spanish translations cited in this dissertation. This is proof that a multiple corpus of translations legitimates the original in its own literary system, since a text which gains translations in several different languages might be considered one of good quality and reputation.

In Chapter 2, we outlined Patrick White's situation (reception and introduction in other systems via translation) all over the world. "Cast as an act of love, and as an act of disruption, translation becomes a means of repositioning the subject in the world and in history" (APTER, 2006, p. 6): we have seen this, for example, with the Chinese translator, who defied dictatorship and censorship to translate Patrick White's novels. J. M. Coetzee claims in the introductory note to the new Spanish translation of Las Esferas del Mandala that Patrick White was so miserable because of the bad reception of *The Aunt's Story* that he simply decided to stop writing and that his resurgence like a Phoenix was due to "what it seems to have been a mystical illumination (WHITE, 2016, p. 18, my translation)<sup>195</sup>". In our research, it becomes transparent that there is more into that than simply such magical force: the French translator Marie Viton is a pivotal name, which is certainly unknown or simply relegated in many biographical and literary works on Patrick White. She was the one who pestered White with letters, asking him questions about his writing (in this case, Happy Valley), and showing, through her passion and conviction, that the book was worth being translated into French (one of the languages White studied). According to Harold Bloom, "reading returns you to otherness, whether in yourself or in friends, or in those who may become friends. [...] Literary criticism [...] ought to be experimental and pragmatic, rather than theoretical" (BLOOM, 2001, p. 19). It was through reading and this exercise of literary criticism that Marie Viton probably started inducing White to see his own work with the eyes of the other, to notice that readings outside the English-language sphere offered a different perspective on his literary art. Translation may not always be the only means to revive an author's oeuvre, however, when we refer to Patrick White, translation (or the passion of a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> In the original in Spanish: "lo que parece haber sido una iluminación mística, empezó a trabajar en *El árbol del hombre* (1955)" (WHITE, 2016, p.18).

translator) was responsible for changing his appreciation (reception) of his own texts. When we stop to translate his writings, we perceive that his genius stands out, and is perpetuated: 50 years ago, *The Solid Mandala* was being launched. Now, 50 years later, it has a new translation into Spanish – and the project "Literaturas del Sur" in action at Universidad San Martín, in Buenos Aires –, and hopefully it will have a published one into Brazilian Portuguese. For the time being, it has this dissertation, which is our devoted contribution to White studies in Brazil and around the world.

In Chapter 3 we focussed on reading and its implications for our activity. Surely, the parallel between reading and translation, verified in this dissertation, is that "appropriations, transpositions, deformations are common to both activities, and the act of reading, in a broader sense, will also be a translation, as to read is to transfer, recognizing an alterity<sup>196</sup>" (CARVALHAL, 1993, p. 47, my translation). As for the translator's task as a reader, Paulo Rónai's words make sense:

[...] the ideal way to read and absorb integrally a masterpiece was to translate it. And then, no dynamic reading, in diagonal, to grasp only at random the meaning and run directly to the end: we savour each word, we read in between the lines, we penetrate the writer's style, we learn how to know him closely and to love him <sup>197</sup> (RÓNAI, 1976, p. 125, my translation).

That was the kind of reading we have performed in our first attempts and later in revision. After analyzing White's presence in the academy in Brazil, we moved on to observe how Australian Literature is positioned in Itamar Even-Zohar's Polysystem's Theory, trying to describe its situation and possible reception when entering different systems (as evinced in Chapter 2), more recently in Argentina (and in other Spanish-speaking countries) and in Brazilian Literature via translations. Our hyperconnected times might pose changes to the Polysystem's Theory assumptions of "peripheral" and "central" authors/works, therefore, we hope that new translations, movie adaptations, plays and academic works help in the promotion of Australian literature worldwide.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> In the original: "apropriações, transposições, deformações são comuns a ambas as práticas como também, num sentido lato, o ato da leitura será ainda uma tradução, pois que ler é transferir, reconhecendo uma alteridade" (CARVALHAL, 1993, p. 47).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> In the original: "[...] a maneira ideal de ler e absorver integralmente uma obra-prima era traduzi-la. Aí, nada de leitura dinâmica, em diagonal, para colher apenas por alto o sentido e correr direto ao desfecho: saboreia-se cada palavra, lê-se nas entrelinhas, penetra-se o estilo do escritor, aprende-se a conhecê-lo de perto e a amá-lo" (RÓNAI, 1976, p. 125).

Translation is the world's second oldest profession<sup>198</sup>. Indeed, the (conscious or unconscious) practice of Translation Studies dates back to antiquity, however, its enriching and captivating results continue to amaze scholars and practitioners all over the world. The profession has dramatically helped shape this world as it is today, full of technologies and providing access to information and diverse ways of entertainment. Literature perhaps has been the great beneficiary of such breakthroughs, since the publication of translations in digital media has been a significant means to divulge the work of many literary artists, from many places in the world, in recent years. *The Solid Mandala* is an alluring and refreshing option to a reader who wants to get in contact with White's oeuvre for the first time, after all, we should recall that the aim of J. M. Coetzee's personal library collection organized by the Argentinian publisher El Hilo de Ariadna has been to provide the reader with an attractive edition, without many footnotes<sup>199</sup>.

In Chapter 4, we lay out the selected excerpts, choosing them according to their historical, social and cultural aspects and challenges. We "aimed at the best possible translation, rather than a hypothetical perfect one" (COETZEE, 2005, p. 145), seeking to develop and put into practice the historical awareness (which is part of the extralinguistic competence proposed in Hurtado Albir's model of competences), as a complement to the aesthetical and cultural competences, being aware that if we did not respect that, we would run the risk of compromising the whole set of ideas and discussions unveiled in the novel.

We identified how these key historical issues were presented in the original – quite often in a subtle manner – and need to be rendered in the translation. To illustrate the importance of such competence, in Chapter 3 we mentioned the case of "country" being translated as "país" in *Voss*, a novel whose main setting was the colony of New South Wales during the 19<sup>th</sup> century, when the whole idea of an independent political unit named as Australia had yet to be conceived. In *The Solid Mandala*, the characters and expressions coined in the Second World War need to be carefully addressed, since the participation of Australia and Brazil in the conflict provoked quite different sensations in the general population, as well as results (as seen with the translation of "The Boys"). In this respect, reading plays a key role, since this culture-specific item (which is actually a "history-specific

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> In the original, in Spanish: "[...] podríamos incluso decir con una sonrisa y sin exagerar demasiado que la traducción constituye la segunda profesión más antigua del mundo (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 10)".

<sup>199</sup> Mónica Herrero: "La colección se viene publicando desde 2013 a razón de cuatro títulos por año. La idea ha

sido ofrecer al lector estas obras de una forma atractiva, con pocas notas, no se trata de ediciones académicas anotadas sino de ediciones para el pleno disfrute de la lectura y destinadas a cualquier lector interesado en ampliar su universo de lecturas o tratar de ver por qué a un Premio Nobel estas obras le gustaron o las eligió". HERRERO, Mónica. *El Hilo de Ariadna*. Personal message. Message received by: *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 4 Sept. 2014.

item") might not be detected by the translator, who might choose to translate it literally, without giving much thought to the cultural and historical aspects of the phrase (since it is not really a difficult one in linguistic terms) or its potential semantic implications. In the selection of the excerpts to be presented, we had in mind the difficulty admitted by Javier Franco Aixelá in determining culture-specific items: "in a language *everything* is culturally produced" (AIXELÁ, 1996b, p. 57). Furthermore, we hoped to have shown that, unlike the perspective provided by Silvia Pupato, who first translated *Las Esferas del Mandala* into Spanish, the characters presented in the novel are local, vocabulary is local, grammar is local, although the theme of the novel might be seen as universal. It is precisely this "local" aspect of the novel, evinced here through the discussion of some examples, which imposes challenges in translation. Déborah Scheidt is cited again, and we agree with her comment:

All the elements that have appeared as constituting White's personal experiences – mirror images, flaw-magnification, theatrical metaphors, fluidity, social preoccupation, exile, the interplay truth-fiction and rebellious attitude – appear somehow in his work embedded in his protagonists or in his dealings with the literary text itself' (SCHEIDT, 1997, p. 48).

Indeed, this is present, for example, in the scene at the Mitchell Library, and the translator's mission is quite daunting: to detect that "rebellious attitude" and convey it to the reader (through word choice), while aiming at instilling the same reactions provoked by the original. It was possible to perceive that the different semantic loads vary according to the chapters of each character, thus signaling their outlook on life: the occurrences of words such as "Pom" and "Dago", with their negative connotations, are found in Waldo's chapter of the novel. The excerpts from Arthur's chapter pose more creative decisions, attesting its increased poeticity in comparison to Waldo's.

Through the different readings of *The Solid Mandala* (including two in Brazilian Portuguese – the first attempt and the revised/guided version), our work sought to take into account meanings in their cultural context in the original. We were worried about how to make such options available in our language, preserving, whenever possible, close semantic and linguistic alternatives, and having as a guide the function of our text, the kind of reader we wanted to target and our mental construction of the characters. Moreover, about the characters, it is our depiction of their speeches, hence reflecting our interpretation from our place in the world (Porto Alegre, South of Brazil) and, surely, being subject to future changes. Far from prescribing the "right" or the "wrong" translations, we arrive at the conclusion, after this exercise, that variety is truly an omnipresent aspect when we are working with any

literary piece: what we do have is a closer or farther reading to the one devised by the author (who, in her/his turn, loses control of her/his text once it is published) by means of her/his virtual reader. Furthermore, translations have their target audiences quite often determined by publishers, taking into account their marketability and purposes. As a result, all their editorial policies might affect our choices. Given that this is an academic work, the immediate audience comprises the members of the panel, who will certainly make their suggestions to polish and perfect the final version. Jiří Levý's comment has been always in mind, since we have never been tempted to leave things out because they were too difficult or apparently impossible to translate: they were translated, even though, of course, using some unpalatable alternatives in the lack of better ones at the moment. However, therein lies the richness and dynamism of Translation Studies: readers and texts are always changing, and human creativity makes wonders in proposing brand new translations of English-language classics, such as William Shakespeare and James Joyce, who have recent translations in Brazilian Portuguese, therefore reshaping and renewing their presence in our literary system. Following what is written in the preface to the collection of short stories of Australian authors Lá da Austrália, organized by Stella Tagnin and her students in Sao Paulo, we do hope that more initiatives come up at universities (and why not in schools and English courses) to encourage Brazilian readers to start reading and discovering Australian Literature.

Patrick White does not have a significant tradition in translation in Portuguese, as depicted in this dissertation through the experience in Portugal and Brazil. His novels, in both countries, did not have an appropriate introduction (not really because of the missing introductory note, since it would be quite simplistic to say that). In Brazil, at least, we might say that the lack of care was a fundamental factor: it is quite disconcerting to hear that the translation of a masterpiece like Voss was commissioned to someone (who was quite young at the time and looking for a job in literary translation) who had never heard about the author, and worse still, had never translated a literary piece before, that is, Patrick White's oeuvre being used as a test to hire a translator (who ended up becoming a renowned one, so the exercise was definitely worthwhile). Lack of research, scarcity of resources, or whatever, should not be an explanation to such careless and perfunctory treatment towards a Nobel Prize winner. Voss, albeit translated in the 1970s (coinciding with White's nomination) in other countries, only appeared on the Brazilian bookshelves in 1985, which brings up the question: what was done during this almost 15-year span? We might expect that the publisher would have had time to devise a thorough introductory note to provide the Brazilian reader with something duly contextualized. However, that did not happen. Would things have been

different in Brazil if the translation had been published soon after the Nobel Prize award? Could a new translation of a novel by Patrick White, featuring an introductory note and counting on a meticulous editorial preparation, be helpful to promote Australian Literature in Brazil? We can only hypothesize about that. Actually, there is a future possibility that the translation of *A sólida mandala* proposed in this dissertation might get published through a grant from the Australia Council for the Arts, as part of the program which promotes Australian Literature overseas. For the time being, however, by presenting this dissertation, we hope, at least at the academic level (as a starting point) to shed light not only on the outdated translation of *Voss*, but also on this translation of *The Solid Mandala*, making White's name one more representative of the literature connected to Australia in many literary systems.

Javier Franco Aixelá maintains that the study of translation requires "[...] an empirical (descriptive) basis which allows to draw conclusions from reality and not any aesthetic ideas, although reasonable or informed they are" (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 37, my translation<sup>200</sup>). Actually, this work used real translations into French, German, Italian and Spanish (two versions) to observe how the whole process takes place in reality, instead of an idealized universe, thus becoming what the Spanish scholar claims to be the "only legitimate object of study" (AIXELÁ, 1996a, p. 38, my translation<sup>201</sup>), and our guide in our translation procedures in Brazilian Portuguese. Therefore, this dissertation became a "laboratory situation to study cultural interaction" (BASSNETT, 2007, p. 19) between Australia, Britain, Brazil and the other countries mentioned, being a tool for other translators to have a look at what has been produced over the years.

Alan Lawson asserts that White's effect to Australian writers, "as a writer and a person, was that he represented the Other, the unexpected thing, the dissonant voice, the dissident person, and because of that, he was very good for us all" (LAWSON, 1994, p. xv). Translation is not only about losses, but also (and mainly) about gains: in terms of a historical, social and cultural discussion in translation, which enriches our view of the Brazilian world in opposition to the Australian (and its relation to the British Empire). With Lawson's words in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> AIXELÁ, Javier Franco. **Condicionantes de traducción y su aplicación a los nombres propios (inglés – español)**. Alicante: Universidade de Alicante, 1996. 779 f. Tese (Doutorado em Letras). Departamento de Filologia Inglesa, Universidade de Alicante, Alicante, 1996a. In the original: "[...] obligación por la ventaja que eso supone para el lector". In the original: "[...] el estudio de la traducción precise urgente e inevitablemente de una base empírica (descriptiva) que permita extraer conclusiones a partir de la realidad y no de las ideas estéticas de cualquiera, por muy razonables o informadas que éstas sean" (p. 37).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> Ibidem. In the original: [...] las traducciones reales son el único objeto de estudio legítimo para unos investigadores que pretendam describir y explicar la naturaleza de un fenómeno que difícilmente se podrá comprender sin saber como se desarolla realmente" (p. 37-38).

mind, we look forward to seeing Patrick White being an inspiration to translators, as well as readers and writers, in Brazil.

## **6 REFERENCES**

AIXELÁ, Javier Franco. Condicionantes de traducción y su aplicación a los nombres propios (inglés – español). Alicante: Universidade de Alicante, 1996. 779 f. Tese (Doutorado em Letras). Departamento de Filologia Inglesa, Universidade de Alicante, Alicante, 1996a. . Culture-specific items in translation. In: ALVAREZ, Roman; VIDAL, M. Carmen-África (Eds.) **Translation, Power, Subversion**. Clevendon: Multilingual Matters, 1996b. ALEXANDER, Ian. Formação Nacional e Cânone Ocidental: Literatura e Tradição no Novo Mundo. Porto Alegre: UFRGS, 2010. 294 f. Tese (Doutorado em Letras). Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras, Instituto de Letras, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, 2010. \_. **Novos continentes**: relações coloniais em *O Continente* e *Voss*. Porto Alegre: PUCRS, 2006, 147 f. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras). Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras, Faculdade de Letras, Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, 2006. \_. Patrick White and his Brazilian contemporaries. Cercles, Rouen, v. 26, p. 39-56, 2012. Available at: http://www.cercles.com/n26/alexander.pdf. \_; STEFANI, Monica. Your Country is of Great Subtlety: Aspects of the Brazilian Translation of Patrick White's Voss. Ilha do Desterro A Journal of English Language, Literatures in English and Cultural Studies, Florianópolis, v. 69, n. 2, p. 107-116, Jun. 2016. Available at: https://periodicos.ufsc.br/index.php/desterro/article/view/2175-

ALLEN, Esther; BERNOFSKY, Susan. In Translation: Translators on Their Work and What It Means. New York: Columbia University Press, 2013.

ALLEN, Graham. Intertextuality: the New Critical Idiom. New York: Routledge, 2000.

AMAZON.FR. Patrick White novels translated into French. Available at: https://www.amazon.fr. Accessed on: 12 Feb. 2014.

ANDREWS, Chris. Translation, Misunderstanding and Nonsense. In: **Literature as Translation/Translation as Literature**. CONTI, Christopher; GOURLEY, James (Eds.). Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014.

AUSTRALIANA. The Australiana Society. Available at: http://www.australiana.org.au/page-516363. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

AZEVEDO, Aluísio. O Cortiço. Available at:

8026.2016v69n2p107. Accessed on: 02 Sept. 2016.

http://www.dominiopublico.gov.br/download/texto/bn000003.pdf. Accessed on: 27 Dec. 2015.

BAKER, Mona. In Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation. London: Routledge, 2001.

BALLYN, Susan. **Patrick White in Spain** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 15 Jul. 2014.

BARNES, Julian. Writer's Writer and Writer's Writer. London Review of Books, London, v. 32, n. 22, p. 7-11, Nov. 2010. Available at http://www.lrb.co.uk/v32/n22/julian-barnes/writers-writer-and-writers-writers-writer. Accessed on: 25 May 2016.

BASSNETT, Susan. **Translation Studies**. 3.ed. London: Routledge, 2005.

BBC Magazine. The Oxford English Dictionary and its chief word detective. Available at: http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-22378819. Accessed on: 5 May 2016.

BELLOS, David. **Is that a fish in your ear**?: translation and the meaning of everything. New York: Faber and Faber, 2011.

BENJAMIN, Walter. The task of the translator. Translated by: Harry Zohn. In: VENUTI, Lawrence (ed.). **The Translation Studies Reader**. 2.ed. New York: Routledge, 2004. p. 75-82.

BENNETT, James. Cyclax in a Patrick White novel [personal message]. Message received by *ianalex63@gmail.com*, on 22 Nov. 2015.

BESTON, John. **Patrick White within the Western Literary Tradition**. Sydney: Sydney University Press, 2010.

BERMAN, Antoine. Translations and the Trials of the Foreign. In: VENUTI, Lawrence (ed.). **The Translation Studies Reader**. New York: Routledge, 2000. p. 284-297.

BIBLIOTECA NACIONAL DE ESPAÑA. BUSQUEDA POR PATRICK WHITE. Available at: http://catalogo.bne.es/uhtbin/cgisirsi/5Sz34hdp8m/BNMADRID/40700093/123. Accessed on: 16 Apr. 2015.

BJÖRKSTÉN, Ingmar. **Patrick White: A general introduction**. Translated by Stanley Gerson. St Lucia: University of Queensland Press, 1976.

BLOOM, Harold. **How to read and why**. New York: Simon and Schuster, 2001.

BOILER. Definition in English. Available at:

http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/boiler. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

BORGES, Jorge Luís. Las versiones homéricas. In: **Discusión. Obras Completas I: 1923-1949**. Buenos Aires: Emecé Editores, 1985.

BOTELHO, José Francisco. O 'Hamlet' de Lawrence Pereira. **Correio do Povo**, Porto Alegre, 28 nov. 2015. Caderno de Sábado.

BOTTOM, Alain de. Can Tolstoi save your marriage? Available at:

http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052748704828104576021713651690094. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2015.

BRITTO, Paulo Henriques. **Perguntas (tradução de Patrick White)** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@msn.com*, on 28 Feb. 2014.

CAIN, Lara. **Translating Australian Culture**: Literary Representations on the World Stage. London: Menzies Centre for Australian Studies, King's College London, 2001.

CANDIDO, Antonio. **Formação da Literatura Brasileira**: momentos decisivos 1750-1880. Rio de Janeiro: Ouro sobre Azul, 2008.

CALLAHAN, David. Patrick White (Brazilian PhD student) [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 27 May 2015.

\_\_\_\_\_. Patrick White translation in Brazil [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 3 Apr. 2003.

\_\_\_\_\_. The Image of Australia in Portugal since the Revolution: From Timor to Television. **Australian Studies**, London, n. 5. p. 8-18, Apr. 1991.

CARVALHAL, Tânia. Tradução e recepção na prática comparatista. In: CARVALHAL, Tânia. **O próprio e o alheio**. São Leopoldo: Editora Unisinos, 2003. p. 217-259.

CECbase - Bibliografia Comparatista em Portugal. Página Inicial. Available at: http://cecbase.comparatistas.edu.pt/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=1&Itemi d=2. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

CECbase – Pesquisa por "Considerações a propósito de THE AUNT'S STORY de Patrick White." Available at:

http://cecbase.comparatistas.edu.pt/index.php?option=com\_cecbase&task=lista&id=1856. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

CECbase – Pesquisa por "Patrick White e a tradição australiana", *O REGRESSO À ABISSÍNIA OU UMA INTERPRETAÇÃO DO ROMANCE DE PATRICK WHITE*. Available at: http://cecbase.comparatistas.edu.pt/index.php?option=com\_cecbase&task=lista&id=2581. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

CEIA. Defintion in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/ceia. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

CHAKHACHIRO, Raymond. Revision for Quality. **Perspectives: Studies in Translatology**, London, No. 3, V. 3, p.225-238, 2005.

CHESTERMAN, Andrew; WAGNER, Emma. Can Theory Help Translators?: A Dialogue Between the Ivory Tower and the Wordface. Manchester: St. Jerome Pub., 2002.

CICERO, Karina R. **Time and Language in Patrick White's "A fringe of leaves"**. Tesis de Licenciatura. Universidad Católica Argentina. Facultad de Filosofia y Letras. Departamento de Lenguas, 2010. Available at: http://bibliotecadigital.uca.edu.ar/repositorio/tesis/time-and-language-patrick-white.pdf. Accessed on: 10 Jan. 2016.

| COETZEE, J. M. Patrick White: <i>Las esferas del mandala</i> . Un ensayo inédito del premio Nobel J. M. Coetzee. <b>La Diaria</b> , Montevideo, 30 Apr. 2014. Available at: http://ladiaria.com.uy/articulo/2014/4/patrick-white-las-esferas-del-mandala/?m=opinion. Accessed on: 10 Aug. 2015.   |
|---|
| Roads to Translation. <b>Meanjin</b> , Melbourne, n. 4, v. 64, p. 141-151, 2005.  |
| COHEN, Marcelo. <b>Musica Prosaica</b> (cuatro piezas sobre traducción). Buenos Aires: Editoria Entropía, 2014.   |
| CORREIA, Maria Helena Paiva. <b>Patrick White in Portugal</b> [personal message]. Message received by <i>jean.page@mac.com</i> , on 24 May 2015.  |
| COSTA, Maurício Alves da. <b>Teoria do polissistema</b> : do folhetim ao blog, o polissistema literário brasileiro sob a interferência da internet. Porto Alegre: UFRGS, 2007, 168 f. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras) – Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras. Instituto de Letras, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, 2007. |
| DAGO. Oxford definition. Available at: http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/dago. Accessed on: 1 Aug. 2015.   |
| The Free Dictionary definition. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/dago. Accessed on: 1 Aug. 2015.  |
| DICTIONNAIRE DE FRANÇAIS LARROUSE. Se mésallier. Available at: http://www.larousse.fr/dictionnaires/francais/se_m%C3%A9sallier/50683?q=m%C3%A9sallier#50574. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.   |
| Mètèque. Available at: http://www.larousse.fr/dictionnaires/francais/se_m%C3%A9sallier/50683?q=m%C3%A9sallier#50574. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.   |
| DIXON, Robert. Australian Fiction and the World Republic of Letters, 1890-1950. In: PIERCE, Peter (ed.). <b>The Cambridge History of Australian Literature</b> . Port Melbourne: Cambridge University Press, 2009.  |
| Australian Literature – International Contexts. In: <b>Southerly</b> . Sydney, v. 67, n. 1-2, p. 15-27, 2007.   |
| National Literatures, Scale and the Problem of the World. <b>JASAL</b> , Sydney, v. 15, n.3, p. 1-10, 2015.   |
| DUTTON, Geoffrey. The Literature of Australia. Ringwood, Vic: Penguin, 1964.  |
| ECO, Umberto. <b>Experiences in Translation</b> . Translated by Alastair McEwen. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001.  |
| <b>Interpretation and Overinterpretation</b> . Translated by Stefan Collini. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.   |

El ESCRITOR australiano Patrick White, premio Nobel de Literatura en 1973, muere a los 78 años. **El País.** Available at:

http://elpais.com/diario/1990/10/01/cultura/654735606\_850215.html. Acessed on: 12 May 2015.

EVEN-ZOAR, Itamar. Polysystem studies. Durham: Duke University Press, 1990.

FORMICA, Denise. Nation, Narration and Translation: the Construction of an Australian Literary Archive in Italian. In: **JASAL Special Issue: Archive Madness**. Vol. 11, No. 1, 2011. Available at:

http://openjournals.library.usyd.edu.au/index.php/JASAL/article/view/9800.

FRENCH TRANSLATIONS OF PATRICK WHITE. Wikipédia. Available at: http://fr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White. Accessed on: 12 Feb. 2014.

GENETTE, Gérard. **Paratexts: Thresholds of interpretation**. Translated by Jane E. Lewin. Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1997.

GIFFIN, Michael. Arthur's dream: the religious imagination in the fiction of Patrick White. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1996.

GOLDSWORTHY, Kerryn. Shock: Australian publishers reject Patrick White novel. **Crikey**, Melbourne, 17 Jul. 2006. Available at: http://www.crikey.com.au/2006/07/17/shock-australian-publishers-reject-patrick-white-novel/?wpmp\_switcher=mobile#2006/07/17-1138-9739. Accessed on: 18 Jun. 2015.

GONÇALVES, Fabiano Bruno. **Tradução, interpretação e recepção literária:** manifestações de Edgar Allan Poe no Brasil. Porto Alegre: UFRGS, 2006. 141 f. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras) - Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras, Instituto de Letras, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, 2006.

| HERMANS, Theo (ed.) <b>The manipulation of literature</b> : studies in literary translation. London/Sydney: Croom Helm, 1985.   |  |
|---|--|
| The translator's voice in translated narrative. In: BAKER, Mona. (Ed.) <b>Critical readings in translation studies</b> . London; New York: Routledge, 2010. p. 193-212. |  |
| Translation in System: Descriptive and Systemic Approach Explained. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing, 1999.  |  |
| HERRERO, Mónica. <b>Contacto El Hilo de Ariadna</b> [personal message]. Message received be <i>mokistefani@yahoo.com.br</i> , on 4 Sept. 2014.                          |  |
| Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires [personal message]. Message received by <i>mokistefani@yahoo.com.br</i> , on 4 Mar. 2015                                  |  |
| Lanzamiento [personal message]. Message received by   |  |

mokistefani@yahoo.com.br, on 3 Nov. 2014.

HOEY, Michael. Patterns of Lexis in Text. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991.

HOLMES, James. **Translated!**: Papers on Literary Translation and Translation Studies. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1988.

HOPE, Deborah. The Face: Vrasidas Karalis. The Australian, Sydney, 10 May 2008.

HORNBY, Albert Sydney. **Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary**. 6.ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

HURLEY, Andrew. What I lost when I translated Jorge Luis Borges. In: **Cadernos de Tradução** (UFSC), No. 4 (1999), p. 289-303.

HURTADO ALBIR, Amparo. **Traducción y traductología**: introducción a la traductología. 3. ed. Madrid: Ediciones Cátedra, 2007.

ITALIAN TRANSLATIONS OF PATRICK WHITE. Wikipédia. Available at: https://it.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White. Accessed on: 10 Jan. 2014.

'IT'S POMICIDE': Aussie papers punish cricket team for humiliating Ashes collapse (+ highlights). TVNZ website. Available at: https://www.tvnz.co.nz/one-news/sport/cricket/-it-s-pomicide-aussie-papers-punish-cricket-team-for-humiliating-ashes-collapse-highlights-q04517. Accessed on: 15 Aug. 2015.

JAUß, Hans Robert. Literary History as a Challenge to Literary Theory. **New Literary History**, v. 2, n. 1, p. 7-37, Autumn, 1970.

JOHNSON, Samuel. Life of Pope. London: Macmillan, 1899.

JOYCE, James. **Ulysses**. Translated by: Caetano W. Galindo. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2012.

JUN, Liu. How Li was found in translation. China Daily, Beijing, 18 Nov. 2008.

JUNQUEIRA, Eduardo. Farra com sotaque. Veja, São Paulo, n. 48, 27 Nov. 1996. p. 98.

KAMPMARK, Nataša. A Clockwise Smile of the First Australian Nobel Prize Winner: Translating Patrick White. **Antipodes - A Global Journal of Australian/New Zealand Literature**, Detroit. v. 27, n. 2, p. 161-165, Dec. 2013.

| Questions on translation! [personal message]. Message received by | y |
|---|---|
| mokistefani@yahoo.com.br, on 28 Feb. 2014.                        |   |

KATAN, David. Translating Cultures, An Introduction for Translators, Interpreters and Mediators. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing, 1999.

KERMODE, Frank. **The Genesis of Secrecy**: On the Interpretation of Narrative. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1979.

KOSHIYAMA, Alice Mitika. **Monteiro Lobato**: Intelectual, Empresário, Editor. São Paulo: Queiroz, 1982.

LAFUENTE, María. Patrick White in Spain (Australian literary studies in translation) [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 19 Jul. 2014.

LAWSON, Alan (ed.). **Patrick White**: Selected Writings. St. Lucia, Qld.: University of Queensland Press, 1994.

LEFEVERE, André. Mother Courage's Cucumbers: Text, System and Refraction in a Theory of Literature. In: VENUTI, Lawrence (ed.). **The Translation Studies Reader**. 2. ed. New York: Routledge, 2004.

\_\_\_\_\_. **Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Fame**. London and New York: Routledge, 1992.

LEVÝ, Jiří. **The art of translation**. Translated by Patrick Corness. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing, 2011.

LOVERIDGE, Georgina. Review: Remembering Patrick White: Contemporary Critical Essays. Eds. Elizabeth McMahon and Brigitta Olubas. In: **JASAL**, n. 10. Available online at: http://www.nla.gov.au/openpublish/index.php/jasal/article/view/1781/2226. Accessed on: 21 Jun. 2015.

MALMKJAER, Kirsten. Translation and linguistics: What does the future hold? In: **Textus**. Genova: Tilgher, v. 12, n. 2, p. 263-273, 1999.

MANGUEL, Alberto. Elogio de la lectura. **El País**, Madrid, 22 Apr. 2006. Available at: http://elpais.com/diario/2006/04/22/babelia/1145662750\_850215.html. Accessed on: 10 Mar. 2015.

\_\_\_\_\_. Quién controla el mundo. **El País**, Montevideo, 27 Jul. 2012. Cultural. Available at: http://historico.elpais.com.uy/suplemento/cultural/quien-controla-el-mundo/cultural\_653517\_120727.html. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2014.

MARR, David. Patrick White: a Life. Sydney: Vintage, 1995.

MATAMBRE. Definition. Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Matambre. Accessed on: 17 Dec. 2016.

METECO. Definition in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/meteco. Accessed on: 1 Aug. 2015.

METIC. The Free Dictionary definition. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/metic. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

MILTON, John. The political adaptations of Monteiro Lobato. **Cadernos de Tradução**, Florianópolis. v. 1, n. 11, p. 211-227, Jan. 2003.

MINOTAUR. Definition. The Free Dictionary Online. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/minotaur. Accessed on: 3 May 2015.

MITTMANN, Solange. Notas do tradutor e processo tradutório: análise e reflexão sob uma perspectiva discursiva. Porto Alegre: Editora da UFRGS, 2003.

MONTEIRO LOBATO, José Bento. **Mundo da Lua e Miscelânea**. São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1964.

MORINI, Massimiliano. **The Pragmatic Translator**: An Integral Theory of Translation. London: Bloomsbury, 2013.

MORTON, Peter. Australia's England, 1880-1950. In: PIERCE, Peter. (Ed.). **The Cambridge history of Australian literature**. Melbourne: Cambridge, 2009. p. 255-281.

MOSSOP, Brian. **Revising and Editing for Translators**. 3.ed. New York: Routledge (Taylor and Francis), 2014.

MURDOCH MYSTERIES. Season 7, Episode 15, The Spy Who Came Up to the Cold. Script available at: http://transcripts.foreverdreaming.org/viewtopic.php?f=13&t=9998. Accessed on: 10 Feb. 2015.

NABOKOV, Vladimir. Lectures on Literature. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1980.

NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA – search for *The Solid Mandala*. Available at: http://catalogue.nla.gov.au/Search/Home?lookfor[]=the+solid+mandala&combinator[]=and&t ype[]=all&bool[]=AND&lookfor[]=&combinator[]=or&type[]=all&bool[]=AND&lookfor[]=&combinator[]=or&type[]=all&limit[]=&thelanguage=&lower=YYYY&upper=YYYY&submit=Find. Accessed on: 30 Apr. 2015.

NATIONAL MUSEUM OF AUSTRALIA. Australian English (Pom). Available at: http://www.nma.gov.au/exhibitions/nation/australian\_english. Accessed on: 5 May 2016.

NEWMARK, Peter. A Textbook of Translation. New York: Prentice Hall, 1988.

NOTICIAS UNSAM. Arrancó la cátedra Coetzee en el Campus: "Comencemos a ver el Sur a través de ojos sureños". Available at: http://noticias.unsam.edu.ar/2015/04/08/arranco-lacatedra-coetzee-en-el-campus-comencemos-a-ver-el-sur-a-traves-de-ojos-surenos/. Accessed on: 5 May 2015.

ORTEGA Y GASSET, José. Miseria y esplendor de la traducción. In: **Obras Completas**. Madrid: Editorial Revista Occidente, 1970.

PALESTRA SOBRE LITERATURA ABORÍGENE AUSTRALIANA: "The Indigenous Protest Poetry of Romaine Moreton". Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/palestra-sobre-literatura-aborigene-australiana-the-indigenous-protest-poetry-of-romaine-moreton.html. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

PATRICK WHITE CONFERENCE: MODERNIST IMPACT/CRITICAL FUTURES, 2010, London. **Translating Patrick White's Novel** *Voss*. London: University of London, 2010.

PAUL, Annie M. Reading Literature Makes Us Smarter and Nicer. **Time Magazine**, New York City, 3 June 2013. Available at: http://ideas.time.com/2013/06/03/why-we-should-read-literature/. Accessed on: 5 May 2016.

PICÃO. Definition in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/picão. Accessed on: 10 Aug. 2015.

POLACK, María Elena. Coetzee, un premio Nobel suelto en Buenos Aires. La Nación, Buenos Aires. 8 Apr. 2015. Available at: http://www.lanacion.com.ar/1782522-coetzee-un-premio-nobel-suelto-en-buenos-aires. Accessed on 12 Aug. 2015.

PUPATO, Silvia. **The translation of The Solid Mandala into Spanish** [personal message]. Message received by *mokistefani@yahoo.com.br*, on 17 Jul. 2014.

RIBEIRO, Leo Gilson. Patrick White, escritor australiano ganhador do Prêmio Nobel de Literatura em 1973. **Veja**, São Paulo, 24 Oct. 1973.

RICOEUR, Paul. **On Translation.** Translated by: Eillen Brennan. New York: Routledge, 2006.

ROCAMBOLE. Definition in Brazilian Portuguese. Aulete Digital. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/rocambole. Accessed on: 4 May 2016.

RÓNAI, Paulo. A tradução vivida. Rio de Janeiro: Educom, 1976.

ROWLING, J. K. Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone. London: Bloomsbury, 1997.

\_\_\_\_\_. **Harry Potter e a pedra filosofal**. Traduzido por: Lia Wyler. São Paulo: Rocco, 2000.

RUSSELL, John. Old and Young Australians. Sunday Times, London, 27 Jan. 1963.

SAINSBURY, Michael. Found in Translation. **The Australian**, Sydney. 13 Feb. 2010. Available at: http://www.theaustralian.com.au/opinion/columnists/found-in-translation/story-e6frg78o-1225828280475. Accessed on: 13 Jan. 2014.

SAPIR, Edward. **Culture, Language and Personality**. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1956.

SCHEIDT, Déborah. "All the difference in the world": Aspects of Alterity in Three Novels by Patrick White. Curitiba: UFPR, 1997. 150 f. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras) – Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras. Curitiba, UFPR, 1997.

SEMINÁRIO SOBRE LITERATURA ABORÍGENE AUSTRALIANA: "**The trickster:** satirising whiteness in the fiction of Australian Indigenous writer Marie Munkara". Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/seminario-sobre-literatura-aborigene-australiana-

the-brokering-of-decolonising-cosmopolitanism-the-case-of-kim-scotts-that-deadmandance.html. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

SEXTON, Jennifer. White Rejections Speak Volumes on Cultural Arbiters. **The Australian**, Sydney, 17 Jul. 2006.

SHOWER TEA. Definition. Available at:

http://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/shower-tea. Accessed on: 10 Jan. 2016.

STAHL, Anna Kazumi. J. M. Coetzee: los libros preferidos de un gran autor. **La Nación**, Buenos Aires, 22 Nov. 2013. Available at: http://www.lanacion.com.ar/1640348-j-m-coetzee-los-libros-preferidos-de-un-gran-autor. Accessed on: 10 Apr. 2014.

STATE LIBRARY OF NEW SOUTH WALES. Available at:

http://www.sl.nsw.gov.au/about/history/. Accessed on: 20 Aug. 2015.

STEFANI, Monica. **'You are what you read'**: intertextual relations in Patrick White's *The Solid Mandala*. 2011. 118 f. Dissertação (Mestrado em Letras) – Instituto de Letras, UFRGS, Porto Alegre.

STEINER, George. After Babel. New York: Oxford, 1975.

ŠUNKOVÁ, Jana. Revising Translations: Corpus Investigation of Revision and Self-revision. Brno: Masaryk University, 2011, 111 f. Thesis (Master's Degree in Translation). Faculty of Arts, Department of English and American Studies, English Language and Literature (English-language Translation), Masaryk University, Brno, 2011.

SUTHERLAND, John. Trouble Down Under: 'The Hanging Garden,' by Patrick White. **The New York Times**, New York, 24 May 2013. Sunday Book Review. Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2013/05/26/books/review/the-hanging-garden-by-patrick-white.html?\_r=1. Accessed on: 24 May 2015.

SWEDISH TRANSLATIONS OF PATRICK WHITE. Available at: http://sv.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White. Accessed on: 20 Feb. 2014.

TAGNIN, Stella E. O. (org.) Lá da Austrália. São Paulo: Editora Fólio, 2004.

TEA. Definition. The Free Dictionary. Available at: http://www.thefreedictionary.com/tea. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

THE BLIND MEN AND THE ELEPHANT. Available at:

http://www.jainworld.com/education/stories25.asp. Accessed on: 29 Jul. 2015.

THE SYDNEY MORNING HERALD. Twitter account. Available at: https://twitter.com/smh/status/629415152236937216/photo/1. Accessed on: 15 Aug. 2015.

THOMSEN, Mads Rosendahl. **Mapping World Literature**: International Canonization and Transnational Literatures. London: Continuum, 2008.

TIRIRICA. Definition in Brazilian Portuguese. Available at: http://www.aulete.com.br/tiririca. Accessed on: 10 Sept. 2015.

TORIZ, Rafael. Un escritor secular de la mano de los maestros. Perfil, Buenos Aires, 17 Apr. 2016. Available at: http://www.perfil.com/cultura/un-escritor-secular-de-la-mano-de-los-maestros-0416-0059.phtml. Accessed on: 3 May 2016.

UNSAM Noticias. Arrancó la cátedra Coetzee. Available at: http://noticias.unsam.edu.ar/2015/04/08/arranco-la-catedra-coetzee-en-el-campus-comencemos-a-ver-el-sur-a-traves-de-ojos-surenos/. Accessed on: 20 Apr. 2015.

VENUTI, Lawrence. **The Translator's Invisibility**: A History of Translation. London: Routledge, 2004.

VERMEER, Hans. 'Skopos and Commission in Translational Action'. In: VENUTI, Lawrence. (ed.). **The Translation Studies Reader**. London: Routledge, 2000.

VIDA SOB OS NOSSOS PÉS - Literatura e Cultura Australianas Hoje. Available at: http://www.ulices.org/eventos-realizados/coloquio-internacional-sobre-a-australia.html. Accessed on: 26 May 2015.

WALTER, Elizabeth. **Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary**. 3.ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

WEST-PAVLOV, Russell; ELZE-VOLLAND, Jens. Australian Literature in German Translation: A Catalogue of Titles, Translators, and Trends 1789-2010. Berlin: Freie Universität Berlin, 2010. Available at: http://www.geisteswissenschaften.fuberlin.de/we06/forschung/forschungsprojekte/2010-03-10\_Translation\_catalogue.pdf. Accessed on 15 Jan. 2014.

WHITE, Patrick. A árvore do homem. Translated by Cárdigos dos Reis. Lisbon: Publicações Dom Quixote, 1973.
\_\_\_\_\_\_. Translated by Cárdigos dos Reis. São Paulo: Círculo do Livro, 1981.
\_\_\_\_\_\_. Flaws in the Glass. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1983.
\_\_\_\_\_\_. Happy Valley. Sydney: Vintage, 2012.
\_\_\_\_\_\_. Die Ungleichen Brüder. Translated by Matthias Büttner. Düsseldorf: Claassen Verlag GmBH, 1978.
\_\_\_\_\_\_. Las esferas del mandala. Translated by Silvia Pupato and Román García Azcárate. Barcelona: Barral, 1973a.
\_\_\_\_\_\_. Translated by Elena Marengo. Buenos Aires: El Hilo de Ariadna, 2016.
\_\_\_\_\_. Les mystérieux mandala. Translated by Andrée R. Picard. Paris: Gallimard, 1973b.

| <b>Màndala solido</b> . Translated by Andrea D'Anna. Milan: Bompiani, 1973c.                     |
|--|
| <b>The Aunt's Story</b> . Sydney: Vintage, 2008.   |
| <b>The Solid Mandala</b> . Sydney: Penguin, 1974.  |
| <b>The Tree of Man</b> . Sydney: Vintage, 1994.  |
| <b>Voss</b> . Translated by Paulo Henriques Britto. Rio de Janeiro: Editora Nova Fronteira 1985. |
| Sydney: Vintage, 1994.   |
| ZILBERMAN, Regina. Recepção e leitura no horizonte da literatura. <b>Alea</b> : Estudos          |

Neolatinos, Rio de Janeiro, v. 10, n. 1, p. 85-97, Jan./Jun. 2008.

# ANNEX A - Contact with Editorial El Hilo de Ariadna, Buenos Aires, Argentina

Subject: Re[2]: Las Esferas del Mandala

From: Monica Herrero

To: mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;

Date: Monday, 15 February 2016, 20:48

### Hola, Mónica:

El libro está en la imprenta. Saldrá para marzo. te aviso. Saludos y buen 2016, Mónica

Subject: RE: Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires

From: Monica Herrero

To: mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;

Date: Wednesday, 10 June 2015, 12:11

## Hola, Mónica:

Todavía no salió el libro. Te aviso encuanto salga. Se reprogramó porque tuvimos que sacar otros libros antes. Saludos,

Mónica Herrero

Gestión de derechos.

Consultorías y Servicios Editoriales

Tel.: (011) 4331 5262 Tel/Fax: (011) 4342 0347

**De:** Monica Stefani [mailto:mokistefani@yahoo.com.br] Enviado el: viernes, 05 de junio de 2015 12:52 a.m.

Para: Monica Herrero

Asunto: Re: Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires

Hola,

¿Como está? ¡Espero que bien!

Lamento no haber podido ir a Buenos Aires durante la Feria del Libro. No lo pude por motivos de trabajo y estudios. Vi que J.M. Coetzee y otros profesores de Australia estuvieron en Buenos Aires a principios de abril, dando un curso en la Universidad San Martín. Yo sigo los eventos a través de internet, pero no he visto noticias del lanzamiento de Las Esferas del Mandala. ¿El libro ya se ha presentado? ¿Hay alguna fecha designada para su lanzamiento?

Espero pronto irme a Buenos Aires. Estoy muy ansiosa de leer la nueva traducción, lo que sin duda es un hito en los estudios de literatura australiana en América del Sur.

Desde ya, muchas gracias!

Saludos Monica

From: Monica Herrero

To: 'Monica Stefani' <mokistefani@yahoo.com.br>

Sent: Tuesday, 10 March 2015, 16:44

Subject: RE: Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires

Ouerida Mónica:

Te averiguo y te cuento. Saludos.

Mónica Herrero



Consultorías y Servicios Editoriales

Bernardo de Írigoyen 330, 5º of. 125 (C1072AAH) C.A.B.A.

Tel.: (011) 4331 5262 Tel/Fax: (011) 4342 0347

**De:** Monica Stefani [mailto:mokistefani@yahoo.com.br] **Enviado el:** martes, 10 de marzo de 2015 02:30 p.m.

Para: Monica Herrero

Asunto: Re: Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires

#### Hola,

¡Muchas gracias por sus informaciones!

Estoy muy feliz de que John Coetzee quizás estará en Buenos Aires. Respecto al evento de presentación, ¿será privado? Sería interesante asistirlo, y ver a John Coetzee también (aunque venga antes de la Feria). Espero la confirmación de la fecha y otras informaciones de la presentación de la traducción.

Estoy planeando mi viaje, pero creo que a principios de abril será un poco complicado, pienso en ir para la Feria. ¿Habrá otro evento relacionado con el libro durante la Feria?

De todos modos, vamos a seguir en contacto y le aviso cuando arreglar mi viaje! ¡Un abrazo!

From: Monica Herrero

To: 'Monica Stefani' <mokistefani@yahoo.com.br>

Sent: Wednesday, 4 March 2015, 13:24

Subject: RE: Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires

#### Hola, Mónica:

Gracias por el saludo. Averiguo cuándo se presenta el libro. Acaba de entrar en imprenta y estará distribuido para los primeros días de abril. Te cuento en cuanto me digan, pero creo que John M. Coetzee viene los primeros días de abril (antes de la Feria) y allí aprovecharemospara hacer la presentación de este título de su Biblitoeca Personal.

Cuando vengas a la Feria, avisame y nos vemos, así nos conocemos personalmente.

Cariños y te mantengo al tanto.

¡¡Beun 2015!! Mónica Herrero

mh

Consultorías y Servicios Editoriales
Bernardo de Irigoyen 330, 5° of. 125 (C1072AAH) C.A.B.A.

Tel.: (011) 4331 5262 Tel/Fax: (011) 4342 0347

**De:** Monica Stefani [mailto:mokistefani@yahoo.com.br] **Enviado el:** martes, 03 de marzo de 2015 09:51 p.m.

Para: Monica Herrero

Asunto: Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires

#### Hola, Mónica

Antes que nada, ¡feliz 2015, que todos tengamos un año muy fructífero, de muchos éxitos y realizaciones! Le escribo porque ya estoy planeando mi viaje para visitar la Feria Internacional del Libro de Buenos Aires en abril. Por eso, quisiera saber si hay alguna fecha para la presentación de la traducción al español de *The Solid Mandala*. De hecho, será un evento muy importante para todos los estudiantes de literatura australiana no sólo en Sudamérica sino en todo el mundo.

Continúo mi trabajo de traducción en Brasil (vamos a empezar la etapa de revisión y comentarios de la tesis doctoral que está en curso) y esperamos que pronto también la publiquemos.

Desde ya, muchas gracias por toda la información. ¡Nos vemos en abril!

Saludos Monica

From: Monica Herrero

To: 'Monica Stefani' <mokistefani@yahoo.com.br>

Sent: Monday, 3 November 2014, 18:11

Subject: RE: Lanzamiento

### Querida Monica:

El libro saldrá o a fines de este año a principios del que viene. Por lo general, en la feria del Libro de Buenos Aires hacemos las presentaciones. Todavía no lo tenemos planeado así que no tengo fecha, pero en cuanto la tenga, aviso con tiempo.

Ya terminamos el proceso de edición, estamos esperando que el departamento de diseño nos mande las galeras. Saludos,

Mónica Herrero

Gestión de derechos,
Consultorías y Servicios Editoriales
Bernardo de Irigoyen 330, 5° of. 125 (C1072AAH) C.A.B.A.
Tel.: (011) 4331 5262
Tel/Fax: (011) 4342 0347

**De:** Monica Stefani [mailto:mokistefani@yahoo.com.br] **Enviado el:** lunes, 03 de noviembre de 2014 01:21 p.m.

Para: Monica Herrero Asunto: Lanzamiento

## ¡Hola, estimada Mónica!

Muchísimas gracias por las informaciones proporcionadas hasta ahora. Espero ansiosamente el lanzamiento del libro, y aprovecho la oportunidad para preguntarle si habrá algún evento para marcar este lanzamiento. Si es así, se puede especificar la fecha, porque me encantaría asistir y comprar una copia del libro. Creo que va a ser un momento muy importante por todo el esfuerzo de la traducción y para el reconocimiento de Patrick White en América del Sur y en otros países hispánicos. ¡Será realmente genial presenciarlo!

¡Una vez más, gracias por la ayuda!

Monica

| Subject: | RE: Fwd: Contacto el hilo de Ariadna |
|----------|--------------------------------------|
| From:    | Monica Herrero                       |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;            |
| Cc:      |                                      |
| Date:    | Thursday, 4 September 2014, 18:28    |

### Hola Monika,

Encantada de escribirte desde El Hilo de Ariadna y responder a tus consultas. Soy Mónci ahererro y me he encargado de la contratación de los derechos de autor de las obras originales y de las traducciones para la colección Biblioteca Personal John M. Coetzee y del seguimiento de la tarea de traducción y corrección de cada título publicado. Esta colección incluirá 12 títulos elegidos por el Premio nobel de Literatura para cada uno de los cuales él ha escrito especialmente una introducción. La colección se viene publicando desde 2013 a razón de cuatro títulos por año. La idea ha sido ofrecer al lector estas obras de una forma atractiva, con pocas notas, no se trata de ediciones académicas anotadas sino de ediciones para el pleno disfrute de la lectura y destinadas a cualquier lector interesado en ampliar su universo de lecturas o tratar de ver por qué a un Premio Nobel estas obras le gustaron o las eligió.

Te doy nuestra respuesta a continuación de cada pregunta que nos formulaste.

¿Cómo fue el procedimiento para la adquisición de los derechos de traducción? ¿Pertenecían a Barral Editores de Barcelona?

Seix Barral ya no tenía esos derechos. Había vencido el contrato. Hicimos una búsqueda de los derechos de autor y conseguim

¿José Danoso, Pilar Serrano y Cristina Piña son los traductores seleccionados para trabajar con The Solid Mandala en español?

No. La traductora de esta novela es Elena Marengo, quien contó con la asistencia del propio John M. Coetzee para aclarar algu

¿Los tres trabajan en la traducción o cada uno está a cargo de una novela de la lista para traducir? ¿Cómo fue la división del trabajo?

En la colección Biblioteca Personal John M. Coetzee hemos tratado de ofrecer nuevas traducciones de las obras o traduccione

Ya estoy traduciendo la novela en Brasil (como parte de mi investigación académica). ¿es posible establecer contacto con los traductores para intercambiar ideas? Consulto a la traductora si puedo pasarte tu mail. No creo que haya inconveniente. También puede pasarme

¿Se pensó en intentar utilizar la obra publicada en España en 1973? ¿O los editores decidieron por traducir la novela de nuevo, tenien cuenta que las traducciones deben ser revisadas periódicamente? Justamente, con el caso de The Solid Mandala, la traducción existente es muy buena, la hizo Azcárate, aunque por momentos

¿Hay previsión para la fecha de lanzamiento? Sí, la traducción está lista. La estoy terminando de revisar y el plan editorial es que salga este año, hacia final de año.

Cualquier otra consulta, no dejes de escribirme. Trataré de contactarte con la traductora.

Mónica Herrero

## **ANNEX B – Contact with the translator Silvia Pupato**

| Subject: | RE: The translation of The Solid Mandala into Spanish |
|----------|---|
| From:    | Silvia Pupato   |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;                             |
| Date:    | Thursday, 17 July 2014, 22:25                         |

#### Hello Monica

So.

- 1. What could you say about the translation process of *The Solid Mandala* into Spanish at that time (during the 1970s)?
  - Translation had to be very fast because the publisher wanted to have the book in the stores for Christmas. And it was.
- 2. How were you and the other translator chosen to perform the task of translating Patrick White? I don't believe we were specially chosen. We had been working for the publisher and had just finished one book.
- 3. How did the whole process go along? Were you in Spain translating it? Or in Argentina? At that time we were living in Barcelona.
- 4. What about the proofreading process? Did the revisors correct your text only in terms of grammar, or was it concerned with other aspects?
- 5. Did you have access to the modified version later? Or you only saw the final result when it appeared at the bookstores? As I can remember (this was 40 years ago), Román proofreaded and the book was published as handed in.
- 6. What kind of research have you both conducted while translating *The Solid Mandala*? The Internet was not available at the time, so what kind of sources did you look up?
  - There was nothing to research about. Vocabulary was common usage. Not even Aussie words. And there were dictionaries. Internet may ease things up but is not a dictionary.
- 7. Had you ever read Patrick White at that time, or had you ever had any experience with Australian literature before translating *The Solid Mandala*?
  - That Patrick White were was nominated to a Nobel prize was a real surprise, for he was practically unknown outside Australia. *Mandala* sold very well and the publisher gave us *The Tree of Man* to translate.
- 8. Had you ever been to Australia prior to the translation of *The Solid Mandala*? D'you think the *in loco* experience might be helpful (and/or necessary) for the task?
  - I visited Australia 20 years later -approx.-. I don't think it would have been helpful to visit Australia before translating. Characters were not local, vocabulary was not local, grammar was not local. The book was universal as a whole.
  - 9.D'you think that the Franco dictatorship represented an influence on your work? At least in terms of swear words and religious issues present in the novel? Or in relation to any other aspect?
  - No influence at all. Franco dictatorship lasted 40 years and by 1973 was almost at its end. By that me people were not executed nor imprisoned nor interned in concentration camps because they supported "an -Spain" ideas, and censorship was really lax. It's my personal view. You have to consider that in Argentina people were living in condtions quite similar to those of the first years of the Franco dictatorship, and we felt quite safe and at ease in Spain, in spite of Franco. One thing: before translating I read the book. I believe it is essential to find how characters develop along the plot. It helps a lot to know them beforehand. I remember there was one thing though: "in the meantime", if I'm not mistaken. I thought a lot about how to solve this, but I cannot remember which was the result. I'm sorry I cannot be more helpful but I worked on the *Mandala* a very long time ago. Best luck with your work. Kind regards, silviaP

### ANNEX C - Contact with Maria Ammazzalorso

| Subject: | RE: Patrick White translated into Greek |
|----------|---|
| From:    | Maria Ammazzalorso                      |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;               |
| Cc:      |   |
| Date:    | Friday, 18 March 2016, 3:33             |

Dear Monica,

Thank you very much for your enquiry. One my colleagues did a search through the Greek Library catalogues and below are the works of Patrick White he have been able to find in Greek. Please be aware that our search may not have brought up all the translated works.

The following link takes you to all the works of Patrick White, listed in the Union Catalog of Greece, held in Greek Libraries in English and in Greek. http://www.unioncatalog.gr/

In addition to our information you may like to contact the National Library of Greece on the following numbers: Telephone: 210-3382500, 210-3382600. Fax: 210-3608246. I was not able to find an e-mail.

- 1. Βος: σπουδή στην περιπέτεια και τον έρωτα / Πάτρικ Γουάιτ; εισαγωγή μετάφραση: Βρασίδας Καραλής = Voss translated by Vrasidas Karalis
- 2. Ψεγάδια στον καθρέφτη: Μια αυτοπροσωπογραφία / Πάτρικ Γουάιτ; εισαγωγή μετάφραση σημειώσεις Γιάννης

Βασιλακάκος... = Flaws in the glass: A self-portrait (Autobiography) – Published in Athens in 2008. Translated by Giannis Vasilakakos

- 3. Ἡ ὑπόθεση Τουάιμπορν: Μυθιστόρημα / Πάτρικ Γουάιτ; μετάφραση Σεραφείμ Βελέντζας = The Twyborn Affair (translated by Serefeim Velentzas)
- by White Patrick (1912-1990) Published: Athens: Έστία, 1999
- 4. Η ιστορία της θείας / Πατρίκ Γουάϊτ, μετάφραση Σεραφείμ Βελέντζας. = The Aunt's Story [1988] (translated by Serefeim Velentzas)
- 5. Το δέντρο του ανθρώπου = The tree of man 1976

Good luck with your studies and we will be interested to know if you do find additional translated works of Patrick White in Greek.

Kind regards, Maria

# ANNEX D - Contact with Susan Ballyn (University of Barcelona)

| Subject: | Re: Patrick White in Spain  |
|----------|-----------------------------|
| From:    | Susan Ballyn                |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;   |
| Date:    | Tuesday, 15 July 2014, 6:25 |

Hello Monica.

I am not sure that I am the right person to answer your questions as I have not followed translations of Patrick White here or in Latin America. However, I will answer you questions with what knowledge I have and I will also put you in contact with somebody who may be able to better help you. Questions

1. In your opinion as a scholar, how is Patrick White seen in Spain nowadays? There is very little general knowledge in the public arena about him but he is often taught on courses dealing with Australian literature or culture

- 2. What could be said of Patrick White's reception in Spanish-language countries? I can only answer regarding Spain and hisreception is strictly within the academic domain
- 3. Would more translations of Patrick White be required/commissioned in the future, in your opinion? They should be but whetherthat will happen I do not know and given the present crisis I would think that preference would be given to other authors
- 4. Was translation a factor in his (either good or poor) reception in Spain? No
- 5. Patrick White's centenary was celebrated in 2012. Did any kind of event take place in Spain to mark the occasion? Not as far as Iknow.

The person you should contact is Prof. Suarez Lafuente.

With all good wishes Susan

### ANNEX E - Contact with Maria Helena de Paiva Correia

| Subject: | Fwd: Patrick White in Portugal |
|----------|--------------------------------|
| From:    | Jean Page                      |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;      |
| Date:    | Sunday, 24 May 2015, 15:27     |

Dear Mónica

I am sending the very comprehensive and helpful reply from, Professor Maria Helena de Paiva Correia, a now retired and distinguished Professor from the Faculty of Letters in Lisbon which will throw light on reception of Patrick White in Portugal in the early 1970s in Portugal.

Wishing you all the best Jean

Dear Jean,

I also hope that the present message finds you well. I will tell you all I know about the reception of Patrick White in Portugal, university teaching, student interest, translation. I'am afraid it's not much...

As a matter of fact, I never taught Patrick White either to undergraduates or to graduate students. Australian Literature was not taught in those days. Later on, I tried to introduce it at Faculdade de Letras, at least by means of CEAUL G4. Please ask Prof. Teresa Casal. I think there is no one teaching Australian Literature.

As a young student, I had to write a thesis to complete my undergraduation (Germanic Phillogy – English / German, 5 years + thesis). I wrote a thesis on Patrick White: Maria Helena Ribeiro de Paiva Correia Gomes de Vallêra, *O Regresso à Abissínia ou uma Interpretação do Romance de Patrick White*, Dissertação de Licenciatura em Filologia Germânica, Lisboa: Faculdade de Letras da Universidade de Lisboa, 1969 (policopiada) — Faculdade de Letras Library (about 500 pages); I sent this work to Patrick White who kindly had provided me with some bibliography (see attachments, please). He wrote back quite angry because he couldn't conceive the idea of my writing the thesis in a language he couldn't read. I had to write it in Portuguese. Then, it was compulsory.

Later on, I published the following paper: Maria Helena Ribeiro de Paiva Correia Gomes de Vallêra, «Considerações a propósito de *The Aunt's Story* de Patrick White», *Revista da Faculdade de Letras*, III série, nº 15, Lisboa: 1973, pp. 521-535 — Faculdade de Letras Library.

Patrick White's *The Trea of Man* was translated into Portuguese in Portugal:

WHITE, Patrick, 1912-1990 - Biblioteca Municipal Eduardo ... catalogo.bmel.pt/plinkres.asp?...%22AU%20WHITE%2C%20Patrick%2...

I think there is a master thesis on Patrick White's *Voss* supervised by Prof. António M. Feijó – Faculdade de Letras Library.

I am almost sure that in other Portuguese "good" Universities there is nothing at all about Patrick White (Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Universidade de Coimbra, Universidade do Porto, Universidade do Minho). Besides, if there were, Prof. David Callahan would know, I dare say.

In the course of my academic career I had a lot of work and became an expert on Late Medieval and Renaissance English Literature (15th 17th centuries), Theory of Literature and Comparative Literature. I can read Portuguese, of course, Latin, Middle English (London dialect),

Early Modern English, Modern English, French (including Medieval and Renaissance French), German (including High Middle German), Spanish (including Medieval and Renaissance Spanish) and Italian (including Medieval and Renaissance Italian). I studied Portuguese Literature, Brasilian Literature, French Literature, English

Literature, Scottish Literature, American Literature, Australian Literature, German Literature, Spanish Literature (including Spanish American Literatures) and Italian Literature. I gave up Patrick White, as well as Australian Literature, many years ago.

That's all.

Best regards,

Maria Helena de Paiva Correia

# **ANNEX F - Contact with Paulo Henriques Britto**

Re: Perguntas (tradução de Patrick White)

Paulo Britto Hotmail Fri 2/28/2014 6:55 PM

To: Monica Stefani < mokistefani@msn.com>

## Cara Monica,

Vamos lá:

- 1. Você já possuía uma vasta experiência na tradução (e na leitura) de outros romances de autores consagrados. Quando você se deparou comPatrick White e seu romance *Voss*, o que você sentiu? Seria mais um desafio?
  - *Voss* foi minha primeira tradução literária. Eu tinha vinte e poucos anos, lia muito desde a mais tenra infância, mas tinha muito pouca experiência de tradução *tout court*, zero conhecimentos a respeito de Austrália e literatura australiana. Foi um tremendo desafio.
- 2. Quais foram os procedimentos de pesquisa para lidar com as especificidades do mundo australiano retratado no romance?
  - Como na época não havia internet, fui à biblioteca do IBEU um curso de inglês aqui do Rio que foi meu primeiro emprego, logo quando saí da casa de meus pais— e passei toda uma tarde lendo o longuíssimo verbete "Australia" da *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, tomando notas num bloco.
- 3. Como foi o trabalho de revisão? Você na época teve acesso ao material modificado? Você tinha oportunidade de justificar suas escolhas paraos editores da Editora Nova Fronteira? Quais eram as atribuições dos revisores? Somente corrigir o português, ou também fazer o cotejamento entre os dois idiomas?
  - Na época a gente entregava o livro à editora e ela fazia o que bem entendia com a nossa tradução. Nenhum contato com revisor nem preparador. O livro só foi publicado muitos anos depois.
- 4. Você acha que houve alguma falha que venha a explicar a obscuridade (creio ser essa a palavra) de Patrick White hoje não somente no Brasil, mas em todo o mundo lusófono? A tradução teria algo a ver com isso?
  - Creio que tem a ver com a pouca expressão da cultura australiana dentro do mundo anglófono, que é dominado por Estados Unidos e Grã-Bretanha, com algumas sobras de atenção para o Canadá e, a partir dos anos 70, para a Jamaica. O resto é ignorado, até mesmo no próprio mundo anglófono.
- 5. Você acredita ser possível revitalizar a tradução de *Voss* feita em 1985 com a publicação, por exemplo, de outra tradução (de *The Solid Mandala*)?
  - Se *Mandala* fizer sucesso, talvez a Nova Fronteira resolva relançar o livro. Não sei se teriam que renegociar os direitos autorais.
- 6. Quanto tempo você levou para concluir a tradução de *Voss*? Francamente, não me lembro. Foi há quase quarenta anos.
- 7. Você já havia viajado para a Austrália quando da realização da tradução? Você acredita ser importante uma vivência no país da língua departida para uma melhor tradução? Nunca estive na Austrália, mas passei parte da infância nos EUA e cursei um ano e meio de faculdade lá também, de modo que o inglês para mim é quase uma segunda língua nativa. Idealmente, é claro, para traduzir literatura australiana seria bom o tradutor conhecer o país in loco.
- 8. Você já havia lido algum romance de Patrick White no original? Como seu nome foi escolhido para a tarefa?
  - Nunca tinha lido nada dele. Me deram o livro porque eu estava querendo começar a traduzir, para ganhar mais dinheiro; fui à Nova Fronteira, apresentei meu parco CV havia traduzido um ou dois livros, nenhum deles de literatura e me deram *Voss*.

9. Por que somente em 1985 essa tradução foi publicada, tendo em vista que Patrick White ganhou o Nobel em 1973, 12 anos antes?

Não sei. Me lembro que fiz a tradução por volta de meados dos anos 70, 77 ou 78 ao mais tardar.

10. Você chegou a ler a outra tradução de White em língua portuguesa (*A árvore do homem,* tradução de *The Tree of Man*), em busca de alguma informação? Ou outra tradução de *Voss* para outro idioma em busca de soluções para eventuais desafios (para não dizer problemas) encontrados? Não, nunca mais li nada de White. Praticamente minha única fonte de consulta na época foi a *Britannica*.

Um abraço.

Paulo

# ANNEX G - Contact with Nataša Kampmark

| Subject: | Re: Questions on translation!   |
|----------|---------------------------------|
| From:    | Natasa Kampmark                 |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;       |
| Date:    | Friday, 28 February 2014, 12:17 |

### Dear Monica,

I am glad to hear that you have gotten down to composing your PhD. Keep up the good work! Of course, I will answer your questions gladly and hope they prove useful and helpful. Well, let's start from the beginning:

- 1. The publisher got interested after seeing an issue of a literary magazine which I edited and which was devoted to the Australianshort story. The publisher proposed to work on an anthology but only if I manage to find the funding. So, it is not any lack of interest which prevents publishers from publishing translated works of Australian writers but it is the funding, especially at these times of economic crisis. So, we applied for a grant to the Australian Council for the Arts and only after our application was successful did we proceed with the project.
- 2. The electronic database with recorded translations is in Serbian, so I am not sure how helpful it can be to you. It can be found at http://www.nb.rs/pages/article.php?id=7390 The electronic version only lists translations from 2003 until 2013. For everything published before that one needs to go to one of the major libraries in Serbia (which I did). As far as the translations of Patrick White are concerned in Serbian (or Serbo-Croatian until 1991), I have information about it:

Voss - translated in 1974 in Zagreb, Croatia

The Aunt's Story - translated in 1979 in Belgrade, Serbia

The Eye of the Storm - translated in 1979 in Zagreb, Croatia

Twyborn Affair - translated in 1984 in Zagreb, Croatia

The Night the Prowler - collection of short stories, translated in

1977 in Belgrade, Serbia And half a dozen of his short storied

appeared in translation in literary magazines.

- 3. I do not think there is a great interest now for translating PW in Serbia.
- 4. The difficulties in translation when PW is concerned would most likely arise from his demanding style and also his vision as awriter. And, of course, there are always the culturally specific contexts that are difficult to translate into another culture.
- 5. Presence in Australia can certainly help. But for me the social studies about Australian society helped as well as good literaryhistories and criticism.
- 6. Since I translated stories and novel extracts into Serbian, proofreading was in Serbian (as the target text). All authors were available for contact during translation if I wanted to clarify any points in their texts. That is a luxury the translator can have with contemporary authors. There were not many changes made to my translated text, but of course, the translator should always get to oversee any changes reviewers and proofreaders want to make.

I hope my answers are helpful. Should you need any more clarifications on these points or have any other question, do not hesitate to ask.

Best,

Nataša

# **ANNEX H – Contact with María Socorro Suárez Lafuente (University of Oviedo)**

| Subject: | Re: Patrick White in Spain (Australian literary studies in translation) |
|----------|---|
| From:    | María Socorro Suárez Lafuente   |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;   |
| Date:    | Saturday, 19 July 2014, 11:34   |

#### Dear Monica.

I've passed your email to Prof. Aurora García, who is the expert in Patrick White at our University. I do love White as a novelist and, occasionally, I teach some of his short works - I particularly like "The night the prowler". All his novels have been translated into Spanish as you can see even in the Spanish wikipedia, http://es.wikipedia.org/wiki/Patrick\_White, however he is not a widely read author. Australia is a far off culture for Spain and Australian authors are rarely read here - one exception might have been Peter Carey's *Oscar and Lucinda*, thanks to the film, but even so... And, I'm sorry to tell you, White's centenary passed unnoticed, with just a short reminder in some of the Literary Supplements in the newspapers.

I hope Professor García writes to you, else I'll be happy to assist you in whatever (poor) information I can give you. Best wishes,

María Socorro

# **ANNEX I – Contact with David Callahan (University of Aveiro)**

| Subject: | Patrick White translation in Brazil |
|----------|-------------------------------------|
| From:    | David Callahan                      |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;           |
| Date:    | Wednesday, 3 April 2013, 18:20      |

#### Hi Mónica

Well, that sounds interesting indeed. Unfortunately, there is almost no interest in Australian studies in Portugal. When I held a big Australian studies conference here 10 years ago, nobody came from Portugal apart from a PhD student of mine and an English friend at the University of Aveiro. And we had important writers, an important artist, and an important documentary filmmaker, as well as many important Australian scholars. Last year they had a small Australian studies conference in Lisbon but it was noticeable that the staff were not interested and did not attend, apart from the couple of staff who were organising it in the effort to look more international.

This is to say that your project would have difficulty being achieved here, even though Patrick White is a great writer. My next article to appear begins by talking about The Aunt's Story, although I am no expert on Patrick White. It's interesting that you've chosen The Solid Mandala. I'm a great fan of Riders in the Chariot, followed by The Tree of Man I Guess. I have never taught White though. I've always gone for more contemporary material, and also shorter books. Even at Master's level I need to cover all of English literature outside the UK and the US, so there's only space for one Australian book at a time.

There is an Australian woman doing a PhD in Lisbon about an Australian poet, although I don't remember which one at the moment. I can find out. It's a canonical name, I know that.

Lucky you getting to spend time at Monash, where I have a good friend (Chandani Lokugé).

The swiftness of my answer shows how pleased I am to get an email like yours instead of the usual work and admin. Don't worry, I know where Porto Alegre is and Brazilian geography in general, although I've never been there. I often comment in PhD classes, where I talk about Indigenous issues in Australia, on Brazilian Indigenous peoples, but neither my Portuguese nor Brazilian students know much about the history, and they know nothing about literature written by Brazilian Indians, which has become something I am very curious about. Cheers

David

| Subject: | RE: Patrick White (Brazilian PhD student) |
|----------|---|
| From:    | David Callahan                            |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;                 |
| Date:    | Wednesday, 27 May 2015, 9:42              |

Dear Mónica

Yes, I remember your email as it was unusual and different from all the admin I get.

I can indeed talk about the things you wonder about. The Australian studies conference in Lisbon attracted very limited interest among students and staff. It was noticeable that the powerful members of staff in the English department did not attend, and did not show any interest in the significant Australian writer Robert Dessaix who was at the conference (and who has had something translated into Portuguese, although I don't remember what at the moment), not to mention the younger writers.

Recently the same research group had another conference on Home in Postcolonial Literature, and there were several papers on Australian issues. Once again, the conference was poorly attended. People are just not interested in anything much outside the Anglo-American axis.

The conference I organised in 2003 was the conference of the European Association for Studies on Australia, and attracted about 120 speakers. However, apart from Jean Page (who at that time was working at the Embassy) nobody came from the rest of Portugal. And at the time I was the Secretary of the Associação Portuguesa de Estudos Anglo-Americanos (the name says it all) so I had included information about the conference and the call for papers in the Association's newsletters, so they can't say it hadn't been publicised. I'll send you the conference programme from another email address (as this one has stopped attaching files for some reason).

Indigenous issues are central to most European countries' interest in Australia, if they have any. I don't think there is any interest in Australia in Portugal to speak of, whether Indigenous issues, canonical literature, recent literature, whatever.

Indeed, I will be speaking on this issue at a conference in Porto in November.

There have, however, been a number of translations of Australian novels, much more than used to be the case. Even a couple of Australian poets (John Mateer, Kit Kelen).

Nice to hear from you David

| Subject: | Australia & Portugal         |
|----------|------------------------------|
| From:    | David Callahan               |
| То:      | mokistefani@yahoo.com.br;    |
| Date:    | Wednesday, 27 May 2015, 9:32 |

### Dear Monica

Here you have the programme of the 2003 European conference of Australian Studies at the Universidade de Aveiro, an article I wrote in 1989:

"Peter Carey's Oscar and Lucinda and the Uses of Literary Power". Proceedings of the X Conference of the Portuguese Anglo-American Studies Association. Aveiro: Department of Languages and Cultures, 1991: 101-109. and another 2 years later:

"The Image of Australia in Portugal since the Revolution: From Timor to Television." *Australian Studies*. 5. April 1991: 8-18.

The first article was the first one I had published. The other article makes comments which were true in 1990 when I wrote it but which are not at all true now. Australian television is now absent on Portuguese channels, and in any event the advent of cable television and then the internet has changed consumption in this area enormously.

Take care

David

## **ANNEX J – Contact with James Bennett**

----- Forwarded message -----

From: James Bennett

Date: 22 November 2015 at 01:58

Subject: Re: Cyclax in a Patrick White novel To: Ian Alexander ianalex63@gmail.com

Hi lan.

Greetings from Australia.

Skin lightening cosmetics were used fairly widely in Australia before WWII to counteract suntanning. The commonest product used in Australia was Dearborn's Mercolized Wax which contained mercury. It lighten tanned skin by affecting melanin production and inducing exfoliation. See this page:

http://www.cosmeticsandskin.com/aba/mercolized-wax.php

However, I don't have any evidence that Cyclax produced a mercury-based skin lightener. Reading the passage you sent that I am not sure that White is referring to Mrs Poulter using a Cyclax product to lighten her skin. White uses the phrases "her health, **her colour"** and "**brownish** and healthy-looking" which fits with the idea (present here in the 1960s and 1970s) that a tanned skin was a healthy-looking skin and something to be encouraged. The skin cancer epidemic here killed that fashion off and heavily tanned individuals are very rare now.

This suggest to me that a Cyclax product was being applied to counteract dry, cracked skin rather than as a skin lightener ("No one could object to a person doing something for her chaps") specifically for her lips? Poulter seems concerned about her skin cracking "If she cracked up like some old enamel pot it was what happens in time." Cyclax had a number of remedies for dry, cracked or reddened skin. See this Cyclax booklet from the 1950s:

http://www.cosmeticsandskin.com/booklets/care-loveliness.php

I think it is more likely that White is referring to Mrs. Poutler needing an excuse to apply lipstick. "Mrs Poulter would lick her lips thinking it out, with very slight Cyclax." A middle-aged woman using lipstick in the Australian suburbs might be regarded as being a bit salacious and this is perhaps what she was worried about! Lips get very dry and chap easily and lipstick was sometimes applied using the excuse that it was a lip protectant. Also, as the Queen used Cyclax make-up that would help make it OK. See:

http://www.cosmeticsandskin.com/ded/coronation.php

I hope that is of some assistance. By the way I was very intrigued by your comment "our Brazilian readers, who have quite different expectations of skin colour from your average Australian." If you have the time I would like to know more about what you meant by this.

regards James